

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<i>A.</i>	Anguttara Nikāya
<i>Abhp.</i>	Abhidhānappadīpikā (Sinh. ed.)
<i>Ba.</i>	Burmese-script printed ed. of <i>Netti</i> , 1917
<i>Bb.</i>	Ditto, 1956
<i>C.</i>	Sinhalese-script printed ed. of <i>Netti</i> , 1923
<i>CPD.</i>	Trenckner's Critical Pali Dictionary, vol. 1 (Copenhagen)
<i>D.</i>	Dīgha Nikāya
<i>Dh.</i>	Dhammapada (verse no.)
<i>DhA.</i>	Dhammapada Commentary
<i>Dhs.</i>	Dhammasaṅgaṇī (§ no.)
<i>DhsA.</i>	Dhammasaṅgaṇī Commentary (Atthasālinī)
<i>Iti.</i>	Itivuttaka
<i>Jā.</i>	Jātaka
<i>Khpa.</i>	Khuddakapāṭha Commentary
<i>Kv.</i>	Kathāvatthu
<i>KvA.</i>	Kathāvatthu Commentary (PañcappakaraṇaA. III)
<i>KvAA.</i>	Mūla-Ṭīkā (Burmese ed. Pt. IV)
<i>M.</i>	Majjhima Nikāya
<i>MA.</i>	Majjhima Nikāya Commentary (Papañcasūdanī)
<i>MAA.</i>	Majjhima Nikāya Ṭīkā (Burmese ed.)
<i>Miln.</i>	Milindapañha
<i>Nd1.</i>	Mahā-Niddesa
<i>Nd2.</i>	Cūḷa-Niddesa (Burmese ed.)
<i>Netti.</i>	Nettipakaraṇa
<i>NettiA.</i>	Netti. Commentary (Pt. <i>PTS Netti.</i> ed., rest Sinhalese-script Hewavitarne ed.)
<i>NettiAA.</i>	Netti Vibhāvanā Ṭīkā (Burmese ed.)
<i>Pe.</i>	Peṭakopadesa
<i>PED.</i>	Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary
<i>PTS.</i>	Pali Text Society

<i>Ppn.</i>	Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga Translation, Colombo, 1956)
<i>Ps.</i>	Paṭisambhidāmagga
<i>PugA.</i>	Puggalapaññatti Commentary (PañcappakaraṇaA. II)
<i>S.</i>	Saṃyutta Nikāya
<i>Sn.</i>	Suttanipāta
<i>S.B.E.</i>	Sacred Books of the East
<i>Thag.</i>	Theragathā
<i>Ud.</i>	Udāna
<i>Vbh.</i>	Vibhanga
<i>Vis.</i>	Visuddhimagga (§ refs. to Harvard University Press ed.)
<i>VisA.</i>	Visuddhimagga Mahā-Ṭikā (Paramatthamañjūsā—Sinhalese ed. up to ch. xviii, Burmese ed. chs. xix-xxiii)
<i>Vv.</i>	Vimānavatthu
<i>Yam.</i>	Yamaka

CONTENTS IN DETAIL

	PARA.
a. Comprehensive Section	1
b. Specification Section	2

PART I

1. INDICATIVE SUBSECTION	2
------------------------------------	---

PART II

2. DEMONSTRATIVE SUBSECTION	5
3. COUNTER-DEMONSTRATIVE SUBSECTION	31

PART III

Chapter i.—16 Modes of Conveying: Separate Treatment

<i>Mode 1: Conveying a Teaching</i>	31
—6 aspects of the 4 Truths: gratification, disappointment, escape; fruit, means, injunction	32
—Quotations for the 6 aspects	33
—Types of persons to whom the teaching is taught	41
—The 4 Ways of Progress and 4 Temperaments	42
—How the teaching is apprehended	45
—The teaching as presentation of the 4 Truths	48
—How the teaching is variously presented	53
—Whom the teaching is intended for	60
 <i>Mode 2: Conveying Investigation</i>	61
—Schedule of what is to be investigated: (1) term, question, answer, consecutivity; (2) gratification, disappointment, escape; fruit, means, injunction; (3) verse-paraphrase; (4) any Thread	62
(1)	
— <i>First Example</i>	63
— <i>Second Example</i>	70
— <i>Third Example</i>	77
Progress to verification of extinction	78

— <i>Fourth Example</i> - - - - -	93
Description of the Blessed One - - - - -	96
Guarding of cognizance - - - - -	97
Four Right Endeavours - - - - -	98
Five Faculties of Faith, etc. - - - - -	100
The World - - - - -	103
Knowledge - - - - -	104
Skill - - - - -	111
Mindfulness and Awareness - - - - -	112
Conduct for Adepts and Initiates - - - - -	113
Actualization of the Four Truths - - - - -	114
Exhaustion of Lust, Hate and Delusion - - - - -	115

(2)

(—See *Mode 1*)

(3)

—Verse-paraphrase - - - - -	116
-----------------------------	-----

(4)

—Any Thread - - - - -	117
-----------------------	-----

Mode 3: Conveying a Construing - - - - - 119

—The 4 Principal Appeals to Authority - - - - -	120
—How to test such appeals - - - - -	121
— <i>Example</i> —Investigation of a question asked - - - - -	126
—Difference in meaning - - - - -	131
—Synonyms for the same meaning - - - - -	134
—Appropriate and inappropriate construing - - - - -	139

Mode 4: Conveying Footings - - - - - 158

—Definitions, by characteristic and Footing, of the 18 Root-Terms - - - - -	159
—of lust for sensual desires, lust for being, and the 5 Categories of Assumption - - - - -	161
—of the 5 Faculties of Faith, etc. - - - - -	162
—of unreasoned Attention and the members of the Dependent-Arising Formula - - - - -	164
—How Being comes about - - - - -	165
—Definitions, by Characteristic and Footing, of the Path - - - - -	166
—Statement of Ideas as Footings (conditions <i>sine qua non</i>) for other ideas - - - - -	167
—Definition of the word 'Footing' - - - - -	168

<i>Mode 5: Conveying Characteristics</i>	170
—Single Characteristics of:	
The Sixfold Base	172
The 5 Categories	173
The 4 Foundations of Mindfulness	174
The 5 Faculties	174
The Ideas Partaking of Enlightenment	175
The Abandoning of the Unprofitable	176
The Dependently-Arisen	180
The Abandoning of the Dependently-Arisen	181
—Summarization	182
 <i>Mode 6: Conveying a Fourfold Array</i>	 184
(i) <i>Linguistics</i>	185
Some grammatical terms	186
(ii) <i>Purport (Intention)</i>	187
Examples by quotations	187
(iii) <i>Source</i>	192
Examples by quotations	192
(iv) <i>Consecutive-Sequence</i>	198
Examples by quotations	198
4 Kinds:	
(a) Meaning-Sequence	214
(b) Phrasing-Sequence	216
(c) Teaching-Sequence	217
(d) Demonstration-Sequence	218
 <i>Mode 7: Conveying a Conversion</i>	 220
—Completion of footings partially stated, statement of corresponding ethical contraries for conversion to the Four Truths:	
<i>First Example</i>	221
<i>Second Example</i>	233
<i>Third Example</i>	238
<i>Fourth Example</i>	250
 <i>Mode 8: Conveying an Analysis</i>	 263
—Threads as Morality or Penetration, Ways as Merit or Fruit, Virtue as Restraint or Abandoning	264
—Ideas shared in common between types of persons	271
—Ideas not shared in common	273
—Plane and Footing	275

	PARA.
<i>Mode 9: Conveying a Reversal</i>	277
—The 10 Rightnesses	278
—The 10 Courses of Profitable Action	279
—Reversal by those who censure the eight-factored Path and 10 Rightnesses	281
—Reversal by those who say that sensual desires should be cultivated, etc.	282
—Abandonment of the 4 Perversions	283
 <i>Mode 10: Conveying Synonyms</i>	 285
—Various synonyms	286
—Recollection of the Enlightened One	296
—Recollection of the True Idea	297
—Recollection of the Community	298
—Recollection of Virtue	299
—Recollection of Generosity	300
 <i>Mode 11: Conveying Descriptions</i>	 302
—Definition of description	303
—Examples by quotations	304
 <i>Mode 12: Conveying Ways of Entry (to the Four Truths)</i>	 351
—Examples by quotations showing how a Way of Entry to the Truths is provided <i>via</i> Faculties, Categories, Elements, Bases, and Dependent-Arising	352
 <i>Mode 13: Conveying a Clearing Up</i>	 414
—Examples by quotation showing how the subject-matter of a question must be covered by the answer	415
 <i>Mode 14: Conveying Terms of Expression</i>	 422
—Alternative terms expressing by Unity and Diversity:	
The 4 Truths	424
Path	428
Cessation	429
Form, and its constituents	430
Ignorance (nescience)	439
Science	440
Attainment	441

	PARA.
Meditator - - - - -	442
Concentration - - - - -	443
Way - - - - -	444
Body - - - - -	445
—Other alternative terms of Expression:	
Creatures, and Ideas - - - - -	446

<i>Mode 15: Conveying Requisites (in the sense of Cause and Condition)</i> - - - - -	448
—Definition of the Requisite of an Idea - - - - -	449
—Cause and Condition - - - - -	451
—Similes of the seed and the milk - - - - -	453
—Cause and condition for the Roundabout of rebirths - - - - -	454
—Causality in immediate-proximity and in remote-relation - - - - -	455
—Simile of the lamp - - - - -	456
—Continuity - - - - -	457
—Various ideas and their conditions - - - - -	458
—Formula of Dependent Arising: how any idea has for condition- <i>sine-qua-non</i> another idea, and for its cause its own individual-essence - - - - -	462
—Redefinition of a Requisite - - - - -	463

<i>Mode 16: Conveying a Coordination</i> - - - - -	465
—Coordination of all ideas that condition an idea mentioned:	
(a) By Footing - - - - -	468
(b) By Synonym - - - - -	478
(c) By Keeping in Being (i.e., what is kept in being with the Path) - - - - -	482
(d) By Abandoning (i.e., what is abandoned with its abandoning) - - - - -	484

PART IV

Chapter ii.—16 Modes of Conveying: Combined Treatment

<i>Mode 1</i> - - - - -	489
—Basic verse (1st half): Unprofitable - - - - -	491
—Exposition of basic verse as a Teaching - - - - -	492
<i>Mode 2</i> - - - - -	
—Unprofitable and profitable craving and conceit, and Investigation promoted by profitable craving, and the temporary heart-deliverance to which it leads - - - - -	505

	PARA.
—Unshakable understanding-deliverance as superior goal and Investigation promoted	509
—Investigation of concentration attained	518
—Investigation of the Noble Eight-factored Path	519
—Impermanence, pain, not-self	527
—The 3 Gateways to Liberation	528
—The 3 Categories of the Path	533
—Keeping-in-being of the Body, Virtue, Cognizance, and Understanding	535
—The 5-fold Arrival	539
—Investigation of the 10 Powers of a Perfect One	541
 <i>Mode 3.</i>	 595
—Basic verse (2nd half): Profitable	595
—Construing of the basic verse	595
 <i>Modes 4-16</i>	 596-643

PART V

Chapter iii.—Moulding of the 5 Guide-Lines	644
INTRODUCTORY	644-5
CONVERSION OF RELISHING GUIDE-LINE	646-72
<i>a. Corruption</i>	646-65
Craving-temperament and view-temperament: behaviour in corruption	646-8
(i) Corruption by self-torment and sensual-indulgence: cleansing by quiet and insight: the 4 Truths	649-51
(ii) Corruption by embodiment-view: cleansing by right-view: the 4 Truths	652-7
(iii) Corruption by annihilationist and eternalist views: cleansing by the middle way: the 4 Truths	657-61
(iv) Corruption by the 62 types of wrong-view: cleansing by the 43 ideas partaking of enlightenment, etc.: the bursting of Delusion's Net	662-5
<i>b. Cleansing</i>	666-72
Craving-temperament and view-temperament: behaviour in cleansing	666-9
The 2 Temperaments, 4 Ways, and sluggishness and keenness of the Faculties, etc.	670-1
The 4 Ways: Conclusion: Summary Verses	672

THE PLOTTING-OF-DIRECTIONS GUIDE-LINE	673-740
INTRODUCTORY	673
<i>a. Unprofit</i>	
10 tetrads all subsumable under the Perversions-tetrad - -	674
—Progressive subsumption of 10 tetrads - - - -	675
—Application to 2 types of temperament - - - -	676-85
—Progressive relationship of 10 tetrads - - - -	686-96
THE 4 DIRECTIONS: Unprofit	697
—Defilement and the 4 Temperaments - - - -	698-701
—Defilement and 3 Gateways to Liberation - - - -	702-11
—Summing up - - - -	712
<i>b. Profit</i>	
10 tetrads all subsumable under the Profitable-perceptions tetrad - - - -	713
—Progressive subsumption of 10 tetrads - - - -	714
—Progressive fulfilment of 10 tetrads - - - -	715
THE 4 DIRECTIONS: Profit (Outlet)	724
—As medicine for the 4 Temperaments - - - -	725-8
—The 10 profitable tetrads and 3 Gateways to Liberation - -	729-38
THE PLAY-OF-LIONS GUIDE-LINE	739
—Their Play: 2 sets of tetrads opposed - - - -	739
—Lions and their Play: Expression of the 4 Faculties as Faith's pasture, and non-expression of the 4 Perversions - - - -	740
—Summary verses - - - -	740
TREFOIL (with the HOOK)	741-58
(i) 4 types of persons defined by the 4 Ways - - - -	741
<i>a. Corruption:</i> 10 Unprofitable tetrads - - - -	742
<i>b. Cleansing:</i> 10 Profitable tetrads - - - -	743-4
(ii) REDUCTION of the 4 types of person to 3 as One-who-gains- knowledge-from-what-is-condensed, etc. - - - -	745
—Instruction, etc., graded to the 3 types - - - -	746-52
<i>a. Corruption:</i> 12 triads all subsumable under the 3 Roots of Unprofit - - - -	753
<i>b. Cleansing:</i> 12 triads all subsumable under the 3 Roots of Profit - - - -	754

	PARA.
(iii) REDUCTION of the 3 types of person to 2 under Craving and View - - - - -	755
<i>a. Corruption:</i> 15 dyads all subsumable under Craving and Ignorance - - - - -	756
<i>b. Cleansing:</i> 18 dyads all subsumable under Quiet and Insight - - - - -	757
—Summary verse - - - - -	758

PART VI

Chapter iv.—The Pattern of the Dispensation

FIRST GROUPING - - - - -	759
--------------------------	-----

Schedule:

- 1. Type of Thread dealing with Corruption
- 2. " " " Morality
- 3. " " " Penetration
- 4. " " " the Adept
- 5. " " " Corruption and Morality
- 6. " " " Corruption and Penetration
- 7. " " " Corruption and the Adept
- 8. " " " Corruption, Penetration and the Adept
- 9. " " " Corruption, Morality and Penetration
- 10. " " " Morality and Penetration
- 11. " " " Corruption by Craving
- 12. " " " Corruption by View
- 13. " " " Corruption by Misconduct
- 14. " " " Cleansing from Craving
- 15. " " " Cleansing from View
- 16. " " " Cleansing from Misconduct

<i>Examples by quotations</i> - - - - -	761
---	-----

<i>Discussion</i> - - - - -	855
-----------------------------	-----

SECOND GROUPING - - - - -	860
---------------------------	-----

Schedule:

- i. (a) Belonging to worlds, (b) dissociated from worlds, (c) both
- ii. (a) Expressed in terms of creatures, (b) in terms of ideas, (c) both
- iii. (a) Knowledge, (b) the knowable, (c) both
- iv. (a) Seeing, (b) keeping in being, (c) both
- v. (a) Our own statement, (b) someone else's statement, (c) both

THE GUIDE
(Nettippakaraṇa)

THE GUIDE

Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa

[A. COMPREHENSIVE SECTION]

1. [1] Wise men can know the Dispensation
Glorious of the Glorious Man,
Whom the world and world-protectors
Ever honour and revere. (1)

*

Twelve terms¹ [do represent] the Thread,²
[Whose] phrasing and [whose] meaning all
Should in both instances be known:
What is the phrasing ? What the meaning ? (2)

Sixteen conveyings³ [as] a guide⁴
[And] five guide-lines the dispensation's
Search [and] eighteen root-terms,⁵ [too],
Mahā-Kaccāna⁶ demonstrated (*Pe* 3). (3)

1/1 The '12 terms' are those in §§27-8 and 49ff. See Intro. (sect. 7b).

1/2 For this rendering of *sutta* by 'Thread' or 'Thread-of-Argument' see Intro. (sect. 8). The word is used in three ways in this work, namely as 'the Thread' in the sense of the entire ('ninefold') utterance of the Buddha, as a 'type of Thread' (e.g., as used in the last chapter), and as 'a Thread' meaning any individual discourse or part of a discourse. In this verse 'Thread' is in the first sense, indicating that the entire utterance is covered by the '6 phrasing-terms' and '6 meaning-terms', which make up the '12 terms' (see n. 1/1 above). To render this clause by 'twelve words (*are*) a Thread' would thus be grammatically quite right and semantically quite wrong.

1/3 See Intro. (sect. 8).

1/4 See Intro. for this rendering. The word '*netti*' ('guide') is to be taken here primarily as the noun rather than as a proper name, to which it is elevated in the terminal title of the work in §965.

1/5 For the '18 Root-Terms' see Intro. (sect. 7b), also n. 764/2.

1/6 *NettiA*, mentioning the existence of a reading *Kaccāyanagottaniddiṭṭhā* (a reading appearing also at *Pe* p. 3), adds 'This verse can be regarded as having been placed here, as a summary of the work's purpose, by those who recited the Guide, and similarly with the concluding phrase terminating each Mode of Conveying' (p. 10).

Conveyings investigate the Thread's
 Phrasing, three Guide-Lines the Thread's meaning;⁷
 Comprised in both these ways, a Thread
 Is called 'according to the Thread'.⁸ (4)

*

[So since] the Teaching and the Taught
 Should both be known, the order can
 Now follow here in which to test
 The Ninefold Thread-of-Argument.⁹ (5)

*

The Comprehensive Section.

1/7 The other 2 Guide-Lines, the Plotting of Directions and the Hook, deal only with phrasing (§§29-30); see Intro. (sect. 7b).

1/8 Presumably an allusion to the four Principal Appeals to Authority (§§120ff.).

1/9 'Ninefold Thread-of-Argument' refers to the classification given at, e.g., *M.* i, 133 as 'Thread-of-Argument, Song, Prose-exposition, Verse, Exclamation, Saying, Birth-Story, Wonderful and Marvellous Idea, and Answers to Questions'. These nine must not be confused with the 'nine terms' mentioned in §29.

[B. SPECIFICATION SECTION

PART 1. INDICATIVE SUBSECTION]

2. Herein, what are the sixteen Modes of Conveying (§1, vse. 3) ?
[They are sixteen modes of the Ninefold Thread as conveying:]

1. a Teaching,¹
2. an Investigation,
3. a Construing,
4. Footings,
5. Characteristics,
6. a Fourfold Array,
7. a Conversion,
8. an Analysis,
9. a Reversal,
10. Synonyms,
11. Descriptions,
12. Ways of Entry,
13. a Clearing Up,
14. Terms of Expression,
15. Requisites,
16. a Co-ordination (*Pe* 3).

[2] Here follows a paraphrasing-verse:

As Teaching, Investigation, Construing,
As Footings, and Characteristics,
Fourfold Array, and then Conversion,
Analysis, Reversal too, (1)
As Synonyms, and as Descriptions,
As Ways of Entry, Clearing Up,
Terms of Expression, Requisites,
And for sixteenth Co-ordination (cf. *Pe* 3). (2)
These Modes are the Sixteen Conveyings (cf. *Pe* 3);
[And] as to the significance [of each]

2/1 For renderings of these and remaining technical terms, see Intro.
(sect. 8).

A separate statement [follows on (§§5-20)]
 With detailed method-analysis for each one² (3)

3. Herein, what are the five Guide-Lines (§1, vse. 3) ? [They are:]

1. the Conversion of Relishing,
2. the Trefoil,¹
3. the Lions' Play;
4. the Plotting of Directions,
5. the Hook (*Pe* 3).

Here follows a paraphrasing-verse:²

Conversion of Relishing comes first,
 In second place the Trefoil follows,³
 The Lions' Play is the name they give
 To the Third Guide-Line formula; (1)
 The fourth Guide-Line most rare they call
 The Plotting of Directions, then
 The Hook is what the fifth is termed:
 That is how all five Guide-Lines go (cf. *Pe* 4). (2)

4. Herein, what are the eighteen Root-Terms (§1, vse. 3) ? They are the nine profitable Root-Terms and nine unprofitable Root-Terms.

Herein, what are the nine unprofitable Root-Terms ? [They are:]

Craving,
 Ignorance;
 Greed,

2/2 *NettiA* says that this verse (the last 2 lines in the Pali) was not in all MSS. (It is not in the *Pe*.) That it might be a later addition seems very probable from its confusing use of the words *attha* and *naya*, which respectively allude here neither to the 6 *atthapada* (opposed to the 6 *byañjanapada*—§§27-8) nor to the 5 *naya* (§§21-5), but quite loosely to the individual *significance* of the 16 Modes, themselves restricted to dealing with *byañjana*, not *attha*, and to the detailed *method* of their separate exposition (§§5-20). Such inconsistent use of prominent technical terms is unlike the rest of the work. Here *NettiA* glosses *naya-vibhatti* with *upāyena vibhāgo* (also *vibhatti* here does not allude to the *vibhatti-hāra*). It glosses the anomalous *vitthāratayā* (metri causa for *vitthāratāya*?) with *vitthārena* and rejects a reading of *vitthāra-nayā* as bad.

3/1 See Intro. (sects. 7b and 8).

3/2 This must be the meaning of *anugīti*; not in *PED*, see *CPD*. *NettiA* glosses with *sangaha-gāthā* (p. 19); see Index; also *Pe* p. 87.

3/3 The order is only that of enumeration. See ch. iii, and *Pe* ch. viii.

Hate,
 Delusion;
 Perception of Beauty,
 Perception of Pleasure,
 Perception of Permanence,
 Perception of Self (cf. *Pe* 4).

These are the nine unprofitable Root-Terms, wherein all that belongs to the unprofitable side is comprised and collated.

Herein, what are the nine profitable Root-Terms? [They are:]

Quiet,
 Insight;
 Non-greed,
 Non-hate,
 Non-delusion;
 Perception of Ugliness,
 Perception of Pain,
 Perception of Impermanence,
 Perception of Not-self (cf. *Pe* 4).

These are the nine profitable Root-Terms, wherein all that belongs to the profitable side is comprised and collated.

Here is a mnemonic for it:

The nine terms Craving and Ignorance
 And Greed, Hate and Delusion too
 And with Perversions four besides
 Do constitute defilement's plane. (1)
 [3] The nine terms Quiet and then Insight
 With the three Profitable Roots
 And Mindfulness-Foundations four¹
 Do constitute the faculties' plane. (2)
 With nine terms on the side of profit
 And nine terms on unprofit's side
 Construed, these Root-Terms [thus] do come
 [In all] to number eighteen terms (cf. *Pe* 4). (3)

*

The Indicative Subsection.

4/1 The use of the term 'four foundations of mindfulness' (*cattāro satipaṭṭhānā*) to refer to the four objects of undistorted perception (*vipallāsa-vatthūni*) is unusual. (Cf. *Pe* 185).

[PART 2. DEMONSTRATIVE SUBSECTION]

5. Here is a summary statement of the guide.

[*The 16 Modes of Conveying*]

Gratification, Disappointment,
Escape, Fruit, Means, the Blessed One's
Injunction to devotees,¹ this Mode
Is the Conveying of a Teaching (cf. *Pe* 81, ll. 4-6). (1)

6. What in the Thread is asked and answered,
As well as a verse-paraphrase,
And the Thread's [term-] investigation:¹
This Mode Conveys Investigation (cf. *Pe* 82). (2)

7. Looking for right and wrong construing
In the case of all the Conveyings'
Plane and resort¹ [will] demonstrate
The Mode Conveying a Construing (cf. *Pe* 88, ll. 3-4). (3)

8. The Victor teaching an idea
Teaches what that idea has too
As footing; so with each idea:
This is the Mode Conveying Footings (*Pe* 89, ll. 8-9). (4)

9. When one idea is mentioned, all
Ideas of like characteristic¹
Are mentioned too: this constitutes
The Mode Conveying Characteristics (cf. *Pe* 90). (5)

5/1 These six words (for the first three see, e.g., *A.* i, 258; *M.* iii, 18; *S.* v, 193) must be taken not as the characteristics distinguishing this Mode but as a general presentation of the Teaching, like 4 Truths, with which they are made to correspond in §48. They do not appear in ch. ii, §§489ff. In the *Pe* they appear instead in one of the Groupings of its ch. ii (*Sāsanapaṭṭhāna*), not in the Modes.

6/1 All texts read *pavicayo*, but *NettiA* (p. 19) takes this to represent *pada-vicayo* and refers to the words '*padam vicinati*' (§62; *PTS Netti* p. 10); cf. treatment of this Mode at *PTS Netti* pp. 252 and 259 and *MAA.* i, 127-8 (reproduced here in Appx.).

7/1 *NettiA* here explains *plane* to mean 'phrasing' and *resort* 'meaning'.

9/1 *Tena* instead of *keci* both at *MA.* i, 31 (where quoted) and *Pe* 90.

10. By way of phrasing,¹ (i) the Linguistic,²
 (ii) The Purport, and (iii) the teaching's Source,
 And (iv) the Consecutive-Sequence:
 This Mode Conveys a Fourfold Array (cf. *Pe* 91). (6)
11. The Mode that, when there is one Footing,
 Searches for a footing that remains
 And then Converts the opposites
 Is that Conveying a Conversion (*Pe* 93). (7)
12. It analyses idea, footing,
 Plane [of types of men], the shared
 And unshared: this Mode should be known
 As that Conveying Analysis.¹ (8)
13. That into opposites reversing
 Ideas of profit and unprofit
 Shown to be kept in being and left
 Is called the Mode Conveying Reversal. (9)
14. [4] Knower of Threads is he that knows
 How many synonyms for one
 Idea are in the Thread: this Mode
 Is that Conveying Synonyms (cf. *Pe* 96). (10)
15. The Blessed One one idea teaches
 By means of manifold descriptions;
 This mood can thus be known to be
 The Mode that does Convey Descriptions. (11)
16. Dependent-Rising, Faculties,
 Categories, Elements, Bases:
 The Mode that by these means gives entry
 Is that Conveying Ways of Entry. (12)

10/1 For *byañjanam* here as nom. standing for instr., see restatement in §184 (*PTS Netti* p. 32). For this, *nirutti*, and *pubbāpara-* ('consecutive-sequence') see *A.* iii. 201.

10/2 '*Nirutta*—linguistic': strengthened form fm. *nirutti* ('language'—there is no need to look for any less homely term). Both forms appear together in §185. See also n. 186/1.

12/1 The terms *vibhatti* ('analysis' here), *vibhanga* ('separate'—title above §31) and *vibhāga* ('specification'—title above §2) must not be confused.

17. Seeking if in a question answered
What in the verse did instigate
Its asking is cleared up or not:
This Mode Conveys a Clearing Up. (13)
18. Ideas when demonstrated by
[Both] unity and diversity,
Need thereby suffer no disjunction:¹
This Mode Conveys Expression's Terms. (14)
19. Ideas that generate each an idea
In due relation are conditions;
And by its picking out¹ the cause
This Mode Conveys the Requisite (cf. *Pe* 104). (15)
20. Ideas with those whose roots they are,
And those shown by the Sage to have
One meaning, should be co-ordinated:
This Mode conveys Co-ordination (cf. *Pe* 110). (16)

*

[The 5 Guide-Lines]

21. The Guide-Line Craving and Ignorance guiding
By Quiet and Insight, and construing
Appropriately the four Truths
Is the Conversion of Relishing (cf. *Pe* 259). (17)
22. Guiding [ideas of] profit and
Unprofit by their [triple] roots
As they are, really, not unreally,
That Guide-Line they call the Trefoil (cf. *Pe* 259). (18)

18/1 The word *vikappa* is the grammarians' term for the disjunctive particle *vā* ('or') as *sampinḍana* is for the conjunction *ca* ('and').

19/1 '*Avakaddhayitvā*—by picking out' : lit. 'drawing down'. Though *PED* gives this ref., it only gives a Jātaka-translation meaning, which does not fit here. *CPD*'s 'to extract from a text' is based on *Netti.A*'s '*suttato niddhāritvā*'; but that is too literal. Cf. *apakaḍḍhati* at *Pe* 74f. (not in *PED* or *CPD*, apparently meaning 'to reserve'). What is meant here is 'picking out' the single 'cause' from among the plurality of 'conditions'.

23. The wise in Guide-Lines have called that
Lions' Play which by the faculties¹
Does faith's true objects² guide, and also
By the perversions the defilements (cf. *Pe* 259). (19)
24. What mentally plots out¹ [ideas
of] profit and unprofit stated
Or here or there in expositions
They call the Plotting of Directions (cf. *Pe* 259). (20)
25. After [thus] plotting with the Plotting
Of Directions, what then throws up
All profit [ideas] and unprofit
And guides them in is called the Hook (cf. *Pe* 259). (21)

*

[How the Modes of Conveying and the Guide-Lines are Employed]

26. Sixteen Conveyings first, surveying
With Plotting then of the Directions,
And having collected with the Hook,
Three Guide-Lines¹ demonstrate a Thread. (22)
27. (i) The Letter, (ii) the Term, and then (iii) the Phrasing,
Also (iv) the Linguistic [inflexion],
(v) the Demonstration, and (vi) the Mood
As sixth: this much concerns the phrasing. (23)
28. [5] (vii) Explaining, (viii) Displaying, and (ix) Divulging,
(x) Analysing, (xi) Exhibiting, (xii) Describing:
By these six terms are demonstrated
A meaning and an action¹ too. (24)

23/1 The 'faculties' here are those of faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and understanding. But what is meant here is the blunt-keen classification of these by temperament in this Guide-Line (see §§645ff. and also 947).

23/2 *Saddhamma* (here rendered 'faith's true object'—Skr. *saddharma*) can be taken as gdve. of *saddahati* ('to have faith', 'to place faith in'), which serves in Pali as vb. for *saddhā* ('faith'—Skr. *śraddhā*). What is referred to here is the four undistorted perceptions beginning with perception of impermanence.

24/1 '*Olokayate*—plots out': lit. 'surveys', 'looks down over'.

26/1 The Reversal of Relishing, the Play of Lions, and the Trefoil.

28/1 *NettiA* says the 'meaning' (*attha*) here is that of a Thread, while the 'action' (*kamma*) is that of condensing (*ugghatanā*), etc., see §§41-7.

29. The Blessed One's Utterance's meaning
 Yokes nine terms for its meaning, namely:
 The [first] three Guide-Lines, dropping none (§§21-3),
 And meaning-words that number six (§28). (25)
30. For meaning nine terms (§29), twenty-four
 For searching of the phrasing, too,¹
 These come in all to thirty-three,
 And that much constitutes the guide. (26)

*

The Demonstrative Subsection.

30/1 The arithmetic is this: 9 terms for the meaning (§28) + 24 for the phrasing (made up of the 16 Modes (§§5-20) + 6 phrasing-terms (§27) + the last 2 Guide-Lines (§§24-5)): $9 + 24 = 33$.

[PART 3. COUNTER-DEMONSTRATIVE SUBSECTION

Chapter i

16 Modes of Conveying: Separate Treatment]

1

The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying a Teaching

31. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Teaching? The Mode of Conveying a Teaching is [summarized] in the following verse:

‘Gratification, Disappointment,
Escape, Fruit, Means, the Blessed One’s
Command to Devotees: this Mode
Is the Conveying of a Teaching’ (§5).
[*The act-of-teaching and what-is-taught*]

32. What does it teach? [It teaches as follows:]

[In the aspects of] gratification, disappointment, escape, fruit, means, and injunction,¹ <Bhikkhus, I shall teach you a True Idea that is good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, with its own meaning and its own phrasing; I shall display a Divine Life that is entirely perfect and pure> (M. i, 280).

33. Herein, what is the *gratification*?

<When a mortal desires, if his desire is fulfilled,
He is sure to be happy by getting what he wants>

This is the gratification.

(Pe 45; Sn. 766).

34. Herein, what is the *disappointment*?

[6]<Desire-born and wilful, if his desires elude him,
He becomes as deformed as if pierced by a barb> (Sn. 767).

This is the disappointment.

32/1 For these six terms see n. 5/1. Here all six words (*assādam . . . ānattim*) are in the accusative and in apposition to the word *dharmam* (‘a True Idea’) in the quotation that follows. They are all governed by the verb *desissāmi* (‘I shall teach’) in the quotation. For a further exercise in the six see Pe 43-8.

35. Herein, what is the *escape* ?

*<He that shuns desires, as a snake's head with his foot,
And is mindful evades this attachment to the world>*

This is the escape.

(Pe 46; Sn. 768).

36. Herein, what is the *gratification* ?

*<Fields, gardens and money, cattle and horses, bondsmen and men,
Women and kin: many are the desires that a man wants>*

This is the gratification.

(Sn. 769).

36a. Herein, what is the *disappointment* ?

*<Impotent-seeming troubles overwhelm and crush him;
Then pain invades him, as water a broken boat> (Sn. 770).*

This is the disappointment.

36b. Herein, what is the *escape* ?

*<So let a man be mindful ever in shunning sense-desires;
Let him abandon them and cross over the flood> (Sn. 771).*

This is the escape.

37. Herein, what is the *fruit* ?

*<The True Ideal guards him that walks therein,
As does a big umbrella in time of rain.
The Ideal's reward when walked in right is this:
Who walks therein has no bad destination>*

This is the fruit.

(Pe 44; cf. Thag. 303).

38. Herein, what is the *means* ?

*< Impermanent are all determinations, . . .
And painful too are all determinations, . . .
[And then besides] not-self are all ideas:
And so when he sees thus with understanding,
He then dispassion finds in suffering;
This path it is that leads to purification> (Pe 44; Dh. 277-9).*

This is the means.

39. [7] Herein, what is the *injunction* ?

*<Just as a man with good sight journeying
Would give wide berth to places of known danger,
So too here in this world of animation
Let wise men give wide berth to evil things> (Ud. 50).*

This is the injunction.

40. <Look upon the world as void, Mogharāja,> is the injunction.
 <Constantly mindful> is the means.
 <With self-view extirpated thus, You may outstrip Mortality> is the fruit (Pe 45; Sn. 1119).

*

[How it is taught]

41. Herein, the Blessed One teaches *escape* to a person who gains knowledge by what is condensed,¹ he teaches *disappointment* and *escape* to a person who gains knowledge by what is expanded,² he teaches *gratification*, *disappointment*, and *escape*, to a person who is guidable.
42. Herein, there are four ways and four [types of] persons. One of craving-temperament¹ who is dull finds the outlet, by way of the foundations of mindfulness as support and with the mindfulness faculty, on the way that is painful with sluggish acquaintanceship. One of craving-temperament who is intelligent² finds the outlet, by way of the [four] meditations as support and with the concentration faculty, on the way that is painful with swift acquaintanceship.³

41/1 'Ugghaṭita—condensed': see A. ii, 135; Pug. 41. It is questionable whether any of the meanings given in PED are right for any context, all of which seem to derive from the A. ref. Here the meaning is as rendered, as this context clearly shows. For the corresponding verb *ugghaṭeti* see n. 54/1. The term is also explained at Pug. 41. The etymology needs overhauling.

41/2 'Vipaṇcita—expanded': the same remarks apply here as in the note above on *ugghaṭita*. PED's 'unillusioned understanding, clear-minded, unprejudiced' is quite off the mark. The point is that while the *ugghaṭitaññū* only needs a condensed (*ugghaṭita*) statement to gain knowledge (*aññā*) of the 4 Truths, the *vipaṇcitaññū* needs an expanded (*vipaṇcita*) statement for the same purpose. He is therefore slower-witted than the other. The 'guidable' (*neyya*), while still slower-witted, is yet able to follow guidance. This applies to A. ii, 135. And *vipaṇcanā* (§55) does not mean 'passing a sentence' as in PED but the 'act of expanding a condensed statement' (as is done in, say, M. Sutta 18). Similarly the derivatives *vipaṇcayati* (§54) and *vipaṇciyanta* (§56). This term is also explained at Pug. 41.

42/1 'Tanhā—craving': this is the usual rendering and will do. The word corresponds to the Skr. *trṣṇā* 'thirst', but is never used for 'thirst', which is *pipāsa*. 'Need' would be a better rendering, perhaps.

42/2 'Udatt(h)a—intelligent': *NettiA* and *C* spell *udattha* and *NettiA* glosses 'uda-attho; ulāra-pañño ti attho' (p. 43). *Ba* and *Bb* support *PTS*. For the meaning PED (*Netti* refs. only) gives 'elevated, high, lofty, clever', but it is simply the opposite of *manda* ('dull') here.

42/3 'Abhiññā—acquaintance': the word (subst. fm. vb. *abhiñāti*) has 3 principal meanings: (1) direct acquaintance by personal experience, (2)

One of view-temperament who is dull finds the outlet, by way of the right endeavours as support and with the energy faculty, on the way that is pleasant with sluggish acquaintanceship. One of view-temperament who is intelligent finds the outlet, by way of the truths as support and with the understanding faculty, on the way that is pleasant with swift acquaintanceship.

43. Both kinds of craving-temperament find the outlet, by way of insight heralded by quiet,¹ to the heart-deliverance due to the fading of lust. Both kinds of view-temperament find the outlet, by way of quiet heralded by insight, to the understanding-deliverance due to the fading of ignorance.²

44. Herein, those who find the outlet (cf. §§529ff.) by the ways heralded by quiet can be brought to abandoning¹ by means of the Conversion-of-Relishing Guide-Line (§§644-72), while those who find the outlet by the ways heralded by insight can be brought to abandoning by means of the Lions'-Play Guide-Line (§§673-757).

[How it is apprehended]

45. [8] Where does this Mode of Conveying actually come into being? When the Master, or some respected companion in the Divine Life, teaches the True Idea to someone, then that someone, on hearing that True Idea, acquires faith.

46. Herein, inquiry, interest, estimating, scrutiny, is understanding consisting in what is heard (see *D.* iii, 219). Suchlike inquiry, estimating, scrutiny, mental looking-over, with what has been heard as the support, is understanding consisting in cogitation. Know-

acquaintance by book-knowledge or by hearing from someone else, 'learning by heart', which is equivalent to 'understanding consisting in what is heard' (§46), and (3) 6 kinds of *abhiññā* or 5 supernormal-powers belonging to worlds and 1 knowledge-of-exhaustion-of-taints dissociated from worlds, together called the *chalabhiññā*. Here the meaning is in the senses of (2) or (3).

43/1 The allusion is to *A.* ii, 157. 'Quiet' (*samatha*) is a synonym for 'concentration' (*samādhi*).

43/2 *Avijjā*—here 'ignorance'—could be well rendered here by 'nescience' as the derivative-opposite of *vijjā* (rendered here by 'science'). *Avijjā* is technically 'ignorance' of the 4 Truths, while *vijjā* has the meanings of (1) loosely any body of knowledge or 'science' (in the old sense) and (2) technically the 'triple science' (*tivijjā*), as Recollection of Past Life (*pubbenivāsānussati*), the Heavenly Eye (*dibba-cakkhu*), and Knowledge of Exhaustion of Taints (*āsava-kkhaya-ñāṇa*).

44/1 '*Hātabba*—can be brought to abandoning': $\sqrt{hā}$ to abandon (?). *NettiA* says '*Yametabbā; netabbā ti attho*'; see n. 181/1.

ledge that, in one associating his attention with these two kinds of understanding, arises on the plane of seeing or on the plane of keeping-in-being,¹ is understanding consisting in keeping-in-being. [Now] understanding consisting in what is heard [arises] from another's utterance. Understanding consisting in cogitation [arises] from reasoned attention² moulded³ for oneself. Understanding consisting in keeping-in-being is knowledge that arises by means of another's utterance and by means of reasoned attention moulded for oneself⁴ (cf. *Pe* 233).

47. He in whom there are the two kinds of understanding, namely that consisting in what is heard and that consisting in cogitation, is one who gains knowledge by what is condensed. He is whom there is understanding consisting in what is heard but no understanding consisting in cogitation is one who gains knowledge by what is expanded. He in whom there is neither understanding consisting in what is heard nor understanding consisting in cogitation is guidable (cf. *Pe* 30).

[The Teaching as presentation of the Four Truths]

48. What does the teaching of the True Idea teach? The Four Truths, namely Suffering, Origin, Cessation, and the Path.

Disappointment and *fruit* are suffering; *gratification* is origin; *escape* is cessation; *means* and *injunction* are the path (cf. §32). These are the Four Truths.

46/1 'Seeing' (*dassana*) as a technical term means the 1st path, at which moment *nibbāna* is first 'seen'. 'Keeping in being' (*bhāvanā*—caus. subst. fm. \sqrt{bhu} to be) is the corresponding technical term for the remaining three paths, which 'keep that vision of *nibbāna* in being' by repeating it. This latter word has thus an important ontological significance.

46/2 '*Yoniso manasikāra*—reasoned attention'. *Yoni* (lit. 'womb') is figuratively used for the 'reason' from which an idea is 'born', i.e., a condition-*sine-qua-non* (*paccaya*), see *M.* iii, 142. *Manasi-kāra* means what it says, namely 'doing in the mind'. It is always necessarily present. *Yoniso manasikāra* ('reasoned attention') as a technical term means thinking in terms of the specific conditionality of existence. The classic example is given at *S.* ii, 105f.; the opposite, *ayoniso manasikāra*, is any train of thought which ignores that specifically conditioned structure of existence (see *M.* i, 7), and which results in the formation of wrong views and the consequent production of suffering. It is not to be confused with temporal ('historical') causality.

46/3 'Moulded for oneself' refers primarily to the original thinking by 'reasoned attention' described at *S.* ii, 105f.

46/4 Cf. *Pe* 1-2.

49. [Now] this is the Wheel of the True Idea, according as the Blessed One said:

‘*This is suffering*’: At Benares, bhikkhus, in the Deer Park at Isipatana, the matchless Wheel of the True Idea was thus set rolling by me not to be stopped by monk¹ or divine² or god or Māra or Divinity or anyone in the world . . . > and the whole ‘Wheel-of-the-True-Idea’ [Discourse should be quoted] (cf. S. v, 424).

Herein, there are terms of ungauged measure, letters of ungauged measure (cf. A. ii, 182), phrases, moods, linguistics and demonstrations of ungauged measure (cf. §27) but there is an explaining, displaying, divulging, analysing, exhibiting, and describing (cf. §28), of that very meaning [in the ninefold Thread] (see Pe 5). This is the Noble Truth of Suffering.

50. ‘*This is the origin of suffering*’: At Benares, bhikkhus, in the Deer Park at Isipatana, the matchless Wheel of the True Idea was set rolling by me . . . > . . .

51. [9] ‘*This is the cessation of suffering*’: At Benares, bhikkhus, . . . > . . .

52. ‘*This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering*’: At Benares, bhikkhus, in the Deer Park at Isipatana, the matchless Wheel of the True Idea was thus set rolling by me not to be stopped by monk or divine or god or Māra or Divinity or anyone in the world > (cf. S. v, 424).

Herein, there are terms of ungauged measure, letters of ungauged measure, phrases, moods, linguistics, and demonstrations of ungauged measure, but there is an explaining, displaying, divulging, analysing, exhibiting, and describing, of that very meaning [in the ninefold Thread]. This is the Noble Truth of the Way Leading to the Cessation of Suffering.

49/1 There is no adequate translation of *samaṇa*. At M.A. i, 113 it is defined as ‘anyone who has gone forth from the house-life’ and is further explained at M.A. ii, 201.

49/2 The three Pali words *brahma* (‘divine’ as in *brahma-vihāra* = ‘divine abiding’, *brahmacariya* = ‘divine life’, *brahmayāna* = ‘divine vehicle’ S. v, 4), *brahmā* (‘High Divinity’), and *brāhmaṇa* (a ‘divine’, a ‘priestly divine’, the ‘priestly-divine caste’, ‘of the divine caste’) are all closely related etymologically and semantically. There are frequent plays on these words, and each is always shadowed by the meanings of the others. *Brahma* (adj.) signifies the *quality* of perfection of the *Brahmā* God, and the *Brāhmaṇa* Caste claims to derive its origins from *Brahmā* regarded as the Creator.

[How the Teaching is variously presented]

53. Herein, the Blessed One explains by letters, displays by terms, divulges by phrases, analyses by moods, exhibits by linguistics, and describes by demonstrations.

54. Herein, the Blessed One condenses¹ by letters and terms, he expands² by phrases and moods, he details by linguistics and demonstrations.

55. Herein, condensing¹ is the beginning, expanding² is the middle, and detailing is the end (see §32).

56. This True Idea and Outguiding (Discipline), when it is condensed,¹ guides out (disciplines) the [type of] person who gains knowledge by what is condensed; hence 'good in the beginning' is said (§32). When expanded it guides out (disciplines) the [type of] person who gains knowledge by what is expanded; hence 'good in the middle' is said (§32). When detailed it guides out (disciplines) the [type of] person who is guidable; hence 'good in the end' is said (§32).

57. Herein, six terms [concern] the meaning, namely *explaining, displaying, divulging, analysing, exhibiting, and describing* (§28); these six terms concern the meaning. [And] six terms [concern] the phrasing, namely *letter, term, phrase, mood, linguistic, and demonstration* (§27); these six terms [concern] the phrasing. That is why the Blessed One said <*Bhikkhus, I shall teach you a True Idea that is good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, with its own meaning and its own phrasing; I shall display a Divine Life that is entirely perfect and pure*> (§32).

58. [10] 'Entirely':¹ disjoined from worlds, not mixed with world

54/1 'Ugghaṭeti—to condense': (see n. 41/1) the meaning 'to open, to reveal' given in *PTS Netti* Index and quoted in *PED* is incorrect. Perhaps confused there with the 'removal' (ugghāṭi) of the '*kasīṇa*' as described at *Vis.* 113 and 327.

54/2 'Vipaṇcayati—to expand' (i.e., expand a condensed meaning): see n. 41/2.

55/1 'Ugghaṭanā—(act of) condensing': not in *PED*.

55/2 'Vipaṇcanā—(act of) expanding' (i.e., expanding a condensed statement): see n. 41/2.

56/1 *Ugghaṭiyanto, vipaṇciyanto, and vitthāriyanto*, are not denominatives as stated in *PTS Netti* Index, but present participles of the passive voice.

58/1 This paragraph simply takes up and explains, for completeness' sake, the final clause of the quotation (§32) which forms the basis of this Mode of Conveying, and which has so far not been dealt with. There is no reason for printing it in small type as is done in *PTS*.

ideas. 'Perfect': perfected, with nothing lacking and nothing superfluous. 'Pure': immaculate, with all stains removed, established [as fit] for all [kinds of] distinctions.

59. <This is called 'a Perfect One's footprint' and 'something used by a Perfect One' and 'something marked by a Perfect One'>¹ (M. i, 182). With that this Divine Life is evident. That is why the Blessed One said 'I shall display a Divine Life that is entirely perfect and pure'.

[For whom the Teaching is intended]

60. For whom is this teaching of the True Idea? For devotees.

This is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'Gratification, Disappointment,
Escape, Fruit, Means, the Blessed One's
Command to devotees; this Mode
Is the Conveying of a Teaching' (§5).

The Mode of Conveying a Teaching is ended.

*

2

[The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying an Investigation]

61. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying an Investigation? The Mode of Conveying an Investigation is [summarized] in the following verse:

'What in the Thread is asked and answered,
As well as a verse-paraphrase,
And the Thread's term-investigation:
This Mode Conveys Investigation' (§6).

62. What does it investigate? It investigates:

- (1) term, question, answer, consecutivity (§§63-115);¹
- (2) gratification, disappointment, escape; fruit, means, injunction (Mode 1);

59/1 *Tathāgatārañjitaṃ* (so read) = *tathāgata + ārañjita*; see M. i, 178 for original simile.

62/1 *NettiA* (p. 52) explains that *investigation* covers the grammatical aspect of words, whether or not the expression is in the form of a question (or an answer, or how the answer is consecutive upon the question answered), and also the six headings given at the beginning of the first Mode of Conveying, and also the paraphrasing-verse if any. 'Ettha anurūpaṃ gīti "anugīti" ti ayam pi attho icchito' (p. 52).

(3) paraphrasing-verse (§116);

(4) all that is in the ninefold Thread-of-Argument (§117).

How would that be ?

[(1) *Term, Question, Answer, Consecutivity*]

63. It would be [firstly] according to the venerable Ajita's question asked of the Blessed One in the *Pārāyana* [Chapter of the *Sutta-nipāta*]:

<[Tell] what is the world shut in¹ by'

So said the venerable Ajita

'And whereby is it not displayed?

And what is it besmeared with? Say.

And what will be its greatest fear?>

(Sn. 1032; Pe 82).

64. These four terms asked are one question.¹ Why? Because of their comprising a single thing. [11] For in asking thus '[Tell] *what is the world shut in by?*' he asks [the question] expressed in terms of the world, [in asking] '*And wherefore is it not displayed?*' he asks about the world's undisplayedness, [in asking] '*And what is*

63/1 '*Nivuta*—shut in' and '*nivaraṇa*—hindrance' have to be understood not so much in the sense of a head-on blockage but rather as, say, the fences that shut traffic in on a road, or embankments of a river, which prevent lateral escape. See §§66 and 499.

64/1 Read *Imāni cattāri padāni pucchitāni, so eko pañho* as one sentence. This exemplifies a rule (not invariably followed, see e.g., Pe 117) governing demonstrative and relative pronouns where two nouns of different gender, number or case, one or each with a demonstrative pronoun, are joined by predication in apposition. In this instance the masc. sing. *so*, though referring back in meaning to the neut. pl. *cattāri padāni*, must agree in gender, number and case with the second subst., here the masc. sing. *pañho*, predicated of the first (here by the copula *hoti* understood). Further examples will be found below (PTS pp. 28, 42, 86: see n. 469/1), and in other books, e.g., '*Aniccā bhikkhave KĀMĀ tucchā musā moghadhammā, māyākatam ETAM bhikkhave BĀLĀLAPANAM* (M. ii, 261), where the neut. sing. *etaṃ* refers in meaning back to the masc. pl. *kāmā*, but agrees in number, gender and case with *bālālapanam*, the copula *hoti* being understood ('Impermanent, bhikkhus, (are) sensual desires and empty and false and inseparable from the idea of vanity, they (are) fools' talk made up of deceit'). Failure to recognize this rule when applied can lead to much confusion of meaning and mispunctuation of unpunctuated MSS.

it besmeared with ? Say' he asks about the world's besmearedness, [and in asking] '*And what will be its greatest fear ?*' he asks about that same world's greatest fear.

The world² is of three kinds: world of defilement, world of being (existence), and world of faculties.

65. Herein, the answer is this:

<By ignorance is the world shut in,

Ajita' the Blessed One said.

'Tis undisplayed through miswishing¹ and neglect,

And hankering smears it, I say;

Suffering is its greatest fear>

(Sn. 1033; Pe 13, 83).

66. Those four terms are answered by these four terms: the first by the first, the second by the second, the third by the third, and the fourth by the fourth.

'By ignorance is the world shut in' is the answer to '[Tell] what is the world shut in by?'. The world is shut in by hindrances; for all creatures have ignorance as their [in-shutting] hindrance, according as the Blessed One said <*Bhikkhus, I say that, relatively speaking,¹ all creatures, all breathing things, all beings, have one hindrance only, that is to say, ignorance; for all creatures have ignorance as hindrance. And bhikkhus, it is with the entire cessation of ignorance, with giving it up and relinquishing it, that creatures have no more hindrance, I say*> (). By this the answer to the first term is appropriately construed.

67. [And again] '*Tis undisplayed through miswishing and neglect*' is the answer to '*And wherefore is it undisplayed ?*'. When a person

64/2 The word *loka* ('world') is used in various senses, among which may be distinguished particularly also (1) the world of other people and things (e.g., *M.* iii, 120), which is the 'triple element' (§§80, 353), (2) this body (e.g., *S.* i, 62; iv, 52), and so on. Ten definitions are given at *Ps.* i, 122, while at *Vts.* 204 there is another threefold definition. As used here 'world' corresponds more or less to 'universe'.

65/1 '*Vivicchā*—miswishing': *Nd2* (Burm. ed., p. 13) glosses by *macchariya*. It seems doubtful if it is a desiderative of $\sqrt{\text{vid}}$ as suggested by *PTS* *Netti* Index and *PED*. See n. 67/1. *NettiA* (p. 54) says '*Vivicchā ti vicikicchā-hetti vivicchāmacchariyan ti Sangahe vuttam*'. Cf. *veviccham* at *Pug.* 19, etc.

66/1 '*Pariyāyato*—relatively speaking' is here glossed by *kāraṇato* ('as to reason') in *NettiA*.

is shut in by hindrances, he miswishes (*vivicchati*),¹ and 'miswishing' (*vivicchā*)¹ is what uncertainty (*vicikicchā*) is called. When he is uncertain (*vicikicchanto*) he does not settle his faith. When he does not settle his faith he does not instigate energy for the abandoning of unprofitable ideas [and] for the verification of profitable ideas. Here he abides devoted to negligence. When he is negligent he does not arouse ideas that belong to the white [side].² Not being aroused, they are not displayed to him, according as the Blessed One said:

*<The True are from afar displayed,
As Himalaya's Mountain is;
But the untrue are seen not here,
Like arrows in the night let fly> (Dh. 304).
<They are displayed by qualities,
By reputation and by fame> ().*

[12] By this the answer to the second term is appropriately construed.

68. 'And hankering smears it, I say' is the answer to 'And what is it besmeared with? Say'. 'Hankering' so named is what craving is called. How does that besmear? In the way stated by the Blessed One:

*<Who lusts no meaning ever knows,
Who lusts sees never an idea,
The mark of darkness laps a man
When he will suffer lust to be> (cf. A. iv, 96).*

This craving, in a person greatly clutching [at existence] taken thus as great hankering, is that wherein the world comes to be 'besmeared'. By this the answer to the third term is appropriately construed.

69. [And lastly] 'Suffering is its greatest fear' is the answer to 'And what will be its greatest fear?'. Suffering is of two kinds: bodily and mental. The bodily kind is pain, while the mental kind is grief. All creatures are sensitive to suffering. Since there is no fear equal to [that of] suffering, how could there be any greater? There are three kinds of painfulness: painfulness as [bodily] pain, painfulness in change, and painfulness in determinations (see *D.* iii, 216).¹

67/1 'Vivicchati—to miswish': see n. 65/1; this is simply a vb. formed here from the subst. in the *Sn.* verse.

67/2 Read *sukke dhamme*, cf. *Pe* 95 (*sukkādamā*) and 131 (*sukkapakkho*).

69/1 Cf. *Pe* 19-20.

Herein, the world is, at one time or another, limitedly free from painfulness as [bodily] pain, and likewise from painfulness in change. Why is that? Because there are those in the world who have little sickness and are long-lived. But only the element of extinction without trace left liberates from the painfulness in determinations. That is why '*Suffering is its greatest fear*', taking it that painfulness in determinations is the world's [inherent liability to] suffering. By this the answer to the fourth term is appropriately construed.

That is why the Blessed One said '*By ignorance is the world shut in . . .*' (§65).

*

70. <'The streams keep streaming everywhere'

So said the venerable Ajita.

'What is it that shuts off the streams?

Tell then, what is restraint of streams,

Whereby it is that streams are sealed'>

(Sn. 1034; Pe 83).¹

71. [13] These four terms asked are two questions (see §126). Why? Because here [the question] is asked with a plurality of designations. With the world proceeding in this way, with the world thus defiled, what is (1) its cleansing and (2) its emergence?

72. Accordingly he said '*The streams keep streaming everywhere*': when someone is unconcentrated and much given to covetousness, ill-will, and negligence, they keep streaming in him. Herein, 'covetousness' is the unprofitable root consisting in greed, 'ill-will' is the unprofitable root consisting in hate, and 'negligence' is the unprofitable root consisting in delusion. When someone is unconcentrated, craving keeps streaming in his six bases: craving for forms, craving for sounds, craving for odours, craving for flavours, craving for tangibles, and craving for ideas; according as the Blessed One said: <'It keeps streaming', *bhikkhus*: this is a designation for the six bases in oneself. The eye keeps streaming to agreeable forms and resisting¹ disagreeable forms. The ear . . . nose . . . tongue . . . body . . .

70/1 A later verse in this same Sutta is discussed at S. ii, 47f.; the untraced quotation in §72 looks like part of a similar discussion.

72/1 '*Paṭihaññati*—keeps resisting': this serves here as verb for the subst. *paṭigha* ('resistance'); see also §75. Not in PED, but see there under *paṭihanti*, also *appaṭihata* ('unresisted') and *paṭighāta* ('resistance') in §96.

The mind keeps streaming to agreeable ideas and resisting disagreeable ideas > (). So it keeps streaming on in all ways² and in all manners. That is why he said *'The streams keep streaming everywhere'*.

73. [With the words] *'What is it that shuts off the streams ?'* he asks about deterrence of obsession. This is cleansing. [With the words] *'Tell then, what is restraint of streams, Whereby it is that streams are sealed'* he asks about eradication of underlying-tendencies. This is emergence (see §71).

74. Here are the answers:

<'Whatever streams are in the world,
Ajita' the Blessed One said,
They are shut off by mindfulness;
The streams' restraint I tell, whereby
They can be sealed, is understanding'>

(Sn. 1035; Pe 17, 84).

75. <*When mindfulness occupied with the body is kept in being and made much of, the eye is not attracted¹ among agreeable forms, and is unresistant among disagreeable forms. The ear . . . nose . . . tongue . . . body . . . The mind is not attracted among agreeable ideas, is unresistant among disagreeable ideas*> (cf. S. iv, 200). For what reason ? Because the faculties are restrained and shut off. [14] Restrained and shut off by what ? By mindfulness's preservation. That is why the Blessed One said *'They are shut off by mindfulness'*.

76. [And again] the underlying-tendencies are abandoned by understanding. When the underlying-tendencies are abandoned the obsessions are abandoned. Why¹ with the abandoning of the underlying-tendencies ? Just as, when the complete uprooting of a tree with its trunk is effected, the continuity of flowers, fruits, shoots, and buds, is severed (cf. Ps. ii, 218), so too, when the underlying-tendencies are abandoned, the continuity of obsessions is severed, closed, covered up. By what ? By understanding. That is why the Blessed One said that *'Whereby they can be sealed is understanding'*.

*

72/2 *Sabbā* ('in all ways'): abl. adv.

75/1 *Āvinchati*—to be attracted': see PED under *āvijjhati*; serves here as alternative for *savati* ('to keep streaming') in §72. *NettiA* (p. 57) glosses by *ākaddhati*.

76/1 *Kissa* ('why') is gen. pronominal adv. here, not gen. interrog-pron. in agreement with *anusayassa*. Cf. *kissa* (also 'why') in §94.

77. <'Understanding and mindfulness.'

So said the venerable Ajita.

'And [now], good sir, this name-and-form:

Tell me then what I ask of you,

Where does this come to its surcease?'

'As to the question that you ask,

Ajita, I [shall] tell you [now]

Where both this name and form do come

To their remainderless surcease:

With cessation of consciousness,

'Tis here this comes to its surcease'

(*Sn.* 1036; *Pe* 84-5).

78. This question asks about the sequence [of meaning]¹ (see also §§198f.). When asking about sequence [of meaning], what does it ask about? About the element of extinction without trace left.²

79. Three Truths are determined, inseparable from the idea of cessation: they are Suffering, Origin, and the Path; Cessation is undetermined. Herein, origin is abandoned on two planes: on the plane of seeing and on the plane of keeping in being.¹ Three fetters are abandoned by seeing: embodiment view,² uncertainty, and misapprehension of virtue and duty.³ Seven fetters are abandoned by

78/1 If the *Pe* is excluded, this is probably the earliest use of *anusandhi* as semantic or logical 'sequence'. *PED* rightly queries the guess 'complete cessation' given in *PTS Netti* Index, a mistake due to confusing a syntactical rule with the subject-matter (namely 'extinction') that is the rule's example here.

78/2 For the terms *sa-upādisesa* ('with trace left') and *anupādisesa* ('without trace left') see *M.* ii, 257, where a non-metaphorical use suggests that they were originally medical terms, later extended by analogy to, respectively, the cessation of lust, hate and delusion during the arahant's life and to the (future-tense) cessation of the 5-category process at the end of his life-span. Cf. *Iti.* 38 for this latter meaning.

79/1 See n. 46/1.

79/2 'Embodiment-view' (*sakkāya-diṭṭhi*) refers to the 20 modes of identification of self (*attā*) with the 5 categories (see *M.* i, 300 and *MA.*): i.e., belief that they 'embody' self in some manner.

79/3 'misapprehension of virtue and duty' is more literal than, say, 'adherence to rites and rituals' as a rendering for *śīlabbataparimāsa*. See *A.* iv, 55; cf. definitions of *parimāsa* at *Vbh.* 365 and *Vis.* 684. The meaning is simply the mistaken expectations of reward, not only regarding the practice of such ritualistic habits and duties as 'ox-virtue', etc.; (see, e.g., *M. Sutta* 57), but also belief that virtue alone suffices without concentration and understanding (see §895).

keeping in being: will to sensual desire, ill will, lust for form, lust for formlessness, conceit,⁴ agitation, and the remainder of ignorance.⁵

80. These are the ten fetters in the triple element [of existence]:¹ five belong to the hither side and five to the further side.

81. [15] Herein, three fetters, namely embodiment view, uncertainty, and misapprehension of virtue and duty, cease with the expression of the I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty, and seven fetters, namely will to sensual desire, ill will, lust for form, lust for formlessness, conceit, agitation, and the remainder of ignorance, cease with the expression of the act-of-final-knowing faculty. Now two kinds of knowledge, namely what he knows thus 'Birth is exhausted for me', which is knowledge about exhaustion, and what he knows thus 'There is no more of this beyond', which is knowledge of non-arising, constitute the final-knower faculty (see §890).

82. Herein, the I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty and the act-of-final-knowing faculty cease in him who reaches the supreme fruit that is Arahantship.

83. Herein, the two kinds of knowledge, namely knowledge about exhaustion and knowledge about non-arising, are one kind of understanding; but it has two names according to imputation:¹ in one who is understanding thus 'Birth is exhausted for me' it has the name 'knowledge about exhaustion', while in one who is understanding thus 'There is no more of this beyond' it has the name 'knowledge about non-arising'. That is '*understanding*' (§77) in the

79/4 *Māna* (as *asmi-māna* 'the conceit "I am"'—see *S.* iii, 128-32) is closely allied to *maññanā* and *maññita* (e.g., *M.* iii, 246) and *maññati* (*M.* i, 1) as 'conceit' and 'to conceive (conceits)'. The root of all these is *man* ('to measure', which gives *mano* 'mind'). The pun between *conceit* as 'conceitedness' and as a 'conceit' or 'concept' is a living one in the Pali as in the English. 'Pride' destroys this word-play but can be used for *atimāna*, whose uses are quite limited.

79/5 The reading *avijjāvasesā* given by *NettiA* and *Bb* seems perhaps preferable, though *NettiA* cites as alternative the *PTS* reading, which both *Ba* and *C* support. If *niravasesā* is right, though, it would mean 'without remainder' ('none left') and not 'inclusive' as given in *PTS Netti Index*.

80/1 The 'triple element' is the sensual-desire element (or mode of being), the form element (or mode of being), and the formless element (or mode of being); see *Pe* 116, and cf. e.g., *M.* iii, 63.

83/1 '*Sanketena*—according to imputation': *sanketa* means lit. 'rendezvous' or 'appointment', cf. §96. What is meant here is that understanding has different names according to what it is about.

sense of act-of-understanding (cf. *Ps.* i, 1),² and it is 'mindfulness' (§77) in the sense of the act-of-not-floating-away [from its object]³ according as [it has] seen [it].

84. Herein, the five categories of assumption constitute 'name-and-form' (§77).¹ And herein, the ideas that have contact as fifth² constitute name; while the five form-faculties [beginning with the eye] constitute form; and both of these, with the associated consciousness, constitute name-and-form (cf. *Pe* 116).

85. It was in asking the Blessed One about the cessation of that [name-and-form] that the venerable Ajita spoke in the *Pārāyana* thus 'Understanding and mindfulness. And [now], good sir, this name-and-form, Tell me then what I ask of you, Where does this come to its surcease?' (§77).

86. Herein, mindfulness and understanding [represent] four faculties: mindfulness [represents] two faculties, namely the mindfulness faculty and the concentration faculty, while understanding [represents] two faculties, namely the understanding faculty and the

83/2 English does not, in the case of the verb 'to understand', distinguish between the two forms *paññā* (subst. 'understanding') and *pajānanā* (subst. 'act of) understanding') as it does, say, with the parallel forms *ñāṇa* (subst. 'knowledge') and *jānanā* (subst. 'knowing').

83/3 'Apilāpana—non-floating away': not as in *PED* for all *Netti* and similar refs. The word is the same as the abstract form *apilāpanatā* (i.e., *a* + *pilāpana* + *tā*: see *PED*) and is glossed by *NettiA* with *ogāhana*. The root is *plu* (to swim or float), not *lap*; see *PED pilavati*, and also *CPD*. Mindfulness is regarded as keeping the mind 'anchored' on its object and preventing it from 'floating away' from it.

84/1 In the Suttas 'name-and-form' (*nāmarūpa*) never seems to include consciousness (*viññāṇa*)—see, e.g., *M.* i, 53; *D.* ii, 62-3; *M.* iii, 17 (a point more important than might be suspected)—but in later literature it is often taken (outside actual dependent-arising contexts) to include consciousness (i.e., to include all 5 categories, not only the first four; e.g., *Vis.* 590). This work seems undecided; this passage identifies name-and-form with all 5 categories, confirmed by §226, but the definition of the 'name-body' in §445 is different and nearer to that given at *M.* i, 53; cf. also §92.

84/2 'Phassapañcamaka—with contact as fifth' (cf. *Vis.* 626 and *MA.* i, 276; iii, 262 for this expression). The most likely formulation referred to here is the 6 things in §445, of which contact is the fifth. But another similar expression, *phassapañcaka* ('contact-pentad'), is used in the Commentaries (e.g., *MA.* i, 249) to refer to the first 5 indispensable concomitants of cognizance listed at *Dhs.* §1, namely 'contact, feeling, perception, choice, cognizance', cf. the definition of 'name' at *M.* i, 53 by the 5, namely 'feeling, perception, choice, contact, and attention', and also the group of 5 at *M.* iii, 26ff. 'contact, feeling, perception, choice, cognizance'.

energy faculty. Any act-of-having-faith, act of trusting, in these four faculties is the faith faculty.

87. Herein, any unification of cognizance with faith in predominance is concentration of will. Any power-of-deliberation, or any power-of-keeping-in-being, owed to suppression of defilements while cognizance is concentrated, is endeavour.¹ [16] Herein, any in-breath and out-breath, any thinking and exploring, any perception and feeling, any memories and intentions, are determinations. So the prior concentration of will, and then the endeavour¹ owed to suppression of defilement—and these determinations—, both these he keeps in being as this [first] <basis for success that possesses concentration-of-will with endeavour¹ and determinations> (cf. S. v, 254), which <is supported by seclusion, supported by fading, supported by cessation, and changes to relinquishment> (S. v, 340).

88. Herein, any unification of cognizance with energy in predominance is concentration of energy . . .

89. Herein, any unification of cognizance with [natural concentration of] cognizance in predominance is concentration of cognizance . . .

90. Herein, any unification of cognizance with inquiry in predominance is concentration of inquiry. Any power-of-deliberation, or any power-of-keeping-in-being, owed to suppression of defilements when cognizance is concentrated, is endeavour. Herein, any in-breath and out-breath, any thinking and exploring, any perception and feeling, any memories and intentions, are determinations. So the prior concentration of inquiry, and then the endeavour owed to suppression of defilements—and these determinations—, both these he keeps in being as this [fourth] <basis for success that possesses concentration of inquiry, as well as endeavour and determinations>, which <is supported by seclusion, supported by fading, supported by cessation, and changes to relinquishment>.

91. All concentration has knowledge for its root, is heralded by knowledge, and has parallel occurrence¹ with knowledge. With

87/1 All eds. confirm PTS reading *pahāna*, though *NettiA* gives *padhāna* as an alternative and comments on both. The latter seems preferable in view of the Sutta formula, (*chanda-*) *samādhi-padhāna-sankhāra-samannāgata*, for the 'bases for success', which are being discussed here.

91/1 '*Anuparivattati*—has parallel occurrence with': the right meaning (not given in PED) needs *anu* to be taken in its not unusual sense of 'parallel', *pari* in its comprehensive sense (= 'completely'), and *vattati* in the sense of 'to occur' (cf. *paravattati*, *nibbattati*, etc.); i.e., 'occurs coextensively with'.

open and untrammelled cognizance he keeps in being cognizance with lucidity thus:

<As before, so after; as after, so before; . . .

And as by night, by day; and as by day, by night>

(A. i, 236; S. v, 277).

92. The five profitable faculties [of faith, etc.] are coexistent with¹ cognizance, arise when cognizance arises, and cease when cognizance ceases;² and name-and-form has consciousness for its cause, and it has occurrence with consciousness for its condition. When its cause is interrupted by the path, consciousness being then without nutriment, with nothing expectantly relished,³ without standing, without re-linking, ceases (cf. §306). No name-and-form occurs in a new existence without cause and without condition. [17] So with the cessation of consciousness, name-and-form ceases, and also understanding and mindfulness. That is why the Blessed One said:

<'As to the question that you ask,

Ajita, I [shall] tell you [now]

Where both this name and form do come

To their remainderless surcease:

With cessation of consciousness

'Tis here this comes to its surcease'> (§77).

*

93. *<'There are the masters of ideas'*

So said the venerable Ajita.

'And several initiates here:

Good sir, if asked, you have the skill

To tell me their behaviour'> (Sn. 1038; Pe 85).

The meaning is paraphrased in §92, cf. also *Dhs.* p. 5. Is *PED*'s meaning 'to move round' ever justified? See *CPD*, also n. 92/1 and *Pe* 82.

92/1 '*Sahabhū*—coexistent with': see *Dhs.* §1197. This, with the idea of *anuparivatti* (see last note), was developed in the later commentarial literature into the theory of 'ideas with simultaneous arising and cessation, and ideas with simultaneous arising and different cessation or different arising and simultaneous cessation' in connexion with the occurrence of *rūpadhammā* and *arūpadhammā* (*VbhA.* 25ff.).

92/2 cf. *Yamaka* ii, 1ff.

92/3 *Abhinandati* (like its subst. *abhinandana*) is mostly used in the sense of 'looking forward expectantly to the future', while *nandati* simply means 'delighting'; but the distinction is not a hard one.

94. These three terms asked are three questions. Why ?¹ By construing [respectively] as the adept, the initiate,² and also the kind of abandoning heralded by insight. For when he said '*There are the masters of ideas*' he was asking about Arahantship; when he said '*And several initiates here*' he was asking about the [seven kinds of] initiate; and when he said '*Good sir, if asked, you have the skill, To tell me their behaviour*' he was asked about the kind of abandoning heralded by insight.

95. Here is the answer:

'Sensual desires he would not want,

Ajita' the Blessed One said.

'He would be undisturbed in mind;

And skilled in all ideas, a bhikkhu

Is mindful in his wanderings' > (Sn. 1039; Pe 85).¹

96. All the Blessed One's bodily action¹ is heralded by knowledge and has parallel occurrence with knowledge. All his verbal action is heralded by knowledge and has parallel occurrence with knowledge. All his mental action is heralded by knowledge and has parallel occurrence with knowledge. His knowing and seeing is unrestricted¹ in the case of the past period, in the case of the future period, and in the case of the presently-arisen period. What resistance to his knowing and seeing should there be? [18] Resistance to knowing and seeing is any unknowing and unseeing in the case of what is impermanent, painful, and not-self. Just as a man here might see the forms of the stars but might not know what number to impute to them: this is resistance to knowing and seeing. But the Blessed One's knowing and seeing is unresisted; for the Enlightened Ones, the Blessed Ones, have unobstructed knowing and seeing.

97. Herein cognizance has to be guarded by an initiate with respect to two [kinds of] ideas: from wanting with respect to ideas provoca-

94/1 See n. 76/1.

94/2 '*Asekha*—Adept' (lit. 'one whose training is done') is a term for one who has attained the fruit of Arahantship. '*Sekha*—Initiate' is a term for the seven types of person, i.e., those with the four paths and 1st 3 fruits.

95/1 *Investigation* of, inquiry into, the nature of an Enlightened One appears in one form here, as the Mode of Conveying here being dealt with, and also in another form at §§541-94 (the same Mode in Combined Treatment). The Buddha's Utterance as communicating an injunction to inquire is found notably in *M. Sutta* 47 (*Vimamsaka-sutta*), cf. also *M. Sutta* 91.

96/1 See n. 326/2 for omniscience.

tive of lust and from hate with respect to ideas provocative of obsession.¹

98. With respect to these the Blessed One said '*Sensual desires he would not want*' (§93) warning against any wishes, infatuations,¹ aspirations, longing, or toying; and [with the words] '*He would be undisturbed in mind*' he mentioned abolition of obsession. For when an initiate wants accordingly he arouses unarisen defilement and he swells arisen defilement. But he who makes efforts with undisturbed intention (cf. *Pe* 146) and not wanting, <(i) produces will² for the non-arising of unarisen evil unprofitable ideas, makes efforts, instigates energy, exerts cognizance, and endeavours; (ii) he produces will for the abandoning of arisen evil unprofitable ideas, makes efforts, instigates energy, exerts cognizance, and endeavours; (iii) he produces will for the arising of unarisen profitable ideas, makes efforts, instigates energy, exerts cognizance, and endeavours, and (iv) he produces will for the endurance, non-forgetting, increase, abundance, maintenance in being, and fulfilment, of arisen profitable ideas, and he makes efforts, instigates energy, exerts cognizance, and endeavours> (*M.* ii, 11).

99. (i) What are the unarisen evil unprofitable ideas? They are thinking with sensual desire, thinking with ill will, and thinking with cruelty. These are the unarisen evil unprofitable ideas. (ii) What are the arisen evil unprofitable ideas? They are the underlying-tendencies, the roots of the unprofitable. These are the arisen evil unprofitable ideas.¹ (iii) What are the unarisen profitable ideas? They are the faculties that belong to the Stream-Enterer. These are the unarisen profitable ideas. [19] (iv) What are the arisen profitable ideas? They are the faculties that belong to him who stands [on a path].² These are the arisen profitable ideas.

97/1 *NettiA* discusses alternative readings of *paṭighaṭṭhānīyesu* and *pariyuṭṭhānīyesu* without rejecting either.

98/1 Read *mucchā* with *C*, *Ba* and *Bb* instead of *pucchā*.

98/2 This passage describes the 4 Right Endeavours (*sammappadhāna*).

99/1 *NettiA* here refers to the kind of 'being arisen' called 'arisen by having soil to grow in' (*Vis.* 687). What is meant is the potentiality for arising contained in the idea of 'underlying-tendencies'. This 'arisen potentiality' or liability is here considered as an arisen evil.

99/2 '*Aṭṭhamakassa*—of him who stands on [a path]': see also §274, where the meaning is clarified by the context (cf. also *Ps.* ii, 193; *Kv.* 243-51; *Yam.* i, 322; ii, 197; *MAA.* i, 137). The explanations both in *PED* and *CPD* cannot be right, and there seems no precedent for counting the 'eight persons' back, starting from the possessor of the fruit of Arahantship as the first,

100. That whereby he shuts off thinking with sensual desire is the mindfulness faculty. That whereby he shuts off thinking with ill will is the concentration faculty. That whereby he shuts off thinking with cruelty is the energy faculty. That whereby he <abandons, dispels, terminates, annihilates, and will not endure, evil unprofitable ideas as soon as they arise> (M. i, 11) is the understanding faculty. And any act of trusting in these four faculties is the faith faculty (cf. §96).

101. <Herein, where is the faith faculty met with? In the four factors of Stream-Entry. Where is the energy faculty met with? In the four Right Endeavours (see §98). Where is the mindfulness faculty met with? In the four foundations of Mindfulness. Where is the concentration faculty met with? In the four meditations. Where is the understanding faculty met with? In the four Noble Truths> (cf. Pe 128; S. v, 196).

102. That is why the initiate who is diligent in all profitable ideas is spoken of by the Blessed One [in terms of] mental non-disturbance. That is why the Blessed One said '*He would be undisturbed in mind*'.

103. '*Skilled in all ideas*': the world is threefold as the world of defilement, the world of being (existence), and the world of faculties (§64).

104. Herein, the world of being (existence) comes about by way of the world of defilement. That causes the occurrence of the faculties. When the faculties are kept in being there is diagnosis of what is knowable.¹ That [diagnosis] has to be scrutinized in two ways as diagnosis by seeing and diagnosis by abandoning. For when an initiate understands the knowable, then the knowable¹ is diagnosed with perception and attention accompanied by dispassion, and two ideas in him then attain to skill: skill in seeing and skill in keeping in being.

and so arriving at the Stream-Entry path for this term. In fact it seems to be derived, not from *aṭṭha* ('eight') at all, but from *ā + √thā* ('to stand upon'), in which case it is synonymous with *paṭipannaka*. *NettiA*, commenting on §274, says '*Aṭṭhamakassa* [means] of one on the way (*paṭipannassa*) to verification of the fruit of Stream-Entry' for the 1st mention in §274, and then again '*aṭṭhamakassa* [mentioned] again [means] of one standing on the path of Non-Return' (pp. 95-6). In this paragraph, therefore, no. (iii) is the faculties of the possessor of the fruit of Stream-Entry, and no. (iv) those of one 'standing on' any of the paths. Cf. expression *catumaggaṭṭhā puggalā* (*Abhidhammatthasangaha*, *sankhipavanānanā-lokuttaracitta* section).

104/1 Reading *ñeyyam* with *Ba* and *NettiA*, and *Bb* the 1st time only; *C* supports *PTS*.

That knowledge should be understood as fivefold, namely acquaintanceship, diagnosis, abandoning, keeping in being, and verification. 105. [20] Herein, what is acquaintanceship? It is any knowledge about the individual characteristics of ideas (§§159ff.), and about the Discrimination of Ideas and the Discrimination of Meanings. This is acquaintanceship.

106. Herein, what is diagnosis? After becoming acquainted in these ways, it is any diagnosis as follows: 'This is profitable, this is unprofitable, this is blameworthy, this is blameless, this is black, this is bright, this is to be cultivated, this is not to be cultivated, these ideas, having been taken thus, make this fruit occur—this is their meaning when taken thus'. This is diagnosis.

107. After diagnosing in this way, three kinds of ideas remain: those to be abandoned, those to be kept in being, and those to be verified.

108. Herein, what ideas are to be abandoned? Any that are unprofitable.

109. Herein, what ideas are to be kept in being? Any that are profitable.

110. Herein, what ideas are to be verified? The undetermined.¹

111. He who knows this is called skilled in meanings, skilled in ideas, skilled in goodness, skilled in fruits, skilled in ways, skilled in unease, skilled in ease, possessed of great skill.

That is why the Blessed One said '*Skilled in all ideas*' (§95).

112. '*A bhikkhu is mindful in his wanderings*' (§95): he should, for the purpose of a pleasant abiding here and now, abide mindful and aware in advancing and retreating, in looking and looking away, in flexing and extending, in wearing the patched-cloak, bowl and [other] robes, in eating, drinking, chewing and tasting, in evacuating and making water, in walking, standing, sitting, going to sleep, waking, talking and keeping silent (cf. *D.* ii, 292).

113. Two kinds of conduct agreed by the Blessed One are these: one for those already purified, and one for those still being purified. Who are those already purified? They are the Arahants. Who are those still being purified? They are the Initiates; an Arahant's faculties have done their task.

114. The discoverable is fourfold as actualization of the diagnosis of suffering, actualization of the abandoning of origin, actualization of the keeping in being of the path, and actualization of the verification of cessation. This is the fourfold discoverable.

110/1 The neuter gender of *yam asankhatam* is notable here.

115. He who knows this [21] is called one who advances mindful, who retreats mindful (cf. *M.* iii, 135), with the exhaustion of lust, the exhaustion of hate, and the exhaustion of delusion.

That is why the Blessed One said:

<‘Sensual desires he would not want,
He would be undisturbed in mind;
And skilled in all ideas, a bhikkhu
Is mindful in his wanderings’> (§95).

That is how it can be asked, and that is how it can be answered (see §62).

[(2) Gratification, etc.: see *Mode 1*.

(3) Paraphrasing Verse]

116. And a Thread’s paraphrasing-verse (§62) must be properly guided in as to meaning as well as to phrasing; for phrasing destitute of meaning is idle chatter. Also the meaning of badly presented terms and phrasing is hard to apply a guide-line to (cf. *A.* i, 58-9, iii, 178). That is why [a paraphrase-verse] should be versified¹ in a manner furnished with meaning as well as phrasing.

[(4) All that is in the Ninefold Thread-of-Argument]

117. The Thread should also be investigated thus: What kind is this Thread-of-Argument? Is it one that consists of an original statement,¹ a statement [elucidating] a sequence [of meaning]?² One

116/1 *C, Ba, Bb*, all read *sangāyitabbam* instead of *PT’S*’s *sangāhītabbam*. This word perhaps ends the paragraph since the words *suttañ ca pavicitabbam* seem to open what follows; they seem to refer back to §§6 and 62 and to be expanded in what follows.

117/1 ‘*Āhacca-vacana*—an original statement’: a free rendering of a difficult term. Cf. *DhsA.* 9, *Miln.* 148. The general sense seems to be that of a statement made by the Buddha himself, in which case it could, for instance, describe the two condensed statements made by the Buddha in *M. Sutta* 18, in contrast with the Elder Mahākaccāna’s expansion of the second one there (see also next note). But √*han* (‘to strike’) is required by *NettiA*’s explanation, which is: ‘*Bhagavato thāna-karaṇādīm āhacca abhihantvā pavatta-vacanam; sammāsambuddhena sāmam desitayuttan ti attho*’ (p. 67), which may be rendered ‘a statement made to occur by causing the Blessed One’s (oral) position, instrument, etc., to strike together; fit for a fully Enlightened One’s own teaching, is the meaning’. For this technical grammarian’s use of *thāna-karaṇ-ādi* see *Rūpasiddhi*: ‘*Thānakaranappayatanehi varṇā jāyante*’, ‘Syllables are produced by means of the oral position (i.e., guttural, palatal, cerebral, dental, labial), the instrument (i.e., tongue, etc.), and the voicedness

whose meaning is already guided? One whose meaning has yet to be guided?³ And also, is it one that deals with corruption, that deals with morality,⁴ that deals with penetration,⁵ or that deals with the Adept (see §760)? Where in this Thread-of-Argument are all the four Truths met with: in its beginning, in its middle, or in its end? That is how the Thread-of-Argument should be investigated.

118. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

‘What in the Thread is asked and answered,
As well as a verse-paraphrase,
And the Thread’s term-investigation:
This Mode Conveys Investigation’ (§6).

The Mode of Conveying an Investigation is ended.

*

3

[The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying a Construing]

119. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Construing? The Mode of Conveying a Construing is this:

(i.e., whether surd or not)’ (quoted in Burmese-script Pali dictionary *Sadda-tiharatanāvali*).

117/2 ‘*Anusandhi-vacana*—statement of sequence [of meaning]’: another syntactical term. *NettiA* says ‘uttered by a hearer (disciple); for it is so called since it occurs by following sequentially upon (*anusandhetvā*) a statement of the Blessed One’s’ (p. 67). This would apply to the explanatory discourse by the Elder Mahā-Kaccāna in, e.g., *M. Sutta* 18. The meaning is thus not the same as that of the *sandhi* at §§198ff.

117/3 ‘*Nītattha*—whose meaning is already guided’ and ‘*neyyattha*—whose meaning needs guiding’ occur at *A. i.*, 60; they can be paraphrased by ‘with explicit meaning’ and ‘with implicit meaning’ respectively, though recollecting that ‘meaning’ here means ‘meaning-as-aim’. The remaining 4 kinds are from the fourth chapter (§760).

117/4 ‘*Vāsanā*—morality’: fm. \sqrt{vas} ‘to dwell’, see *Sn.* 1009, *Miln.* 263, *Vis.* 185. Here contexts show the meaning to be cultivation of merit, hence ‘morality’; but cf. *Vin.* iv, 120, where it is allowed to ‘treat’ or ‘cure’ (*vāsetum*) clay in order to prevent it from becoming ill-smelling.

117/5 Spelling *nibbedha* in all eds., which implies \sqrt{vidh} , (= Skr. \sqrt{vyadh}); yet possibly one might read *nibbheda* (‘breaking out’ fm. \sqrt{bhid}) in all instances. See *abhinibbhida* and n. 326/1. There seems to be some real fusion of these two and with \sqrt{vid} (*nibbidā*, ‘dispassion’).

'Looking for right and wrong construing
In the case of all the Conveyings'
Plane and resort [will] demonstrate
The Mode Conveying a Construing' (§7).

120. What does it construe? The four Principal Appeals to Authority (see *A. ii*, 167). These are the appeal to the Enlightened One as authority, the appeal to a community as authority, the appeal to several elders as authority, and the appeal to a single elder as authority. These are the four Principal Appeals to Authority.¹

121. [In all such appeals to authority] <These terms and phrasing must, in the case of the Thread, be conformable to the ways of entry [to it],¹ and, in the case of the Out-guiding (Discipline), be seen [there] for oneself> (*A. ii*, 167), and they must, in the case of the essential nature of the idea,² be adaptable [to it].

122. [22] What is the Thread to whose ways of entry they must be conformable (see also §§351ff.)? The four Noble Truths.

123. What is the Outguiding (Discipline) where they must be seen for oneself? The outguiding of lust, the outguiding of hate, and the outguiding of delusion.

124. What is the essential nature of the idea to which they must be adaptable? Dependent arising (see §462; *S. ii*, 25).

125. If, in the case of the Noble Truths, there is a way of entry [to them],¹ and if, in the case of the Outguiding of defilements, it is

120/1 This passage clearly takes *mahāpadesa* to be made up of *mahā* + *apadesa*, not *mahā* + *padesa*. Ref. in *PED* to *A. ii*, 167 should thus be under *apadesa*, not under *padesa*, and ref. *D. ii*, 123 should be added there; *CPD* does not mention under *apadesa*. The meaning is thus clearer; for it is not the authority itself so much as the *appeal* made to the authority, the correctness of the *appeal* being recommended to be checked against the Suttas and the Vinaya.

121/1 For *otārayitabba* ('must be conformable to the ways of entry'—i.e., to the 4 Truths) see Introduction (sect. 8).

121/2 *Dhammatā* (lit. 'idea-ness'—the particular idea by which the 'thing' is recognised) combines the notions of 'idea' (*dhamma*), 'nature' (*pakati*), and 'essence' (*bhāva*—in its post-Piṭaka use), rather in the sense of the English expression 'It is of the essence . . .'. What is referred to here is dependent arising as the essential conditionedness of all being.

125/1 '*Avatarati*—there is a way of entry': = *otarati*; not in *PED*, see *CPD*; but the rendering 'to descend' in *CPD*, while literal, does not suit this context

seen for oneself, and if, in the case of the essential nature of the idea, there is no running counter [to it], then there is no generation of taints. Whatever is [so] construable from among the four Principal Appeals to Authority can be accepted, whatever it is construable by and however it is construed.

126. When [in the Thread] someone is asked a question, [the question] should be fathomed and investigated as to the terms thus: 'How many terms are there in the question (see §§63f.)? If all the terms are in concord about a single meaning, that is a single question. If four terms are in concord about a single meaning, that is a single question. If three terms are in concord about a single meaning, that is a single question. If two terms are in concord about a single meaning, that is a single question. If one term is in concord about a single meaning, that is a single question.'

127. When scrutinizing it, what one needs to recognize is this: 'Now are these ideas different in meaning and different in phrasing, or have these ideas a single meaning, only¹ the phrasing being different?' (cf. *M.* i, 297).

128. How would that be? According as the deity asked the Blessed One the following questions:

<'The world: by what is it struck down?
And then by what is it beset?
What barb has it been entered by?
And by what harassed¹ constantly?'> (*S.* i, 40).

129. These four terms asked are three questions: How is that recognized? Because the Blessed One answered the deity as follows:

<'Mortality strikes down the world.
And then it is beset by ageing.
And craving's barb has entered it.
And wishes harass it constantly'> (*S.* i, 40).

130. Herein, ageing and death are two of the determined charac-

well; it requires the more specific sense of 'to allow or provide a way of entry into (i.e., the 4 truths)'. What is meant is given in full in the 12th Mode (§§351ff.).

127/1 'Eva—only': this very commonly met with meaning not in *PED*.

128/1 'Dhūpayita—harassed': no meaning that fits given in *PED*; lit. 'smoked', but here *NettiA* glosses by *santāpita*; cf. *Psalms of the Brethren* 448. So also *dhūpayanā* (§136). Cf. *dhūpāyati* at *A.* ii, 215.

teristics of the determined; for ageing is <alteration of what is steady> [and] death is <subsidence> (A. i, 152).¹

131. Herein, there is a difference between the meanings of ageing and of death. For what reason? [23] Because those who die in the womb never become aged. And there is death among the gods though their physical frames do not age.¹ One can get by² ageing, but death one cannot get by, except for what is in the province of those possessing supernormal success (power; see D. ii, 99).

132. Now when it is said '*Craving's barb has entered it*', those without lust are seen to age and die. And if craving were the same as ageing and death, then that being so, all those who were youthful would be without craving. And [if], in the way that craving is the origin of suffering, so too were ageing and death [the origin of suffering], then that [ageing and death] would actually be the origin of suffering and craving would not be the origin of suffering; but ageing and death are not the origin of suffering, and craving is the origin of suffering. And [if], in the way that craving is exterminable by the path, so [too ageing and death were the same], then ageing and death would also be exterminable by the path.

133. By means of this kind of construction it can be examined with various other¹ reasons whether the construction is seen for oneself and [whether] otherness of meaning is co-ordinated (cf. §§465ff.); And it should be examined as to phrasing as well.

134. Now in the case of the two ideas, namely '*barb*' and '*harassment*' (§128), there is oneness of meaning; for no difference is construable between the meanings of '*wishes*' and '*craving*' (§129). When craving's intent is not fulfilled, anger and spite arise with respect to the nine Grounds for Annoyance (see A. v, 408).

135. By means of this construction there is otherness in the meanings of ageing, of death, and of craving.

136. However, when the Blessed One calls this by the two names, '*wishes*' and '*craving*', it is in virtue of the external grounds which

130/1 Read *Jarā yaṃ thitassa aññathattam; maraṇaṃ vayo*.

131/1 For the death of gods see *Iti*. 76f.

131/2 '*Paṭikkamaṃ kātuṃ*—to get by': not in *PED*, lit. 'to make a by-pass'; cf. *parikkamanāya* (M. i, 43). Perhaps the reading here should be *parikkamaṃ*.

133/1 This use of *aññamañña* as 'various others' or 'this and other' is unusual, perhaps peculiar to this work, the normal meaning being 'each other' or 'mutual'. *NettiA* says '*aññamaññehi ti aññehi kāraṇupapattihi; althato ce aññattam tadaññam pi; byañjanato gavesitabban ti altho*' (p. 72).

are its object that it is called by him by the two names, 'wishes' and 'craving'; for all craving has the single characteristic of cleaving to. Just as all fire has the single characteristic of heating, though it has various other names according to its consumption [assumed], that is to say, 'log-fire' and 'grass-fire' and 'brushwood-fire' and 'cowdung-fire' and 'chaff-fire' and 'rubbish-fire' (cf. *M.* i, 259), yet all fire has only the characteristic of heating, so too, all craving has only one characteristic, namely the characteristic of cleaving to, [24] though it is called by various other names according to the fuel-consumption [assumed] that is its object, that is to say, 'wishes' and 'craving' and 'barb' and 'harassment'¹ and 'the Current' and 'attachment' and 'affection (moisture)' and 'torment' and 'the Creeper' and 'conceiving [in terms of "I" and "mine"]' and 'responsibility' and 'need' and 'thirst' and 'expectant-relishing'; yet all craving has only one characteristic, namely the characteristic of cleaving to, according as it is stated in the [Mode of Conveying] Synonyms (see §§285ff.):

137. <Need and longing, expectant relishing,
*Enticements*¹ on the several elements based,
Hankering whose being is rooted in unknowing:
To all that with its root I put an end>
 (Pe 17; cf. *S.* i, 181; see §286).

138. That is synonymous with craving, according as the Blessed One said: <*Tissa, when someone is not without lust, not without will, not without love, not without thirst, not without fever, for form . . . for feeling . . . for perception . . . for determinations . . . for consciousness . . .*> all of which argument can be cited in detail (cf. *S.* iii, 107).

139. This synonym for Craving¹ is construable in this way: 'All access to suffering has for its root determinations [conditioned] by craving for sensual desires.' It is not construable in this way: 'All

136/1 'Saritā—current' might mean 'memory-maker' and refer to the *sara-sankappa* of, say, *M.* iii, 132 or to the *samanussarato* of *M.* iii, 217, depending on the root.

137/1 'Sarā—enticements': the word is not in the *Saṃyutta* text, which differs a good deal from this quotation. *NettiA* (p. 99) equates with *taṇhā* but does not explain the word anywhere.

139/1 *C*, *Ba* and *Bb* agree that the words *taṇhāy' etaṃ vevacanāṃ evaṃ yujjati* are one clause. *Ba* and *Bb* append it to what goes before, while *C* begins the following passage with it, which seems preferable.

access to dispassion has for its root some requisite of craving for sensual desires.²

By means of this construction it can be examined with various other reasons.

140. For just as¹ the Blessed One teaches ugliness to a person of lusting temperament, teaches loving kindness to a person of hating temperament, teaches dependent-arising to a person of deluded temperament—for if he taught to a person of lusting temperament the heart-deliverance of loving kindness, or the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship, or the pleasant way with swift acquaintanceship, or the kind of abandoning heralded by insight, the teaching could not be construed—, so too, whatever conforms with the abandoning of lust, whatever conforms with the abandoning of hate, and whatever conforms with the abandoning of delusion, [25] can all be construed under the Mode of Conveying a Construing, after investigating it under the Mode of Conveying an Investigation, so far as the plane of knowledge extends.

141. When someone abides in loving kindness, the teaching is not construable thus: 'Ill will keeps gripping his heart,' the teaching is construable thus: 'Ill will is abandoned and disappears in him.'

142. When someone abides in compassion, the teaching is not construable thus: 'Cruelty keeps gripping his heart,' the teaching is construable thus: 'Cruelty is abandoned and disappears in him.'

143. When someone abides in gladness, the teaching is not construable thus: 'Boredom keeps gripping his heart,' the teaching is construable thus: 'Boredom is abandoned and disappears in him.'

144. When someone abides in onlooking-equanimity, the teaching is not construable thus: 'Lust¹ keeps gripping his heart,' the teaching is construable thus: 'Lust is abandoned and disappears in him.'

145. When someone abides in the signless, the teaching is not construable thus: 'His cognizance occurs by means of this or that by following signs,' the teaching is construable thus: 'Any sign is abandoned and disappears in him.'

146. When the [conceiving 'I] am' is absent, the teaching is not

139/2 'Kāmatanḥāparikkhāramūlako—has for its root some requisite of craving for sensual desires' is explained by *NettiA* to be objective sensual desires (desired things) as the basis for subjective sensual desire (craving). Cf. distinction between *vatthu-kāma* and *kilesa-kāma* at *NdJ*, 1.

140/1 Where *PTS* has *yathā Bhagavā C* has *yath' āha Bhagavā*, *Ba* and *Bb* *yathā hi Bhagavā*.

144/1 Cf. *M*, i, 424, which has *paṭigha* here, not *rāga*.

construable thus ‘“I do not see thus ‘I am this’, yet the barb of uncertainty and wondering ‘What am I?, How am I?’¹ keeps gripping my cognizance,”’ the teaching is construable thus ‘“The barb of uncertainty and wondering is abandoned and disappears [in me].”’

147. [Again,] when¹ someone has entered upon the first meditation, the teaching is not construable thus ‘Lust for sensual desires and ill will occur² in his distinction,’ the teaching is construable thus ‘They occur in his inferior state,’ or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus ‘Perception and attention accompanied by what is without thinking occur in his inferior state,’ the teaching is construable thus ‘They occur in his distinction.’

148. When someone has entered upon the second meditation, the teaching is not construable thus ‘Perception and attention accompanied by what has thinking and exploring occur in his distinction,’ the teaching is construable thus ‘They occur in his inferior state,’ or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus ‘Perception and attention accompanied by what has pleasure due to onlooking-equanimity occur in his inferior state,’ the teaching is construable thus ‘They occur in his distinction.’

149. [26] When someone has entered upon the third meditation, the teaching is not construable thus ‘Perception and attention accompanied by what has pleasure due to happiness occur in his distinction,’ the teaching is construable thus ‘They occur in his inferior state,’ or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus ‘Perception and attention accompanied by mindfulness whose purity is due to onlooking-equanimity occur in his inferior state,’ the teaching is construable thus ‘They occur in his distinction.’

150. When someone has entered upon the fourth meditation, the teaching is not construable thus ‘Perception and attention accompanied by what has [pleasure due to] onlooking-equanimity¹ occur

146/1 Where *PTS* has *kismiñci katasmin ti*, *Ba* has *kiñci gatasmin ti* and *Bb* and *C* *kismī ti kathasmī ti*. *NettiA* ignores. Since the allusion is certainly to *M. i*, 8, *Bb* and *C* are right and the resolution is as follows *kiṃ asmī? ti*, *katham asmī? ti*.

147/1 The words *yathā vā pana* at *PTS* p. 25, line 23 (= beginning of §147) must relate forward to the *evam* at *PTS* p. 26, line 38 (‘so too’ in §156). Consequently §§147-56 are one sentence in the Pali, regardable as beginning with the ‘just as . . .’ which is followed in due course by the ‘. . . so too . . .’

147/2 ‘*Samvattanti*—occur’: this meaning, not infrequent, not given in *PED*; cf. *nibbattati* and *pavattati*.

150/1 Read *upekkhāsukhasahagatā*.

in his distinction,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his inferior state;' or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by the base consisting of infiniteness of space² occur in his inferior state,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his distinction.'

151. When someone has entered upon the base consisting of infiniteness of space, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by form occur in his distinction,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his inferior state;' or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by the base consisting of infiniteness of consciousness occur in his inferior state,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his distinction.'

152. When someone has entered upon the base consisting of infiniteness of consciousness, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by the base consisting of infiniteness of space occur in his distinction,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his inferior state;' or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by the base consisting of no-owning¹ occur in his inferior state,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his distinction.'

153. When someone has entered upon the base consisting of no-

150/2 'Ākāsa—space': *PED* derives from prefix *ā* + (Skr.) $\sqrt{kās}$ 'to shine forth' (though it is a mystery how space, which is devoid of *rūpa*, can do that). The old Pali definitions are all negative and imply the prefix *ā-* to be a strengthened negative (as in *ākiñcañña*) + either $\sqrt{kās}$ (Skr. $\sqrt{kās}$) 'to display', 'to shine' or else \sqrt{kas} (Skr. $\sqrt{kṛs}$) 'to draw a line', 'to plough a furrow'; *ākāsa* is then either 'that which does not shine forth' or 'that on which no line can be drawn' (cf. Simile at *M. i*, 127: impossibility of drawing a picture on space (*ākāsa*)). See negative definition in *Vibhāvini Tīkā ad Abhidhammatthasangaha*: 'Na kassati ti ākāso, na kāso vā ākāso'. The very late and Sanskritized *Abhidhānappadīpikā Tīkā* admits a positive definition, however: 'Bhusaṃ kasante dippante padatthā etenā ti ākāso; na kassati na vilekhiyati ti vā akaso'.

152/1 'ākiñcaññāyatana—base consisting of no-owning': *PED* derives *ākiñcañña* from neg. prefix *a-* + pron. *kiñ* + suffix *-cana*; but the word seems rather to be a negative derivative of \sqrt{kic} ('to press', 'to obstruct'); see *M. i*, 298 'rāgo kiñcano' ('lust is an owning'), etc., explained at *MA. ii*, 354 by *kiñcati* = *maddati*. Cf. also *kiñcanatā* (so read) at *M. ii*, 263 and *MA. iv*, 64 = *Vis. 654*. The words 'n'atthi kiñci' (*M. i*, 41) in the description of the *ākiñcaññāyatana* are then a play on the two different words *kiñci* (pron.) and *kiñcana* (subst. fm. \sqrt{kic}). Otherwise well rendered by 'base consisting of nothingness'.

owning, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by the base consisting of infiniteness of consciousness occur in his distinction,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his inferior state;' or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by the base consisting of neither perception nor non-perception occur in his inferior state,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his distinction.'

154. When someone has entered upon the base consisting of neither perception nor non-perception, the teaching is not construable thus 'The accesses to perception occur in his distinction,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his inferior state;' or alternatively, the teaching is not construable thus 'Perception and attention accompanied by cessation of perception and feeling¹ occur in his inferior state,' the teaching is construable thus 'They occur in his distinction.'

155. The teaching is not construable thus 'Cognizance is healthy when it does not submit to directive management,'¹ the teaching is construable thus 'Cognizance is healthy when it submits to directive management.'

156. That is how all the ninefold Thread should, after being in all ways (§62) investigated in accordance with the Mode of Conveying an Investigation, be construed in accordance with the Mode of Conveying a Construing, doing so according to the True Idea, according to the Outguiding (Discipline), [27] and according to the Master's Dispensation.

157. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'Looking for right and wrong construing
In the case of all the Conveyings'
Plane and resort [will] demonstrate
The Mode Conveying a Construing' (§7).

The Mode of Conveying a Construing is ended.

*

154/1 *NettiA* points out that such perception and attention in this case accompany the preparatory work done by one who has decided to enter upon the attainment of cessation of perception and feeling (p. 76).

155/1 '*Abhinihāra*—directive management': what is meant is, making and keeping a resolution, but the word also has a technical reference to the development of the 5 supernormal *abhiññā* belonging to worlds (see, e.g., *D. i*, 76).

4

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying Footings*]

158. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Footings? The Mode of Conveying Footings is this:

'The Victor teaching an idea
Teaches what that idea has too
As footing; so with each idea:
This is the Mode Conveying Footings' (§9).

159. What does this [Mode] teach? [It teaches as follows:]

[*Definitions of the 18 Root-Terms—see §4*]

Ignorance has the characteristic of not penetrating ideas according to actuality; its footing is the [four] perversions. *Craving* has the characteristic of cleaving to; its footing is endearing form or alluring form. *Greed* has the characteristic of aspiring; its footing is the taking of what is not given. [*Hate*¹ has the characteristic of willing ill; its footing is killing breathing things. *Delusion* has the characteristic of wrongly theorizing about things; its footing is wrong theory.²] *Perception of beauty* has the characteristic of apprehending colour, shape and features;³ its footing is non-restraint of the faculties [beginning with the eye]. *Perception of pleasure* has the characteristic of approaching contact affected by taints; its footing is gratification. *Perception of permanence* has the characteristic of unseeing of ideas that have the characteristic of being determined [that they are so]; its footing is consciousness. *Perception of self* has the characteristic of not seeing with perception of impermanence and perception of pain; its footing is the name-body (cf. *Pe* 121f.).

160. *Science* has the characteristic of penetrating all ideas; its footing is the knowable. *Quiet* has the characteristic of preventing distraction of cognizance; its footing is the kinds of ugliness.¹

159/1 The clauses for hate and delusion are oddly missing in all eds.; they are easily reconstructed from their counterparts in §160.

159/2 See n. 160/2.

159/3 There is no justification for rendering *byañjana* in this context by 'attire' as is done in *PTS Netti* index; what is meant is such 'personal features' as nose, hand, etc.

160/1 'The kinds of ugliness' can be taken as the 31 (or 32) parts of the body (e.g., *D.* ii, 293) or the 9 corpse-meditations (*D.* ii, 295f.), or the different corpse-meditations (as at *A.* i, 42).

Non-greed has the characteristic of preventing recourse to wishes; its footing is abstention from taking what is not given. *Non-hate* has the characteristic of non-ill-will; its footing is abstention from killing breathing things. *Non-delusion* has the characteristic of not wrongly theorizing² about things; its footing is right theory.³ *Perception of ugliness* has the characteristic of apprehending the discoloured [corpse-stage] and the festering [corpse-stage]; its footing is dispassion. *Perception of pain* has the characteristic of diagnosing contact affected by taints; its footing is feeling. *Perception of impermanence* has the characteristic of seeing ideas that have the characteristic of being determined; [28] its footing is rise and subsidence (fall). *Perception of not-self* has the characteristic of non-insistence⁴ in the case of all ideas;⁵ its footing is perception of ideas⁶ (cf. *Pe* 127f.).

[Further Definitions]

161. The five strands of sensual desire are the footing for *lust for sensual desires*. The five faculties [beginning with the eye] that have form are the footing for *lust for form*. The sixth¹ base [namely that of mind] is the footing for *lust for being (existence)*. The state of a contemplator² of being (existence) as occurrence is the footing for *the five categories of assumption*. Recollection of past life is the footing for *knowing and seeing*.

160/2 '*Avippaṭipādana*—without wrong theorizing': not in *PED*, see *CPD*.

160/3 '*Sammāpaṭipatti*—right theory': *paṭipatti* in this sense not in *PED*, see last note. The word appears in *Vis.* (pp. 468, 471, etc.), which doubtless borrowed it from here; cf. *Pe* 33, 35; *Miln.* 96. At *A.* iii, 325 *micchāpaṭipanna* occurs with *micchādīṭhika*.

160/4 *C* confirms *PTS* reading; *Ba* and *Bb* *sabbadhamma-abhinivesa-*; but the sense demands *sabbadhammānabhinivesa-* = *sabbadhammānam anabhinivesa-*.

160/5 The compound *sabbadhammā* should be taken as equivalent to *sabbe dhammā* and translated 'all ideas'; but it could also—such is the ambiguity of compounds—be taken in the sense of 'ideas of all' as the conceits (*maññanā*) based on the notion of 'all' (*sabba*: see esp. *M.* i, 3; 329; and *S.* iv, 15), though this is an improbable meaning.

160/6 An allusion, apparently, to *Dh.* 279 quoted at §38, but also at the same time to the fourth Foundation of Mindfulness (*dhammānupassanā*), cf. n. 4/1.

161/1 All Oriental eds. and *NettiA* have (correctly) *chaṭṭhāyatanam*. The allusion is to there being only the 'sixth' (i.e., mind) in the 4 formless states.

161/2 '*Anupassitā*—state of one contemplating': fem. abstr. subst., not in *PED*, see *CPD*.

[Definitions of the five faculties]

162. *Faith* has the characteristic of trusting, and its manifestation is belief. *Confidence* has the characteristic of being undisturbed and its manifestation is confiding (clarification).¹ *Faith* has the characteristic of credence;² its footing is confidence-by-having-undergone.³ *Confidence* has the characteristic of being undisturbed; its footing is faith.

163. *Energy* has the characteristic of instigating; its footing is a right endeavour. *Mindfulness* has the characteristic of non-drifting;¹ its footing is a foundation of mindfulness. *Concentration* has the characteristic of unification; its footing is the meditations. *Understanding* has the characteristic of act-of-understanding; its footing is the four Truths (cf. §295; also *Pe* 128-9).

[Definitions of the Members of the Formula of Dependent Arising]

164. Another guide-line:

Unreasoned attention has the characteristic of directing attention to gratification; its footing is ignorance. *Ignorance* has the characteristic of confusing Truth; it¹ is the footing for determinations. *Determinations* have the characteristic of developing² renewal of

162/1 '*Pasāda*—confidence' means lit. 'transparency' or 'settledness' (i.e., of water that was muddy and has become clear), and the word *pasīdati* is used both for the clearing of water and for acquiring confidence. *Faith* is thus regarded as the settling of the disturbance of doubts and clearing of the mind by resolution or trust.

162/2 '*Abhipatt(h)iyana*—credence': not in *PED*, see *CPD*; *NettiA*, which spells *abhipatthiyana*, glosses by '*Saddahanam eva*' ('Simply having faith', p. 78).

162/3 '*Avecca*—having undergone': the rendering is both literal and accurate. Ger. of *ava-* ('down', 'under') + *√i* ('to go'). The meaning can be clarified by looking over the substance of *M. Sutta* 47 (*M.* i, 320). *Avecca-pasāda* ('confidence by having undergone') thus means the kind of confidence (in the Three Jewels) that is due to one's having oneself actually undergone the cessation of craving that comes with attainment of the 1st Path, since before that undergoing there was only unconfirmed faith in what had been heard about it from the word of another.

163/1 See n. 83/3.

164/1 '*Tam*—it', while agreeing in gender, number and case with *padatthānam* (neut.), refers back in meaning to *avijjā* (f.). For this syntactical rule see n. 64/1. In the Pali this paragraph contains a string of examples.

164/2 '*Virohana*—developing': not in *PED*; caus. n. fm. *virūhati*.

being (existence); they are the footing for consciousness. *Consciousness* has the characteristic of causing occurrence by opening the way to reappearance;³ it is the footing for name-and-form. *Name-and-form* has the characteristic of conjoining the name-body and the form-body;⁴ it is the footing for the sixfold base.⁵ *The sixfold base* has the characteristic of defining the [six] faculties; it is the footing for contact.⁶ *Contact* has the characteristic of causing concurrence of [e.g.] eye, forms, and consciousness; it is the footing for feeling (affectivity). *Feeling* has the characteristic of being coessential⁷ with the wished-for and the un-wished-for; it is the footing for craving.⁸ *Craving* has the characteristic of cleaving to; it is the footing for assuming.⁹ *Assuming* opens the way to reappearance;³ it is the footing for being (existence).¹⁰ *Being (existence)* has the characteristic of giving actual being (existence) to the name-body and the form-body; [29] it is the footing for birth. *Birth* has the characteristic of giving manifest being (existence)¹¹ to the categories; it is the footing for ageing. *Ageing*

164/3 ‘*Opapaccāyika*—opening the way to reappearance’: fm. *upapatti + aya + ka*; not in *PED*; *NettiA* says of the first mention, in definition of *consciousness*, ‘This means that it has for its individual essence the causing of occurrence as a state of existence-as-appearance (*upapatti-bhava-bhāvena*, cf. *Ps.* i, 52 for this term)’ and of the second mention, in the definition of *assumption*. ‘It causes the occurrence of the categories in reappearance [in the new existence]’ (p. 79).

164/4 *PED*, under *nāmarūpa*, equates that term with *nāmakāya*—a bad mistake. See definition at §445; see also n. 84/1.

164/5 The ‘sixfold base’ (*saḷāyatana*) is a term for the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind.

164/6 ‘*Phassa*—contact’: See definition at, e.g., *M.* i, 111.

164/7 ‘*Anubhavana*—being coessential with’: *anu-* = ‘parallel with’ or ‘co-’, and the *√bhu* ‘to be’, which should not have its ontological significance obscured here by another rendering, recollecting that the formula of Dependent Arising is intended to describe the structure (and potentiality for cessation) of both positive and negative being (*bhava*) as well as its complexity; here the *Craving* for the affectivity-stimulation of *feeling* induces *assuming* future being . . .

164/8 ‘*Taṇhā*—craving’: see n. 42/1. For *ajjhosāna* (‘cleaving to’) see, e.g., def. of *ajjhosāya tiṭṭhati* at *MA.* ii, 311 ‘*taṇhājḥhosānena gīlitvā pariniṭṭhapetvā gārhāti*’.

164/9 ‘*Upādāna*—assuming’: mostly rendered by ‘clinging’; but see Intro. (sect. 14).

164/10 ‘*Bhava*—being (existence)’: for rendering see *KhpA.* Trsln. Appx. I.

164/11 ‘*Pātubhavana*—giving manifest being’: fm. *pātu(r)* (‘manifest’) + *√bhu* (‘to be’); *birth* (as historical beginning) brings the individualized 5-category process into manifest renewed existence.

has the characteristic of overripening the essentials of existence;¹² it is the footing for death. *Death* has the characteristic of interrupting the life-faculty; it is the footing for sorrow. *Sorrow (soka)* causes care (*ussukka*); it is the footing for lamentation. *Lamentation* causes constant crying out; it is the footing for pain. *Pain* is oppression of body; it is the footing for grief. *Grief* is oppression of cognizance; it is the footing for despair. *Despair* causes surrendering;¹³ it is the footing for being (cf. *Pe* 117-18).

[*How Being comes about*]

165. When these factors of being (existence)¹ are (exist) [by their] having occurrence in harmony, [then] that [is] being (existence); that [is] the footing for the roundabout [of rebirths].

[*Further Definitions*]

166. *The Path* has the characteristic of giving outlet; it is the footing for cessation.

167. Knowledge of watering-places is the footing for knowledge of what it is to have drunk [enough] (see *M.* i, 220). Knowledge of what it is to have drunk [enough] is the footing for knowledge of the

164/12 '*Upadhi*—essentials of existence': *upa* + $\sqrt{dhā}$ (to put). What is meant is any necessity for life in the widest possible sense. But cf. *Pe* 117: *indriyānaṃ paribhedo upanāho* (*sic*, read *upadāho* or *upadhi?*) *paripāko* and (p. 118) *upanaya-* (*sic*, read also *upadāha-* or *upadhi?*) *paripākalakkhaṇā jarā*. **164/13** '*Odahana*—surrendering' (if this translation is correct): the meaning 'putting in, fig. attention, devotion' in *PED*, this ref., will not do since it has no regard for the context. *NettiA* says '*Avadahanam, attano nissayassa santappanam eva*' ('= *avadahana*, simply tormenting one's own physical support'—p. 79).

165/1 '*Bhavanga*—factor of being': *NettiA* says '*Bhavangāni* means either "factors of being" or "factors called being". Of these, the defilements are "factors of being" and the round of action's ripening is the "factors called being". "Harmony" means all of this' (p. 70). The term is very frequently used by Ācariya Buddhaghosa and others to explain the continuity of cognizance. While they have taken this term from the *Paṭṭhāna*, which is the only place where it occurs in the Tipiṭaka (though without explanation—*Ptn.* 159, 160, 169, 324), no Piṭaka commentary offers any explanation of it. Its meaning here is not quite the same, perhaps, and seems to be the more simple one that each item (from 'ignorance' down as far as 'assumption') in the formula of Dependent Arising is to be considered as a 'factor of being' (itself a member of the formula).

[right] amount.¹ Knowledge of the [right] amount (*mattaññutā*) is the footing for self-knowledge (*attaññutā*).² Self-knowledge is the footing for the state of having previously performed merit. The state of having previously performed merit is the footing for living in befitting places. Living in befitting places is the footing for waiting on true men. Waiting on true men is the footing for right disposition in self-guidance (see *A.* ii, 32). Right disposition in self-guidance is the footing for the kinds of virtue. The kinds of virtue are the footing for gladness. Gladness is the footing for tranquillity. Tranquillity is the footing for pleasure. Pleasure is the footing for concentration. Concentration is the footing for knowing and seeing how [things] are. Knowing and seeing how [things] are is the footing for dispassion. Dispassion is the footing for fading of lust. Fading of lust is the footing for deliverance. Deliverance is the footing for knowing and seeing of deliverance. 168. In this way all kinds of general-support, all kinds of conditions, are a footing.¹

169. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said :

‘The Victor teaching an idea
Teaches what that idea has too
As footing; so with all ideas:
This is the Mode Conveying Footings’ (§8).

The Mode Conveying Footings is ended.

*

5

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying Characteristics*]

170. [30] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Characteristics ? The Mode of Conveying Characteristics is this:

167/1 *NettiA* reads *pattaññutā* for *mattaññutā* and explains as ‘knowledge of what one has reached through keeping in being’ (p. 79). But all eds. confirm *PTS*, which suggests *bhojane mattaññutā* (see *M.* iii, 2), though the connexion is not then very clear.

167/2 ‘*Attaññutā*—knowledge of self’ is ‘knowing oneself to be possessed of the five factors of endeavour (see *A.* iii, 65)’ according to *NettiA*. This rejects taking *atta* here as pp. of $\bar{a} + \sqrt{d\bar{a}}$ (‘knowledge of what has been taken up’), cf. *asamatta* (§§575f.).

168/1 *C*, *Ba* and *Bb* support *PTS*, but *NettiA* reads *yo koci upanissayo balavapaccayo*, though it cites an alternative reading *exam yā kāci upanissā yogato ca paccayato ca*, which suggests a remarkable corruption worthy of the *Pe* texts. The sentence is repeated below at §463.

'When one idea is mentioned, all
Ideas of like characteristic
Are mentioned too: this constitutes
The Mode Conveying Characteristics' (§9).¹

171. How does it characterize? [It does so as follows: When] certain ideas have a single [common] characteristic, then when one of those ideas is stated, the rest of those ideas are stated.

172. How would that be? According [for example] as the Blessed One said: <*Bhikkhus, the eye is unstable, small, trifling, fleeting: besides (?) it is painful, destructible, liable to dislodgement, ashes (?)¹, a determination (?)*; it is a victim for slaughter in the midst of enemies> (). Now when this eye is stated, the rest of the bases in oneself [beginning with the ear] are stated. For what reason?

Because all the bases in oneself have a single [common] characteristic in the sense of victim for slaughter².

173. And according as the Blessed One said: <*Rāḍha, do not look back¹ with yearning to past form; do not expectantly relish future form; practise the way to dispassion, fading of lust, ceasing, giving up, and relinquishment, as to presently-arisen form*> (). Now when this form category is stated, the rest of the categories are stated. For what reason? Because in the *Yamakovāda Sutta* (S. iii, 113) all the five categories of assumption have a single characteristic in the sense of victim for slaughter.

174. And according as the Blessed One said:

<*They whose mindfulness of body
Is constantly well instigated
Do never what should not be done
And ever do what should be done*> (Dh. 293; Pe 91).

So when Mindfulness Occupied with the Body is stated, Mindfulness Occupied with Feeling and that Occupied with Cognizance and that Occupied with Ideas are stated (see *D. Sutta* 22, *M. Sutta* 119). And likewise when anything whatever that is seen or heard or

170/1 I.e., one being stated, the rest are implied positively or negatively.

172/1 This untraced quotation, which *NettiA* and *Ṭīkā* ignore, is full of difficulties. It is not clear how *parato* (rendered 'besides') is to be taken; it could mean 'alien'. Also the words *kukkulaṃ* and *sankhāraṃ* are obscure in this context.

172/2 Read *vadhakapṭṭhena*.

173/1 In view of '*paṭipajja*' at end of sentence, read *hohi* for *hoti*.

sensed¹ is stated, what is cognized is stated. And the Blessed One said accordingly: [31] <Therefore, bhikkhus, abide contemplating the body as a body, ardent, aware and mindful, guiding out covetousness and grief about the world> (cf. *M.* iii, 83).

Now 'ardent' [here means] the energy faculty, 'aware' the understanding faculty, 'mindful' the mindfulness faculty, and 'guiding out covetousness and grief' the concentration faculty. So when someone abides contemplating the body as a body the four Foundations of Mindfulness come to fulfilment through keeping in being. For what reason? Because of the four faculties' state of having a single characteristic.

175. When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are kept in being the four Right Endeavours come to fulfilment through keeping in being. When the four Right Endeavours are kept in being the four Bases for Success (Roads to Power) come to fulfilment through keeping in being. When the four Bases for Success are kept in being the five Faculties [beginning with Faith] come to fulfilment through keeping in being. When the five Faculties are kept in being the five Powers¹ come to fulfilment through keeping in being. When the five Powers are kept in being the seven Enlightenment Factors come to fulfilment through keeping in being. When the seven Enlightenment Factors are kept in being the Noble Eight-Factored Path² comes to fulfilment through keeping in being. And all ideas that tend to enlightenment and partake of enlightenment come to fulfilment through keeping in being. For what reason? Because all ideas that tend to enlightenment and partake of enlightenment have a single characteristic with their characteristic of giving outlet. They come to fulfilment through keeping in being owing to their singleness of characteristic (see also §§451-2).

174/1 '*Muta*—sensed': a comprehensive term for what is smelt, tasted and touched (see *Nd2 ad Sn.* 789); apparently never means 'thought, supposed, imagined' as given in *PED*, which is probably due to faulty etymology. The root is not at present certain. It may be noted that a Sanskrit version of the Pali *dīṭṭha-suta-muta-viññāta* is *dr̥ṣṭe . . . śrute cintite vijñāte* (see Lamotte, p. 608) which is divergent from the Pali commentaries' explanation of *muta* (see *Niddesa*, etc.).

175/1 The '5 Powers' (*bala*) are the same five as the '5 faculties' (*indriya*) but considered from the point of view, not of their 'potentiality' or 'predominance' when arisen as faculties, but of their 'unshakability' when kept in being as powers against their respective opposites (see *Ps.* i, 21).

175/2 'Eight-factored path' is merely more literal than the more elegant and familiar 'eightfold path'.

176. Also unprofitable ideas are abandoned and disappear owing to their singleness of characteristic. When the four Foundations of Mindfulness are kept in being the Perversions are abandoned, the Nutriments come to diagnosis, one becomes free from assuming as regards the Assumptions, one is unfettered from the Bonds, one is dissociated from the Ties, one is untainted by the Taints, one has crossed over the Floods, one is barbless as regards the Barbs, the Steadying-Points for Consciousness¹ come to one's diagnosis, and one goes no bad way as regards the Goings on the Bad Ways (cf. §§484-7). [32] In this way also one's unprofitable ideas are abandoned and disappear.

177. Or else, wherein a faculty having form [such as the eye, etc.] is taught, therein too are taught the form element, the form category, and the form base.

178. Or else, wherein pleasant feeling is taught, therein too are taught the pleasure faculty, the joy faculty, and the origin of suffering as a Noble Truth.

179. Or else, wherein painful feeling is taught, therein too are taught the pain faculty, the grief faculty, and suffering as a Noble Truth.

180. Or else, wherein neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling is taught, therein too are taught the onlooking-equanimity faculty, and all dependent arising.¹ For what reason? Because ignorance underlies neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling (see *M. i*, 303); with ignorance as condition, determinations; with determinations as condition, consciousness; with consciousness as condition, name-and-form; with name-and-form as condition, the sixfold base; with the sixfold base as condition, contact; with contact as condition,

176/1 '*Vinnāṇaṭṭhiti*—steady-ing-point for consciousness': these are explained to some extent in §§304, 306 (see also refs. in Index). Four kinds are given at *D. iii*, 228 and seven (on a different basis) at *D. iii*, 253. *PED* rather obscures than clarifies; for 'duration' and 'phase' are not directly intended, but rather the particular 'original choice' by which consciousness first roots itself on its basic object, upon which ramification takes place into the experience of life. At death the 'steady-ing-point' is lost and another assumed by the action of craving, and so a new life ramifies out again upon that. And so on. (See also *S. ii*, 65 quoted at §840).

180/1 *NettiA* says 'The construction is: The whole formula of Dependent Arising is taught too; for the neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling is underlain owing to the underlying tendency to ignorance (see *M. i*, 303). So this kind of feeling implies ignorance, and ignorance implies the whole Dependent-Arising formula, of which it is the initial member' (p. 83).

feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, assuming; with assuming as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; with birth as condition ageing and death have actual being, and also sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief, and despair; that is how there is an origin to this whole category of suffering (cf. *S. ii*, 1).

181. Now this [Dependent Arising] can be brought to abandonment by way of that which is on the side of corruption through its being affected by lust, affected by hate, and affected by delusion; and it can be brought to abandonment by way of the noble ideas that are without lust, without hate, and without delusion.¹

182. In this way, as regards those ideas that have a single characteristic in their function¹ and in their characteristic and in their generality, and also in their death and reappearance, when one of these ideas is stated the rest of such ideas are also stated.

183. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

‘When one idea is mentioned, all
Ideas of like characteristic
Are mentioned too: this constitutes
The Mode Conveying Characteristics’ (§9).

The Mode of Conveying Characteristics is ended.

*

181/1 For *hātabba* see n. 44/1. *NettiA* (p. 83) explains thus: “‘And’ has the meaning of the negative (*byatireka*, i.e., cessation), whereby he illustrates how this Dependent Arising is twofold as “with” and “against”, as will be stated later. What is called “that on the side of corruption” (namely “arising”) is the former and the other (namely “cessation”) the latter’. Here the *hātabba* phrase can probably be taken in the sense of ‘brought to the abandonment of craving by appropriate reasoning’.

182/1 *NettiA* distinguishes as follows: “‘Function’ means that of, say, earth’s upholding as a constituent of form, or contact’s making coincide (see n. 164/6), which is formless, or any arisen condition-idea’s conditioning of any appropriately conditionally-arisen idea. “Characteristic” means any individual-essence such as earth’s hardness, or contact’s touching. “Generality” means any such kind as the “deformability” (*ruppana*) of form (*rūpa*), the “bent-for-naming” (*namana*) of name (*nāma*). “Death and reappearance” means the dissolution and rearing of determined ideas, or the co-arising and co-ceasing of form and formless (see n. 92/1)’.

6

[The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying a Fourfold Array]

184. Herein, what is the Conveying of a Fourfold Array? [It is] this:

‘By way of phrasing, (i) the Linguistic,
(ii) the Purport, and (iii) the teaching’s Source,
And (iv) the Consecutive-Sequence:
This Mode Conveys a Fourfold Array’ (§10).

By way of the phrasing, the Thread’s Linguistic, its purport (intention), its source [as the circumstance of its utterance], and its consecutive-sequence, should be examined.

[(i) *Linguistic*]

185. [33] Herein, what is the linguistic? It is any language employing terms, any knowledge of ideas by name.¹

186. For when a bhikkhu knows the name of a meaning and knows the name of an idea, and he applies¹ it accordingly, he is called skilled in meanings and skilled in ideas, skilled in phrasing, skilled in language, skilled in consecutivity (syntax), skilled in the teaching, skilled in designations of past [tenses], skilled in designations of future [tenses], skilled in designations of presently-arisen [tenses], skilled in designations of the feminine [gender], skilled in designations of the masculine [gender], skilled in designations of the neuter [gender], skilled in designations of the singular [number], skilled in designations of the plural [number] (cf. *Pe* 91-2).² All regional linguistics (cf. *M.* iii, 234-5) and all regional languages can be treated in this way. This is ‘language employing terms’.

[(ii) *Purport (intent)*]

187. Herein, what is the purport (intent)? [Take, for example the following passage:]

185/1 N.b. *nāma* (‘name’) is also the grammarians’ collective term for nouns, adjectives and pronouns, as one of the ‘four Parts of Speech’ in Oriental grammar (*nāma*, *ākhyāta*, *upasagga*, *nipāta* = ‘names, verbs, prepositions (prefixes), and particles’).

186/1 The semantic connexion here between *abhiniropeti* and *nirutti* implies a punning association of *nirutti* with √*ruh* instead of √*vac* (cf. *vutta*; Skr. √*uk*).

186/2 Note differences in these terms at *Pe* 91-2.

*<The True Ideal guards him that walks therein
As does a big umbrella in time of rain.
The Ideal's reward, when walked in right, is this:
Who walks therein has no bad destination> (§37).*

What is the Blessed One's purport (intent) here? [It is that] those who desire to be liberated from the states of deprivation will be those who walk in the True Idea: this is the Blessed One's purport here.

188. [Again:]

*<Just as a robber taken in house-breaking
Is haunted by and responsible¹ for his act,
So too a man hereafter, when departed,
Is haunted by and responsible for his act> (cf. M. ii, 74).*

What is the Blessed One's purport (intent) here? [It is that] when acts have been done by someone's own choice and stored up to be felt (experienced) as pain, their un-wished-for and disagreeable ripening will be coessential [with a future state]. This is the Blessed One's purport here.

189. [Again:]

*<Who with the rod is cruel to beings
That are desirous to find pleasure
Shall find no pleasure when departed,
For all the pleasure he may seek> (Dh. 131).*

What is the Blessed One's purport here? [It is that] those who would seek pleasure, let them not do evil acts: this is the Blessed One's purport here.

190. [34] [Again:]

*<A dullard drowsy with much gluttony,
Engrossed in sleep, who wallows as he lies
Like a great porker stuffed with fattening food,
Comes ever and again back to the world> (Dh. 325).*

What is the Blessed One's purport here? [It is that] those who desire to be distressed¹ by ageing and death will be such as know the [right] amount in eating, keep the doors of their faculties

188/1 'Sa-kammunā . . . bajjhate—is responsible for his act'; for this sense of *bajjhati* (lit. 'is bound'), not in *PED*, see §912, also *KhpA.* 28f.

190/1 'Attijitun—lit 'to feel hurt by'; an allusion to *A.* i, 145.

guarded, are devoted to wakefulness in the first and last [of the three] watches of the night (see *M.* iii, 2), practise insight with regard to profitable ideas, and respect their companions in the divine life whether elder or new or middle [bhikkhus]:² this is the Blessed One's purport here.

191. [Again:]

*<The Deathless State is diligence;
That of Mortality, neglect:
The diligent will never die;
As good as dead the negligent> (Dh. 21; Pe 92).*

What is the Blessed One's purport here? [It is that] those who desire to pursue the search for the Deathless will abide diligent. This is the Blessed One's purport here.

[(iii) Source]

192. Herein, what is a source? [It is the reason for the utterance of a Thread, for example,] according as the cattle-owner Dhaniya¹ said to the Blessed One

*<'A man with children finds relish through his children;
And a cattle-owner likewise through his cattle.
These essentials of existence are a man's relish;
Who has them not will never relish find'> (Sn. 33),*

and as the Blessed One replied

*<'A man with children finds sorrow through his children;
And a cattle-owner likewise through his cattle.
These essentials of existence are a man's sorrow;
Who has them not will never sorrow find'> (Sn. 34; cf. Pe 55).*

Here² it is known that with this as circumstance, with this as source, the Blessed One speaks of an external chattel as an essential of existence.

190/2 An 'elder bhikkhu' has ten or more years' seniority since full admission (*upasampadā*), a 'middle bhikkhu' has five to ten, and a 'new bhikkhu' has less than five. Full admission can be given as soon as the 20th year from conception is completed.

192/1 In the *Sn.* text it is not Dhaniya but Māra who says this.

192/2 *Idha* seems to belong better to the preceding *nāyati* than to the succeeding *bhagavā . . . āha*.

193. And according as, when the Evil One, Māra, let fall a large stone from the Vulture-Peak Rock, the Blessed One said

*<‘Even if you choose to move
The whole of Vulture-Peak, for sure
No fully freed Awakened One
Would be perturbed on that account’> (S. i, 109),*

[and]

*‘Were heaven to split, were earth to quake, were all
The things that breathe to fear, were you to plunge
A dagger in his heart, no Wakened One
Takes shelter in essentials of existence’> (S. i, 107).*

Here it is known that with this as circumstance, with this as source, the Blessed One speaks of the body as an essential of existence.

194. And according as he said

*<‘The steadfast will never call that a strong bond
Made of iron or consisting of wood or of thongs.¹
But greed flushed with lusting for jewels [and gems]
And concern for a wife and for children as well: . . .’>
But greed flushed with lusting for jewels [and gems]
(S. i, 77; see next para).*

Here it is known that with this as circumstance, with this as source, the Blessed One speaks of craving for external things.

195. And according as he said

*<‘’Tis these that the steadfast will call a strong bond,
Which pulls a man down, subtle, hard to get free from;
Yet this too they sever and wander [in freedom],
Unconcerned, and [all] sensual pleasures foregone’>
(S. i, 77; Pe 25, 214).*

Here it is known that with this as circumstance, with this as source, the Blessed One speaks of abandoning craving for external things.

196. And according as he said

194/1 PED (this ref.) equates *pabbaja* (here rendered by ‘thongs’) with *babbaja* (a kind of grass with a tangle of roots), but that does not work out well from the context. *Pabbaja* here could be made up of *pabba* (‘section’, ‘joint-to-joint-length of creeper’, etc.) and *ja* (‘born of’, ‘made of’). SA ignores.

< *This sick impure foul thing, stinking,
Oozing with carcase-exudations
[Unceasingly] by day and night:
[Only] a fool could relish it* > (cf. *Thag.* 394).

Here it is known that with this as circumstance, with this as source, the Blessed One speaks of abandoning craving for things in oneself.
197. And according as he said

[36] < *Cut off affection for the self,
As with the hand an autumn lily;
And so pursue the path of peace,
The Quenching the Sublime One taught* > (*Dh.* 285).

Here it is known that, with this as circumstance, with this as a source, the Blessed One speaks of abandoning craving for things in oneself.

[(iv) Consecutive Sequence]

198. Herein, what is Consecutive Sequence? It is according to what the Blessed One said, namely:

< *Caught in the net of sensual murk,
And blocked by craving's bondage,
Fenced in by fences of neglect
Like fishes in a funnel-trap,
They follow after ageing and death
As does the sucking-calf its mother* > (*Pe* 24; *Ud.* 76).

What is stated is craving for sensual desires. What consecutive sequence is that construable by?

199. It is according as he said

< *Who lusts no meaning ever knows,
Who lusts sees never an idea;
The murk of darkness laps a man
When he will suffer lust to be* > (§68).

200. So it is that same craving that is expressed by [the terms] 'murk' and being 'caught' (§198). And when it is said 'caught in the net of sensual murk, And blocked by craving's bondage' (§198), and when it is said 'Who lusts no meaning ever knows, Who lusts sees never an idea' (§199), it is that same craving that is expressed by these terms [which illustrate] obsession.

201. The 'murk' (§198) is the origin of suffering, and that is the craving that gives renewal of being.

202. And when it is said 'sensual' (§198) this is sensual-desire as defilement; and when it is said 'caught in the net' (§198) obsession is shown by those same sensual desires as means. Consequently craving is called a 'fence' (§198) by way of defilement and by way of obsession. It is such as these that 'follow after ageing and death' (§198).

203. [37] The following verse, as it is presented by the Blessed One, is given in order to show by what power¹ they 'follow after ageing and death':

*<Who has no steadying points, no diversification,²
Who has outstripped the Chain and Bar beside:
Not even the world with all its gods can know
The conduct of that Stilled One free from craving> (Ud. 77).*

204. The 'diversifications' are craving, views, and conceit, and the determinations thereby actively determined. The 'steadying-points' are the underlying-tendencies.¹ The 'Chain' is obsession by craving, which is the thirty-six ways explored by the net of craving (see A. ii, 211ff.). The 'Bar' is delusion. The determinations [determined] by the diversifications, and the steadying-points, and the Chain, and the Bar: whoever has surmounted all those is called 'free from craving'.

203/1 Read as two words either *yathānikkhiitagāthā balena* or . . . *phalena*? §205 suggests the latter but §209 the former.

203/2 For *papañca* ('diversification' or 'dialectic') in the sense in which 'p.' is used in the Suttas as the contrary of *nibbāna* (called *appapañca* and *nippapañca*), see *KhpA.* trsln, Appx. I 'Nirodha'; see also §297. It could be emphasized that *papañca* in these contexts is not well translated by 'multiplicity', which would make *nibbāna* (as *nippapañca*) unilaterally 'unity'. The Pali terms for 'multiplicity' and 'unity' are *nānatta* and *ekatta* respectively, which are used for 'form' (*rūpa-saññā*: *M.* i, 41) and its opposite, namely the four formless (*arūpa*) states. Such rendering of *papañca* and *nippapañca* must invite the only too easy confusion between the (*sankhata*) *arūpa-dhātu* and the *asankhata-dhātu* (*nibbāna*). But both form and the formless are alike 'determined'. The 'diversification' or 'dialectic' between mere 'multiplicity' and 'unity' being itself a determination, whereas *nibbāna* remains undetermined. For multiplicity/unity and *nibbāna* see, e.g., *Sn.* 714. *Nibbāna* would seem misconceived as 'an absolute-opposed-to-particularity' ('*kaṣiṇa*', '*advaya*'), or as, philosophically, 'the Absolute'.

204/1 But cf. §§484ff. for the 'steadying-points' (*ṭhiti*). This definition of *ṭhiti* by *anusaya* is unusual. See also n. 176/1.

205. Herein, determinations due to obsession can be felt (experienced) here and now [in their ripening] or they can be felt on next reappearance, or they can be felt in some subsequent period. So craving gives fruit in three ways: here and now [in this existence], or on next reappearance, or in some subsequent period.

206. So the Blessed One said: *<Whatever action he does effected out of greed by body or speech or mind, makes his existence coessential with its ripening, either here and now or on next reappearance or in some subsequent period>* (cf. A. i, 134).

This is construed with a consecutive sequence of the Blessed One's statements.

207. Herein, obsession is action [whose ripening] can be felt here and now, or it is action [whose ripening can be felt] on next reappearance, or it is action [whose ripening can be felt] in some subsequent period. So action ripens¹ in these three ways: here and now [in this existence] or on next reappearance or in some subsequent period. According as it is said:

208. *<And when a fool is one who here kills breathing things, . . . holds wrong view, in consequence he feels the ripening of that here and now or on next reappearance or in some subsequent period>* ().

[38] This is construed by a consecutive sequence of the Blessed One's [statements].

209. Herein, the obsession is abandonable by means of the power of deliberation, the determinations are abandonable by means of the power of seeing, and the thirty-six ways explored by craving are abandonable by means of the power of keeping-in-being. So craving is abandonable in three ways.

210. 'Freedom from craving' (§203) is the element of extinction with trace left, but with the dissolution of the body it is the element of extinction without trace left. 'Diversification' (§203) is what keeping bound together¹ is called.

211. And when the Blessed One says *<He diversifies instigated by a past, a future, or a presently-arisen form cognizable by the eye>* (

207/1 *Vipaccati*. Perhaps neither this word nor *paccati* nor their derivatives should be translated by 'to cook' in *kamma* contexts, especially where mention is made of the hells, despite the fires, 'Ripening out' of bad action in hell is what is meant, in the sense of its finding its moment for ripening and at the same time expending itself. The metaphor seems from the ripening of fruit, rather than from the kitchen-stove.

210/1 'Anubandha—keeping bound together': In the sense of keeping ideas of opposites tied together or in the sense of 'obstructing'? *NettiA* says only '*Taṇhādinam anuppabandhanapavatti*' (p. 86).

), and when the Blessed One says <Rādhā, do not look back with yearning to past form, do not expectantly relish future form, practise the way to dispassion, fading of lust, ceasing, giving up, and relinquishment, as to presently-arisen form> (§173), this is construed by the consecutivity of the Blessed One's [statement].

212. And while the diversifications, and the determinations, and the relishing of the past, future and presently-arisen, are a singularity, yet the teaching of the True Idea stated by the Blessed One with various other terms, with various other letters, with various other phrases, is of ungauged meaning (cf. §49).

213. That is how the Thread is demonstrated by collating Thread with Thread, adding the sequence together by consecutivity.¹

[4 kinds of Consecutive Sequence]

214. Now this consecutive sequence is of four kinds: meaning-sequence, phrasing-sequence, teaching-sequence, and demonstration-sequence.

215. (i) Herein, *meaning-sequence* is the six terms, namely explaining, displaying, divulging, analysing, exhibiting, and describing (§53).

216. (ii) *Phrasing-sequence* is the six terms, namely letter, term, phrase, mood, language, and demonstration (§53).

217. (iii) *Teaching-sequence*; he does not meditate with earth as support and yet he meditates as a meditator. He does not meditate with water . . . fire . . . [39] air . . . the base consisting of infiniteness of space . . . the base consisting of infiniteness of consciousness . . . the base consisting of no-owning . . . the base consisting of neither perception nor non-perception . . . He does not meditate with this world or the other as support, and yet he meditates as a meditator. And what is in between both—the seen, heard, sensed,¹ cognized, reached, sought, thought, explored, and cogitated over with the mind—he does not meditate with that as support too and yet he meditates as a meditator.² In the world with its gods, its Māras, and its High Divinities, in this generation with its monks and divines, its princes and men, when one such as this meditates with cognizance unsupported, he is not known (cf. *A.* v, 324f.). Just as

213/1 *Sandhim* seems a better reading than *saddhim* here.

217/1 See n. 174/1.

217/2 This sequence means the normal order of enumeration found in the Suttas. It is called *yathānusandhi* at *MA.* i, 175, as one of 3 kinds mentioned there.

Māra the Evil One, seeking the clansman Godhika's consciousness, neither knew nor saw it (*S. i*, 120f.; *Pe* 11); for with the abandoning of craving he had gone past diversification, and he had no more support for views. And as Godhika, so too Vakkali (*S. iii*, 119ff.). When such as these are meditating with unsupported cognizance they are not known by the world with its gods, its Māras, and its High Divinities, by this generation with its monks and divines, its princes and men.

This is teaching-sequence.

218. (iv) Herein, what is *demonstration-sequence*?

Those with supported cognizance (cf. §364) can be demonstrated by means of the unprofitable side; those with unsupported cognizance (cf. §364) can be demonstrated by means of the profitable side.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of corruption; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of cleansing.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of the occurrence of the roundabout; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of the non-occurrence of the roundabout.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of craving and ignorance; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of quiet and insight.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of consciencelessness and shamelessness; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of conscience and shame.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of unmindfulness and unawareness; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of mindfulness and awareness.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of what is no reason (see *M. iii*, 140) and [40] by means of unreasoned attention (see *M. i*, 7); and those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of what is a reason and by means of reasoned attention.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of idleness and difficult admonishability; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of instigation of energy and easy admonishability.¹

218/1 'Dovacassatā—difficult admonishability' and 'sovacassatā—easy admonishability' mean literally 'the state of one to whom it is difficult—easy—to speak (in order to point out his faults)'. They never mean respectively

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of faithlessness and negligence; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of faith and diligence.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of hearing what is not the true object of faith and by means of non-restraint; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of the true object of faith and by means of restraint.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of covetousness and ill-will; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of non-covetousness and non-ill-will.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of the hindrances and the fetters; those with unsupported cognizance by means of the heart-deliverance due to fading of lust and by means of the understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance.

Those with supported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of the annihilation view and by means of the eternity view; those with unsupported cognizance can be demonstrated by means of the element of extinction with trace left and the element of extinction without trace left.

This is demonstration-sequence.

219. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

‘By way of phrasing, the Linguistic,
The Purport, and the teaching’s Source,
And the Consecutive-Sequence:
This Mode Conveys a Fourfold Array’ (§10).

The Mode of Conveying a Fourfold Array is ended.

*

7

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying a Conversion*]

220. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Conversion? It is this:

‘The Mode that, when there is one Footing,
Searches for a footing that remains
And then converts the opposites
Is that Conveying a Conversion’ (§11).

‘ill-spoken’ and ‘well spoken’. See *Dhs.* 1325 and 1327; also *A.* v, 90 (*suvaṇṇa = khamo padakkhiṇagāhī anusāsaniṃ*). ‘Well-spoken’ = *kalyāṇavāca* (*A.* v, 155).

221. <Instigate [yourselves], launch out, devote
[Yourselves] in the Enlightened One's
Dispensation;
Scatter the armies of Mortality
As does an elephant a hut of reeds>

(*Pe* 71; *S. i*, 157).

[The words] 'Instigate yourselves, launch out' are the footing for energy. [The words] 'Devote yourselves in the Enlightened One's Dispensation' are the footing for concentration. [The words] 'Scatter the armies of Mortality as does an elephant a hut of reeds' are the footing for understanding.

[The words] 'Instigate yourselves, launch out' are the footing for the energy faculty. [The words] 'Devote yourselves in the Enlightened One's Dispensation' are the footing for the concentration faculty. [The words] 'Scatter the armies of Mortality as does an elephant a hut of reeds' are the footing for the understanding faculty.

[41] These footings constitute the teaching [beginning with 'Instigate yourselves'].

222. The instigation is for creatures who are either already devoting [themselves] or who are not yet devoting [themselves].

223. Herein, those not yet devoting [themselves] do not devote [themselves] owing to their being rooted in negligence. That negligence is of two kinds: rooted in craving and rooted in ignorance.

224. Herein, as to that [negligence] rooted in ignorance, such [negligence] as is shut in by such unknowing that it does not understand how the five categories are inseparable from the idea of arising and subsidence is rooted in negligence.

Such [negligence] rooted in craving is of three kinds: (i) when someone seeks for the arising of unarisen properties he falls into negligence; [and when he seeks] (ii) the sign of preservation, and (iii) the sign of use, of the arisen properties, he falls into negligence.

These are the four kinds of negligence in the world: one kind due to ignorance and three kinds due to craving.

225. Herein, the name-body is the footing for ignorance, [and] the form-body is the footing for craving. Why is that? In the kinds of being (existence) having form there is cleaving to them, and in the formless kinds of being (existence) there is confusion [about them].

226. Herein, the form-body¹ is the form category, [and] the name-body is the four formless categories (cf. §§84 and 445).

227. With assumption in virtue of what is it that the five are categories of assumption? In virtue of craving and ignorance.

228. Herein, craving is two kinds of assumption, namely sensual-desire assumption and virtue-and-duty assumption, while ignorance is two kinds of assumption, namely view assumption and self-doctrine assumption.¹

229. Any categories of assumption (see *M.* iii, 16) [so called] in virtue of these four kinds of assumption, are suffering. The Blessed One teaches the True Idea for the [respective] diagnosis and abandoning of them: for the diagnosis of suffering and the abandoning of its origin.

230. Herein, any one of the three kinds of negligence rooted in craving (1) seeks for the arising of unarisen properties, and (2) works for the preservation, and (3) the sign of use of the arisen properties.

231. Quiet guards against and prevents that [negligence] by means of full penetration. How is that? When one knows, in the case of sensual desires, the gratification as gratification, the disappointment [42] as disappointment, the escape as escape, and also degradation, corruption, and cleansing, and the benefits of renunciation, then any inquiry, any scrutiny, therein is insight. These two ideas come to fulfilment through keeping in being, that is to say quiet and insight. When these two ideas are kept in being, two ideas are abandoned, namely craving and ignorance. When these two ideas are abandoned the four kinds of assuming cease; with cessation of assuming, cessation of being; with cessation of being, cessation of birth; with cessation of birth, ageing and death cease, and also sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair; that is how there is a cessation to this whole category of suffering.

232. So there are the first two truths, namely Suffering and Origin; and quiet and insight are the Path; and cessation of being is Extinction. These are the four Truths. That is why the Blessed One said 'Instigate yourselves, launch out, . . . '.

*

233. <Just as a tree, though felled, sprouts up again
As long as firm its root is and intact,
So too this pain springs ever and anon
With tendency to craving unimpaired> (*Dh.* 338).

228/1 For 'assumption (assuming)' see n. 164/9. Here and at §257 the 4 kinds are the same as in the Suttas (e.g., *M.* i, 67), but at §§484-7 and 678 *silabbatūpādāna* is replaced by *bhavūpādāna*. Does the latter appear outside this work except at *Pe* 94?

This is the underlying-tendency to craving. To what kind of craving? To craving for being (existence). The condition for that idea is ignorance; for it is with ignorance as condition that there is craving for being (existence). These are the two defilements namely craving and ignorance. And these are the four kinds of assumption (see §228).

234. Any categories of assumption [so called] in virtue of these four kinds of assumption are Suffering. The four kinds of assumption are Origin, while the five categories are the suffering. The Blessed One teaches the True Idea for their [respective] diagnosis and abandoning: for the diagnosis of Suffering and the abandoning of Origin.

235. [43] That whereby one eradicates the underlying-tendency to craving is quiet; that whereby one shuts off ignorance, the condition for the underlying-tendency to craving, is insight. These two ideas come to fulfilment through keeping in being, namely quiet and insight.

236. Herein, the fruit of quiet is the heart-deliverance due to fading of lust; the fruit of insight is the understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance.

237. So there are the first two truths, namely Suffering, and its Origin; and quiet and insight are the Path; and the two kinds of deliverance are Cessation. These are the four Truths. That is why the Blessed One said 'Just as a tree . . .' (§233).

*

238. <No doing any kind of evil,
Perfecting profitable skill,
And purifying one's own heart:
This is the Buddhas' Dispensation>

(Pe 54, 91; Dh. 183; D. ii, 49).

What is called 'any kind of evil' is the three kinds of misconduct, namely bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct. These are the ten unprofitable courses of action, namely killing breathing things, taking what is not given, and misconduct in sensual-desires; false speech, malicious speech, harsh speech, and gossip; and covetousness, ill will, and wrong view.¹

238/1 The 1st 3 are known as bodily, the next 4 as verbal, and the last 3 as mental, unprofitable action.

239. These are two kinds of action, namely choice and concomitant of cognizance (cf. *Pe* 35-6).¹

240. Herein, killing breathing things, malicious speech and harsh speech are moulded by hate; taking what is not given, misconduct in sensual-desires, and false speech are moulded by greed; and gossip is moulded by delusion. These seven kinds of acting are action as choice.¹

241. Covetousness is greed as a root of the unprofitable; ill will is hate as a root of the unprofitable; wrong view is the wrong path. These three kinds of acting are action as concomitant of cognizance. That is why it was said 'action as choice and action as concomitant of cognizance' (see §239).

242. When a root of the unprofitable comes to [expression by] the means [consisting of body or speech], it comes to [expression as] one [of the four] bad ways, namely those through will, hate, fear, or delusion.

243. [44] Herein, when it comes to [expression as] the bad way through will, it is moulded by greed; when it comes to [expression as] the bad way through hate, it is moulded by hate; when it comes to [expression as] the bad ways through fear and delusion, it is moulded by delusion.

244. Herein, greed is abandoned by means of [contemplating] ugliness, hate by means of loving kindness, and delusion by means of understanding. Likewise, greed is abandoned by means of onlooking-equanimity, and hate by means of loving kindness and compassion, and delusion is abandoned and disappears by means of sympathetic-gladness. That is why the Blessed One said 'No doing any kind of evil, . . .' (§243).

245. And what is called 'any kind of evil' is the eight wrongnesses, namely wrong view, wrong intention, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness, and wrong

239/1 This twofold division seems peculiar to this work and the *Pe*. From the following paragraphs, the first obviously stands for bodily and verbal action together and the second for mental.

240/1 The analysis of action here is more easily grasped if the following distinctions are kept in mind. A 'course of action' (*kammāpatha*) is a completed 'historical act' regarded as continuing from the first planning of it down to the carrying of it out, which 'course' involves body and/or speech. The 'choice' (*cetanā*) here is the momentary mental 'willing' (or 'affirmation') at each and every stage of the 'course'. 'Mental action'—'action as concomitant of cognizance' here—is simply covetousness, ill will, and wrong view, and their respective profitable opposites. See *DhsA*. 82ff.

concentration. These are called 'any kind of evil'. Any non-effecting, non-doing, non-practising, of these eight wrongnesses is called 'no doing any kind of evil'.

246. When the eight wrongnesses are abandoned, the eight rightnesses reach excellence (*sampajjanti*). Any effecting of, producing excellence in (*sampādana*), the eight rightnesses is called 'perfecting (*upasampadā*) profitable skill'.

247. 'And purifying one's own heart' is the effecting, keeping in being, of the <Ancient Path> (S. ii, 105),¹ it is mindfulness of that. When the heart is purified, the categories become purified. That is why the Blessed One said <*Bhikkhus, a divine life is lived under a Perfect One for the purpose of purification of the heart*> ()

248. The purifying is of two kinds, namely the abandoning of hindrances and the eradication of underlying-tendencies. Also there are two planes of purifying, namely the plane of seeing and the plane of keeping-in-being.

249. Herein, that by the penetration of which one purifies is Suffering. That from which one purifies is the Origin. That by which one purifies is the Path. And that which is purified is Cessation (cf. *Pe* 91). These are the four Truths. Hence the Blessed One said 'No doing any kind of evil . . .' (§238).

*

250. <The True Idea guards him that walks therein,

As does a big umbrella in time of rain.

[45] The Ideal's reward when walked in right is this:

Who walks therein has no bad destination>

(§37).

What is called 'the True Idea' is of two kinds, namely (1) faculty-restraint and (2) the Path. A 'bad destination' is of two kinds, as follows: compared with gods and human beings, the states of unease

247/1 The 'Ancient Path' does not refer to a path other than the 'Noble Path' as suggested by note 1 at *PTS Netti*, p. 222. The alternative (*vā*) in the commentary seems to wish to refer the word 'ancient' (*atīta*) either to 'the ancient noble path discovered by former Buddhas including the Buddha Vipassī' or to 'the noble path discovered by the ancient Buddha Vipassī'. It is the same path that all Buddhas discover.

are a bad destination; but compared with extinction, all kinds of reappearance are a bad destination.

251. (1) Herein, in the case of virtue as restraint, there is the keeping of it untorn (see *A.* iv, 53, and §299 below), and this True Idea when walked in right guards one from the states of unease. Accordingly the Blessed One said <*Bhikkhus, there are two kinds of destination for one who is virtuous: the gods and human beings*> ().

And accordingly the Gāmaṇī Asibandhakaputta said to the Blessed One in the town of Nālandā <‘Venerable sir, there are Divines of the West Country (?),¹ who use a kamaṇḍalu (ascetic’s drinking-vessel),² who wear water-weed garlands, who [morning and evening] go down to the water, and who worship fires. When someone is deceased and dead they cajole and coerce³ him, trying to get him a footing in⁴ heaven. Now, venerable sir, is the Blessed One capable of so doing that all the world, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappears in a good destination, in the heavenly world?’—‘As to that, Gāmaṇī, I shall ask you a question in return; answer it as you like. How do you conceive this, Gāmaṇī? Here a man might be a killer of breathing things, a taker of what is not given, misconducted in sensual desires, a speaker of falsehood, a malicious speaker, a harsh speaker, a gossip, covetous, with ill will in his heart, and wrong in his view. Then a large body of people met and foregathered, and they begged and implored and beseeched with hands extended palms together “Oh let this man, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in a good destination, in the heavenly world”, how do you conceive this, Gāmaṇī, because of that large body of people’s begging, because of their imploring, because of their beseeching with hands extended palms together, would that man, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in a happy destination in the heavenly world?’—‘No, venerable sir.’—‘Gāmaṇī, suppose a

251/1 See *SA.* iii, 104.

251/2 *Kamaṇḍalukā* = *Kuṇḍikā* (*Abhp.* 443). *SA* has only ‘sakamaṇḍaluno’. ‘Kassa jalassa maṇḍo pasannabhāvo kamaṇḍo, tam lāti ti kamaṇḍalu’ (*Abhp.* *Ṭikā*).

251/3 *NettiA* glosses *uyyāpenti* (‘urge’) by *upari yāpenti* (= *SA.* iii, 104), and *saññāpenti* (‘coerce’) by *sammā yāpenti* (p. 92; *SA*: *sammā ñāpenti*—a misspelling?). So *saññāpenti* appears as a spelling of *saṃyāpenti* (cf. *saññojana* for *saṃyojana*), and both words are causatives fm. $\sqrt{yā}$ with prefixes *u(d)* and *saṃ* respectively. Neither is in *PED*. (*Saññāpeti* is also a possible causative form of *saññānāti*, but that is not meant here.)

251/4 *NettiA* has *uggamenti* for *okkamenti*, supported by *C*; *Ba* and *Bb* support *PTS*.

man threw a big solid stone into a deep pool of water, and then a large body of people [46] met and foregathered, and they begged and they implored and they beseeched with hands extended palms together "Oh sirs, let the solid stone emerge, oh sirs, let the solid stone float up, oh sirs, let the solid stone float to dry land", how do you conceive this, Gāmaṇī, because of their begging, because of their imploring, because of their beseeching with hands extended palms together, would that solid stone emerge, would it float up, would it float to dry land?—"No, venerable sir."—"So too, Gāmaṇī, when a man is a killer of breathing things, . . . and wrong in his view, for all that a large body of people might meet and foregather and might beg and implore and beseech with hands extended palms together "Oh let this man, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in a good destination, in the heavenly world", yet that man, on the dissolution of the body, after death, might reappear in a state of unease, in a bad destination, in perdition, in hell. How do you conceive this, Gāmaṇī? Here a man might have abstained from killing breathing things, . . . right in his view. Then a large body of people met and foregathered and they begged and implored and beseeched with hands extended palms together "Oh let this man, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in a state of unease, in a bad destination, in perdition, in hell", how do you conceive this, Gāmaṇī, because of that large body of people's begging, because of their imploring, because of their beseeching with hands extended palms together, would that man, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in a state of unease, in a bad destination, in perdition, in hell?—"No, venerable sir."—"Gāmaṇī, suppose a man sank a ghee-pot or an oil-pot in a deep water-pool and fixed it so that any sand or gravel there might be in it would go to the bottom and any ghee or oil there might be in it would go to the top, and then a large body of people met and foregathered and they begged and implored and beseeched with hands extended palms together "Oh sirs, let the ghee, the oil, sink; oh sirs, let the ghee, the oil, go down", how do you conceive this, Gāmaṇī, [47] because of that large body of people's begging, because of their imploring, because of their beseeching with hands extended palms together, would that ghee, that oil, sink down, go down?—"No, venerable sir." "So too, Gāmaṇī, when a man abstains from killing breathing things, . . . right in his view, for all that a large body of people might meet and foregather and might beg and implore and beseech with hands extended palms together "Oh let this man, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappear in a state of unease, in a bad destination, in perdition, in hell", yet that man, on the dissolution of the body, after

death, might reappear in a good destination, in the heavenly world' > (S. iv, 312ff.).

So it is this True Idea that, when walked in right, guards one from the states of unease.

252. (2) Herein, it is the keenness, the outstandingness, of the Path that is the 'True Idea' which, when walked in right, guards one from all kinds of reappearing. Accordingly the Blessed One said:

*<So let his cognizance be guarded,¹
Having for pasture right intention,
Giving right view first place through knowing
Rise and fall; transcending drowsing
And lethargy, the bhikkhu may
Abandon all bad destinations > (Ud. 38).*

253. Herein, the cause of the bad destinations is craving and ignorance. These are the four kinds of assuming (see §228).

254. Any categories of assuming [so called] in virtue of these four kinds of assuming are Suffering. The four kinds of assuming are Origin, while the five categories are Suffering. The Blessed One teaches the True Idea for their [respective] diagnosis and abandoning: for the diagnosis of Suffering and for the abandoning of its Origin.

255. Herein, the five faculties that have form are the footing for craving while the mind-faculty is the footing for ignorance.

256. One who guards the five faculties that have form keeps concentration in being and deters craving, while one who guards the mind-faculty keeps insight in being and deters ignorance.

257. With the deterrence of craving two kinds of assuming are abandoned, namely sensual-desire assuming and virtue-and-duty assuming, while with the deterrence of ignorance two kinds of assuming are abandoned, namely view assuming and self-doctrine assuming.

258. [48] When the four kinds of assuming are abandoned, two ideas come to fulfilment through keeping in being, namely quiet and insight: this is called the Divine Life.

259. Herein, the fruit of the Divine Life is the four fruits of the monk's state, namely the fruit of Stream-Entry, fruit of Once-Return, fruit of Non-Return and the highest fruit which is Arahantship. These are the four fruits of the Divine Life (cf. *Pe* 130, 135).

260. So there are the first two Truths, namely Suffering and its Origin (§254); and quiet and insight and the Divine Life are the Path; and the fruits of the Divine Life and the Undetermined Element, which is the object of these,¹ are Cessation. These are the four Truths. That is why the Blessed One said 'The True Idea guards . . .' (§250).

261. Herein, that by the penetration of which it guards is Suffering. That from which it guards is Origin. That by which it guards is the Path. And that which guards is Cessation (cf. §249). These are the four Truths.

262. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'The Mode that, when there is one Footing,
Searches for a footing that remains
And then converts the opposites
Is that Conveying a Conversion' (§11).

The Mode Conveying a Conversion is ended.

*

8

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying an Analysis*]

263. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying an Analysis? [It is this:]

'It analyses idea, footing,
Plane [of types of men], the shared
And unshared: this Mode should be known
As that Conveying Analysis' (§12).

264. The two kinds of Thread, namely that dealing with morality and that dealing with penetration (see §§117 and 270) are the two ways, namely that dealing with merit and that dealing with the fruit [of the Divine Life] (see §444), which are the two kinds of virtue, namely virtue as restraint and virtue as abandoning.

265. Herein, it is for the purpose of the way dealing with merit that

260/1 *Tadārammaṇā ca asaṃkhatadhātu:* the 'undetermined element' (*asaṃkhatadhātu*—a term reserved solely to *nibbāna*) is sometimes called in the Commentaries the 'object' (*ārammaṇa*—lit. 'what is hung on to' or 'what is leant on') of 'cognizance dissociated from worlds'. The use here of the compound *tadārammaṇa* is not the normal commentarial one, renderable by 'having that as its object' (freely 'registration': see *Vis.* 459-60); but here the meaning is 'which is the object of that' (cf. use at *Pe.* 108).

the Blessed One teaches a Thread dealing with morality. He [who needs this kind of teaching] is steadied [by it] in virtue as restraint, and he is one who lives the Divine Life by that kind of Divine Life. 266. [49] Herein, it is for the purpose of the way dealing with the fruit [of the Divine Life] that the Blessed One teaches a Thread dealing with penetration. He [who needs this kind of teaching] is steadied [by it] in virtue as abandoning, and he is one who lives the Divine Life by that kind of Divine Life.

267. Herein, what is a Thread dealing with morality? A Thread dealing with morality is this: talk on giving, talk on virtue, talk on heaven and the disappointment in sensual desires and the benefits in renunciation (see *M.* i, 379).

268. Herein, what is a Thread dealing with penetration? A Thread dealing with penetration is this: any displaying of the four Truths.

269. In a Thread dealing with morality there is no act-of-understanding, there is no Path, there is no Fruit [of the Path]. In a Thread dealing with penetration there is the act-of-understanding, there is the Path, there is the Fruit [of the Path].

270. These are [two of] the [first] four¹ types of Thread (see §§117 and 760) [which] should, after being in all ways (§62) investigated in accordance with the Mode of Conveying Investigation, be construed² in accordance with the Mode of Conveying Construing as to these four types of Thread's teaching, fruit, virtue, and Divine Life (see §§264-5), in so far as the plane of knowledge extends (cf. §156).

*

271. (1) Herein, what kinds of ideas are [shared] in common?¹

270/1 This sentence is a very elliptic and difficult one; but it seems impossible to obtain from it, with or without the commentary, what is given at *PTS* p. 223, note 1 (and what does that really mean?). *NettiA*, after saying only '*desanāyā ti desanānāyena*', goes on "After being in all ways investigated in accordance with the Mode of Conveying an Investigation": it should, by means of the Mode of Conveying an Investigation, be investigated as to all parts by processing it under the eleven heads (in §62). "Should be construed in accordance with the Mode of Conveying a Construing": by this he shows that the Modes of Conveying an Investigation and of Conveying a Construing (read *vicayahāra-yuttihārā*) are the field of preparatory work for the Mode of Conveying an Analysis. "In so far as the plane of knowledge": by this he shows how wide a field the Mode of Conveying an Analysis has' (p. 94).

270/2 *C* and *NettiA* both *yojetabbāni*; *Ba* and *Bb* support *PTS*.

271/1 Shared in common by ordinary men and Stream-Enterers, firstly, see §272.

Two kinds of ideas are [shared] in common, namely [shared] in common by a name and [shared] in common by a thing [or person] or also any other such kind.

272. Defilements to be abandoned by seeing (see *M. i*, 7f.) are common to [ordinary men whether they are] creatures certain of wrongness¹ or those not thus certain. Lust for sensual desires and ill will are common to the ordinary man and to the Stream Enterer. The further-side fetters are common to the ordinary man and to the Non-Returner. Any attainment belonging to the worlds that an [initiate] Noble Disciple attains is common to [him and to] those without lust. For ideas shared in common remain thus each within the successive limits of their own provinces, and the type of person possessed of any one of these ideas does not [as such] surpass the [limit set by any such] idea.

These kinds of ideas are shared in common.

273. Herein, what kinds of ideas are not shared in common has to be examined as to whether the teaching is about Initiates or Adepts [in the case of Noble Persons] or those capable or incapable [of enlightenment in this life, in the case of ordinary men].

274. Lust for sensual desires and ill will are [50] common to the Stream Enterer standing upon¹ [the Path and to the ordinary man, but] the essential nature of the idea [of Stream Entry] is not common [to both]. And the further-side fetters are common to the Non-Returner standing upon¹ [that path and to those below him, but] the essential nature of the idea [of Non-Return] is not common [to both]. The name ['Initiate'] is common to all the seven kinds of initiate, [but] the essential nature of the idea [of each kind] is not common [to the rest]. The name ['on the way'] is common to all [the four] kinds of those on the way [of their respective paths, but] the essential nature of the idea [of each kind] is not common [to all the rest]. Initiates' virtue is common to all kinds of Initiate [but] the essential nature of the idea [of each kind] is not common [to the rest]. That is how it has to be examined according to the inferior, superior, and medium, by one who sees the distinctions.

272/1 'Certain of rightness' (*sammatta-niyata*) means one who has attained the eight-factored path for the first time. 'Certain of wrongness' (*micchatta-niyata*) means one who has not attained the path and has performed some action, or holds some wrong view, which is certain in the badness of its ripening immediately on rebirth. 'Not thus certain' applies to anyone else who has not attained the path. Cf. §562, also *Pe* 32.

274/1 See n. 99/2.

275. (2) The *plane* of seeing is (3) the *footing* for finding a footing in certainty.¹ (2) The *plane* of keeping in being is (3) the *footing* for the reaching of the higher fruits. The painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship is the footing for quiet. The pleasant way with swift acquaintanceship is the footing for insight.

The ground-for-making-merit-consisting-in-giving (see *A.* ii, 241) is the footing, shared in common, for [hearing about the True Idea from] another's utterance. The ground-for-making-merit-consisting-in-virtue is the footing, shared in common, for understanding-consisting-in-cogitation (see §46). The ground-for-making-merit-consisting-in-keeping-in-being is the footing, shared in common, for understanding-consisting-in-keeping-in-being. The ground-for-making-merit-consisting-in-giving is the footing, shared in common, for [hearing about the True Idea from] another's utterance and for understanding-consisting-in-what-is-heard. The ground-for-making-merit-consisting-in-virtue is the footing, shared in common, for understanding-consisting-in-cogitation and for reasoned attention. The ground-for-making-merit-consisting-in-keeping-in-being is the footing, shared in common, for understanding-consisting-in-keeping-in-being and for right view.

Living in befitting places (see *A.* ii, 32) is the footing, shared in common, for seclusion and for concentration. Waiting on True Men is the footing, shared in common, for the three kinds of confidence due to undergoing (see e.g. §788) and for quiet. Right disposition in self-guidance is the footing, shared in common, for conscience and for insight.

Giving up the unprofitable is the footing, shared in common, for inquiry into the profitable and for the concentration faculty. The well-proclaimedness of the True Idea is the footing, shared in common, for the planting of the profitable root and for the attainment of the fruits [of the paths]. The Community's having progressed by the good way is the footing, shared in common, for the Community's goodness. The excellence of the Master is the footing, shared in common, for instilling confidence in the unconfident and for strengthening the already confident. The state of not having resisted the *Patimokkha* Rule [51] is the footing, shared in common, for the deterrence of contumacious persons and for the comfort of pious persons.

275/1 The term *niyā mavakkanti* (= *niyā mokkanti*: see *S.* iii, 225) refers to the Stream-Entry path, otherwise called 'seeing'. 'Keeping in being' in these contexts refers to the 3 higher paths.

276. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

‘It analyses idea, footing,
Plane [of types of men], the shared
And unshared: this Mode should be known
As that Conveying Analysis’ (§12).

The Mode Conveying an Analysis is ended.

*

9

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying a Reversal*]

277. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Reversal? [It is this:]

‘That into opposites reversing
Ideas of profit and unprofit
Shown to be kept in being and left
Is called the Mode Conveying Reversal’ (§13).

278. In a mature person with right view wrong view is abolished, and the many unprofitable ideas that might arise in him with wrong view for their condition are also abolished in him, and the many profitable ideas that gain actual being with right view for their condition come to perfection in him through keeping in being (cf. *M.* iii, 76).

In a mature person with right intention . . .

. . . right speech . . .
. . . right action . . .
. . . right livelihood . . .
. . . right effort . . .
. . . right mindfulness . . .
. . . right concentration . . .
. . . right deliverance . . .

In a mature person with right knowing and seeing of deliverance wrong knowing and seeing of deliverance is abolished, and the many evil unprofitable ideas that might arise in him with wrong knowing and seeing of deliverance for their condition are also abolished in him, and the many profitable ideas that gain actual being with

right knowing and seeing of deliverance for their condition come to perfection in him through keeping in being.¹

279. Killing of breathing things has been abandoned in one who abstains from killing breathing things.

Taking what is not given has been abandoned in one who abstains from taking what is not given.

What is not the divine life has been abandoned in one who lives the divine life.

False speech has been abandoned in one who speaks truth.

Malicious speech has been abandoned in one who speaks un-maliciously.

Harsh speech has been abandoned in one who speaks in a timely manner.

Covetousness [52] has been abandoned in one who is uncovetous.

Ill will has been abandoned in one who has no cognizance of ill will.

Wrong view has been abandoned in one who has right view.

280. If there are any who censure the eight-factored path, then from their assertions certain legitimate deductions to be seen for oneself come up which are censurable (*M.* iii, 77) [as follows].

281. For when those worthy ones censure the idea of right view, the consequence is that those who have wrong view must be honoured and praised by those worthy ones.

For when those worthy ones censure the idea [of] right intention . . .

. . . right speech . . .

. . . right action . . .

. . . right livelihood . . .

. . . right effort . . .

. . . right mindfulness . . .

. . . right concentration . . .

. . . right deliverance . . .

For when those worthy ones censure the idea of right knowing and seeing of deliverance, the consequence is that those who have wrong knowing and seeing of deliverance must be honoured and praised by those worthy ones (cf. *M.* iii, 77).

282. And if there are any who say 'Sensual desires should be

278/1 The '10 rightnesses' are usually made up of the 8 factors of the path plus 'right knowledge' and 'right deliverance' (*M.* iii, 78). This Mode of Conveying is drawn directly from *M.* Sutta 117, end.

enjoyed, sensual desires should be rejoiced in, sensual desires should be repeated, sensual desires should be used, sensual desires should be kept in being, sensual desires should be made much of' (cf. *M.* i, 130), then abstention from sensual desires is not the True Idea according to them.

Or if there are any who say 'The True Idea is devotion to self-torment' (cf. *M.* i, 92f.), then the True Idea that is the outlet is not the True Idea according to them.

And if there are any who say 'The True Idea is painful' (cf. *M.* i, 93f.), then the True Idea that is pleasant is not the True Idea according to them.

283. According as a bhikkhu's perception of beauty in all determinations is abandoned when he abides contemplating ugliness, according as his perception of pleasure is abandoned when he abides contemplating pain, according as his perception of permanence is abandoned when he abides contemplating impermanence, and according as his perception of self is abandoned when he abides contemplating not-self (cf. *Ps.* i, 46-7), then whatever idea he elects or approves, [thereby] he has implicated the contrary-opposite of any such idea as un-wished-for.

284. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'That into opposites reversing
Ideas of profit and unprofit
Shown to be kept in being and left
Is called the Mode Conveying Reversal' (§13).

The Mode of Conveying a Reversal is ended.

*

10

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying Synonyms*]

285. [53] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Synonyms ?
[It is this:]

'Knower of Threads is he that knows
How many synonyms for one
Idea there are in the Thread: this Mode
Is that Conveying Synonyms' (§14).

286. According as the Blessed One demonstrates a single idea by means of many synonyms. [For example:]

<Need and longing, expectant relishing,
 Enticements on the several elements based,
 Hankering whose being is rooted in
 unknowing:
 To all that with its root I put an end> (§137).

287. What is called 'need' (*āsā*) is any longing (*āsimśanā*) for a benefit about to be;¹ 'need' arises in one thus 'Surely it will come'.

288. What is called 'longing' is any aspiration for a presently arisen benefit, or else, on seeing someone better, 'longing' arises in one thus 'May I be like that'.¹

289. Fostering the production of a benefit is what is called 'expectant relishing', or one expects thus a dear relative, or one expects thus a dear idea, or one expects [something] thus as unrepulsive.

290. 'The several elements' are the eye element, form element, and eye-consciousness element; ear element, sound element, and ear-consciousness element; nose element, odour element, and nose-consciousness element; tongue element, flavour element, and tongue-consciousness element; body element, tangible element, and body-consciousness element; mind element, idea element, and mind-consciousness element (cf. *M.* iii, 62).

291. 'Enticements': some believe in forms, some believe in sounds, some believe in odours, some believe in flavours, some believe in tangibles, some believe in ideas (cf. §568).

292. Herein, the twenty-four terms, namely the six kinds of grief with the house-life as support (see *M.* iii, 218), the six kinds of joy with the house-life as support (see *M.* iii, 217), the six kinds of grief with renunciation as support (see *M.* iii, 218), the six kinds of joy with renunciation as support (see *M.* iii, 217), being on the side belonging to craving, are synonyms for craving.

But the six kinds of onlooking-equanimity with the house-life as support (see *M.* iii, 219) are on the side belonging to views. That same [onlooking-equanimity] in the mood of aspiration, as relishing of the True Idea, love of the True Idea, cleaving to the True Idea, is synonymous with craving (cf. §506).

293. Cognizance, [54] mind, and consciousness,¹ are synonyms for cognizance (cf. *S.* ii, 94).

287/1 *Bhavissassa*: gen. of future participle.

288/1 Read *patthanā, seyyataram vā disvā* 'ediso ...

293/1 Read *mano viññāṇam* as two words.

294. Mind faculty, mind element, mind base, and act-of-being-conscious, are synonyms for mind.

Understanding faculty, understanding power, training in the higher understanding, understanding category, investigation-of-ideas enlightenment factor, knowledge, right view, judgment, insight, knowledge about an idea, knowledge about a meaning, knowledge about an inference, knowledge about exhaustion, knowledge about non-arising, the I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty, the final-knowing faculty, the final-knower faculty, vision (eye), science, discovery, breadth, wit, light, or also any other such kind: these are synonyms for understanding (cf. §440).

295. All the five faculties, when disjoined from worlds, are understanding. Furthermore, faith has the sense of dominance, energy the sense of instigation, mindfulness the sense of non-floating away [from its object], concentration the sense of non-distraction, and understanding the sense of act-of-understanding (cf. §§162-3).

296. And as it is said in the Recollection of the Enlightened One: <That Blessed One is such since he is accomplished, fully enlightened,¹ perfect in science and conduct, sublime, knower of worlds, incomparable leader of men to be tamed, teacher of gods and men, enlightened, Blessed> (Pe 131; A. iii, 285), [and further] he who has come to produce the Powers,² reached the kinds of Intrepidity, arrived at the Discriminations, left behind the four bonds, passed beyond going the bad ways, extracted the barbs, cured the wounds,³ crushed the thorns, remedied the obsessions, outstripped the tether, unknotted the ties, passed beyond inclination, disrupted darkness; who is the possessor of eyesight, who has surmounted the worldly ideas, who is dissociated from favouring and opposing among wished-for and unwished-for ideas, who has no recourse to amassing, who has passed beyond the tether, who has done with battling, who is the most eminent, who is the torch-bearer,⁴ light-maker, illuminator, gloom-dispeller, conflict-abandoner, measureless in qualities, immense in qualities, incalculable in qualities, maker of radiance, maker of irradiance, illuminator of the True Ideal, enlightened, blessed.

296/1 Perhaps *sambuddha* ought to be rendered 'self-enlightened' in contrast to *anubuddha* ('enlightened by another').

296/2 Read *balanipphattigato*.

296/3 '*Nirūlhavaṇo*—who has cured the wound': *nirūlha* not in this sense in PED.

296/4 '*Okkādharo*—torch-bearer': form not in PED, where see *ukkā*; C. and Bb have *ukkādharo*, but Ba supports PTS.

These are synonyms for the Recollection of the Enlightened One. 297. And as it is said in the Recollection of the True Idea [55] <The True Idea is well proclaimed by the Blessed One, to be seen for oneself, not delayed (timeless), inviting inspection, onward-leading, and directly experienceable by the wise> (A. iii, 285), <That is to say, the disillusionment of vanity, the outguiding of thirst, the elimination of reliance, the termination of the round, the void, the very hard to get, the exhaustion of craving, fading, cessation, extinction> (Pe 131; cf. A. ii, 34), [and further:]

The Undetermined, the Infinite, and the Untainted,
The Truth, the Further Shore, the Subtle, very hard to see,
The Ageless, Everlasting, and Un-worn-away,
Making no showing,¹ undiversifying, peace,
The Deathless, the Supreme, the Blissful, and the Safe,
Exhaustion of thirst, the Wonderful, the Marvellous,
The Unplugged, whose nature it is to be unplugged,
Extinction (see S. iv, 368-71)—this is what the Sublime one taught—

The Unborn, and the Un-brought-to-being (Ud. 80), the
Hazard-Free,
The Unmade (Ud. 80), and the Sorrowless, the Sorrow-free,
The Unmenaced, whose nature it is to be unmenaced,
Extinction—this is what the Sublime One taught—

Profound, and very hard to see as well,
Surpassing too, and unsurpassed,
That is unlike, that has no like,
Foremost and best, as it is called.

Shield, shelter, without conflict,² without blemish,
Spotless, immaculate, as it is called,
The Lamp (Isle), and Bliss, the Immense, the Standing-point,
Non-owning, non-diversifying called.

These are synonyms for the Recollection of the True Idea.

297/1 'Anidassana—that makes no showing': the word appears at M. i, 329 (where spoken by the Buddha, not by Brahmā—see Burmese *Chatttha -Sangiti* ed. of M.) and repeated at D. i, 223, and it is also a term in the 9th dyad of the Abhidhamma *Mātikā* or 'Schedule' (Dhs. p. 3). Usually translated 'invisible'. See *KhpA.* trsln. Appx. I √*bhu*.

297/2 PTS *Netti* Index gives 'refuge' for *saraṇa* here, taking it as equivalent to the 'saraṇa' at S. iv, 372. It is easy to confuse *sar-aṇa* (subst. fm. √*sar* 'to flow') with *sa-raṇa* ('with conflict'), opposite of *a-raṇa* (see M. iii, 235): 'Araṇo ti araṇo nikkilesa' (MA. v, 32).

298. And as it is said in the Recollection of the Community <The Community of the Blessed One's hearers has progressed by the good way, the Community of the Blessed One's hearers has progressed by the straight way, the Community of the Blessed One's hearers has progressed by the true way, the Community of the Blessed One's hearers has progressed by the proper way, that is to say, the four pairs of men, the eight types of mature persons. This Community of the Blessed One's hearers is fit for gifts, fit for hospitality, fit for offerings, fit for reverential salutation, as the incomparable field of merit for the world> (A. iii, 286), [56] [and further] perfect in virtue, perfect in concentration, perfect in deliverance, perfect in knowing and seeing of deliverance; it is creatures' core (cf. M. iii, 80), creatures' fine-essence, creatures' fine-extract, creatures' pillar, creatures' blossom of fragrance,¹ to be honoured by gods and human beings. These are synonyms for the Recollection of the Community.

299. And just as it is said in the Recollection of Virtue <Those kinds of virtue that are untorn, unrent, unblotched, unmottled, noble, desired by Noble Ones, liberating, commended by the wise, not misapprehended, and conducive to concentration> (A. iii, 286), [and further] virtue as an ornament for adorning the topmost limb,¹ and virtue as a treasure laid by in the sense of surmounting all defects, and virtue as an archer's craft for hitting the bull's eye, and virtue as a rule in the sense of non-transgression, and virtue as [wealth of] corn in the sense of terminating poverty, and virtue as a looking-glass for the purpose of surveying ideas [of quiet and insight], and virtue as a [storied] palace in the sense of [a place for] surveying, and virtue that by its having parallel occurrence with all the [four] planes,² ends in the Deathless. These are synonyms for the Recollection of Virtue.

300. And as it is said in the Recollection of Generosity <On an

298/1 'Surabhi-pasūna—blossom with fragrance': read as one compound. *Surabhi* (fragrance, scent) not in *PED*, see *Jā. vi*, 236, *Abhp.* 146; *pasūna* not in *PED*. *NettiA*: 'Surabhi-kusuman ti attho' (p. 102). See *Abhp. Tīkā ad Abhp.* 16.

299/1 Read *uttamangopasobhanatāya* and resolve into *uttamanga* ('head') + *upasobhanatāya*. The note '(m.)' in *PTS Netti Index* ('uttamanga (m.)') has mistaken the *sandhi o* (= *a + u*) for a masc. nom. sing. termination.

299/2 This means that it is coextensive with the 3 planes of being (those of sensual-desire, of form, and of formlessness), and also with the unincluded (*apariyāpanna*) fourth plane (not of being, either positive or negative), which is dissociated from worlds and concerned with cessation (the deathless extinction).

occasion on which a Noble Hearer lives in a house, freely generous, open-handed, delighting in relinquishing, used to being asked, and delighting in giving and sharing . . . > (A. iii, 287). These are synonyms for the Recollection of Generosity.

301. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

‘Knower of Threads is he that knows
How many synonyms for one
Idea there are in the Thread: this Mode
Is that Conveying Synonyms’ (§14).

The Mode of Conveying Synonyms is ended.

*

11

[The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying Descriptions]

302. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Descriptions? [It is this:]

‘The Blessed One one idea teaches
By means of manifold descriptions:
This mood can thus be known to be
The Mode that does Convey Descriptions’ (§15).

303. [57] Any teaching by [explanatory] talk about the nature [of anything] is a description [in terms of] presentation.¹ And what is the teaching as [explanatory] talk about the nature [of anything]? It is the four Truths, according as the Blessed One said: <This is suffering> (§49). This is a description. It is a description [in terms of] presentation [applied] to the five categories, the six elements, the eighteen elements, the twelve bases, and the ten faculties.²

303/1 ‘*Nikkhepapaññatti*—description in terms of presentation’: *NettiA*: ‘It presents (*nikkhipati* lit. “throws out”) in a guidable continuity (i.e., in a trainable person’s mind) a meaning of the Blessed One’s, according as intended by him, thus it is called a “presentation” (*nikkhepa*)’ (p. 102). The *Tikā* adds ‘*Nikkhipati ti patitthāpeti, yathā cattāro suttanikkhepā* (MA. i, 15) ādi aṭṭha-kathāsu vuccati’ (p. 70). The kinds of ‘description’ given here have no connexion with the sets listed at *PugA*. (see *Ppn*. ch. viii, note 11: there rendered ‘concept’).

303/2 The ‘ten faculties’ are, according to *NettiA*, ‘8 faculties possessing form (i.e., eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, femininity, masculinity, and life—see,

304. <Bhikkhus, if there is lust, if there is relish, if there is craving, for physical nutriment,¹ there consciousness finds a steadying-point and develops. Wherever consciousness finds a steadying-point and develops, there is the finding of a footing for name-and-form. Wherever there is the finding of a footing for name-and-form, there is maturing of determinations. Wherever there is maturing of determinations, there renewed being is made to occur in the future. Wherever renewed being is made to occur in the future, there is future birth, ageing and death. Wherever there is future birth, ageing and death, that is accompanied by sorrow, bhikkhus, accompanied by trouble, accompanied by despair, I say. If there is lust . . . for contact, . . . despair. If there is lust . . . for mind-choice, . . . despair. If there is lust . . . for consciousness, . . . despair> (Pe 49, 97; S. ii, 101ff.).²

305. This is description [in terms] of giving-being [applied] to suffering and to its origin.

306. <Bhikkhus, if there is no lust, if there is no relish, if there is no craving, for physical nutriment, there consciousness does not find a steadying-point or develop. Wherever consciousness does not find a steadying-point or develop, there is no finding of a footing for name-and-form. Wherever there is no finding of a footing for name-and-form, there is no maturing of determinations. Wherever there is no maturing of determinations, there no renewal of being is made to occur in the future. Wherever no renewal of being is made to occur in the future, [58] there is no future birth, ageing and death. Wherever there is no future birth, ageing and death, that is sorrowless, bhikkhus, untroubled and free from despair, I say. If there is no lust . . . for contact, . . . free from despair. If there is no lust . . . for mind-

e.g., Vis. 491), the mind-faculty, and the feeling-faculty (counting the five, namely pleasure, joy, pain, grief, and onlooking-equanimity, as one)' (p. 102). This numbering is an unusual one. For another 10 see §405.

304/1 The idea of 'nutriment' (*āhāra*)—= condition (*paccaya*)—is fundamental to Buddhist thought. The word means lit. 'bringing to' and is used basically for physical food, but extended by analogy to the other three kinds, and is thus synonymous with 'condition *sine qua non*' (*paccaya*). Cf. 'All creatures subsist by nutriment' (A. v, 50-1), a fact that one 'should have direct acquaintance of' (D. iii, 273). A state of being (*existence*) postulated as self-subsistent without nutriment of any kind would therefore be regarded as a mere mythical abstraction not possible of verification or distinguishable effectively from nothing.

304/2 This quotation and its counterpart in §306 describe the conditionality of experience as dynamic with emphasis on how existence (being) develops through ignorance and determinations. Cf. quotation at §840.

choice, . . . free from despair. If there is no lust . . . for consciousness, . . . free from despair> (S. ii, 102f.; Pe 49, 97).

307. This is a description [in terms] of diagnosis [applied] to suffering, a description in terms of abandoning applied to origin, a description in terms of keeping in being applied to the path, a description in terms of verification applied to cessation.

308. <Bhikkhus, maintain concentration in being: a bhikkhu who is diligent, prudent, mindful, concentrated, understands how [things] are. And how does he understand how [things] are? The eye is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Forms are impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Eye consciousness is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Eye contact is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Whatever is felt, whether pleasant or painful or neither painful-nor-pleasant that arises with eye contact for its condition, that too is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. The ear is impermanent . . . sounds are impermanent . . . The nose is impermanent . . . odours are impermanent . . . The tongue is impermanent . . . flavours are impermanent . . . The body is impermanent . . . tangibles are impermanent . . . The mind is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Ideas are impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Mind consciousness is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Mind contact is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is. Whatever is felt, whether pleasant or painful or neither-painful-nor-pleasant, that arises with mind contact for its condition, that too is impermanent: That is how he understands how it is> (cf. S. iv, 80).

309. This is a description in terms of keeping in being applied to the path, a description in terms of diagnosis applied to suffering, a description in terms of abandoning applied to origin, a description in terms of verification applied to cessation.

310. [59] <Dispense with form, Rādha, shatter it, put it out of play, by means of understanding, practise the way to exhaustion of craving. With exhaustion of craving there is exhaustion of suffering. With exhaustion of suffering there is extinction. Dispense with feeling . . . Dispense with perception . . . Dispense with determinations . . . Dispense with consciousness, shatter it, put it out of play, by means of understanding, practise the way to exhaustion of craving. With exhaustion of craving there is exhaustion of suffering. With exhaustion of suffering there is extinction> (cf. S. iii, 190).

311. This is a description in terms of cessation applied to cessation, a description in terms of dispassion applied to gratification, a

description in terms of diagnosis applied to suffering, a description in terms of abandoning applied to origin, a description in terms of keeping in being applied to the path, a description in terms of verification applied to cessation.

312. <'This is suffering': that is how he understands how it is. 'This is the origin of suffering': that is how he understands how it is. 'This is the cessation of suffering': that is how he understands how it is. 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering': that is how he understands how it is> (M. i, 183; Pe 41).

313. This is a description in terms of penetration applied to the truths, a description in terms of presentation applied to the plane of seeing, a description in terms of keeping in being applied to the path, a description in terms of verification applied to the fruit of Stream-Entry.

314. <'These are taints': that is how he understands how it is. 'This is the origin of taints': that is how he understands how it is. 'This is the cessation of taints': that is how he understands how it is. 'This is the way leading to the cessation of taints': that is how he understands how it is> (M. i, 183).

315. This is a description in terms of arising applied to knowledge of exhaustion, a description in terms of opportunity applied to knowledge of non-arising, a description in terms of keeping in being applied to the path, a description in terms of diagnosis applied to suffering, a description in terms of abandoning applied to origin, a description in terms of instigation applied to the energy faculty, a description in terms of 'removal'¹ applied to 'grubs' (see M. i, 220; A. v, 347ff.), a description in terms of presentation applied to the plane of keeping in being, a description in terms of counteraction² applied to evil unprofitable ideas.

316. <'This is suffering': such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the science, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before. 'This is the origin of suffering': such . . . 'This is the cessation of suffering': such . . . 'This is the way leading to cessation of suffering': such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the science, the light, that arose in regard to [60] ideas not heard by me before> (cf. S. v, 424f.).

317. This is a description in terms of teaching applied to the truths, a description in terms of presentation applied to understanding-

315/1 'Āhaṭana—removal': not in PED.

315/2 'Abhinighāta—counteraction': not in PED, see CPD; cf. also *nighāta*.

consisting-in-what-is-heard, a description in terms of verification applied to the I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty, a description in terms of 'setting rolling' (making occur) applied to the 'Wheel (Blessing) of the True Idea'.

318. <'This suffering must be diagnosed': such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the science, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before. 'This origin of suffering must be abandoned': such . . . 'This cessation of suffering must be verified': such . . . 'This way leading to the cessation of suffering must be kept in being': such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the science, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before> (cf. S. v, 424f.).

319. This is a description in terms of keeping in being applied to the path, a description in terms of presentation applied to understanding-consisting-in-cogitation, a description in terms of verification applied to the final-knowing faculty.

320. <'This suffering has been diagnosed': such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the science, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before. 'This origin of suffering has been abandoned': such . . . 'This cessation of suffering has been verified': such . . . 'This way leading to the cessation of suffering has been kept in being': such was the vision, the knowledge, the understanding, the science, the light, that arose in regard to ideas not heard by me before> (cf. S. v, 424).

321. This is a description in terms of keeping in being applied to the path, a description in terms of presentation applied to understanding-consisting-in-keeping-in-being, a description in terms of verification applied to the final-knower faculty, a description in terms of 'setting rolling' applied to the 'Wheel of the True Idea'.

*

322. <*The Stilled One dropped the being-determinant
That gives existence measured and unmeasured,
And happy in himself and concentrated
He sundered, like a mail-coat, self-existence*

(Pe 68; S. v, 263).

323. [61] 'Measured' is the determinations-element. 'Unmeasured' is the extinction-element.

'That gives existence measured and unmeasured' is a description

in terms of acquaintanceship applied to all ideas, a description in terms of presentation applied to the Discrimination-of-Ideas.

324. 'The Stilled One dropped the being-determinant' is a description in terms of giving-up applied to origin, a description in terms of diagnosis applied to suffering.

325. 'And happy in himself and concentrated' is a description in terms of keeping-in-being applied to Mindfulness-Occupied-with-the-Body, a description in terms of steadiness applied to unification of cognizance.

326. 'He sundered, like a mail-coat, self-existence' is a description in terms of 'breaking out'¹ applied to cognizance, a description in terms of assuming² applied to omniscience, a description in terms of 'bursting open' applied to the 'egg-shell of ignorance' (cf. *M. i*, 104).

That is why the Blessed One said:

'The Stilled One dropped the being-determinant

That gives existence measured and unmeasured . . .' (§322).

*

327. <How could a man to sensual desires stoop¹

Who pain has seen and that wherefrom it sources ?

Who knows they make for clinging in the world

Should mindful train in guiding them away> (*Pe* 15; *S. i*, 117).

326/1 'Abhinibbidā—breaking out': the root ought to be *bhid*, not *vidh* or *vid*, and the correct spelling here is, in fact, not *abhinibbidā* or *abhinibbidhā* (as in *PED* and *PTS Netti* Index note) but *abhinibbhidā* (as in §574 = *PTS Netti* p. 98); see *CPD*. The meaning is 'breaking out', and the direct allusion is to *M. i*, 104 (there spelt *abhinibbhidā*). The three roots mentioned, however, show a tendency to coalesce. *NettiA* says here 'Abhinibbidā-paññatti' (sic) *cittassā ti āyusankhārossajanavasena cittassa abhinīhārapaññatti*' (p. 104), but commenting on §574 says 'Na ca bhabbo abhinibbidhā (sic) gantum ti kilesā-bhisankhāraṃ abhinibbijjhanato (sic) abhinibbidhā-sankhātāṃ (sic) ariyamaggam abhigantum na ca bhabbo' (p. 140). N.b. spellings as they appear in the edition quoted. Do these explanations imply that the commentator did not regard them as the same word? Did he connect them with *M. i*, 104?

326/2 'Upādāna-paññatti—description in terms of assuming': *NettiA* glosses with *gahana-paññatti*. Technically omniscient knowledge (see also §594) belongs only to worlds (*NettiA* pp. 147-8). The term 'omniscience' (*sabbāññutā*) seems to make its first appearance at *Ps. i*, 131. The Buddha disclaimed simultaneous knowledge of all (*M. ii*, 127). For a discussion see *Ppn.* ch. vii, note 7.

327/1 'Nameyya' lit. 'to bend' and 'to name' is glossed here in *NettiA* with *abhinameyya* (not in *PED* or *CPD*; *SA.* does not explain the word).

328. 'Who pain' is a description in terms of a synonym applied to pain (suffering) and it is a description in terms of diagnosis applied to it.

329. 'And that wherefrom it sources' is a description in terms of giving-being applied to origin and it is a description in terms of abandoning applied to it.

330. 'Has seen' is a description in terms of a synonym applied to the eye of knowledge and it is a description in terms of penetration applied to it.

331. 'How could a man to sensual desires stoop' is a description in terms of sensual desires applied to craving for sensual desires and it is a description in terms of insistence applied to it.

332. 'Who knows they make for clinging in the world' is a description in terms of 'seeing an enemy' applied to sensual desires; for sensual desires have the simile of a pit of coals (*M.* i, 130), the simile of a lump of flesh (*M.* i, 130), are like a conflagration (*A.* iv, 128f.), and have the similes of a chasm and a serpent's head (*M.* i, 130; also §35).

333. 'Mindful . . . them' is a description in terms of dispersal applied to abandoning, a description in terms of presentation applied to Mindfulness-Occupied-with-the-Body, and a description in terms of keeping-in-being applied to the path.

334. 'Should train in guiding . . . away' is a description in terms of penetration applied to outguiding of lust, outguiding of hate, and outguiding of delusion.

335. 'A man' is a description in terms of a synonym applied to a devotee.

336. Now when a devotee understands that 'they make for clinging' then without the arising of sensual desires he arouses profitable ideas, he makes efforts for the arising of unarisen profitable ideas. [62] This is a description in terms of effort applied to the reaching of the as yet unreached, a description in terms of presentation applied to discontent with what deals with the hither-side.

337. Herein, <He makes efforts for the steadiness of arisen profitable ideas> (*M.* ii, 11): this is a description in terms of diligence applied to keeping in being, a description in terms of presentation applied to the energy faculty, a description in terms of preservation applied to profitable ideas, a description in terms of steadiness applied to the training in the higher cognizance.

That is why the Blessed One said:

'How could a man to sensual desires stoop
Who pain has seen and that wherefrom it sources ? . . .'

(§338)

*

338. <The world is held in bondage by delusion
And only looks as though 'twere capable:
Wrapped in bewilderment a fool is held
In bondage by essentials of existence;
To him who sees, it will appear devoid
Of features, he will have no owning there¹> (Ud. 79).

339. 'The world is held in bondage by delusion' is description in terms of teaching applied to the perversions.

340. 'And only looks as though 'twere capable' is a description in terms of the distorted applied to the world.

341. 'A fool is held In bondage by essentials of existence' is a description in terms of giving-being applied to recourse to evil wishes, a description in terms of function¹ applied to the obsessions, a description in terms of strength applied to the defilements, a description in terms of development applied to determinations.

342. 'Wrapped in bewilderment' is a description in terms of teaching applied to the murk of ignorance, and a description in terms of a synonym applied to it.

343. 'It will appear devoid Of features' is a description in terms of seeing applied to the heavenly eye, a description in terms of presentation applied to the eye of understanding.

344. 'To him who sees . . . he will have no owning there' is a description in terms of penetration applied to creatures: <Lust is an owning, hate is an owning, delusion is an owning> (cf. M. i, 298).

That is why the Blessed One said:

'The world is held in bondage by delusion . . . ' (§338).

*

345. <Bhikkhus, there is an unborn, an un-brought-to-being, an un-made, an undetermined. If that were not unborn, un-brought-to-being, unmade, undetermined, no escape from the born, the brought-to-being, the made, the determined, would be evident here. And it is because

338/1 For *kiñcana* as 'owning' see n. 152/1.

341/1 Cf. Pe 102.

there is an unborn, an un-brought-to-being, an unmade, an undetermined, that therefore the escape from the born, the brought-to-being, the made, the determined, is evident> (Ud. 80f.).

346. [63] 'If that were not unborn, un-brought-to-being, unmade, undetermined' is a description in terms of the teaching applied to extinction, and a description in terms of synonyms applied to it.

347. 'No escape from the born, the brought-to-being, the made, the determined would be evident here' is a description in terms of synonyms applied to the determined, and a description in terms of guiding-example¹ applied to it.

348. 'And it is because there is an unborn, an un-brought-to-being, an unmade, an undetermined' is a description in terms of synonyms applied to extinction, and a description in terms of illustrative proof applied to it.

349. 'That therefore the escape from the born, the brought-to-being, the made, the determined, is evident' is a description in terms of synonyms applied to extinction, a description in terms of outlet applied to the path, a description in terms of escape applied to the roundabout [of rebirths].

That is why the Blessed One said: 'If that were not . . .' (§345).

*

350. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'The Blessed One one idea teaches
By means of manifold descriptions;
This mood can thus be known to be
The Mode that does Convey Descriptions' (§15).

The Mode of Conveying Descriptions is ended.

*

347/1 'Upanayana—guiding-example': the ordinary logical term for the *example* in the classical Indian syllogism. *NettiA* says 'Herein, (in this instance, as to) "description in terms of guiding-example" the describing of the guiding-example gives the middle term (*hetu*) in the contrary opposite. (As to) the "description in terms of illustrative proof" (§348) the description is the displaying of the establishment (*siddhi*) of the proposition's content (*paṭiññātussa atthassa*)' (p. 106).

12

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying Ways of Entry to the Truths*]

351. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Ways of Entry ?
[It is this:]

‘Dependent-Rising, Faculties,
Categories, Elements, Bases:
The Mode that by these means gives entry
Is that Conveying Ways of Entry’ (§16).

352. <Above, below, in every way released,
And seeing not at all that ‘I am this’;
Thus liberated, he has crossed the flood
Not crossed before, for non-renewal of beings>

(*Pe* 24; *Ud.* 74).

353. ‘Above’ is the form-element and the formless element. ‘Below’ is the sensual-desire element. ‘In every way released’: that is the Adept’s deliverance in the triple element [of existence]. That itself is the Adept’s five faculties. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

354. These same Adept’s five faculties are science. With arising of science [there is] cessation of ignorance (nescience); with cessation of ignorance, cessation of determinations; with cessation of determinations, cessation of consciousness; with cessation of consciousness, cessation of name-and-form; with cessation of name-and-form, cessation of the sixfold base; with cessation of the sixfold base, cessation of contact; with cessation of contact, cessation of feeling; with cessation of [64] feeling, cessation of craving; with cessation of craving, cessation of assuming; with cessation of assuming, cessation of being; with cessation of being, cessation of birth; with cessation of birth, ageing and death cease, and [also] sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief, and despair; that is how there is a cessation to this whole category of suffering. This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

355. Those same Adept’s five faculties are comprised within the three Categories, namely the Virtue Category, the Concentration Category, and the Understanding Category.¹ This is the way of entry by Categories.

355/1 These are the 3 divisions of the 8-factored path as given at *M.* i, 301. *NettiA* (p. 106) says that since right intention is counted in the same category as right view ‘because of its helpfulness to right view’ (see *MA.* ii, 361f.),

356. Those same Adept's five faculties are included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] free from taints and not factors of being—are comprised within the idea-element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

357. That idea-element is included in the idea-base, which base is [in this case] free from taints and not a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

358. 'And seeing not at all that "I am this"': this is the eradication of the embodiment-view. That is the Initiate's deliverance. That itself is the Initiate's five faculties. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

359. Those same Initiate's five faculties are science. With the arising of science . . . (complete as in §354) . . . So the whole Dependent Arising. This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

360. That same science is the Understanding Category. This is the way of entry by Categories.

361. That same science is included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] free from taints and not factors of being—are comprised within the idea-element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

362. That idea-element is included in the idea-base, which is [in this case] free from taints and not a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

363. It is one liberated by means of the Initiate's deliverance and the Adept's deliverance who 'has crossed the flood not crossed before, for non-renewal of being'.

[65] That is why the Blessed One said:

'Above, below, . . . ' (§352).

*

364. <The supported is liable to dislodgement; the unsupported is not liable to dislodgement. When there is no liability to dislodgement, there is tranquillity. When there is tranquillity, there is no bent-for-naming. When there is no bent-for-naming, there is no coming-and-going. When there is no coming-and-going, there is no decease-and-reappearance. When there is no decease-and-reappearance, there is no

so too, the five faculties having been called 'science' (§354), the first four can be classed within the path-categories because of their 'helpfulness' to understanding, since understanding corresponds to right view.

here or beyond or in between: this is the end of suffering> (*Pe* 18, 110; *Ud.* 81, cited at *M.* iii, 266).

365. 'The supported is liable to dislodgement': support is of two kinds, namely support by craving and support by view. Herein, any choice on the part of one who is lusting is support by craving, and any choice on the part of one who is confused is support by view.

366. Now choice is determinations. It is with determinations as condition that consciousness [has actual being]; with consciousness as condition, name-and-form; . . . And so with the whole Dependent Arising (cf. *Pe* 110)¹ [down to . . . with birth as condition, ageing and death have actual being, and [also] sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief, and despair; that is how there is an origin to this whole category of suffering.] This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

367. Herein any feeling in one who lusts is pleasant feeling, and any feeling in one who is confused is neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling. These feelings belong to the feeling category. This is the way of entry by Categories.

368. Herein, pleasant feeling is two faculties, namely the [bodily] pleasure faculty and the [mental] joy faculty, and the neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling is the onlooking-equanimity faculty. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

369. Those same faculties are included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] affected by taints and factors of being—are comprised within the idea-element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

370. That idea-element is included in the idea-base, which base is [in this case] affected by taints and a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

371. 'The unsupported is not liable to dislodgement': unsupported by craving and in virtue of quiet, and unsupported by view and in virtue of insight.

372. Any insight is science. With arising of science [there is] cessation of ignorance; with cessation of ignorance, cessation of determinations; with cessation of determinations, cessation of consciousness; . . . and thus the whole Dependent Arising. [66] This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

366/1 This passage is drawn from *Pe*'s 16th *Mode* and placed here in improved form.

373. That same insight is the understanding category. This is the way of entry by Categories.

374. That same insight is two faculties, namely the energy faculty and the understanding faculty. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

375. That same insight is included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] free from taints and not factors of being—are comprised within the idea-element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

376. That idea-element is included in the idea-base, which base is [in this case] free from taints and not a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

377. 'When there is tranquillity': tranquillity is of two kinds, namely bodily and mental. Any bodily pleasure is bodily tranquillity, and any mental pleasure is mental tranquillity. One who has bodily tranquillity feels pleasure. When he is pleased, his cognizance is concentrated (cf. *M.* i, 37). One who is concentrated understands how [things] are. When he understands how [things] are, he finds dispassion. Finding dispassion, his lust fades. With the fading of lust he is liberated. There is the knowledge 'I am liberated'. He understands 'Birth is exhausted, the divine life has been lived out, what was to be done is done, there is no more of this beyond' (cf. *M.* iii, 280).

378. He has 'no bent-for-naming' in regard to forms or sounds or odours or flavours or tangibles or ideas because of the exhaustion of lust, because of the exhaustion of hate, because of the exhaustion of delusion.

379. He is liberated in the complete exhaustion of form owed to the exhaustion, fading, ceasing, giving up, and relinquishing, of such form as that whereby he might describe a Perfect One as standing or walking. He does not take for granted that 'there is a Perfect One' (cf. §908); and he does not take for granted that 'there is not'; he does not take for granted that 'there is and there is not'; he does not take for granted that 'there neither is nor is not' (cf. *M.* i, 486; *S.* iv, 383); but rather [he knows] that he comes to be calculated as profound, immeasurable (cf. §783), incalculable, quenched, because of exhaustion of lust, because of exhaustion of hate, because of exhaustion of delusion.

380. He is liberated in the complete exhaustion of feeling . . .

381. . . . of perception . . .

382. . . . of determinations . . .

383. He is liberated in the complete exhaustion of consciousness [67] owed to the exhaustion, fading, ceasing, giving up, and relinquishing, of such consciousness as that whereby he might describe a Perfect One as standing or walking. He does not take for granted that 'there is a Perfect One'; and he does not take for granted that 'there is not'; he does not take for granted that 'there is and there is not'; he does not take for granted that 'there neither is nor is not'; but rather [he knows] that he comes to be calculated as profound, immeasurable, incalculable, quenched, because of extinction of lust, because of extinction of hate, because of extinction of delusion.

384. 'Coming' is coming here. 'Going' is any being (existence) after passing away [from this life]. Both the coming and the going are no more.

385. 'Nor here': [he sees no self] in the six bases in oneself.

386. 'Nor beyond': [he sees no self] in the six external bases.

387. 'Nor in between':¹ he sees no self in the ideas aroused by contact.²

388. 'This is the end of suffering' is Dependent Arising. That is of two kinds, namely belonging to worlds and disjoined from worlds. Herein, that belonging to worlds is [that beginning] <With ignorance as condition, determinations> down as far as <ageing and death> (S. ii, 1). That disjoined from worlds is [that beginning] <A virtuous man has no remorse> down as far as <There is no more of this beyond> (see §806).

That is why the Blessed One said 'The supported is liable to dislodgement, the unsupported is not liable to dislodgement . . . this is the end of suffering' (§364).

*

389. <Whatever sorrows, lamentations, pains
Of many kinds, are found here in the world,
That they exist is owed to something dear;
With naught held dear they never come to be.
So they are blissful, free from sorrowing,
That nothing in the world hold dear at all.

387/1 *UdA.* under *ubhayantarena* discusses the impropriety of the concept of the 'bhavantara' ('interval between existences, between death and rebirth').

387/2 This refers to the feeling (affectivity), etc., that arises simultaneously with the arising of consciousness (see, e.g., *M.* iii, 279, 285; also cf. §308). 'Contact' is in the sense of 'presence to', see description at *M.* iii, 285.

*So would you sorrowless and stainless be,
Hold nothing dear whatever in the world> (Pe 14; Ud. 92).¹*

390. 'Whatever sorrows, lamentations, pains Of many kinds, are found here in the world, That they exist is owed to something dear': this is painful feeling. 'With naught held dear they never come to be': this is pleasant feeling. [68] Feelings are the feeling category. This is the way of entry by Categories.

391. With feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, assuming; with assuming as condition birth; with birth as condition, ageing and death . . . and so all the rest. This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

392. Herein, pleasant feeling is two faculties, namely the pleasure faculty and the joy faculty. Painful feeling is two faculties, namely the pain faculty and the grief faculty. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

393. Those same faculties are included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] affected by taints and factors of being—are comprised within the idea-element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

394. That idea-element is included in the idea-base, which base is [in this case] affected by taints and a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

395. 'So they are blissful, free from sorrowing, That nothing in the world hold dear at all. So would you sorrowless and stainless be, Hold nothing dear whatever in the world': this is the abandoning of craving. With cessation of craving, cessation of assuming; with cessation of assuming, cessation of being; . . . and so all the rest. This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

396. That same abandoning of craving is quiet. That quiet is of two kinds, namely the mindfulness faculty and the concentration faculty. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

397. That same quiet is the concentration category. This is the way of entry by Categories.

398. That same quiet is included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] free from taints and not factors of being—

389/1 The same sentiments appear in the *Suttanipāta* verses quoted at §192 and are presented very trenchantly in *M. Sutta* 87 and at *Ud.* 91-2. But cf. *Sn.* 262. There is no contradiction, since what is the 'greatest blessing' in existence is *ipso facto* no blessing in its impermanence:

are comprised within the idea-element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

399. That idea-element is included in the idea-base, which is [in this case] free from taints and not a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

*

400. <[69] <When a mortal desires, if his desire is fulfilled,
He is sure to be happy by getting what he wanted.
Desire-born and wilful, if his desire fails him,
He becomes as deformed as if pierced by a barb.
Who shuns desires as a snake's head with his foot,
And is mindful, evades this attachment to the world> (§§33-5).

401. Herein, the 'happiness' is approval. What is stated by 'he becomes as deformed as if pierced by a barb' is resistance. Now approval and resistance are sides of craving. The ten bases having form¹ are the footing for craving. This is the way of entry by Bases.

402. Those same bases having form are the form-body associated with name.¹ Both together are name-and-form. With name-and-form as condition, the sixfold base; with the sixfold base as condition, contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; . . . and so all the rest. This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

403. That same name-and-form is the five categories. This is the way of entry by Categories.

404. That same name-and-form is the eighteen elements. This is the way of entry by Elements.

405. Herein, the form-body is the five faculties having form,¹ and the name-body is the five formless faculties. These are ten faculties. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

406. Herein, what is stated by 'Who shuns desires, as a snake's head with his foot, And is mindful, evades this attachment to the world'

401/1 The 'ten bases having form' would seem to be the 5 pairs, namely eye-cum-forms, . . . body-cum-tangibles. *NettiA* ignores. This reckoning is taken from *Pe* 99. A different numerical reckoning is given at *Vis*. 590.

402/1 Read *nāmasampayutto* as one compound.

405/1 The 'five faculties having form' can be taken as those of the eye, ear, nose, tongue, and body, and the 'five formless faculties' as those of faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and understanding. These '10 faculties' are thus not the same 10 as those in §303, at least according to the description of the former given by *NettiA*, which ignores these.

is the element of extinction with trace left. This is the way of entry by Elements.

407. That same extinction element with trace left is science. With arising of science, cessation of ignorance (nescience); with cessation of ignorance, cessation of determinations; . . . and so all the rest. [70] This is the way of entry by the [two] aspects of Dependent Arising.

408. That same science is the understanding category. This is the way of entry by Categories.

409. That same science is two faculties, namely the energy faculty and the understanding faculty. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

410. That same science is included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] free from taints and not factors of being—are comprised within the idea-element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

411. That idea-element is included in the idea-base, which base is [in this case] free from taints and not a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

That is why the Blessed One said ‘When a mortal desires . . .’ (§400).

412. At this point the [formula of] Dependent [Arising], the Faculties, the Categories, the Elements, and the Bases, have come to be made ways of entry and meeting-places. That is how Dependent [Arising], Faculties, Categories, and Bases, can be made ways of entry.

413. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

‘Dependent-Rising, Faculties,
Categories, Elements, Bases:
The Mode that by these means gives entry
Is that Conveying Ways of Entry’ (§16).

The Mode of Conveying Ways of Entry is ended.

*

[The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying a Clearing-Up]

414. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Clearing-Up? [It is stated in] the verse:

'Seeking if in a question answered
 What in the verse did instigate
 Its asking is cleared up or not:
 This Mode Conveys a Clearing-Up' (§17).

415. For instance, in the *Parāyana* [Chapter of the *Suttanipāṭa*] the venerable Ajita asked the Blessed One the question [and received the answer thus:]

< '[Tell] *what is the world shut in by ?*
And wherefore is it not displayed ?
And what is it besmeared with ? Say.
And what will be its greatest fear ?'

' *By ignorance is the world shut in,*
Ajita' the Blessed One said.
 ' 'Tis undisplayed through miswishing and neglect.
 And hankering smears it, I say.
 Suffering is its greatest fear' > (§§63, 65).

416. In the case of the question '[Tell] what is the world shut in by ?' the Blessed One [with his answer] 'By ignorance is the world shut in' clears up a term but not the instigation.¹ In the case of the question 'And wherefore is it not [71] displayed ?' The Blessed One [with his answer] 'Tis undisplayed through miswishing and neglect' clears up a term but not the instigation. In the case of the question 'And what is it besmeared with ? Say' the Blessed One [with his answer] 'And hankering smears it, I say' clears up a term but not the instigation. [But] in the case of the question 'And what will be its greatest fear ?' the Blessed One [with his answer] 'Suffering is its greatest fear' clears up a term, and the instigation is cleared up too.

That is why the Blessed One said 'By ignorance is the world shut in . . .' (§415).

*

416/1 '*Ārambha*—instigation' (i.e., the 'initially prompting subject-matter'): \sqrt{rabh} 'to begin, to instigate'. This use of the word seems peculiar to this work and to *Pe* (e.g., p 101). *NettiA* has nothing enlightening to say. Cf. *ārambha-dhātu* ('element of instigation' or 'of initiative': *S.* v, 66) and use of *ger. ārabhha* as adv. in sense of 'instigated by', 'inspired by', 'contingent upon' (§17; also *Vis.* 197). This root is sometimes inclined to coalesce with \sqrt{lamb} (to hang, cf. *ālambana* and *ārammaṇa*) and $\sqrt{rādh}$ (to satisfy, to invite, with which it shares its pp. *āraddha*).

417. [Again there are the following question and answer:]

<The streams keep streaming everywhere'

So said the venerable Ajita.

'What is it that shuts off the streams ?

Tell then, what is restraint of streams,

Whereby it is that streams are sealed ?'

'Whatever streams are in the world,

Ajita' the Blessed One said

'They are shut off by mindfulness;

The streams' restraint I tell, whereby

They can be sealed, is understanding' > (§§70 and 74).

418. In the case of the question 'The streams keep streaming everywhere; What is it that shuts off the streams?' the Blessed One [with his answer] 'Whatever streams are in the world, They are shut off by mindfulness' clears up a term but not the instigation. In the case of the question 'Tell then, what is restraint of streams, Whereby it is that streams are sealed?' [with the answer] 'the streams' restraint I tell, whereby They can be sealed, is understanding' the instigation is cleared up.

That is why the Blessed One said 'Whatever streams are in the world . . .' (§417).

*

419. [Again,] in the case of the question

<'Understanding and mindfulness.'

So said the venerable Ajita

'And [now], good sir, this name-and-form,

Tell me then what I ask of you,

Where does it come to its surcease ?' > (§77)

[with the answer]

<'As to the question that you ask,

Ajita, I [shall] tell you [now].

Where both this name and form do come

To their remainderless surcease:

With cessation of consciousness,

'Tis here this comes to its surcease' > (§77).

the instigation is cleared up.

That is why the Blessed One said 'As to the question that you ask . . . '.

420. [72] Wherever the instigation is cleared up in this way the question is answered; but wherever the instigation is not cleared up that question is not yet answered.

421. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'Seeking if in a question answered
What in the verse did instigate
Its asking is cleared up or not:
This Mode Conveys a Clearing-Up' (§17).

The Mode of Conveying a Clearing-Up is ended.

*

14

[The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying Terms of Expression]

422. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Terms of Expression ?
[It is this:]

'Ideas when demonstrated by
[Both] unity and diversity
Need thereby suffer no disjunction:
This Mode conveys Expression's Terms' (§18.)

423. Those [ideas] should be remembered according as they are demonstrated there where they appear [in their contexts as follows].

424. 'Suffering' is a unity.

Herein, what is Suffering ? <Birth is suffering, ageing is suffering, sickness is suffering, death is suffering, association with the loathed is suffering, dissociation from the loved is suffering, not to get one's wish is suffering, in brief the five categories of assumption are suffering> (S. v, 421; cf. Pe 5): form is suffering, feeling is suffering, perception is suffering, determinations are suffering, consciousness is suffering. This is a diversity.

425. 'The Origin of Suffering' is a unity.

Herein, what is the Origin of Suffering ? <It is that craving which renews being (existence), is accompanied by relish and lust, relishing this and that, namely craving for sensual desires, craving for being (existence), craving for non-being (non-existence)> (S. v, 421). This is a diversity.

426. 'Cessation of suffering' is a unity.

Herein, what is cessation of suffering? <It is the remainderless fading of that same craving, its ceasing, giving it up, relinquishing it, letting it go, non-relying on it, and rejecting it> (S. v, 421). This is diversity.

427. 'The way leading to cessation of suffering' is a unity.

[73] Herein, what is the way leading to cessation of suffering? <It is the Noble Eight-factored Path, that is to say, right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration> (S. v, 421-2). This is a diversity

428. 'Path' is a unity.

Herein, what is a path? It is the path leading to hell, the path leading to the animal womb, the path leading to the ghost realm, the path leading to the Asura (Demon) womb, the path leading to heaven, the path leading to humanity, the path leading to extinction. This is a diversity.

429. 'Cessation' is a unity.

Herein, what is cessation? It is deliberate cessation, undeliberate cessation;¹ cessation of approval, cessation of resistance; cessation of conceit, cessation of contempt, cessation of domineering, cessation of envy, cessation of avarice, cessation of all defilements. This is a diversity.

430. 'Form' is a unity.

Herein, what is form? Form is the four great entities (cf. *M.* i,

429/1 'Paṭisankhā-nirodha—deliberate cessation' and 'appaṭisankhānirodha—undeliberate cessation': neither compound is in *PED* and latter not in *CPD* (Vol. 1); see *Kv.* 226 and *Kv.* trsln. ('Points of Controversy') 137, note; also *Mitr.* (cf. also *Pe* 151, line 15 *nirodhasamāpatti(m) appaṭisankhāya*). *NettiA* says 'Paṭisankhānirodha is cessation due to deliberating (*paṭisankhāya*), due to keeping in being opposition (to arising—*paṭipakkhabhāvanāya*); or when opposition has not occurred in that way, it is the non-arising of what is ready to arise, owing to opposition to its arising being already in existence. *Appaṭisankhānirodha* is the cessation of determined ideas along with their individual natures: what is meant is cessation from moment to moment' (p. 109). That these two terms should be present here and absent from the *Pe* is noteworthy. The second, according to *NettiA*, means the cessation incessantly taking place in the process of impermanence. Cf. *KvA* (Burm. ed., p. 140) and *KvAA* (Burm. ed., p. 56). There seems no reason for supposing that the later independent Sanskrit *Mahāyāna* development of these terms is in any way implied here (for which see, e.g., O. Rosenberg, *Die Probleme der Buddhistischen Philosophie*, Heidelberg, 1924, p. 128; E. Obermiller, *The Doctrine of Prajñā-pāramitā*, Leningrad, 1932; and E. Lamotte, *Histoire du Bouddhisme Indien*, Louvain, 1958, p. 675).

185), and any description of form assuming the four great entities (*M.* iii, 17).

431. Herein, what are the four great entities? They are the earth element, the water element, the fire element, the air element. These elements can be comprised in two moods, namely in brief [as above] and in detail.

432. How does one comprise the elements in detail? One comprises the earth element in detail in twenty moods, one comprises the water element in detail in twelve moods, one comprises the fire element in detail in four moods, and one comprises the air element in detail in six moods.

433. In what twenty moods does one comprise the earth element in detail? [74] There are in this body head-hairs, body-hairs, nails, teeth, skin; flesh, sinews, bones, bone-marrow, kidney; heart, liver, midriff, spleen, lights; bowels, entrails, gorge, dung (cf. *M.* i, 421), and brain-in-the-head (*Ps.* i, 7). One comprises the earth element in detail in these twenty moods.

434. In what twelve moods does one comprise the water element in detail? There are in this body bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat; tears, grease, spittle, snot, oil-of-the-joints, and urine (cf. *M.* i, 422). One comprises the water element in detail in these twelve moods.

435. In what four moods does one comprise the fire element in detail? There is that whereby one is warmed, whereby one ages, whereby one burns, and whereby what is eaten, drunk, chewed, and tasted, gets completely digested (cf. *M.* i, 422). One comprises the fire element in detail in these four moods.

436. In what six moods does one comprise the air element in detail? There are up-going forces, down-going forces, forces in the paunch, forces in the belly, forces that course through the limbs, and in-breath and out-breath (cf. *M.* i, 422). That is how one comprises the air element in detail in six moods.

437. He who thus in detail recharacterizes, estimates, fathoms, inquires into, and reviews, the elements as to individual-essence¹ in these forty-two moods sees nothing at all worth taking, whether body or bodily part. Just as one who investigated a cesspool would see nothing at all worth taking, just as one who investigated a privy would see nothing worth taking, so [75] too he who thus in detail re-characterizes, estimates, fathoms, inquires into, and reviews, the

elements as to individual-essence in these forty-two moods sees nothing at all worth taking, whether body or bodily part.

438. That is why the Blessed One said: <Now both the earth element in oneself and the external earth element should be seen, with right understanding how they are, in this way: 'I am not this,¹ this is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self.' On seeing it thus, with right understanding how it is, he finds dispassion in the earth element, and lust for the earth element fades from his heart. Now both the water element in oneself and the external water element . . . both the fire element in oneself and the external fire element . . . both the air element in oneself and the external air element should be seen, with right understanding how they are, in this way: 'I am not this, this is not mine, this is not I, this is not my self.' On seeing it thus, with right understanding how it is, he finds dispassion in the air element, and lust for the air element fades from his heart> (cf. *M.* i, 421). This is a diversity.

439. 'Ignorance' is a unity.

Herein, what is ignorance? It is unknowing about suffering, unknowing about the origin of suffering, unknowing about cessation of suffering, and unknowing about the way leading to cessation of suffering (cf. *Pe* 116); unknowing about the past, unknowing about the future, unknowing about the past and future; unknowing about specific conditionality and dependently arisen ideas; it is any such unknowing, unseeing, non-actualization, failure to be enlightened by another, failure to enlighten oneself, non-penetration, failure to characterize, failure to recharacterize, failure to counter-characterize, [76] disregard, inexperience, witlessness, folly, unawareness, delusion, illusion, confusion, ignorance, flood of ignorance, bond of ignorance, underlying tendency to ignorance, obsession by ignorance, lock of ignorance, delusion as a root of the unprofitable. This is a diversity.

440. 'Science' is a unity.

Herein, what is science? It is knowledge about suffering, knowledge about the origin of suffering, knowledge about cessation of suffering, knowledge about the way leading to cessation of suffering; knowledge about the past, knowledge about the future, knowledge about the past and future; knowledge about specific conditionality and dependently arisen ideas; <it is any such under-

438/1 This phrase, *nev' csāham*, is extra to the usual statement of this formula.

standing, act-of-understanding, investigation, reinvestigation, investigation-of-ideas, characterization, recharacterization, counter-characterization, wisdom, skill, cleverness, elucidation, cogitation, scrutiny, breadth, wit, guidance, insight, awareness, goad, understanding faculty, understanding power, understanding weapon, understanding [storied] palace, understanding light, understanding illumination, understanding lucidity, understanding jewel, non-delusion, investigation-of-ideas, right view, investigation-of-ideas enlightenment factor, path-factor included in the path (Dhs. 292; cf. Pe 122). This is a diversity.

441. 'Attainment' is a unity.

Herein, what is attainment? There is percipient attainment, unpercipient attainment, neither-percipient-nor-unpercipient attainment, attainment percipient of non-entity,¹ attainment of cessation.² This is a diversity.

442. 'Meditator' is a unity.

Herein, what is a meditator? There is the Initiate meditator, there is the Adept meditator, there is the neither-Initiate-nor-Adept meditator, there is the 'thoroughbred' meditator, there is the 'colt' meditator (see A. v, 323; cf. Pe 146), there is the meditator governed by views, there is the meditator governed by craving, there is the meditator governed by understanding. [77] This is a diversity.

443. 'Concentration' is a unity.

Herein, what is concentration? There is concentration with conflict, concentration without conflict;¹ concentration with risk, concentration without risk; concentration with ill will, concentration with non-ill-will; concentration with happiness [i.e., the first two meditations], concentration free from happiness [i.e., the last two meditations]; materialistic concentration, non-materialistic concentration;² concentration with prompting-determinations, concentra-

441/1 '*Vibhūtasaññāsamāpatti*—attainment percipient of nonentity': *Netti* A: 'The attainment of the base consisting of infiniteness of consciousness; for it is owing to the non-entity (*vibhāvanato*) [through its being now ceased and past] of the consciousness [now ceased and being contemplated] that *was* cognizing the first Formless State (i.e., space) and of the [conascent] perception that was perceiving the first Formless State that it is so called (cf. *Vis.* ch. x, §§60-5/pp. 339-40). But some read *vibhūtarūpasaññā*, and in their opinion this would mean the rest of the Formless States' (p. 113). This explanation takes the ambiguous *vibhavati* in its negative sense. See n. 843/1 But here the reference is perhaps to '*paṭhavisaññā vibhūtā*', etc., at A. v, 325.

441/2 Read *nirodhasamāpatti* as at §580.

443/1 For *sa-rāṇa* and *a-rāṇa* see n. 297/2.

443/2 '*Āmisa*—materialistic': the word normally refers to such material physical needs as food and medicine, and *sāmisa* is what is concerned with

tion without prompting-determinations;³ concentration kept in being unilaterally, concentration kept in being bilaterally, concentration whose keeping in being is both ways kept in being;⁴ concentration with thought and exploring, concentration without thought and with mere exploration, concentration without thought and without exploring (see *D.* iii, 219); concentration dealing with an inferior state, concentration dealing with steadiness, concentration dealing with distinction, concentration dealing with penetration (see *Ps.* i, 48); concentration belonging to worlds, concentration disjoined from worlds; wrong concentration, right concentration. This is a diversity.

444. 'Way' is a unity.

Herein, what is a way? There is the way of luxury, the way of austerity, the middle way (*A.* i, 295); the way of the impatient, the way of the patient; the way of quieting, the way of taming (see *D.* iii, 229); the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship, the painful way with swift acquaintanceship, the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship, the pleasant way with swift acquaintanceship (see *D.* iii, 228). This is a diversity (see also §264).

445. 'Body' is a unity.

Herein, what is a body? There are the name-body and the form-body. Herein, what is the form-body? It is head-hairs, body-hairs, nails, teeth, skin; flesh, sinews, bones, bone-marrow, kidney; heart, liver, midriff, spleen, lights; bowels, entrails, gorge, dung; bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat; tears, grease, spittle, snot, oil-of-the-joints, urine; and brain-in-the-head (see *Ps.* i, 7). [78] This is the form-body (cf. §226). The name-body consists of feeling, perception, choice, cognizance, contact, and attention. This is the name-body (see §226). This is a diversity.

446. In this way, while some idea [say, 'birth'] has the same essence

that, while *nirāmisā* is what is dissociated from that. 'The flesh and the spirit' conveys the same opposites.

443/3 '*Sasankhāra*—with prompting-determination' and '*asankhāra*—without pr.-d.' are not in *PED*; the latter is in *CPD*. See also *Dhs.* 146 and *A.* iv, 72.

443/4 *NettiA*: "Concentration kept in being unilaterally" is that in one who is a Bare-(dry-)insight worker (see below). "Concentration kept in being bilaterally" is that in one whose vehicle is quiet (*Vis.* ch. xviii. §3/p. 587); and "concentration whose keeping in being is both-ways kept in being" is concentration in a Body-Witness (see *M.* i, 478; *Pug.* 14; *Vis.* ch. xxi, §§74-5/p. 659); for he is one whose keeping (of concentration) in being is kept in being in both ways (with maximum of quiet and Insight) (p. 114). For the term 'bare-insight worker' (*sukkha vipassaka*) see *Vis.* chs. xviii and xxi.

[namely 'suffering' in this instance] as that of some [other related] idea, [say, 'ageing' in this instance], that former idea finds unity with this latter idea through [their common] unity, yet it has diversity from it in virtue of that whereby it has its differentiating (particular) characteristic.

So when one is asked about the Tread[-type, which term covers all modes of the Teaching,] or about prose-expositions or about verse, the inquiry should be made as follows: 'How, then, does he ask according to unity or according to diversity?'. If asked according to a unity, then it should be answered according to the unity. If asked according to a diversity, then it should be answered according to the diversity. If asked expressed in terms of creatures, the answer should be expressed in terms of creatures. If asked expressed in terms of ideas, the answer should be expressed in terms of ideas (see §§860 and 943). According as it is asked, so it should be answered.

447. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'Ideas when demonstrated by
[Both] unity and diversity
Need thereby suffer no disjunction:
This Mode conveys Expression's Terms' (§18).

The Mode Conveying Terms of Expression is ended.

*

15

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying Requisites*]

448. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Requisites? [It is this:]

'Ideas that generate each an idea
In due relation are conditions;
And by its picking out the cause
This Mode Conveys the Requisite' (§15).

449. Any idea that generates¹ an idea is a requisite of that idea.

450. What is the Requisite's characteristic? The Requisite has the characteristic of a generator.

449/1 I.e., an idea that is another idea's condition *sine qua non*, as, say, ignorance is for determination.

451. Two kinds of ideas generate, namely a cause and a condition.

452. Herein, what is a cause's characteristic? What is a condition's characteristic? A cause has the characteristic of not being shared in common, while a condition has the characteristic of being shared in common.¹

453. How might that be? In the same way that for the occurrence of a [seed's] sprout the seed is not shared in common [with the sprout] while earth [79] and water are common to both [seed and sprout]; for while the earth and the water are each a condition for the sprout, still individual essence is its cause;¹ or in the same way that milk left in a pot is² curd, and yet there is no simultaneous con-

452/1 This distinction and these two definitions are perhaps peculiar to this work.

453/1 For 'sabhāva—individual essence' see *Ppn.* ch. viii, n. 68, where the term is discussed and various commentarial derivations given. The only *Piṭaka* ref. seems to be that at *Ps.* ii, 178 (either 'born form is void of individual essence' or 'born form is void by individual essence' according to how the instr. (*sabhāvena*) is taken in that passage, which has given *PsA* much trouble). See also *Mīl.* 90, 164, 212, 360; also *Pe* 104. Very frequent in the Commentaries. The use of the word here as a synonym for 'cause' (*hetu*) is different from the commentarial use as a synonym for 'nature' (*pakati*) or any idea (*dhamma*) that is not merely a name or a negation. *NettiA*: "Its individual essence is its cause": the same (existing) essence (*samāna-bhāva*), the seed, is the cause. But is it not a fact that the seed is not like (*sadisa*) the sprout, etc.?—There is no (saying) that it is not; for there is no arising of that kind (of sprout) from any other kind (of seed)' (p. 115). The *Netti*'s argument here contains a hidden (and apparently unintentional?) ambiguity, namely, that between the seed-as-thing (individual) and the seed-as-nature (principle). *Vis* categorically denies the non-Buddhist doctrine of 'inherence' or 'immanence' (*samavāya*), by which the cause is held to inhere in the result (*Vis.* 513), and *VisA* rejects the theory of *sabhāva* as an adequate and sufficient cause (*Ppn.*, ch. xvi, note 23); cf. also the wrong theory attributed to Makkhali Gosāla at *D.* i, 53 with use of *bhāva* (some read *sabhāva*). The word *svabhāva* had great currency in Indian Sanskrit philosophy, both Mahāyāna-Buddhist and non-Buddhist, and it took on many shades, sometimes approaching Aristotle's use of 'essence' as distinct from 'attributes'. To repeat, the word never seems to have been used at all by the Buddha.

453/2 This is an instance where it would be incorrect to translate *bhavati* by 'becomes'. *NettiA* senses an ontological difficulty when it says "Is curd (*dadhi bhavati*)" is said according to the Identity Guide-Line (*Ekatta-naya*—see *Vis.* 585) or according to the Metaphor of Non-Breach (*abhedopacāra*—see *Ppn.* ch. viii, n. 65), but not in any other way; for milk is not (*na hoti*) curd, which is why "and yet there is no simultaneous occurrence of milk and curd" is said' (p. 115). To translate by 'becomes' leaves nothing for the commentary to explain and conceals the difficulty of deciding the 'first moment' when it is curd.

currence of milk and curd, so too there is no simultaneous concurrence of the cause and the condition.

454. Now this roundabout [of rebirths] has occurrence with cause and with condition; for this is said: <With ignorance as condition, determinations; with determinations as condition, consciousness; . . . and so with all the formula of Dependent Arising (cf. S. ii, 1). Consequently ignorance is the cause and unreasoned attention the condition (cf. *Pe* 104 and §462).

455. Previous ignorance is the cause of subsequent ignorance. Herein, the previous ignorance is underlying tendency to ignorance, while the subsequent ignorance is [open] obsession by ignorance. The previous underlying tendency to ignorance is the cause, in causality-by-immediate-proximity, of the subsequent obsession by ignorance, like the seed and the sprout in the growing;¹ but wherever any fruit [of that seed] occurs, this [seed] is [then only] the cause-in-remote-relation of that [fruit]; for cause is of two kinds, namely cause-in-immediate-proximity [as that of the seed for the sprout] and cause-in-remote-relation [as that of the seed for the fruit].² So the cause of ignorance is also of two kinds, namely cause-in-immediate-proximity and cause-in-remote-relation.

456. Or in the same way that vessel, wick and oil are, as it were, the light's condition, but not its cause-as-individual-essence—for one cannot, without a flame, light the vessel, wick and oil, which are the light's condition—; the individual-essence-as-cause being like the light. So the individual-essence is the cause, while the other-essence is the condition;¹ the in-itself is the cause while the external-to-it is the condition; the generator is the cause while the accessory²

455/1 'Paribrūhanā—growing': not in *PED*.

455/2 Cf. *Vis.* 532 (*anantarapaccaya* and *samanantarapaccaya*) and 536 (*anantarūpanissayapaccaya*) for discussion. It is not clear whether the *Netti* has the *Paṭṭhāna* in view or not. *Samanantara-hetu* and *parampara-hetu* seem to be confined to this work and the *Pe* (cf. *Pe* 77 and 104-5).

456/1 This use of *sabhāva* ('individual essence') and *parabhāva* ('other essence') is taken straight from the *Pe* (p. 104). It makes this argument a purely ontological one. *Bhāva* is caus. subst. fm. \sqrt{bhu} , i.e., a 'making be', a 'keeping in being', an 'essence', a '-ness' or '-hood', in the sense of recognizable distinctive quality.

456/2 This definition of *hetu* ('cause') as on a lower level of generality to *paccaya* ('condition') seems peculiar to this work. In the Suttas no difference is discernible. In the Abhidhamma *hetu* tends to be restricted to the six *hetu*, namely greed, etc., while *paccaya* can be either antecedent (e.g., *kamma*), or postnascent (i.e., *cetasikadhammā* against any contemporary *rūpa-dhammā* that arose earlier but ceases with or later owing to the longer presence (*thitī*)),

is the condition; the not-shared-in-common is the cause while the shared-in-common is the condition.

457. The meaning of continuity, the meaning of non-interruption, the meaning of fruit, the meaning of being-made-to-occur, the meaning of renewal of being, the meaning of relinking, the meaning of obsession, the meaning of impediment, the meaning of underlying-tendency, the meaning of non-eradication, the meaning of ignorance, the meaning of non-penetration, the meaning of being undiagnosed, are consciousness's meaning of seed (cf. *A.* i, 224).

458. Where there is non-interruption there is continuity, where there is continuity there is [80] occurrence, where there is occurrence there is fruit, where there is fruit there is relinking,¹ where there is relinking there is renewal of being, where there is renewal of being there is impediment, where there is impediment there is obsession, where there is obsession there is non-eradication, where there is non-eradication there is underlying tendency, where there is underlying tendency there is non-penetration, where there is non-penetration there is ignorance, where there is ignorance there is undiagnosed consciousness affected by taints, where there is undiagnosed consciousness affected by taints there is the meaning of seed (see §304).

459. The virtue category is the condition for the concentration category, the concentration category is the condition for the understanding category, the understanding category is the condition for the deliverance category, the deliverance category is the condition for the knowing-and-seeing-of-deliverance category.

or conascent (i.e., *cetasikā dhammā* that arise and cease together, or that arise with *rūpa-dhammā* but cease earlier). Also *hetupaccaya* is one of the 24 kinds of *paccaya* listed in the *Paṭṭhāna* (see *Vis.* ch. xvii). Buddhist doctrine does not allow a first cause (§644; *Vis.* ch. xvii, §§35ff./p. 525).

458/1 '*Paṭisandhi*—relinking' (or 'rebirth-linking'): *PED*'s article is inadequate, and also misleading with its unfortunate choice of 'metempsychosis' (besides overlooking the only Sutta ref. *M.* iii, 230, which has a different, non-technical, meaning). Some technical Abhidhamma and Commentary refs. are: *Ptn.* 320, etc., *Ps.* ii, 72, etc., *Vis.* 460. Commentarial meaning: while *cuti-citta* is used for the last cognizance of a dying person, *paṭisandhi-citta* is used for the first cognizance upon rebirth, which follows immediately upon—'links up with'—the death-cognizance. There is thus unbroken continuity without any 'thing'—consciousness or anything else—having any permanency. Only the 'momentum' of *kamma* is communicated or 'passed on' by the dying cognizance to the relinking cognizance in virtue of ignorance and craving.

460. Knowledge of watering-places is the condition for knowledge of what it is to have drunk [enough], knowledge of what it is to have drunk [enough] is the condition for knowledge of the [right] amount, knowledge of the [right] amount is the condition for knowledge of self (§167).

461. Or in the same way that <eye consciousness arises depending upon eye and forms> (*M.* i, 111; iii, 285): Herein, the eye is a condition through the conditionality of predominance, while forms are a condition through conditionality of object, light¹ is a condition through co-supporting, and attention, as the individual-essence, is the cause (cf. §454).

462. While consciousness's condition is determinations, its individual essence is its cause.¹ While name-and-form's condition is consciousness, its individual essence is its cause. While the sixfold base's condition is name-and-form, its individual essence is its cause. While contact's condition is the sixfold base, its individual essence is its cause. While feeling's condition is contact, its individual essence is its cause. While craving's condition is feeling, its individual essence is its cause. While assuming's condition is craving, its individual essence is its cause. While being's condition is assuming, its individual essence is its cause. While birth's condition is being, its individual essence is its cause. While ageing-and-death's condition is birth, its individual essence is its cause. While sorrow's condition is ageing-and-death, its individual essence is its cause. While lamentation's condition is sorrow, its individual essence is its cause. While pain's condition is lamentation, its individual essence is its cause. While grief's condition is pain, its individual essence is its cause. While despair's condition is grief, its individual essence is its cause.

461/1 The addition of 'light' (*āloka*) as one of the conditions for the arising of eye-consciousness is later than the Tipiṭaka, in which it is not mentioned in that capacity. Cf. *Vis.* 488-9 (quoting the 'Former Teachers'). This must be the earliest mention in any extant Pali work, though cf. the passage in *Nd2* (234) '*cakkhunā puriso āloketi rūpagatāni*'. Cf. *D.* iii, 223—'*ālokasaññā*'.

462/1 From what has gone before (§§452 and 456) this must mean prior consciousness in continuity, and so with the rest. *NettiA* says 'Determinative-acts of merit (demerit and imperturbability) are the condition for relinking-consciousness (at rebirth). Herein, that which is the individual-essence is the cause. And here by "determinations" is intended any arising of cognizance, profitable or unprofitable, that belongs to worlds' (p. 116). The Piṭaka refs. for Dependent Arising are as follows: *D. Sutta* 15; *M. Suttas* 9 and 38; *S. Nidāna Saṃyutta*; *A.* i, 177; *Vbh. Paccayākāravibhanga*; *Ps.* i, 50-2.

463. In this way all kinds of general-support are a requisite (cf. §168).

464. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

‘Ideas that generate each an idea
In due relation are conditions;
And by its picking out the cause
This Mode Conveys the Requisite’ (§19).

The Mode of Conveying Requisites is ended.

*

16

[*The Ninefold Thread in the Mode of Conveying a Co-ordination*]

465. [81] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Co-ordination ?
[It is this:]

‘Ideas with those whose roots they are,
And those shown by the Sage to have
One meaning, should be co-ordinated:
This Mode Conveys Co-ordination’ (§20).

466. As many footings as furnish ways of entry should all be co-ordinated with any single footing [mentioned], in the same way as, in the Mode of Conveying a Conversion, several footings are made to furnish ways of entry.

467. Herein, co-ordination is of four kinds, namely (i) footing, (ii) synonym, (iii) keeping in being, and (iv) abandoning (cf. §§107ff.).

[(i) Footing]

468. Herein, what is co-ordination of footing ?

<No doing any kind of evil,
Perfecting profitable skill,
And purifying one’s own heart:
This is the Buddhas’ Dispensation> (§238).

469. What is the footing for that ? The three kinds of good conduct, namely bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct. These are a footing.¹

469/1 For the construing of the words *Tīṇi sucaritāni . . . idaṃ padaṭṭhānam* see n. 64/1. *NettiA*: ‘This (*idaṃ*) triple good conduct (*sucaritaṃ*) is a footing (*padaṭṭhānam*) because it is the field and foundation for the Enlightened Ones’ Dispensation, for their advice’ (p. 117).

470. Herein, any bodily and verbal good conduct are the virtue category. In the case of mental good conduct, any uncovetousness and non-ill-will are the concentration category, and any right view is the understanding category (see §238). These are a footing.

471. Herein, the virtue category and the concentration category are quiet, and the understanding category is insight. These are a footing.

472. Herein, the fruit of quiet is the heart-deliverance due to fading of lust, and the fruit of insight is the understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance. These are a footing.

*

473. The <wood>¹ is the footing for the <woodedness> (*Dh.* 283). What is the 'wood' and what is the 'woodedness'? The 'wood' means the five strands of sensual desire, while the 'woodedness' means craving. This is a footing.

474. [82] The 'wood' means the apprehending, by signs (*M.* i, 180), of 'woman' or 'man', while the 'woodedness' is the apprehending of such and such limbs as features thus 'Oh an eye! Oh an ear! Oh a nose! Oh a tongue! Oh a body!'. This is a footing.

475. The 'wood' means the undiagnosed bases in oneself and external thereto, and the 'woodedness' means any fetter that arises dependent on these (cf. *D.* ii, 302). This is a footing.

476. The 'wood' is the underlying-tendency and the 'woodedness' is the manifest-obsession. This is a footing.

477. That is why the Blessed One said:

<Having cut down the wood and woodedness> (*Dh.* 283).

This is co-ordination of footing.

*

473/1 The whole *Dh* verse should have preceded here but is missing. An explanation of the word *vana* is given at *MA.* i, 11 (= *KhpA.* 111) as follows, 'It is what one would (*vanayate*), thus it is a wood (*vana*); it creates fondness in creatures for its own excellence; the meaning is that it arouses affection in them towards itself. Or alternatively, it would (*vanute*), thus it is a wood (*vana*); the meaning is that with the cries of cuckoos . . . it is, as it were, begging all creatures to "come and enjoy me"'. The word-play on *vana* and *vāna* is also found at *Vis.* 293. *Vanatha* is 'woodedness', i.e., 'overgrowth' or 'blanketed over with woods', rather than *PED*'s 'underwood'; for suffix *-tha* (= -ness) cf. *sama-tha*.

[(ii) *Synonym*]

478. Herein, what is co-ordination of synonym? The heart-deliverance due to fading of lust is the Initiate's fruit, and the understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance is the Adept's fruit. These are synonyms.

479. The heart-deliverance due to fading of lust is the Non-Returner's fruit, and the understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance is arahantship, the highest fruit. These are synonyms.

480. The heart-deliverance due to fading of lust surmounts the element of sensual desire, and the understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance surmounts the threefold element [of sensual-desire, form, and formless existence]. These are synonyms.

481. Understanding faculty, understanding power, training in the higher understanding, understanding category, investigation-of-ideas enlightenment factor, equanimity enlightenment factor, knowledge, right view, judgment, adjudgment, conscience, insight, knowledge of the True Idea (cf. §294): all these are synonyms.

This is co-ordination of synonym.

*

[(iii) *Keeping in being*]

482. Herein, what is co-ordination of keeping-in-being? It is according as the Blessed One said: <Therefore, *bhikkhus*, abide contemplating the body as a body, ardent, aware and mindful, guiding out covetousness and grief about the world> (§174).

[83] Now 'ardent' means the energy faculty, 'aware' the understanding faculty, 'mindful' the mindfulness faculty, and 'guiding out covetousness and grief about the world' the concentration faculty (§174).

So when someone abides contemplating the body as a body, the four foundations of mindfulness come to fulfilment through keeping in being. For what reason? Because of the four faculties' state of single characteristic (§174).

483. When the four foundations of mindfulness are kept in being, the four right endeavours come to fulfilment through keeping in being. When the four right endeavours are kept in being, the four bases for success (roads to power) come to fulfilment through keeping in being. When the four bases for success are kept in being, the five faculties come to fulfilment through keeping in being . . . And so all. For what reason? Because all the ideas that

lead to enlightenment, that partake of enlightenment, have a single characteristic in the characteristic of outlet. They come to fulfilment through keeping in being owing to singleness of characteristic (cf. §175).

This is co-ordination of keeping in being.

*

[(iv) *Abandoning*]

484. Herein, what is co-ordination of abandoning ?

One who abides contemplating the body as a body abandons the perversion that there is beauty in the ugly, physical nutriment comes within his diagnosis, he is without assuming in regard to sensual-desire assuming, he is unbound in regard to the bond of sensual desire, he is dissociated in regard to the bodily tie of covetousness, he is taintless in regard to the taint of sensual desire, he has crossed over the flood of sensual desire, he is barbless as regards the barb of lust,¹ form as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on² comes within his diagnosis, his lust for the form element is abandoned, and he does not go a bad way through will.

485. One who abides contemplating feelings as feelings abandons the perversion that there is pleasure in the painful, contact as nutriment comes within his diagnosis, he is without assuming in regard to existence-assuming,¹ he is unbound in regard to the bond of existence, he is dissociated in regard to the bodily tie of ill-will, he is taintless in regard to the taint of existence, he has [84] crossed over the flood of existence, he is barbless in regard to the barb of hate, feeling as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on comes within his diagnosis, his lust for the feeling element² is abandoned, and he does not go a bad way through hate.

486. One who abides contemplating cognizance as cognizance abandons the perversion that there is permanence in the impermanent, consciousness as nutriment comes within his diagnosis, he is

484/1 The 4 'barbs' (*salla*) here are lust, hate, conceit, and delusion, as in §§674ff. But in *Pe* (p. 245) they are lust, hate, delusion, and views. 3 kinds appear in §753. These enumerations are not found in the Suttas, apparently.

484/2 See n. 176/1.

485/1 *Bhavūpādāna* ('existence-assuming') is not found in the *Tipiṭaka*. See 228/1.

485/2 For the terms *vedanā-dhātu* ('feeling-element'), *saññā-dhātu* ('perception-element': §486), and *sankhāra-dhātu* ('determinations-element': §§323, 487), see, e.g., *S.* iii, 10.

without assuming in regard to wrong-view assuming, he is unbound in regard to the bond of views, he is dissociated in regard to the bodily tie of misapprehension of virtue and duty, he is taintless in regard to the taint of views, he has crossed over the flood of views, he is barbless in regard to the barb of conceit, perception as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on comes within his diagnosis, his lust for the perception-element is abandoned, and he does not go a wrong way through fear.

487. One who abides contemplating ideas as ideas abandons the perversion that there is self in the not-self, mind-choice as nutriment comes within his diagnosis, he is without assuming in regard to self-doctrine assuming, he is unbound in regard to the bond of ignorance, he is dissociated in regard to the bodily tie of insistence that 'only this is the truth', he is taintless in regard to the taint of ignorance, he has crossed over the flood of ignorance, he is barbless in regard to the barb of delusion, determinations as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on comes within his diagnosis, his lust for the determinations-element is abandoned, and he does not go a bad way through delusion.

This is co-ordination of abandoning.

488. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'Ideas with those whose roots they are,
And those shown by the Sage to have
One meaning, should be co-ordinated:
This Mode Conveys Co-ordination' (§16).

The Mode of Conveying a Co-ordination is ended.

*

The 16 Modes of Conveying in Separate Treatment are ended.

[Chapter ii

16 Modes of Conveying: Combined Treatment]

489. [85] It was said as follows:

‘Sixteen Conveyings first, surveying
With Plotting then of the Directions,
And having collected with the Hook,
Three Guide-Lines demonstrate a Thread’ (§26).

490. Now where is a demonstration of that to be found? In the Modes of Conveying in Combined Treatment.¹

*

[1]

491. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Teaching in Combined Treatment? [It is, for example, as follows]

<With an unguarded cognizance,
Encumbered by wrong view, oppressed
By lethargy and drowsiness,
One travels on in Māra’s power>

(cf. *Ud.* 38; counterpart verse at §595).

492. What does ‘with an unguarded cognizance’ teach? Negligence. That is the state of Mortality.

493. ‘Encumbered by wrong view’: one is called ‘encumbered by wrong view’ when he sees permanence in the impermanent. That is a perversion. Now what is the characteristic of a perversion? A perversion has the characteristic of distorted apprehension. What does it pervert? Three ideas, namely perception, cognizance, and view (see *A.* ii, 52). What does it cause perversion in? The four grounds for self-hood.¹ [It does so] as follows <*He sees form as self, or self as possessed of form, or form in self, or self in form*>

490/1 The 16 Modes are here all applied to the single quotation from the *Ud* in two parts, at §§491 and 595 respectively.

493/1 See *Pe* 121, which appears to be the earlier example of the term *attabhāva-vatthu* and the only other book where it is used. There the 4 are

(*M.* i, 299f.; iii, 17). Likewise with feeling, perception, determinations, and consciousness.

494. Herein, form is the first ground for perversion, namely that there is beauty in the ugly; feeling is the second ground for perversion, namely that there is pleasure in the painful; perception and determinations are the third ground for perversion, namely that there is self in the not-self; and consciousness is the fourth ground for perversion, namely that there is permanence in the impermanent (cf. *Pe* 20-1).

495. [86] Two ideas are corruptions of cognizance: they are craving and ignorance. Cognizance shut in (hindered) by craving is perverted by the two perversions that there is beauty in the ugly and that there is pleasure in the painful. Cognizance shut in (hindered) by ignorance is perverted by the two perversions that there is permanence in the impermanent and that there is self in the not-self.

496. Herein, any perversion of view sees past form as self, sees past feeling . . . past perception . . . past determinations . . . sees past consciousness as self.

497. Herein, any perversion of craving expectantly relishes future form, expectantly relishes future feeling . . . future perception . . . future determinations, expectantly relishes future consciousness.

498. Two ideas are imperfections of cognizance, they are craving and ignorance. [It is when] purified from these that cognizance is purified.

499. Of those who have ignorance for their hindrance and craving for their fetter no first beginning is evident (see §644) as they run on and on and go the roundabout (cf. *S.* ii, 178ff.), now in hell, now among animals, now in the ghost realm, now in the body of the Asura Demons, now among gods, now among men.

500. 'Oppressed by lethargy and drowsiness': lethargy is any unhealthiness, unwieldiness, of cognizance; drowsiness is any sloth of the body (cf. *Pe* 137).

501. 'One travels on in Māra's power': he travels on in the power of Māra (the Death-Dealer) as Defilement and Māra as Creature; for he faces the roundabout [of births].

502. Now these two Truths have been taught by the Blessed One: Suffering and its Origin. The Blessed One teaches the True Idea for their diagnosis and abandoning: for the diagnosis of Suffering

derived by subsuming the 5 Categories under the 4 Foundations of Mindfulness, instead of as here. For *attabhāva* alone as 'body' (physical and mental) see, e.g., *A.* i, 279.

and for the abandoning of its Origin. That by way of which one diagnoses and that by way of which one abandons is the Path. The abandoning of craving and of ignorance is Cessation. These are the four Truths.

503. That is why the Blessed One said 'With an unguarded cognizance . . .' (§491).

504. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'Gratification, Disappointment,
Escape, Fruit, Means, the Blessed One's
Injunction to devotees: this Mode
Is the Conveying of a Teaching' (§5).

The Mode of Conveying a Teaching in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[2]

505. [87] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying an Investigation in Combined Treatment? [It is, for example, as follows.]

506. Herein, craving is of two kinds: profitable and unprofitable (cf. *Pe* 97). While the unprofitable kind goes with the roundabout, the profitable kind is craving for abandoning, which goes with dispersal (cf. *D.* iii, 216).

507. Also conceit is of two kinds: profitable and unprofitable. Any conceit supported by which one abandons conceit is profitable; but any conceit which makes suffering occur is unprofitable conceit (cf. *Pe* 160-1).

508. Herein, [as an example] in the case of the grief that has for its support the renunciation [described thus] <'When shall I enter upon by verification and abide in that base, which peaceful base the Noble Ones enter upon by verification and abide in?', and longing arises in him, and grief with the longing as its condition> (cf. *M.* iii, 218 and *Pe* 161): such craving is profitable; for there being the heart-deliverance due to fading of lust, [such craving] is profitable in having that for its object.

509. [Now there is also] the understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance:¹ what is [the basis for] investigation of that?

509/1 Read . . . *Rāgavirāgā cetovimutti tadārammaṇā kusalā.* (new para.)
Avijjāvirāgā paññāvimutti, tassa ko pavicayo? . . .

[Investigation of the Eight-factored Path]

510. [The basis for that is] the eight path factors:¹ right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.

511. Where is [an example of investigation of] that to be found? In [as the most outstanding instance] the perfection of the fourth meditation (cf. *Pe* 153). For in the fourth meditation cognizance is kept in being possessed of eight factors: it is quite purified, quite bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability (cf. *M.* i, 22). He [who has attained this perfection of the fourth meditation] then arrives at an eightfold [state], namely the Six kinds of Acquaintanceship [with supernormal power] (cf. *M. Sutta* 6) and the Two Distinctions, [that is, the Mind-Made Body and Insight-Knowledge (cf. *M.* ii, 27)].

512. When that cognizance is quite purified it is quite bright; when quite bright, unblemished; when unblemished, rid of imperfections; when rid of imperfections, malleable; when malleable, wieldy; when wieldy, steady; when steady, it is attained to imperturbability.

513. [88] Herein, blemish and imperfection both belong to the side of craving, and any perturbation and unsteadiness of cognizance belong to the side of views.

514. Four faculties—namely the [bodily] pain faculty, the [mental] grief faculty, the [bodily] pleasure faculty, and the [mental] joy faculty, cease in the fourth meditation.¹ In that the onlooking-equanimity faculty is left. This [meditator] gives attention to the [next] higher attainment as [more] peaceful. When he gives attention to the [next] higher attainment as [more] peaceful, his perception of grossness shapes itself to the fourth meditation and his perception of resistance reaches upwards [to something better].

510/1 The abrupt introduction of the 8 Path-factors here may seem disconnected. But this Mode presents the Thread in the context of *Investigation*. Now the kind of investigation, or search, that leads to heart-deliverance is given in §508. The ground is thereafter prepared (§§510-13), for the dissatisfaction with each attainment of mere quiet alone in the stages of heart-deliverance, and so the search (investigation) for something higher (§§514-17), and the consequent questionings (§§518-19), lead to the development of insight as well as quiet till the outlet by the 3 Gateways to Liberation is found to be the understanding-deliverance (§§528ff.); and this is the Right View that emerges with the first attainment of the 8-factored Path (cf. *M. Sutta* 111).

514/1 Cf. formulation of 4th *jhāna* (e.g., at *M.* i, 22).

515. With complete surmounting of perceptions of form, with disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and with no attention to perceptions of difference, [aware that] 'Space is infinite', he enters upon by realization and abides in the attainment of the base consisting of infiniteness of space (cf. *M. i*, 41).

516. The directive management [of cognizance] in the kinds of acquaintanceship [with supernormal power] is perception of form; the constituting [of diversity] is perception of difference.¹ He surmounts [these] and his perception of resistance disappears.

517. Such is concentration. When he is concentrated, his illumination vanishes and also his seeing of forms (cf. *M. iii*, 158).

518. That [kind of] concentration can be reviewed as possessing six factors: '(1) My notion of all the world is accompanied by non-covetousness; (2) my cognizance of all creatures is unaffected by ill-will, (3) my energy is instigated and exerted, (4) my body is tranquillized and uninstigated, (5) my cognizance is concentrated and undistracted, (6) my mindfulness is established and unforgotten' (cf. *M. i*, 21).

519. Herein, any notion unaccompanied by covetousness about all the world, and any cognizance of all creatures unaffected by ill-will, and any energy instigated and exerted, and any concentrated undistracted cognizance: these are Quiet. [But] the tranquillized body remaining uninstigated is the requisite for concentration (cf. *M. iii*, 71), and the mindfulness established unforgettingly is Insight.

520. That [kind of] concentration can be understood in five ways as follows: (1) 'This concentration has presently-arisen pleasure': this is how his knowing and seeing are manifested in himself. And 'this concentration has future pleasant ripening': this is how his knowing and seeing are manifested in himself. (2) 'This concentration is noble and unmaterialistic': this is how [89] his knowing and seeing are manifested in himself. (3) 'This concentration is not cultivated by trivial men': this is how his knowing and seeing are manifested in himself. (4) 'This concentration is both the [most] peaceful and the superior [goal], and it has gained tranquillity and arrived at singleness and does not have to be protected [from defilement] with the deterrence of prompting determinations':¹

516/1 Read *Abhiññābhinihāro rūpasāññā; vokāro nānattasāññā. Samatikkamati, paṭighasāññā c'assa abbattham gacchati.*

520/1 Reading *vāritavato* with *NettiA* (p. 127).

this is how his knowing and seeing are manifested in himself. (5) 'Now I attain this concentration mindful and emerge from it mindful': this is how his knowing and seeing are manifested in himself (cf. *D.* iii, 278-9; *A.* iii, 24).

521. Herein, any concentration that has presently-arisen pleasure and any concentration that has future pleasant ripening are Quiet. And any concentration that is noble and unmaterialistic,¹ and any concentration that is not cultivated by trivial men, and any concentration that is the [most] peaceful and the superior [goal] and has gained tranquillity and has arrived at singleness and does not have to be protected [from defilement] with the deterrence of prompting determinations, and any [concentration of which one is aware] 'Now I am in attainment of this concentration mindful, and I emerge from it mindful', are Insight.

522. That concentration can be understood [again] in five ways [as follows]: extension of happiness, extension of pleasure, extension of cognizance, extension of light, and the sign of concentration (cf. *D.* iii, 278-9; *A.* iii, 27).

523. Herein, any extension of happiness, any extension of pleasure, any extension of cognizance, are Quiet, while any extension of light, and any extension of reviewing, are Insight.

524. There are the ten bases of wholeness: wholeness¹ of earth (solidity), wholeness of water (cohesion), wholeness of fire (temperature), wholeness of air (force); wholeness of blue-black, wholeness of yellow, wholeness of red, wholeness of white; wholeness of space, and wholeness of consciousness (cf. *M.* ii, 14-15).

525. Herein, the wholeness of earth . . . down to . . . the wholeness of white: these eight wholenesses are quiet, while the wholeness of space and the wholeness of consciousness are insight.¹

526. In this way the whole Noble Path, in whatever way it is stated, can be construed accordingly as Quiet and Insight (see §510).

521/1 'Noble' by path-attainment and 'unmaterialistic' through unconcern with physical things (see n. 443/2).

524/1 '*Kasīṇāyatana*—base for wholeness': for non-technical use of *kaśīṇa* (as adj. meaning 'whole, entire') see *M.* i, 328 and also this work §899 (these refs. not in *PED*). The 10 here are as given in the Tipiṭaka (e.g., *M.* ii, 14; *A.* v, 46) and not as in the Commentaries, where the last two are, for reasons unexplained, replaced by 'light' (see n. 461/1) and 'limited space' respectively (*Vis* chs. iii and xxxv).

525/1 This division of the 10 is notable; cf. last note.

527. [90] These [ideas] are comprised by three ideas: by impermanence, by painfulness, and by not-self.

528. [Consequently,] when he keeps in being quiet and insight, he keeps in being the three Gateways to Liberation (*Ps.* ii, 48; and next paragraph). When he keeps in being the three gateways to liberation, he keeps in being the three categories [of virtue, concentration, and understanding]. When he keeps in being the three categories, he keeps in being the Noble Eight-factored Path.

529. A person of lusting temperament finds outlet by the signless gateway to liberation, training by the training in higher cognizance, abandoning greed as a root of unprofit, not approaching contact to be felt as pleasant, diagnosing pleasant feeling, washing out the stain of lust, shaking off the dust of lust, vomiting forth the poison of lust, extinguishing the fire of lust, extracting the barb of lust, and disentangling the tangle of lust (cf. §44).

530. A person of hating temperament finds outlet by the dispositionless gateway to liberation, training by the training in higher virtue, abandoning hate as a root of unprofit, not approaching contact to be felt as painful, diagnosing painful feeling, washing out the stain of hate, shaking off the dirt of hate, vomiting forth the poison of hate, extinguishing the fire of hate, extracting the barb of hate, and disentangling the tangle of hate.

531. A person of deluded temperament finds outlet by the void gateway to liberation, training by the training in higher understanding, abandoning delusion as a root of unprofit, not approaching contact to be felt as neither-painful-nor-pleasant, diagnosing neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, washing out the stain of delusion, shaking off the dirt of delusion, vomiting forth the poison of delusion, extinguishing the fire of delusion, extracting the barb of delusion, and disentangling the tangle of delusion.

532. Herein, the void gateway to liberation is the understanding category, the signless gateway to liberation is the concentration category, and the dispositionless gateway to liberation is the virtue category.¹ When he keeps in being the three gateways to liberation, he keeps in being the three categories, and when he keeps in

532/1 Compare this triple association with *Ps.* ii, 58 (quoted at *Vis.* 658), where voidness is coupled with 'wisdom' (*veda*), dispositionlessness with 'tranquillity' (*passaddhi*), and signlessness with 'belief' (*adhimokkha* = *saddhā*), by which belief (faith) virtue is undertaken in the first place (*Vis.* 511). This passage, then agrees with the *Ps.* about understanding, but disagrees about virtue and concentration.

being the three categories he keeps in being the Noble Eight-factored Path.

533. [91] Herein, right speech, right action, and right livelihood, are the virtue category; right effort, right mindfulness, and right concentration, are the concentration category; right view, and right intention, are the understanding category (cf. *M.* i, 301).

534. Herein, the virtue category and the concentration category are quiet, while the understanding category is insight.

535. When anyone keeps in being quiet and insight, two factors of being are kept in being in him, namely, the body and cognizance (cf. *M.* i, 209); and the way leading to the cessation of being is the two basic stages, namely virtue and concentration. This bhikkhu has kept the body in being, kept virtue in being, kept [concentrated] cognizance in being, and kept understanding in being (cf. *A.* i, 249; *S.* iv, 111; *Pe* 191).

536. While the body is kept in being, two ideas also are kept in being, namely right action and right effort. While virtue is kept in being, two ideas also are kept in being, namely right speech and right livelihood. While [concentrated] cognizance is kept in being, two ideas also are kept in being, namely right mindfulness and right concentration. While understanding is kept in being, two ideas also are kept in being, namely right view and right intention.

537. Herein, the right action and the right effort may be bodily and may be mental.

538. Herein, what is comprised within the body is also kept in being when the body is kept in being, and what is comprised within the mental is also kept in being when [concentrated] cognizance is kept in being.

539. When he keeps in being quiet and insight, he arrives at the fivefold arrival:¹ there is arrival at quickness, there is arrival at deliverance, there is arrival at greatness, there is arrival at abundance, and there is arrival at remainderlessness.

540. Herein, arrival at quickness and arrival at greatness and arrival at abundance come about through quiet, while arrival at deliverance and arrival at remainderlessness come about through insight.

539/1 '*Adhigama*—arrival': cf. parallel use at *MA.* i, 6 and *Khpa.* 103 (*āgamaḍhigama* translated in *Khpa* trsln. by 'scripture and scribing' with accepted explanation of 'the *pariyatti* and the *lokuttara-dhamma*', lit. 'the Coming (= learning) and the Arrival (= practice and realization)'). This ref. seems the earliest use of *adhigama* in this technical sense.

[Investigation of the Ten Powers of a Perfect One]

541. Herein, he who gives the teaching is the Master possessed of the Ten Powers (see *M.* i, 71f.), and he does not mislead his hearers with his advice. He [gives advice] in three ways: [92] Do this; do it by this means; when that is done it will be for your welfare and pleasure (cf. §§37-40).

[i. Knowledge of Instance and No Instance (cf. *Pe* 32-4)]

542. That, on being thus advised and thus instructed, and thus doing and thus practising the way, he will not reach that plane: no such instance is found. That, on being thus advised and thus instructed, he should reach that plane without perfecting the virtue category: no such instance is found. That being thus advised and thus instructed, he should reach that plane when he perfects the virtue category: such an instance is found.

543. That [anyone will accuse a Perfect One with truth]: '[Although] you are fully enlightened (have discovered completely), yet these ideas have not been discovered by you': no such instance is found. That [anyone will accuse a Perfect One with truth]: '[Although] you have quite exhausted all taints, yet these taints are unexhausted in you': no such instance is found. That [anyone will accuse a Perfect One with truth]: 'When the True Idea is taught to someone by you, it does not, when he gives effect to it, give outlet for him to complete exhaustion of suffering': no such instance is found. That [anyone will accuse a Perfect One with truth]: 'When a hearer practises the way of ideas in accordance with the True Idea, practises the way properly, conducts himself according to the True Idea, he will not verify any arrival at progressively higher distinctions': no such instance is found. That [anyone will accuse a Perfect One with truth]: 'Ideas called obstructions by you are not sufficiently so to obstruct the pursuer of them': no such instance is found.

544. That ideas which do not give outlet should, when someone practises them, give him outlet to the complete exhaustion of suffering: no such instance is found. That ideas which give outlet should, when someone practises them, give him outlet to the complete exhaustion of suffering: such an instance is found.

545. That [anyone will accuse a Perfect One with truth]: 'Your hearers will, with trace still left, reach the extinction element without trace left': no such instance is found.

546. That one perfected in his view [as a Stream Enterer or higher]

should deprive his mother of life or assassinate¹ her by hand or foot: no such instance is found. That an ordinary man [who has not attained the path] should deprive his mother of life or assassinate her by hand or foot: such an instance is found . . . Likewise with a father, and an Arahant bhikkhu² . . . That one perfected in his view should cause a schism in the Community or should create dissension in the Community: no such instance is found. That an ordinary man [93] should cause a schism in the Community or should create dissension in the Community: such an instance is found. That one perfected in his view should with cognizance of hate shed a Perfect One's blood, or should with cognizance of hate destroy the monument³ of a Perfect One attained to extinction: no such instance is found. That an ordinary man should with cognizance of hate shed a Perfect One's blood, or with cognizance of hate destroy the monument of a Perfect One attained to extinction: such an instance is found. That one perfected in his view should confess another Master even for the sake of a livelihood: no such instance is found. That an ordinary man should confess another Master: such an instance is found.

547. That one perfected in his view should try someone outside to make offerings to: no such instance is found. That an ordinary man should try someone outside to make offerings to: such an instance is found. That one perfected in his view should expect purification through the kind of good omen that is open to the tumult of debate:¹ no such instance is found. That an ordinary man should resort for purification to the kind of good omen that is open to the tumult of debate: such an instance is found.

548. That a Wheel-Turning Monarch¹ might be female: no such

546/1 '*Suhatam kareyya*—should assassinate': not in *PED*; glossed by *NettiA* with *ativadhita*, also not in *PED* or *CPD*; perhaps the meaning is 'to batter to death'. The phrase is additional to the *Piṭaka* version.

546/2 Following *Ba* and *Bb*, the words *arahantam bhikkhum* are taken as one expression (which must be right) instead of two clauses as in *C* and *PTS*. The additions to the *Sutta* texts here are notable, as are the changes. *Pe*. is still further from the *Suttas* in this.

546/3 For this addition to the texts see *PTS Netti* p. ccv (Not in *Pe*).

547/1 '*Kutūhala-mangala*—the kind of good omen that is open to the tumult of debate': explained at length at *Nd2 ad Sn.* 789 and *KhpA.* 118f., where told how debates were held among those who maintained variously the superstitions that the Good Omen was really in the seen, or in the heard, etc. It is doubtful if *PED*'s meaning 'festivity, ceremony' is justifiable at all.

548/1 For the Wheel-Turning Monarch (*cakkavatti*) see *M. Sutta* 129.

instance is found. That a Wheel-Turning Monarch might be male: such an instance is found. That Sakka Ruler of Gods might be female: no such instance is found. That Sakka Ruler of Gods might be male: such an instance is found. That Māra the Evil One might be female: no such instance is found. That Māra the Evil One might be male: such an instance is found. That the High Divinity might be female: no such instance is found. That the High Divinity might be male: such an instance is found.² That a Perfect One accomplished and fully enlightened might be female: no such instance is found. That a Perfect One accomplished and fully enlightened might be male: such an instance is found. That in a single world-element two Perfect Ones accomplished and fully enlightened might contemporaneously arise and teach the True Idea: no such instance is found. That in a single world-element one Perfect One accomplished and fully enlightened might arise and teach the True Idea: such an instance is found.

549. That the ripening of the three kinds of misconduct [by body, speech and mind] will be wished for, desired, likable and agreeable: no [94] such instance is found. That the ripening of the three kinds of misconduct will be un-wished-for, undesired, dislikable and disagreeable: such an instance is found. That the ripening of the three kinds of good conduct will be un-wished-for, undesired, dislikable and disagreeable: no such instance is found. That the ripening of the three kinds of good conduct will be wished for, desired, likable and agreeable: such an instance is found.

550. That a certain monk or divine who is a schemer, a persuasive talker, a hinter,¹ giving precedence to scheming, persuasive talk and hinting,¹ without abandoning the five hindrances, defilements of the heart that weaken understanding, without keeping in being the seven enlightenment factors, while abiding with mindfulness unestablished in the four Foundations of Mindfulness, will discover the unsurpassed complete enlightenment: no such instance is found. That a certain monk or divine who is rid of all faults, abandoning

548/2 Against the statement in the commentaries that sex is not manifest in the *rūpa-brahmaloka* (*Vis.* 552), *NettiA* justifies this statement by the following interpretation: that while a present male can be reborn as the High Divinity (*Brahmā*), a present female can only be reborn as a member of the High Divinity's retinue (cf. *MA.* iv, 122). Be this as it may change of sex is regarded as possible and to take place in one life or one rebirth.

550/1 '*Nemittika*—a hinter': i.e., one who hints by signs for what he wants (see *M.* iii, 75: *Vis.* 23), not as in *PED*.

the five hindrances, defilements of the heart that weaken understanding, and keeping in being the seven enlightenment factors, while abiding with mindfulness established in the four Foundations of Mindfulness, will discover the unsurpassed complete enlightenment:² such an instance is found.

551. Knowledge as to cause and as to instance (cf. *Pe* 36) about this unlimitedly is called the Perfect One's first Power consisting in knowledge of Instance and Non-Instance (cf. *Pe* 32-4).¹

[*ii. Knowledge of the Way that Leads Anywhere*]

552. All who come under the Instance and Non-Instance [just mentioned] are inseparable from the idea of exhaustion, from the idea of subsidence, from the idea of fading, from the idea of ceasing; some pass on to heaven, some pass on to states of unease, some pass on to extinction. This is why the Blessed One said:

<All creatures will [most surely] die
Because the end of life is death.
According to their acts they go
[Reaping] merit's and evil's fruits:
Evil-doers [pass on] to hell;
Merit-makers pass on to heaven> (*Pe* 9; *S.* i, 97);
<Others maintain the path in being
And find extinction free from taints> (cf. *Dh.* 126).

553. 'All creatures' noble and ignoble; those included in embodiment (cf. *Ps.* ii, 131) and those beyond embodiment.¹ 'Will die' by the two kinds of death, namely by sluggish death and by non-sluggish death. Non-sluggish death is that of those included in embodiment and sluggish death is that of those beyond embodiment.² 'Because the end of life is death': the complete ending of life, the complete ending by death, [comes] with exhaustion of the life-span, with surcease of the faculties (cf. *M.* i, 295). 'According to their acts they go' [means] ownership of action.³ '[Reaping] merit's and evil's fruits' [means] the state of seeing the fruits of acts and non-

550/2 See n. 296/1.

551/1 The order of the 10 Powers is not the same as that in the Suttas (e.g., *M.* i, 69-70) and again differs from that at *Pe* 32-8; omniscience (see n. 326/2) is added to the 10th.

553/1 What are 'those beyond embodiment'? *NettiA* and *Ṭīkā* both ignore. For the extent of 'embodiment' see *M.* ii, 265.

553/2 What is this kind of death? *NettiA* and *Ṭīkā* both ignore.

553/3 Following *NettiA*, read *kamma-ssakatā*, not *kamassa katā* as in *PTS*.

separation [from them]. Those who have made determinations of demerit, being 'evil-doers, [pass on] to hell' while 'merit-makers [pass on] to heaven': [95] those who have [made] determinations of merit will go to a good destination. 'Others maintain the path in being And find extinction free from taints' [means] the surmounting of all determinations. That is why the Blessed One said 'All creatures . . . extinction free from taints'.

554. 'All creatures will [most surely] die Because the end of life is death. According to their acts they go [Reaping] merit's and evil's fruits: Evil-doers [pass on] to hell' is the [two extreme] ways of luxury and of penance. 'Others maintain the path in being And find extinction free from taints' is the middle way.

555. 'All creatures will [most surely] die Because the end of life is death. According to their acts they go [Reaping] merit's and evil's fruits: Evil-doers [pass on] to hell': this is corruption. This is how the roundabout is made to occur.

556. 'All creatures will [most surely] die . . . Evil-doers [pass on] to hell': there are these three rounds: the round of suffering, the round of action, and the round of defilement. 'Others maintain the path in being And find extinction free from taints' is the stopping (non-occurrence) of the three rounds.

557. 'All creatures will [most surely] die . . . Evil-doers [pass on] to hell' is the disappointment. 'The merit-makers [pass on] to heaven' is the gratification. 'Others maintain the path in being And find extinction free from taints' is the escape (cf. §32).

558. 'All creatures will [most surely] die . . . Evil-doers [pass on] to hell' is cause and fruit. The five categories are the fruit and the craving the cause. 'Others maintain the path in being And find extinction free from taints' is the path and its fruit.

559. 'All creatures will [most surely] die . . . Evil-doers [pass on] to hell' is corruption. That corruption is of three kinds: corruption by craving, corruption by views, and corruption by misconduct (see §760). Herein, corruption by craving can be demonstrated by the three kinds of craving, namely craving for sensual desires, craving for being, and craving for non-being (§425); or else it can be demonstrated by any thing cleaved to. In detail it is the thirty-six ways of behaviour of the net of craving (*A.* ii, 211ff.). Herein, too, corruption by views can be demonstrated by annihilationism and eternalism; or else it can be demonstrated by any thing someone insists upon through a [wrong] view thus [96] 'Only this is true; anything else is wrong' (*M.* ii, 233). Its detail is the sixty-two types

of views (see *D. Sutta* 1; *M. Sutta* 102). And herein, corruption by misconduct can be demonstrated by action as choice and as concomitant of cognizance (§§239-41), [that is,] by the three kinds of misconduct, namely bodily misconduct and verbal misconduct [as the former], and mental misconduct [as the latter]. Its detail is the ten unprofitable courses of action. 'Others maintain the path in being And find extinction free from taints' is cleansing (cf. §760). Now this cleansing is [also] of three kinds, that is to say: corruption by craving is purified by quiet, and that quiet is the concentration category; corruption by views is purified by insight, and that insight is the understanding category; and corruption by misconduct is purified by good conduct, and that good conduct is the virtue category.

560. 'All creatures will [most surely] die Because the end of life is death. According to their acts they go [Reaping] merit's and evil's fruits: Evil-doers [pass on] to hell' is the way of demerit. 'The merit-makers [pass on] to heaven' is the way of merit. 'Others maintain the path in being And find extinction free from taints' is the way that surmounts merit and demerit.

561. Herein, as to the 'way of merit' and the 'way of demerit', these are one way that leads anywhere, one among the states of unease and another among the gods. And as to the 'way that surmounts merit and demerit', this way leads either here or there (see §562).

562. Now there are three classes, namely the class of those certain-of-wrongness, the class of those certain-of-rightness, and the class of those not-thus-certain (cf. *Pe* 32; *D.* iii, 217). While the certainty-of-wrongness class and the certainty-of-rightness class herein are one way, namely that which leads either here or there (§561), it is the class of those without this certainty herein that is the way that leads anywhere. For what reason? If someone [in this class] got the [requisite] condition, he would reappear in hell, if he got the [requisite] condition, he would reappear among animals, if he got the [requisite] condition, [97] he would reappear in the ghost realm, if he got the [requisite] condition, he would reappear among the Asura Demons, if he got the [requisite] condition, he would reappear among the gods, if he got the [requisite] condition, he would reappear among human beings, if he got the [requisite] condition, he would attain extinction. That is why this is the way that leads anywhere.

563. Knowledge as to cause and as to instance about this unlimitedly is called the Perfect One's second Power consisting in Knowledge of the Way that Leads anywhere (cf. *Pe* 34-5).

[iii. Knowledge of the World with its Many and Different Elements]

564. The way that leads anywhere is the world of many elements; the way that leads either here or there is the world of different elements.

565. Herein, what is the world of many elements? It is the eye element, form element, eye-consciousness element, ear element, sound element, ear-consciousness element, nose element, odour element, nose-consciousness element, tongue element, flavour element, tongue-consciousness element, body element, tangible element, body-consciousness element, mind element, idea element, mind-consciousness element; the earth element, water element, fire element, air element, space element, consciousness element; the sensual-desire element, ill-will element, cruelty element, renunciation element, non-ill-will element, non-cruelty element; the pain element, grief element, ignorance element, pleasure element, joy element, onlooking-equanimity element; the form element, formless element, cessation element; the determinations element, the extinction element (cf. *M.* iii, 62-3). This is the world of many elements.

566. Herein, what is the world of different elements? The eye element is one, the form element is another, the eye-consciousness element is another, . . . and so with all the rest down to . . . the extinction element is another.

567. Knowledge as to cause and as to instance about this unlimitedly is called the Perfect One's third Power consisting in the knowledge of the many and different elements (cf. *Pe* 35).

[iv. Knowledge of Difference in Belief]

568. Many elements and different elements of what world? Whatever element creatures believe in, that they express and insist upon. Some believe in forms, some believe in sounds, some believe in odours, some believe in flavours, some believe in tangibles, some believe in ideas, some believe in females, some believe in males, some believe in generosity, some believe in inferiority, [98] some believe in superiority, some believe in gods, some believe in human beings, some believe in extinction.¹

568/1 All these 'beliefs' could be expressed in terms of 'isms' as follows: materialism or realism (5 varieties according to which of the 5 'senses' one believes gives 'true' data), idealism, masculinism, feminism, liberalism, evolutionism (from an origin), involutionism (towards a goal), theism or deism, humanism, and extinctionism (for the last see the *dīṭṭhadhammanibbāṇa*

569. Knowledge as to cause and as to instance about this unlimitedly thus 'This one is outguidable, this one is not outguidable, this one is going to heaven, this one is going to a bad destination' is called the Perfect One's fourth Power consisting in knowledge of how creatures differ in their beliefs (cf. *Pe* 35).

[v. *Knowledge of Ripening of Action*]

570. As these [creatures] believe so they come to be.¹ [For] they undertake this or that kind of undertaking of action. They undertake action in six ways: some through greed, some through hate, some through delusion, some through faith, some through energy, and some through understanding.

571. That [action can be] divided into two as that which goes with the roundabout and that which goes to extinction.

572. Herein, any action which [someone] does through greed and through hate and through delusion is black action with black ripening (see §844). Herein, any action which he does through faith and through energy is white action with white ripening. Herein, any action which he does through greed and through hate and through delusion and through faith is black-and-white action with black-and-white ripening. Herein, any action which he does through energy and through understanding is action that is not black and not white with neither-black-nor-white ripening. That is the supreme action, the best action, and it conduces to the exhaustion of action (cf. *M.* i, 389f.).

573. There are four ways of undertaking action: there is a way of undertaking action that has presently-arisen pleasure and ripens in the future as pain. There is a way of undertaking action that has presently-arisen pain and ripens in the future as pleasure. There is a way of undertaking action that has presently-arisen pain and ripens in the future as pain. There is a way of undertaking action that has presently-arisen pleasure and ripens in the future as pleasure (cf. *M.* i, 305): any such kind of undertaking action.

574. The Blessed One, [when he sees that] 'An undertaking of

wrong view at *D.* i, 36 and *M.* i, 509 and *nibbānam maññati* at *M.* i, 4). See also §291.

570/1 There should be a period, not a query, after *bhavanti*. This is an allusion to the link of the Dependent Arising formula: *upādānappaccayā bhavo* (for a special replacement there of *upādāna* by *adhimokkha* in some instances—which stands for *saddhā*—see *Vbh.* 165).

unprofitable action has been stored up by this person, which [though as yet] unripened is just about to ripen, and [so] he is incapable of coming to the breaking out' (see §326; also *M.* i, 104), [99] does not advise him, as in the case of Devadatta (*Vin.* ii, 197ff.), Kokālika (*Sn.* pp. 123f.), Sunakkhatta, son of Licchavis (*D. Sutta* 24; *M.* i, 68), and any other creatures certain of wrongness. 575. The Blessed One, [when he sees that] 'These persons have stored up [some] unprofitable action, but [the undertaking of it] has not yet come to its fulfilment; it is [still] before it has come to fulfilment, before it has given fruit, before it has obstructed the path, before it has exceeded [the bounds of] outguidability', advises them while [their action is] not [fully] undertaken, as in the cases of Puṇṇa the ox-duty ascetic and the naked dog-duty ascetic (see *M. Sutta* 57).

576. The Blessed One, [when he sees that] 'This person's undertaking of unprofitable action when fulfilled will obstruct the path, [but] it is [still] before it has come to fulfilment, before it has given fruit, before it has obstructed the path, before it has exceeded [the bounds of] outguidability', advises him while [his action is] not [fully] undertaken, as in the case of the venerable Angulimāla (*M. Sutta* 86).

577. In all cases there is the light,¹ the medium, and the outstanding state. Herein, imperturbable determinative acts are light, the remaining profitable determinations are medium, and unprofitable determinations are outstanding.

578. Knowledge as to cause and as to instance unlimitedly thus 'This [kind of action] is to be felt [ripening] here and now (in this life), this kind is to be felt on reappearance, this kind is to be felt in some subsequent period; this is to be felt in hell, this is to be felt as a animal, this is to be felt in the ghost realm, this is to be felt as an Asura demon, this is to be felt as a god, this is to be felt as a human being' is called the Perfect One's fifth Power consisting in knowledge as to cause and as to instance unlimitedly of past, future, and presently arisen, undertaking of action, which is Knowledge of Diversity in Ripening (cf. *Pe* 35-6).

577/1 *Mudu* (here rendered by 'light') has apparently two distinct though not unallied meanings: (1) as at §512, where it means 'soft', 'malleable', and (2) as §§577, 586, 670, and 747 (*muduka*), where it means 'blunt' or 'light'. Here *NettiA* glosses with *avisada* ('un-clear-cut'), and *mudu* in this paragraph is rendered by 'blunt'; but it is glossed with *lahuka* ('light') at §§511-12; there *mudu* is a praise-word but here it is not.

[vi. *Knowledge of Defilement, Cleansing, and Emergence, in the cases of the Meditations, Liberations, Concentrations, and Attainments*]

579. There is unobstructed knowledge of actions thus undertaken, and of meditations, liberations, concentrations, and attainments thus undertaken, [knowing] that 'This is the corruption, this is the cleansing, this is the emergence, this is how it is corrupted, this is how it is cleansed, this is how there is emergence'.

580. Herein, how many meditations ? [100] Four meditations.

How many liberations ? Eleven and eight and seven and three and two.¹

How many concentrations ? Three concentrations: concentration with thinking and exploring; concentration without thinking and with only exploring; concentration without thinking and without exploring (see §443).

How many attainments ? Five attainments: percipient attainment, unpercipient attainment, neither-percipient-nor-unpercipient attainment, attainment percipient of nonentity,² attainment of cessation (§441).

581. Herein, what is the corruption ? Lust for sensual desires and ill-will are the corruption of the first meditation, and the first two [meditations are so for] a shy meditator,¹ or any concentration dealing with an inferior state. These are the corruption.

582. Herein, what is the cleansing ? The purification of the first meditation from the hindrances, and the [attainment of the] last

580/1 *NettiA* gives the '11' as the 8 liberations (*vimokkha*: see *M.* ii, 12-13) plus the 3, namely voidness, signlessness, and dispositionlessness (*Ps.* ii, 35); the '8' as the 8 already mentioned; the '7' as the 8 without cessation-attainment; the '3' as those already mentioned, which are allowed by the Suttas; and the '2' as voidness and dispositionlessness, which are allowed by the *Abhidhamma*, signlessness being disallowed there (see *Vis.* ch. xxi, §72/ p. 658).

580/2 Read *vibhūṭasaññāsamāpatti* as at §441.

581/1 '*Kukkūṭajjhāyī*—a shy meditator': not in *PED*; *NettiA*: 'The state of (satisfaction with) that-at-most (*tapparamatā*) under the heading of lack of distaste for not knowing (*ajāññājigucchānamukhena*) is called "shy" (*kukkūṭam*). "*Kukkūṭajjhāyī*" expresses the meditations in terms of persons; what is meant is the first and second meditations. When someone makes the 1st or 2nd meditation occur and then holds back, then any of the 4 meditations are called "shy meditations" in his case. One who possesses these is called a "shy meditator"' (p. 142). *Kukkūṭa* here is perhaps a pp. of $\sqrt{\text{kar}}$ (?); cf. *ku-kata* (*Vis.* 470); for cerebral t see *kaṭatta* (abstr. subst. fm. *kata*, pp. of $\sqrt{\text{kar}}$).

two [meditations for] a shy meditator, or any concentration dealing with distinction, these are cleansing.

583. Herein, what is the emergence? Skill in emerging from an attainment (cf. *Ps. i*, 48).

584. Knowledge as to cause and as to instance about this unlimitedly is called the Perfect One's sixth Power consisting in knowledge of corruption, cleansing, and emergence, in the cases of all meditations, liberations, concentrations, and attainments.

[vii. *Knowledge of the Disposition of Creatures' Faculties*]

585. That same concentration has three ideas for its equipment, namely faculties, powers, and energy. Those same faculties come to be powers in virtue of energy: they are faculties in the sense of predominance, while they are powers in the sense of unshakability (see *Ps. i*, 21).

586. They have the blunt, medium, and outstanding states thus: This one has blunt faculties, this one has medium faculties, this one has outstanding faculties.

587. Herein, the Blessed One advises one of keen faculties with advice in brief; the Blessed One advises one of medium faculties with advice in brief and detail; the Blessed One advises one of blunt faculties with advice in detail.

Herein, the Blessed One discloses a blunt (light) teaching of the True Idea to one of keen faculties; the Blessed One discloses a blunt-to-keen teaching of the True Idea [101] to one of medium faculties; the Blessed One discloses a keen teaching of the True Idea to one of blunt faculties.

Herein, the Blessed One discloses quiet to one of keen faculties; the Blessed One discloses quiet and insight to one of medium faculties; the Blessed One discloses insight to one of blunt faculties.

Herein, the Blessed One discloses escape to one of keen faculties; the Blessed One discloses disappointment and escape to one of medium faculties; the Blessed One discloses gratification and disappointment and escape to one of blunt faculties.

Herein, the Blessed One makes one of keen faculties understand by means of the training in the higher understanding; the Blessed One makes one of medium faculties understand by means of the training in the higher cognizance; the Blessed One makes one of blunt faculties understand by means of the training in the higher virtue.

588. Knowledge as to cause and as to instance about this unlimitedly thus 'This one has gone to this plane and keeping-in-being, and at this period, and with this kind of instruction; and this one has such and such elements [beginning with the inferior], and such was the bias [in his view], and such was his underlying tendency' is called the Perfect One's seventh Power consisting in knowledge of diversity in the several faculties of other creatures, other persons.

[viii. *Knowledge of Past Life*]

589. Herein, he recollects his manifold past life, that is to say, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred thousand births, many hundred births, many thousand births, many hundred thousand births, many aeons of [world] contraction, many aeons of [world] expansion, many aeons of [world] contraction and expansion: 'There I was so named, of such a race, with such appearance, such was my nutriment, such my feeling of pleasure and pain, such my life-term; and passing away from there, I reappeared elsewhere; and there too I was so named, of such a race, with such appearance, such was my nutriment, such my feeling of pleasure and pain, such my life-term; [102] and passing away from there, I reappeared here', thus with its moods and its phases he recollects his manifold past life (*M.* i, 22; 70).

590. Herein, among creatures passing on to heaven and creatures passing on to humanity, and creatures passing on to states of unease, the Blessed One knows without reserve, recollecting such and such existences thus 'This person has greed, etc., prominent and non-greed, etc., weak; this person has non-greed, etc., prominent and greed, etc., weak; or whichever are prominent and whichever weak; This person has these faculties stored up, this person has these faculties not stored up, in that million aeons, hundred thousand aeons, thousand aeons, hundred aeons, aeon, aeon-interval, half-aeon, year, half-year, month, half-moon, day, or hour, by means of this negligence, or by means of this confidence'.

[ix. *The Heavenly Eye*]

591. Herein, with the Heavenly Eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees creatures deceasing and reappearing, inferior and superior, comely and uncomely, well behaved and ill-behaved, he

understands how creatures pass on according to their actions thus 'These worthy creatures, misconducted in body, speech and mind, revilers of Noble Ones, wrong in their views, undertaking actions due to wrong view, have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappeared in a state of unease, in a bad destination, in perdition, in hell; but these worthy creatures, well conducted in body, speech and mind, not revilers of Noble Ones, right in their views, undertaking actions due to right view, have, on the dissolution of the body, after death, reappeared in a good destination, in the heavenly world' (cf. *M.* i, 22-3; 70-1).

592. Herein, among creatures passing on to heaven and creatures passing on to humanity and creatures passing on to states of unease, [the Blessed One knows without reserve] 'By this person such action was stored up in that million aeons, [103] . . . day, or hour, by means of this negligence, or by means of this confidence'.

593. These two kinds of knowledge of the Blessed One's, the Knowledge of Recollection of Past Life and the Heavenly Eye, are the Perfect One's eighth and ninth Powers (cf. *Pe* 38).

[*x. Omniscience in Knowledge of Exhaustion of Taints*]

594. Herein, when omniscience was reached, when all ideas were found, when the spotless immaculate omniscient knowledge had arisen, when Māra was routed at the foot of the Tree of Enlightenment: that constitutes the Perfect One's tenth Power consisting in the Knowledge of Complete Extinction of all Taints. For the Enlightened Ones, the Blessed Ones, are possessed of ten powers.

The Mode of Conveying an Investigation in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[3]

595. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Construing in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded,
Having for pasture right intention,
Giving right view first place through
knowing

Rise and fall, transcending drowsing
 And lethargy, a bhikkhu may
 Abandon all bad destinations.

(§252; continuation of quotation in §491).

‘So let his cognizance be guarded, Having for pasture right intention’: this is construable thus: One with guarded cognizance will be one who has for his pasture right intention. It is construable thus: One who has for his pasture right intention will be one who has right view. It is construable thus: When he abides with right view placed first he will penetrate rise and fall. It is construable thus: When he penetrates rise and fall he will abandon all bad destinations. It is construable thus: When he abandons all bad destinations he will surmount all the fears of bad destinations and states of unease.

The Mode of Conveying a Construing in
 Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[4]

596. [104] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Footings in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

◁So let his cognizance be guarded...▷

597. ‘So let his cognizance be guarded’: this is the footing for the three kinds of good conduct.

‘Having for pasture right intention’: this is the footing for quiet.

‘Giving right view first place’: this is the footing for insight.

‘Through knowing rise and fall’: this is the footing for the plane of seeing [as the path of Stream Entry].

‘Transcending drowsing and lethargy a bhikkhu may’: this is the footing for energy.

‘Abandon all bad destinations’: this is the footing for keeping in being [as attainment of the three higher paths].

The Mode of Conveying Footings in
 Combined Treatment is ended,

*

[5]

598. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Characteristics in Combined Treatment ? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . . >

599. 'So let his cognizance be guarded, Having for pasture right intention': this is the mindfulness faculty. When the mindfulness faculty is admitted the five faculties [of faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and understanding,] are admitted.

600. 'Giving right view first place': when right view is admitted the noble eight-factored path is admitted. Why is that ? Because it is from right view that right intention is given being, from right intention that right speech is given being, from right speech that right action is given being, from right action that right livelihood is given being, from right livelihood that right effort is given being, from right effort that right mindfulness is given being, from right mindfulness that right concentration is given being, from right concentration that right deliverance is given being, and from right deliverance that right knowing and seeing of deliverance is given being (cf. *M.* iii, 76).

The Mode of Conveying Characteristics in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[6]

601. [105] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Fourfold Array in Combined Treatment ? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . . >

602. [In the case of the word 'guarded'] (i) the *language* is [any establishment of terms as follows:] He keeps it protected, thus it is guarded, [and so on with the other terms.]

603. (ii) What is the Blessed One's *purport* here ? The Blessed One's purport is this: Those who will be desirous of being liberated from the bad destinations will be those who walk in the True Idea.

604. (iii) [As to the *source*:] because Kokālika corrupted his cog-

nizance with hate for the Elders Sāriputta and Moggallāna he reappeared in the Great Paduma Hell (see *Sn.* pp. 123ff.).¹

605. (iv) And [as to the *consecutive sequence*:] the Blessed One is possessed of cognizance that has preserved mindfulness; for in the Thread it is said that <*Cognizance can be guarded by mindfulness*> (), [which provides the consecutive sequence here.]

The Mode of Conveying a Fourfold Array in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[7]

606. Herein what is the Mode of Conveying a Conversion in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . . >

607. 'So let his cognizance be guarded, Having for pasture right intention': this is quiet.

'Giving right view first place': this is insight.

'Through knowing rise and fall' is diagnosis of suffering.

'Transcending drowsing and lethargy, a bhikkhu' is the abandoning of the origin [of suffering].

'Abandons all bad destinations' is cessation.

These are the four Truths.

The Mode of Conveying a Conversion in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[8]

608. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying an Analysis? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . . >

609. The profitable side [as stated in this verse] can be demonstrated

604/1 This is not, as one might have expected here, the *source* of the *Udāna* verses that form the subject of this chapter. Their *source* is, oddly enough, not given at all in this chapter. For hell see n. 786/2.

by [the details¹ of] the profitable side, while the unprofitable side [as the opposite (§491) of what is stated in this verse] can be demonstrated by the details¹ of the unprofitable side.

The Mode of Conveying an Analysis in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[9]

610. [106] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Reversal in Combined Treatment? [It is this:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded...>

611. When quiet and insight are kept in being, then cessation is their fruit, suffering has been diagnosed, its origin has been abandoned, and the path has been kept in being, by means of the opposites.¹

The Mode of Conveying a Reversal in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[10]

612. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Synonyms in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded...>

613. 'So let his cognizance be guarded': cognizance, mind, consciousness, mind-faculty, mind-base, act-of-being-conscious, cognizedness, these are synonyms.

614. 'Having for pasture right intention': intention of renunciation, intention of non-ill-will, intention of non-cruelty, these are synonyms.

615. 'Giving right view first place': right view is called weapon of understanding, sword of understanding, jewel of understanding,

609/1 The *analysis* here consists of the *details* to be 'demonstrated'.

611/1 'By means of the opposite the verse beginning "With an unguarded cognizance" (§491: for the opposite see §595), is what is intended. Or else by means of the unprofitable side in the Mode of Conveying an Analysis' (*NettiA* p. 150).

illumination of understanding, goad of understanding, [storied] palace of understanding, these are synonyms.

The Mode of Conveying Synonyms in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[11]

616. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Descriptions in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . . >

617. 'So let his cognizance be guarded' is a description in terms of its footing applied to mindfulness.

618. 'Having for pasture right intention' is a description in terms of keeping-in-being applied to quiet.

619. 'Giving right view first place through knowing Rise and fall' is a description in terms of presentation applied to the plane of seeing.

620. 'Transcending drowsing And lethargy, a bhikkhu' is a description in terms of abandoning applied to the origin.

621. 'May Abandon all bad destinations' is a description in terms of keeping-in-being applied to the path.

The Mode of Conveying Descriptions in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[12]

622. [107] Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Ways of Entry? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . . >

623. 'So let his cognizance be guarded, Having for pasture right intention, Giving right view first place': when right view is admitted the five faculties are admitted [right view being synonymous with the understanding faculty]. This is the way of entry by Faculties.

624. Those same faculties are science. With the arising of science, cessation of ignorance (nescience); with cessation of ignorance,

cessation of determinations; . . . and so the whole Dependent Arising . . . This is the way of entry by Dependent Arising.

625. Those same faculties are comprised by the Categories, by the virtue category, by the concentration category, and by the understanding category. This is the way of entry by Categories.

626. Those same categories are included in determinations. These determinations—[in this case] free from taints and not factors of being—are comprised within the idea element. This is the way of entry by Elements.

627. That idea element is included in the idea base, which base is [in this case] free from taints and not a factor of being. This is the way of entry by Bases.

The Mode of Conveying Ways of Entry in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[13]

628. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Clearing-Up in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . .>

629. Wherever the instigation is cleared up the question is answered; but wherever the instigation is not cleared up that question is not yet answered (§420).

The Mode of Conveying a Clearing-Up in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[14]

630. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Terms of Expression in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . .>

631. 'So let his cognizance be guarded' is a unity.

Cognizance, mind, consciousness: this is a diversity.

632. 'Having for pasture right intention' is a unity.

Intention of renunciation, intention of non-ill-will, [108] intention of non-cruelty: this is a diversity.

633. 'Giving right view first place' is a unity.

Right view is called knowledge about suffering, knowledge about the origin of suffering, knowledge about cessation of suffering, knowledge about the way leading to cessation of suffering (cf. §440); knowledge about the way, knowledge about the path (cf. §428-9); knowledge about a cause, knowledge about causally-arisen ideas, knowledge about a condition, knowledge about conditionally-arisen ideas (cf. *Vbh.* 104); any knowing and seeing how [things] are in the various cases, any actualization, complete penetration, coming to truth: this is a diversity.

634. 'Through knowing rise and fall' is a unity.

By means of 'rise': with ignorance as condition, determinations; with determinations as condition, consciousness; . . . and so all the rest . . . that is how there is an origin [to this whole category of suffering]. By means of 'fall', cessation of ignorance; with cessation of ignorance, cessation of determinations; . . . and so all the rest . . . that is how there is a cessation [to this whole category of suffering]. This is a diversity.

635. 'Transcending drowsing And lethargy, a bhikkhu' is a unity.

'Lethargy' is a name for unwieldiness of cognizance, 'drowsing' is a name for any sloth of body. This is a diversity (cf. §500).

636. 'May Abandon all bad destinations' is a unity.

Compared with gods and human beings the states of unease are bad destinations; but compared with extinction all kinds of appearance are bad destinations (§250). This is a diversity.

The Mode of Conveying Terms of Expression in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[15]

637. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying Requisites in Combined Treatment? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded . . . >

638. This is the requisite of quiet and insight.

The Mode of Conveying Requisites in
Combined Treatment is ended.

*

[16]

639. Herein, what is the Mode of Conveying a Co-ordination in Combined Treatment ? [It is as follows:]

<So let his cognizance be guarded,
 Having for pasture right intention,
 Giving right view first place through
 knowing
 Rise and fall, transcending drowsing
 And lethargy, a bhikkhu may
 Abandon all bad destinations> (§595).

640. [109] (i) 'So let his cognizance be guarded' is the footing for the three kinds of good conduct. (ii) When cognizance is guarded, then, as bodily action, verbal action, and mental action, is guarded.

641. (iii) 'Having for pasture right intention': when right view is kept in being, the noble eight-factored path is kept in being. For what reason ? Because it is from right view that right intention is given being, from right intention . . . [complete as in §600] . . . from right deliverance that right knowing and seeing of deliverance is given being.

642. (iv) This is a person without trace left and the extinction element without trace left.

The Mode of Conveying a Co-ordination in
 Combined Treatment is ended.

*

643. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'Sixteen Conveyings first, Surveying
 With Plotting then of the Directions,
 And having collected with the Hook,
 Three Guide-Lines demonstrate a Thread' (§26).

The Modes of Conveying in Combined Treatment are ended.

*

[Chapter iii

The Moulding of the Guide-Lines]

644. Herein, what is the Moulding of the Guide-Lines? [It is as follows.]

[Introductory]

No past term is evident of ignorance (*A. v*, 113) and of craving for being (*A. v*, 116). Herein, ignorance is the hindrance and craving the fetter (cf. *Pe* 243).¹

645. Creatures with ignorance for their hindrance and fettered [by craving] to ignorance, explore on the side of ignorance. They are called 'of view-temperament'. Creatures with craving as their fetter and fettered to craving, explore on the side of craving. They are called 'of craving-temperament'.

[The Conversion of Relishing]

646. [110] Those of view-temperament who have gone forth [into homelessness] outside this [dispensation] abide devoted to the pursuit of self-torment. Those of craving-temperament who have gone forth [into homelessness] outside this [dispensation] abide devoted to the pursuit of indulging sensual pleasure among sensual desires (cf. *Pe* 243-4).

647. Herein what is the reason why those of view-temperament who have gone forth outside this [dispensation] abide devoted to the pursuit of self-torment, why those of craving-temperament who have gone forth outside this [dispensation] abide devoted to the pursuit of indulging sensual pleasure among sensual desires? Outside this [dispensation] there is no definition of truth, so whence any explanation of the four truths, or any skill in quiet and insight,¹ or any reaching the pleasure of peace?

648. With cognizance distorted through having no acquaintanceship with the pleasure of peace, they have made such pronouncements as <There is no pleasure [arrived at] through pleasure: pleasure is to

644/1 Separate the words as follows: *tattha avijjā nīvaraṇaṃ, tanhā samyojanam*. For this paragraph and the next as 'introductory' see n. 673/1.

647/1 Read *samathavipassanākosallaṃ* as one compound.

be arrived at through pain (suffering)> (M. i, 93), and <He who cultivates sensual desires enriches the world; he who enriches the world lays by much merit>(). So perceiving, and with such views, aspiring to pleasure through pain, [or] perceiving merit in sensual desires, they abide devoted to the pursuit of self-torment and devoted to the pursuit of indulging sensual pleasure. Such being their acquaintanceship, they enrich only the sickness, they enrich only the boil, they enrich only the barb. Overwhelmed by the sickness, oppressed by the boil, wounded by the barb, doing their diving in and out of the hells, the animal womb, ghosts and demons, making their existence co-essential with exhilaration and depression,¹ they find no medicine for the sickness, the boil, the barb.

649. (i) Herein, the pursuit of self-torment and the pursuit of indulgence of sensual pleasures are the corruption; quiet and insight are the cleansing. The pursuit of self-torment and the pursuit of indulgence of sensual pleasure are the sickness; quiet and insight are the counteractive¹ medicine for the sickness. The pursuit of self-torment and the pursuit of indulgence of sensual pleasure are the boil; quiet and insight are the counteractive medicine for the boil. The pursuit of self-torment and the pursuit of indulgence of sensual pleasure are the barb; quiet and insight are the medicine that extracts the barb.

650. Herein, the corruption is Suffering; craving, as the clinging thereto, is the Origin; cessation of craving is Cessation of Suffering; quiet and insight are the Way Leading to Cessation of Suffering.

651. [111] These are the four Truths. Suffering has to be diagnosed, the Origin abandoned, the Path kept in being, and Cessation verified.

652. (iii) [Again] herein, one of view-temperament approaches form as self, approaches feeling . . . perception . . . determinations . . . consciousness as self. One of craving-temperament approaches self as possessing form, or form as in self, or self as in form; or he

648/1 'Ugghāta—exhilaration' and 'nigghāta—depression' are both not in PED. See Vis. 370. Prefix *ni(r) + ghāta*.

649/1 'Ni(g)ghātaka—counteracting': a different word from *nigghāta* in the last paragraph and should be spelt with only one *g*; cf. *nighāta* (§943) and *abhinighāta* (§315). Prefix *ni* (not *nir*) + *ghāta*. Cf. use at Pe 65, 98, and 123. (There is also uncertainty about *ṭ* or *t*.)

approaches self as possessing feeling . . . possessing perception . . . possessing determinations . . . possessing consciousness, or consciousness as in self, or self as in consciousness. This is what is called the twenty-based embodiment view (cf. *M.* i, 300; *Pe* 242).

653. Opposed to this is right view disjoined from worlds, and its attendant right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right concentration. This is the noble eight-factored path.

654. That is the three categories: the virtue category, the concentration category, and the understanding category. The virtue category and the concentration category are quiet, and the understanding category is insight.

655. Herein, embodiment is Suffering, the origin of embodiment is the Origin of Suffering, the cessation of embodiment is Cessation of Suffering, and the noble eight-factored path is the Way Leading to Cessation of Suffering.

656. These are the four Truths. Suffering has to be diagnosed, the Origin abandoned, the Path kept in being, and Cessation verified.

657. (iii) Herein, those who approach form as self, who approach feeling . . . perception . . . determinations . . . consciousness as self, are called annihilationists. Those who approach self as possessing form, or form as in self, or self as in form, who approach self as possessing feeling . . . possessing perception . . . possessing determinations . . . possessing consciousness, or consciousness as in self, or self as in consciousness, are called eternalists (cf. *Pe* 242).

658. Herein, annihilationism and eternalism are the two extremes. They [both cause] the occurrence of the roundabout.

659. [112] The opposite of that is the middle way, the noble eight-factored path. This is the non-occurrence of the roundabout.

660. Herein, occurrence is Suffering; craving, as the clinging thereto, is the Origin; cessation of craving is Cessation of Suffering; the noble eight-factored path is the Way Leading to Cessation of Suffering.

661. These are the four Truths. Suffering has to be diagnosed, the Origin abandoned, the Path kept in being, and Cessation verified.

662. (iv) Herein, in combination annihilationism and eternalism are the twenty-based embodiment view (cf. *M.* i, 300; iii, 17), while in detail they are the sixty-two types of views (cf. *D. Sutta* 1; *M. Sutta* 102; *S.* iii, 262ff.; *Ps.* i, 135ff.).

663. The opposites of these are the forty-three¹ ideas that side with enlightenment, the eight liberations, the ten bases for wholeness.

664. The sixty-two types of views are delusion's net, which has no beginning and continues its occurrence unremittingly.¹ The forty-three ideas that partake of enlightenment are the diamond of knowledge that bursts open delusion's net.

665. Herein, the delusion is ignorance, and the net is craving for being.¹

That is why it was said above 'No past term is evident of ignorance and of craving for being' (§644).

666. Herein, when one of view-temperament has gone forth [into homelessness] in this dispensation he becomes one who lives with continuous¹ effacement, having keen regard for effacement, while when one of craving-temperament has gone forth in this dispensation he is one who lives with the training preserved, having keen regard for the training (cf. *Pe* 243).

667. When one of view-temperament finds a footing in the certainty of rightness (see *S.* iii, 225), he is a Follower by Ideas, while when one of craving-temperament finds a footing in the certainty of rightness, he is a Follower by Faith (cf. *Pe* 243).

668. One of view-temperament finds the outlet on the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship and with swift acquaintanceship, and one of craving-temperament finds the outlet on the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship and with swift acquaintanceship (cf. §42).

669. Herein, what is the reason (cf. §647) why one of craving-temperament finds outlet on the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship and with swift acquaintanceship? Because sensual desires have not been given up by him. [113] When

663/1 The '43' are the '37' (i.e., 5 faculties beginning with faith, 5 powers, 4 foundations of mindfulness, 4 bases for success, 4 right endeavours, 7 enlightenment factors, and the 8-factored path; see e.g., *M.* ii, 245; cf. *Pe* 114) plus the 6 contemplations of impermanence, pain, not-self, abandoning, fading, and cessation (cf. *D.* iii, 251).

664/1 '*Anidhana*—unremittingly': neither in *PED* nor in *CPD*. Fm. neg. *a* + *ni-* + $\sqrt{dh\ddot{a}}$.

665/1 Read *moho avijjā, jālaṃ bhavataṇhā*.

666/1 '*Anusantata*—continuous': not in *PED*, see *CPD*; this paragraph is a good instance of how the *Pe* has been used but altered in this work.

he is secluding himself from sensual desires, he relinquishes¹ painfully and sluggishly gains knowledge² of the True Idea. Now as to one of view-temperament, from the very beginning he is no seeker of sensual desires. [So] when he is secluding himself from them he relinquishes swiftly and he swiftly gains knowledge of the True Idea (cf. *Pe* 243).

670. The painful way is of two kinds: with sluggish acquaintanceship and with swift acquaintanceship. And the pleasant way is of two kinds: with sluggish acquaintanceship and with swift acquaintanceship. And creatures are of two kinds: with blunt faculties and with keen faculties.¹ Those with blunt faculties relinquish sluggishly and sluggishly gain knowledge of the True Idea. Those with keen faculties relinquish swiftly and swiftly gain knowledge of the True Idea (cf. *Pe* 243).

671. These are the four ways. It is by these same four ways that anyone at all ever has found the outlet, or finds the outlet, or will find the outlet (cf. *Pe* 244).

672. That is how Noble Ones describe a tetrad path (*Pe* 244) for unwise¹ folk to cultivate, for fools to desire, for the lustful to master their lust by, the aim of which is conversion of relishing, of craving for being.

This is called the Plane of Conversion of Relishing. That is why it was said

[The Guide-Line] Craving and Ignorance [guiding]
By Quiet and Insight, [and construing]
Appropriately the four Truths
Is the Conversion of Relishing'] (§21).

*

669/1 *Paṭinissarati* here serves for *paṭinissajjati*, for which it is possibly a reading.

669/2 *Ājānāti* has two principal meanings: (1) to know, i.e., to understand the meaning of what is said, and (2) to come to the Arahant's final knowledge, subst. *aññā* ('final knowledge').

670/1 But cf. 3 kds. at §586.

672/1 'Abudha—unwise': not in *PED* or *CPD*.

[The Plotting of Directions]

673. 'What mentally plots out [ideas
Of] profit and unprofit stated
Or here or there in expositions
[They call the Plotting of Directions]' (§24).¹

[Now] these [ideas are] scrutinizable in two ways, namely whether they follow the world's round or whether they follow the world's stopping, what is called 'round' being the roundabout [of rebirths] and what is called 'stopping' being extinction, with action and defilements² [as] the roundabout's cause (cf. *Pe* 246). Herein, the action is demonstrable as choice and as concomitant of cognizance (cf. §239). How³ is that to be regarded? Through³ the storing up.

674. Now all defilements are demonstrable through the four perversions. Where are they to be found? In the conglomeration of defilement with its ten grounds. [114] What ten grounds?

1. Four Nutriment [physical nutriment, contact, choice, and consciousness (*D.* iii, 228)].¹
2. Four Perversions [seeing beauty, pleasure, permanence, and self, where there are none (*A.* ii, 52)].
3. Four Assumptions [sensual-desire, views, virtue-and-duty, and self-doctrine (*D.* iii, 230; but see §§257 and 484-7)].
4. Four Bonds [sensual-desire, being, views, and ignorance (*D.* iii, 230)].
5. Four Ties [covetousness, ill-will, misapprehension of virtue-and-duty, and insistence that 'only this is true' (*D.* iii, 230)].
6. Four Taints [sensual-desire, being, views, and ignorance (*A.* ii, 211)].
7. Four Floods [sensual-desire, being, views, and ignorance (*D.* iii, 230)].
8. Four Barbs [lust, hate, conceit, and delusion (cf. *Pe* 245)].

673/1 Terminal titles often make it hard to find the beginnings. After considering the general structure of this ch. and comparing with *Pe* ch. viii, the first Guide-Line must start with §646 and this verse must start a new section.

673/2 *Bb*: *kammakilesā*.

673/3 *Bb*: *upacayena*. With *PTS* reading *upacaye*, *kattha* would seem preferable to *kathaṃ*.

674/1 Cf. *Pe* 244. Details in square brackets in this paragraph are added from those that follow.

9. Four Steadying-points for consciousness [form, feeling, perception, and determinations (*D. iii*, 228)].
10. Four Goings on Bad Ways [through will, hate, fear, and delusion (*D. iii*, 228)] (cf. *Pe* 244).

675. 1-2. In the first nutriment there is the first perversion; in the second nutriment, the second perversion; in the third nutriment, the third perversion; in the fourth nutriment, the fourth perversion (cf. *Pe* 244).

2-3. In the first perversion there is the first assumption; in the second perversion, the second assumption; in the third perversion, the third assumption; in the fourth perversion, the fourth assumption.

3-4. In the first assumption there is the first bond; in the second assumption, the second bond; in the third assumption, the third bond; in the fourth assumption, the fourth bond.

4-5. In the first bond there is the first tie; in the second bond, the second tie; in the third bond, the third tie; in the fourth bond, the fourth tie.

5-6. In the first tie there is the first taint; in the second tie, the second taint; in the third tie, the third taint; in the fourth tie, the fourth taint.

6-7. In the first taint there is the first flood; in the second taint, the second flood; in the third taint, the third flood; in the fourth taint, the fourth flood.

7-8. In the first flood there is the first barb; in the second flood, the second barb; in the third flood, the third barb; in the fourth flood, the fourth barb.

8-9. In the first barb there is the first steadying-point for consciousness; in the second barb, the second steadying-point for consciousness; in the third barb, the third steadying-point for consciousness; in the fourth barb, the fourth steadying-point for consciousness.

9-10. In the first steadying-point for consciousness there is the first going on a bad way; in the second steadying-point for consciousness, the second going on a bad way; in the third steadying-point for consciousness, the third going on a bad way; in the fourth steadying-point for consciousness, the fourth going on a bad way (cf. *Pe* 244).

676. 1. Herein, physical nutriment and nutriment as contact are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while nutriment

as mind-choice and nutriment as consciousness are imperfections in a person of view-temperament (cf. *Pe* 244).

677. 2. Herein, the perversion that there is beauty in the ugly¹ and the perversion that there is pleasure in the painful are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while the perversion that there is permanence in the impermanent and the perversion that there is self in the not-self are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

678. [115] 3. Herein, sensual-desire-assumption and being-assumption are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while view-assumption and self-doctrine-assumption are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

679. 4. Herein, the bond of sensual desire and the bond of being are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while the bond of views and the bond of ignorance are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

680. 5. The body-tie of covetousness and the body-tie of ill-will are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while the body-tie of misapprehension-of-virtue-and-duty and the body-tie of insistence-that-only-this-is-true are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

681. 6. Herein, the taint of sensual desire and the taint of being are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while the taint of views and the taint of ignorance are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

682. 7. Herein, the flood of sensual desire and the flood of being are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while the flood of views and the flood of ignorance are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

683. 8. Herein, the barb of lust and the barb of hate are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while the barb of conceit and the barb of delusion are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

684. 9. Herein, form as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on and feeling as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while perception as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on and determinations as a steadying-point for consciousness passing on are imperfections in a person of view-temperament.

685. 10. Herein, the going on a bad way through will and the going

677/1 Read *asubhe subhan ti vipallāso, yo ca dukkhe sukhan ti vipallāso*.

on a bad way through hate are imperfections in a person of craving-temperament, while the going on a bad way through fear and the going on a bad way through delusion are imperfections in a person of view-temperament (cf. *Pe* 244).

686. 1-2. Herein, the perversion that there is beauty in the ugly [occurs] with respect to physical nutriment; the perversion that there is pleasure in the painful, with respect to nutriment as contact; the perversion that there is permanence in the impermanent, with respect to nutriment as consciousness; the perversion that there is self in the not-self, with respect to nutriment as mind-choice (cf. *Pe* 244-5).

687. 2-3. One steady in the first perversion assumes sensual desires: this is called sensual-desire-assuming. One steady in the second perversion [116] assumes future being: this is called being-assuming. One steady in the third perversion assumes the view that has expectant relish for the roundabout: this is called view-assuming. One steady in the fourth perversion, having supposed a self, assumes [accordingly]: this is called self-doctrine-assuming (cf. §304).

688. 3-4. He is fettered (bound) by sensual desires through sensual-desire-assuming: this is called the bond of sensual desire. He is fettered by the kinds of being through being-assuming: this is called the bond of being. He is fettered by an evil view through view-assuming: this is called the bond of views. He is fettered by ignorance through self-doctrine-assuming: this is called the bond of ignorance.

689. 4-5. One steady in the first bond ties the body¹ with covetousness: this is called the body-tie of covetousness. One steady in the second bond ties the body with the tie of ill-will: this is called the body-tie of ill-will. One steady in the third bond ties the body with misapprehension [of virtue and duty]: this is called the body-tie of misapprehension. One steady in the fourth bond ties the body with the insistence that only this is true: this is called the body-tie of insistence-that-only-this-is-true.

690. 5-6. His defilements, thus tied, taint [him]. And as what are they said to taint [him]? As underlying tendency, or as [open] obsession (cf. §455). Herein, there is the taint of sensual desire

689/1 'Body' has to be taken here as the name-body as well as the form-body. The word *kāya* ('body') has in Pali (as in English) the meaning of 'group' or 'conglomeration'.

through the body-tie of covetousness, the taint of being through the body-tie of ill-will, the taint of views through the body-tie of misapprehension [of virtue and duty], and the taint of ignorance through the body-tie of insistence-that-only-this-is-true.

691. 6-7. When these four taints abound they are floods, so with the abundance of taints there is abundance of floods. Herein, there is the flood of sensual desires through the taint of sensual desires, the flood of being through the taint of being, the flood of views through the taint of views, the flood of ignorance through the taint of ignorance.

692. 7-8. These four floods, accompanied by the underlying tendencies, intrude into one's inclinations till they strike one's heart and remain steady there: hence they are called 'barbs'. Herein, there is the barb of lust with the flood of sensual desire, the barb of hate with the flood of being, the barb of conceit with the flood of views, and the barb of delusion with the flood of ignorance.

693. 8-9. When one's consciousness is gripped by these four barbs it shapes itself to the following four ideas, namely to form, to feeling, to perception, and to determinations (cf. §304).

694. Herein, form [117] is the steadying-point for consciousness passing on when consciousness has an infection¹ of relishing through the barb of lust; feeling is the steadying-point for consciousness passing on when consciousness has an infection of relishing through the barb of hate; perception is the steadying-point for consciousness passing on when consciousness has an infection of relishing through the barb of conceit; determinations are the steadying-point for consciousness passing on when consciousness has an infection of relishing (cf. *Pe* 218) through the barb of delusion.

695. 9-10. When one's consciousness is stiffened by these four steadying-points for consciousness one goes a bad way because of the following four ideas, namely because of will, because of hate, because of fear, and because of delusion.

696. Herein, it is owing to lust that one goes a bad way through will, owing to hate that one goes a bad way through hate, owing to fear that one goes a bad way through fear, and owing to delusion that one goes a bad way through delusion (cf. *Pe* 245-6).

That is how that action and those defilements are the cause of the roundabout. That is how all defilements can be demonstrated by the four perversions (see §674).

694/1 Compare '*cittam vyāsiñcati*' at *S.* iv, 78 with '*nandūpasecana*' here.

697. Herein, the directions are these four (cf. §723): (i) physical nutriment, the perversion that there is beauty in the ugly, sensual-desire-assumption, the bond of sensual desire, the body-tie of covetousness, the taint of sensual desire, the flood of sensual desire, the barb of lust, form as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, going a bad way through will, are the first direction. (ii) Nutriment as contact, the perversion that there is pleasure in the painful, being-assumption, the bond of being, the body-tie of ill-will, the taint of being, the flood of being, the barb of hate, feeling as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, going a bad way through hate, are the second direction. (iii) Nutriment as consciousness, the perversion that there is permanence in the impermanent, view-assumption, the bond of views, the body-tie of misapprehension, the taint of views, the flood of views, the barb of conceit, perception as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, going a bad way through fear, are the third direction. (iv) Nutriment as mind-choice, the perversion that there is self in the not-self, self-doctrine-assumption, the bond of ignorance, the body-tie of insistence that only this is true, the taint of ignorance, the flood of ignorance, the barb of delusion, determinations as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, going a bad way through delusion, are the fourth direction (cf. *Pe* 246).

698. (i) Herein (cf. §724), as to the following ten Thread-[terms], physical nutriment, the perversion that there is beauty in the ugly, sensual-desire-assumption, the bond of sensual desire, the body-tie of covetousness, the taint of sensual desire, the flood of sensual desire, the barb of lust, form as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, and going a bad way through will: their meaning is one and only the phrasing is different. These are imperfections in a person of lusting temperament.

699. (ii) [118] Herein, as to the following ten Thread-[terms], nutriment as contact, the perversion that there is pleasure in the painful, being-assumption, the bond of being, the body-tie of ill-will, the taint of being, the flood of being, the barb of hate, feeling as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, and going a bad way through hate: their meaning is one and only the phrasing is different. These are imperfections in a person of hating temperament.

700. (iii) Herein, as to the following ten Thread-[terms], nutriment as consciousness, the perversion that there is permanence in the

impermanent, view-assumption, the bond of views, the body-tie of misapprehension, the taint of views, the flood of views, the barb of conceit, perception as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, and going a bad way through fear; their meaning is one, and only the phrasing is different. These are imperfections in one of dull view-temperament.

701. (iv) Herein, as to the following ten Thread-[terms], nutriment as mind-choice, the perversion that there is self in the not-self, the bond of ignorance, self-theory-assumption, the body-tie of insistence-that-only-this-is-true, the taint of ignorance, the flood of ignorance, the barb of delusion, determinations as steadying-point for consciousness passing on, and going a bad way through delusion: their meaning is one and only the phrasing is different. These are imperfections in one of intelligent view-temperament (cf. *Pe* 246-7).

702. 1. Herein, physical nutriment and nutriment as contact come to diagnosis through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, nutriment as consciousness through the void [gateway to liberation], and nutriment as mind-choice through the signless [gateway to liberation].

703. 2. Herein, the perversion that there is beauty in the ugly and the perversion that there is pleasure in the painful come to disappearance through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, the perversion that there is permanence in the impermanent [does so] through the void, and the perversion that there is self in the not-self [does so] through the signless.

704. 3. Herein, sensual-desire-assumption and being-assumption come to abandonment through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, view-assumption through the void, and self-theory-assumption through the signless.

705. 4. Herein, the bond of sensual desire and the bond of being come to abandonment through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, the bond of views through the void, and the bond of ignorance through the signless.

706. 5. Herein, the body-tie of covetousness and the body-tie of ill-will come to abandonment through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, [119] the body-tie of misapprehension through the void, and the body-tie of insistence-that-only-this-is-true through the signless.

707. 6. Herein, the taint of sensual desire and the taint of being come to abandonment through the dispositionless gateway to

liberation, the taint of views through the void, and the taint of ignorance through the signless.

708. 7. Herein, the flood of sensual desire and the flood of being come to abandonment through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, the flood of views through the void, and the flood of ignorance through the signless.

709. 8. Herein, the barb of lust and the barb of hate come to abandonment through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, the barb of conceit through the void, and the barb of delusion through the signless.

710. 9. Herein, form as steadying-point for consciousness passing on and feeling as steadying-point for consciousness passing on come to diagnosis through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, perception as steadying-point for consciousness passing on [does so] through the void, and determinations as steadying-point for consciousness passing on [does so] through the signless.

711. 10. Herein, going a bad way through will and going a bad way through hate come to abandonment through the dispositionless gateway to liberation, going a bad way through fear [does so] through the void, and going a bad way through delusion [does so] through the signless.

712. So all the ideas that follow the world's round (see §673) find outlet from the triple world by way of the three Gateways to Liberation.

713. Here is the outlet (cf. counterpart at §674):

1. Four Ways (§42; *D.* iii, 228).
2. Four Foundations of Mindfulness [body, feelings, cognizance, ideas (*D.* iii, 221; but cf. §4 and §730)].
3. Four Meditations [1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th (*D.* iii, 222)].
4. Four Abidings [heavenly, divine, noble, imperturbable (*D.* iii, 220)].
5. Four Right Endeavours [the effort to prevent the arising of unarisen unprofit, to get rid of the arisen, to arouse unarisen profit, and to increase the arisen (*D.* iii, 221)].
6. Four Wonderful Marvellous Ideas [abandoning conceit, eliminating reliance, abandoning ignorance, pacification of being (*Pe* 247)].
7. Four Expressions [truth, generosity, understanding, peace (*D.* iii, 229)].

8. Four Ways of keeping Concentration in Being [will, energy, cognizance, inquiry = 4 bases for success (*D.* iii, 222)].
9. Four ideas dealing with pleasure [faculty-restraint, ardour, discovery, relinquishment of all essentials of existence (*Pe* 247)].
10. Four Measureless States [lovingkindness, compassion, gladness, onlooking-equanimity (*D.* iii, 223; *Pe* 247)].¹

714. 1-2. The first way [corresponds to] the first foundation of mindfulness; the second way to the second foundation of mindfulness; the third way to the third foundation of mindfulness; the fourth way to the fourth foundation of mindfulness.

2-3. The first foundation of mindfulness [corresponds to] the first meditation; the second foundation of mindfulness to the second meditation; the third foundation of mindfulness to the third meditation; the fourth foundation of mindfulness to the fourth meditation.

3-4. The first meditation [corresponds to] the first abiding; the second meditation to the second abiding; the third meditation to the third abiding; the fourth meditation to the fourth abiding.

4-5. The first abiding [corresponds to] the first right endeavour; the second abiding to the second right endeavour; the third abiding to the third right endeavour; the fourth abiding [120] to the fourth right endeavour.

5-6. The first right endeavour [corresponds to] the first wonderful marvellous idea; the second right endeavour to the second wonderful marvellous idea; the third right endeavour to the third wonderful marvellous idea; the fourth right endeavour to the fourth wonderful marvellous idea.

6-7. The first wonderful marvellous idea [corresponds to] the first expression; the second wonderful marvellous idea to the second expression; the third wonderful marvellous idea to the third expression; the fourth wonderful marvellous idea to the fourth expression.

7-8. The first expression [corresponds to] the first keeping of concentration in being; the second expression to the second keeping of concentration in being; the third expression to the third keeping of concentration in being; the fourth expression to the fourth keeping of concentration in being.

713/1 Details in square brackets added from paragraphs that follow.

8-9. The first keeping of concentration in being [corresponds to] the first idea dealing with pleasure; the second keeping of concentration in being to the second idea dealing with pleasure; the third keeping of concentration in being to the third idea dealing with pleasure; the fourth keeping of concentration in being to the fourth idea dealing with pleasure.

9-10. The first idea dealing with pleasure [corresponds to] the first measureless state; the second idea dealing with pleasure to the second measureless state; the third idea dealing with pleasure to the third measureless state; the fourth idea dealing with pleasure to the fourth measureless state.

715. 1-2. When the first way is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the first foundation of mindfulness; when the second way is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the second foundation of mindfulness; when the third way is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the third foundation of mindfulness; when the fourth way is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the fourth foundation of mindfulness (*Pe* 247).

716. 2-3. When the first foundation of mindfulness is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the first meditation; when the second foundation of mindfulness is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the second meditation; when the third foundation of mindfulness is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the third meditation; when the fourth foundation of mindfulness is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the fourth meditation.

717. 3-4. When the first meditation is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the first abiding; when the second meditation is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the second abiding; when the third meditation is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the third abiding; when the fourth meditation is kept in being, [121] made much of, it fulfils the fourth abiding.

718. 4-5. When the first abiding is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the non-arising of unarisen evil unprofitable ideas. When the second abiding is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the abandoning of arisen evil unprofitable ideas. When the third abiding is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the arising of unarisen profitable ideas; when the fourth abiding is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the steadiness, unlostness and plentifulness of arisen profitable ideas.

719. 5-6. When the first right endeavour is kept in being, made

much of, it fulfils the abandoning of conceit. When the second right endeavour is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the eradication of reliance.¹ When the third right endeavour is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the abandoning of ignorance. When the fourth right endeavour is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the pacification of being.²

720. 6-7. When the abandoning of conceit is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the expression of truth. When the eradication of reliance is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the expression of generosity. When the abandoning of ignorance is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the expression of understanding. When the pacification of being is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the expression of peace.

721. 7-8. When the expression of truth is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils concentration of will. When the expression of generosity is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils concentration of energy. When the expression of understanding is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils concentration of [purity of] cognizance. When the expression of peace is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils concentration of inquiry

722. 8-9. When concentration of will is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils faculty-restraint. When concentration of energy is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils ardour. When concentration of [purity of] cognizance is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils discovery. When concentration of inquiry is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils the relinquishing of all essentials of existence.

723. 9-10. When faculty-restraint is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils lovingkindness. When ardour is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils compassion. When discovery is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils gladness [at others' success]. When relinquishment of all essentials of existence is kept in being, made much of, it fulfils onlooking-equanimity (cf. *Pe* 247).

724. Herein, the four directions are these (cf. §697): (i) The first way, first foundation of mindfulness, first meditation, first abiding,

719/1 *PT'S Netti* Index has 'feigning' against *ālaya*, but that is quite wrong here. What is meant is 'reliance', either as act-of-relying or thing-relied-on, the allusion being to the 16th of the 18 Principal Insights (*mahā-vipassanā*: *Ps.* i, 45, quoted at *Vis.* p. 50).

719/2 '*Upasama*—pacification' is to be taken here in the sense of 'cessation' (i.e., not mere negation, but cessation without remainder).

first right endeavour, first wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of truth, concentration of will, faculty-restraint, and lovingkindness, [122] are the first direction. (ii) The second way, second foundation of mindfulness, second meditation, second abiding, second right endeavour, second wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of generosity, concentration of energy, ardour, and compassion, are the second direction. (iii) The third way, third foundation of mindfulness, third meditation, third abiding, third right endeavour, third wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of understanding, concentration of [purity of] cognizance, discovery, and gladness, are the third direction. (iv) The fourth way, fourth foundation of mindfulness, fourth meditation, fourth abiding, fourth right endeavour, fourth wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of peace, concentration of inquiry, relinquishment of all essentials of existence, and onlooking-equanimity, are the fourth direction (cf. *Pe* 247-8).

725. (i) Herein (cf. §698), as to the following ten Thread-[terms], the first way, first foundation of mindfulness, first meditation, first abiding, first right endeavour, first wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of truth, concentration of will, faculty-restraint, and lovingkindness: their meaning is one and only the phrasing is different. These are the medicine for a person of lusting temperament.

726. (ii) Herein, as to the following ten Thread-[terms], the second way, second foundation of mindfulness, second meditation, second abiding, second right endeavour, second wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of generosity, concentration of energy, ardour, and compassion: their meaning is one and only the phrasing is different. These are the medicine for a person of hating temperament.

727. (iii) Herein, as to the following ten Thread-[terms], the third way, third foundation of mindfulness, third meditation, third abiding, third right endeavour, third wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of understanding, concentration of [purity of] cognizance, discovery, and gladness: their meaning is one and only the phrasing is different. These are the medicine for a person of dull view-temperament.

728. (iv) Herein, as to the following ten Thread-[terms], the fourth way, fourth foundation of mindfulness, fourth meditation, fourth abiding, fourth right endeavour, fourth wonderful marvellous idea, the expression of peace, concentration of inquiry, relinquishment of all essentials of existence, and onlooking-equanimity; their

meaning is one and only the phrasing is different. [123] These are the medicine for a person of intelligent view-temperament.

729. 1. Herein (cf. §702), the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship and the painful way with swift acquaintanceship are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship is the void gateway to liberation; and the pleasant way with swift acquaintanceship is the signless gateway to liberation.

730. 2. Herein, the foundation of mindfulness as the state of a contemplator-of-the-body-as-a-body and the foundation of mindfulness as the state of a contemplator-of-feelings-as-feelings are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; the foundation of mindfulness as the state of a contemplator-of-cognizance-as-cognizance is the void gateway to liberation; and the foundation of mindfulness as the state of a contemplator-of-ideas-as-ideas is the signless gateway to liberation.

731. 3. Herein, the first meditation and the second meditation are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; the third meditation is the void gateway to liberation; and the fourth meditation is the signless gateway to liberation.

732. 4. Herein, the first abiding and the second abiding are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; the third abiding is the void gateway to liberation; and the fourth abiding is the signless gateway to liberation.

733. 5. Herein, the first right endeavour and the second right endeavour are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; the third right endeavour is the void gateway to liberation; and the fourth right endeavour is the fourth gateway to liberation.

734. 6. Herein, the abandoning of conceit and the eradication of reliance are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; the abandoning of ignorance is the void gateway to liberation; and the pacification of being is the signless gateway to liberation.

735. 7. Herein, the expression of truth and the expression of generosity are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; the expression of understanding is the void gateway to liberation; and the expression of peace is the signless gateway to liberation.

736. 8. Herein, concentration of will and concentration of energy are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; concentration of cognizance is the void gateway to liberation; and concentration of inquiry is the signless gateway to liberation.

737. 9. Herein, faculty-restraint¹ and ardour are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; discovery is the void gateway to liberation; renunciation of all essentials of existence is the signless gateway to liberation.

738. 10. [124] Herein, lovingkindness and compassion are the dispositionless gateway to liberation; gladness is the void gateway to liberation; and onlooking-equanimity is the signless gateway to liberation.

[*The Play of Lions*]

739. The *play* of these [is as follows]:

There are four nutriments: their opposites are the four ways. There are four perversions: their opposites are the four foundations of mindfulness. There are four assumings: their opposites are the four meditations. There are four bonds: their opposites are the four abidings. There are four ties: their opposites are the four right endeavours. There are four taints: their opposites are the four wonderful marvellous ideas. There are four floods: their opposites are the four expressions. There are four barbs: their opposites are the four ways of keeping concentration in being. There are four steadying-points for consciousness: their opposites are the four ideas that deal with pleasure. There are four goings on a bad way: their opposites are the four measureless states (cf. *Pe* 248-9).

740. The *Lions* are the Enlightened Ones, the Hermit Enlightened Ones, and the hearers who have destroyed lust, hate, and delusion.

Their *play* [consists in] keeping in being, in verification, and in termination.

The *play* is the expression of the faculties [beginning with faith (cf. §670), and] the *play* is the non-expression of the pervertednesses:¹ the [four] faculties [of energy, mindfulness, concentration, and understanding] are the pasture for the true object of [the faculty of] faith, the pervertednesses being the pasture for defilement. This is called the Play-of-Lions Guide-Line and the Plotting-of-Directions Guide-Line. That is why it was said:

737/1 Read *indriyasamvaro* (one compound) or *indriyānaṃ samvaro* for *indriyaṃ samvaro*.

740/1 '*Vipariyāsa*—pervertedness': not in *PED*; variant spelling of *vipallāsa*. See Vin. iv, 79 = *M.* ii, 248.

'The wise in Guide-Lines have called that
Lions' Play, which by the faculties
Does faith's true objects guide, and also
By the perversions the defilements' (§23),
and also

'What mentally plots out [ideas
Of] profit and unprofit stated
Or here or there in expositions
They call the Plotting of Directions' (§§24, 673).

*

[*The Trefoil and Hook*]

741. Herein, those who find outlet by the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship and [by that] with swift acquaintanceship are two [types of] persons. And those who find outlet by the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship and [by that] with swift acquaintanceship are two [types of] persons (*Pe* 249).

742. Corruption for those four types of persons is as follows: the four nutriments, four perversions, four assumings, four bonds, four ties, four taints, four floods, four barbs, four steadying-points for consciousness, and four goings on a bad way (see §674).

743. [125] Cleansing for these four types of persons is as follows: the four ways, four foundations of mindfulness, four meditations, four abidings, four right endeavours, four wonderful marvellous ideas, four expressions, four ways of keeping concentration in being, four ideas dealing with pleasure, and four measureless states (see §713).

744. Herein, those who find outlet by the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship and that with swift acquaintanceship are two types of persons, and those who find outlet by the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship and that with swift acquaintanceship are two types of persons (see §668; *Pe* 249).

745. Herein, one who finds outlet by the pleasant way with swift acquaintanceship is one who gains knowledge from what is condensed. One who [does so by both the painful way with swift

acquaintanceship and the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship] in common (see *Pe* 30) is one who gains knowledge by what is expanded. One who finds outlet by the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship is guidable (see *Pe* 249).¹

746. Herein, the Blessed One discloses quiet to a person who gains knowledge by what is condensed, insight to one who is guidable, and quiet and insight to one who gains knowledge by what is expanded.

747. Herein, the Blessed One discloses a blunt teaching of the True Idea to a person who gains knowledge by what is condensed, a keen one to one who is guidable, and a blunt-to-keen one to one who gains knowledge by what is expanded (cf. §587).

748. Herein, the Blessed One teaches the True Idea in brief to a person who gains knowledge by what is condensed, in brief and in detail to one who gains knowledge by what is expanded, and in detail to one who is guidable (cf. §587).

749. Herein, the Blessed One discloses escape to a person who gains knowledge by what is condensed, disappointment and escape to a person who gains knowledge by what is expanded, and gratification, disappointment and escape to one who is guidable (cf. §§41ff.; §587).

750. Herein, the Blessed One describes training in higher understanding to one who gains knowledge by what is condensed, training in higher cognizance to one who gains knowledge by what is expanded, and training in higher virtue to one who is guidable (cf. §587).

751. Herein, [to repeat,] those who find outlet by the painful way with sluggish acquaintanceship and by that with swift acquaintanceship are two types of persons. And those who find outlet by the pleasant way with sluggish acquaintanceship and by that with swift acquaintanceship are two types of persons (§744).

752. [But although] four in this way they are [yet] three, namely one who gains knowledge by what is condensed, one who gains knowledge by what is expanded, and one who is guidable (cf. §745).

753. The corruption of these three types of persons is as follows:

1. Three roots of unprofit: greed as a root of unprofit, hate as a root of unprofit, delusion [126] as a root of unprofit (*D.* iii, 214).

2. Three kinds of misconduct: bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, mental misconduct (*D. iii*, 214).

3. Three unprofitable type sof thinking: thinking of sensual desires, thinking of ill-will, thinking of cruelty (*D. iii*, 215).

4. Three unprofitable types of perception: perception of sensual desires, perception of ill-will, perception of cruelty (*D. iii*, 215).

5. Three distorted types of perception: perception of permanence, perception of pleasure, perception of self ().

6. Three kinds of feelings: pleasant feeling, painful feeling, neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling (*D. iii*, 216).

7. Three kinds of painfulness: painfulness in pain, painfulness in change, painfulness in determinations (*D. iii*, 216).

8. Three fires: the fire of lust, the fire of hate, the fire of delusion (*D. iii*, 217).

9. Three barbs: the barb of lust, the barb of hate, the barb of delusion ().

10. Three tangles: the tangle of lust, the tangle of hate, the tangle of delusion ().

11. Three unprofitable scrutinies: unprofitable bodily action, unprofitable verbal action, unprofitable mental action (cf. *M. i*, 415).

12. Three failures: failure in virtue, failure in views, failure in conduct (cf. *A. i*, 268, 270; *Vbh.* 246-7; *Pe* 250).

754. The cleansing of these three types of persons is as follows:

1. Three roots of profit: non-greed as a root of profit, non-hate as a root of profit, non-delusion as a root of profit (*D. iii*, 214).

2. Three kinds of good conduct: bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, mental good conduct (*D. iii*, 215).

3. Three profitable types of thinking: thinking of renunciation, thinking of non-ill-will, thinking of non-cruelty (*D. iii*, 215).

4. Three kinds of concentration: concentration with thinking and with exploring, concentration without thinking and with only exploring, concentration without thinking and without exploring (*D. iii*, 219).

5. Three profitable types of perception: perception of renunciation, perception of non-ill-will, perception of non-cruelty (*D. iii*, 215).

6. Three undistorted types of perception: perception of impermanence, perception of suffering, perception of not-self ().

7. Three profitable scrutinies: profitable bodily action, profitable verbal action, profitable mental action (cf. *M. i*, 415ff.).

8. Three purenesses: bodily pureness, verbal pureness, mental pureness (*D.* iii, 219).

9. Three successes: success in virtue, success in concentration, success in understanding ().

10. Three trainings: training in higher virtue, training in higher concentration, training in higher understanding (*D.* iii, 219).

11. Three categories: the virtue category, the concentration category, the understanding category (see *M.* i, 301).

12. Three gateways to liberation: the void, the signless, the dispositionless (see *Ps.* ii, 48, 69) (cf. *Pe* 252).

755. [Now although] four in this way [yet] they are three, being three [yet] they are two,¹ namely one of craving-temperament and one of view-temperament (§645; cf. *Pe* 253-4).

756. The corruption of these two types of persons is as follows:

1. Craving and ignorance (*S.* ii, 178),
2. consciencelessness and shamelessness (*A.* i, 95),
3. unmindfulness and unawareness (*A.* i, 95), [127]
4. [unreason and] unreasoned attention,¹
5. idleness and difficult admonishability,
6. I-making and my-making (*A.* i, 132),
7. faithlessness and negligence,
8. not hearing faith's true object, and non-restraint,
9. covetousness and ill will,
10. hindrances and fetters (*S.* ii, 178; cf. *Ps.* i, 143),
11. anger and spite (*A.* i, 95),
12. contempt and domineering (*A.* i, 95),
13. envy and avarice (*A.* i, 95),

755/1 It may be noted here that the *Pe* allots its two sets of subsidiary dyads to the Conversion-of-Relishing for subsumption under the pair of Root-Dyads, as with the other two meaning-Guide-Lines; also that it places this Guide-Line last, not first. Here, however, it is put first, with its pair of Root-Dyads, but the whole procedure of subsumption is omitted from it, the two sets of subsidiary dyads being put under the Trefoil as subsidiary to its Root-Triads. This shows that the process of 'subsumption' of sets of pairs under the Root-Pair is a mere detail and not an essential characteristic of any particular Guide-Line.

756/1 Read *ayoni ca ayonisomanasikāro ca* (see §218 where 10 of these dyads occur. Cf. also *Pe* p. 254, where they are rather different).

14. deceit and fraud (*A. i, 95*),
15. the eternalist view and the annihilationist view (cf. *S. iv, 400-1*; cf. *Pe 254*).

757. The cleansing of these two types of persons is as follows:

1. Quiet and insight (*A. i, 61*),
2. conscience and shame (*A. i, 95*),
3. mindfulness and awareness (*A. i, 95*),
4. [reason and] reasoned attention,¹
5. instigation of energy and easy admonishability,
6. knowledge of the True Idea and knowledge of inferences,
7. knowledge of exhaustion and knowledge of non-arising,
8. faith and diligence,
9. hearing faith's true object and restraint,
10. uncovetousness and non-ill-will,
11. heart-deliverance due to fading of lust and understanding-deliverance due to fading of ignorance (*A. i, 61*),
12. fewness of wishes and content,
13. unanger and unspitefulness (*A. i, 96*),
14. uncontentment and undomineering (*A. i, 95*),
15. abandoning of envy and abandoning of avarice (cf. *A. i, 95*),
16. science and deliverance (*A. i, 83*),
17. the kind of liberation whose object is determined and the kind of liberation whose object is undetermined,²
18. the extinction element with trace left and the extinction element without trace left (*Iti. 38*).

758. This is called the plane of the Trefoil Guide-Line and the Hook Guide-Line.

That is why it was said:

'Guiding [ideas of] profit and
Unprofit by their [triple] roots
As they are, really, not unreally,
That Guide-Line they call the Trefoil' (§22),

757/1 See n. 756/1. Read *yoni ca yonisomanasikāro ca* (see §218).

757/2 '*Sankhatārammaṇa*—whose object is determined': i.e., the 'temporary' liberations consisting in the 4 Meditations and 4 Formless States (see *Pug. 11*). '*Asankhatārammaṇa*—whose object is undetermined': i.e., the 'non-temporary' liberation 'whose object is *nibbāna*', and which consists in the four Paths, 4 Fruits of the Paths, and Cessation Attainment.

[and also]

‘After [thus] plotting with the Plotting
Of Directions, what then throws up
All profit [ideas] and unprofit
And guides them in is called the Hook’ (§25).

*

The Moulding of the Guide-Lines is ended.

[Chapter iv
The Pattern Of The Dispensation]

759. Herein, the eighteen Root-Terms: where are they to be seen ?
In the Pattern of the Dispensation (cf. §964).¹

760. Herein what is the Pattern of the Dispensation ? [It is the
Thread grouped, firstly, as follows:]

[*First Grouping—Schedule*]

- [128] [A] 1. Type of Thread dealing with corruption,
[B] 2. type of Thread dealing with morality,
[C] 3. type of Thread dealing with penetration,
[D] 4. type of Thread dealing with the Adept;¹
[AB] 5. type of Thread dealing with corruption and morality,
[AC] 6. type of Thread dealing with corruption and penetration,
[AD] 7. type of Thread dealing with corruption and the Adept,
[ACD] 8. type of Thread dealing with corruption, penetration,
and the Adept,

759/1 *NettiA* explains this elliptic sentence as follows: ‘After thus analysing in all ways the Moulding of the Guide-Lines, now in analysing the Pattern of the Dispensation he said “Where are the eighteen Root-Terms to be seen? In the Pattern of the Dispensation”, and since the Pattern is included in the Comprehensive Section (§1) by only the Root-Terms and not in its own form, this is said in order to show that, just as the Pattern can be derived from the Root-Terms, so also the Root-Terms can be derived from the Pattern’ (p. 184). Again ‘(As to the two expressions) “eighteen Root-Terms” and “Pattern of the Dispensation” each includes the other, just as (for example, each of the three) Guide-Lines that deal with meaning (includes the other two, or as each of the two) triads of determinations (namely that of determinative-acts of merit, demerit and imperturbability, and that of the bodily, verbal and mental includes the other triad)’ (p. 2; *Ṭikā*, pp. 16-17). See also n. 764/2.

760/1 These 4 basic types appear with their combinations also at *Pe* 23ff. and in the classification of Threads at *Pe* 153 down to end of that ch. (see, e.g., *Pe* 163, line 1). *NettiA* says ‘That which deals with craving, etc., as defilement is “that dealing with defilement”, that which deals with giving, etc., and with the grounds for merit-making, is “that dealing with morality”, that dealing with the virtue category, etc., in Initiates is “that dealing with penetration”, and that dealing with the virtue category, etc., in Adepts is “that dealing with the adept”’ (p. 185). See Intro. (sect. 7b).

- [ABC] 9. type of Thread dealing with corruption, morality, and penetration,
 [BC] 10. type of Thread dealing with morality and penetration;²
 [A1] 11. type of Thread dealing with corruption by craving,
 [A2] 12. type of Thread dealing with corruption by view,
 [A3] 13. type of Thread dealing with corruption by misconduct;
 [B-D1] 14. type of Thread dealing with cleansing from craving.
 [B-D2] 15. type of Thread dealing with cleansing from view,
 [B-D3] 16. type of Thread dealing with cleansing from misconduct
 (cf. *Pe* 22ff.).³

761. Herein, corruption is of three kinds: corruption by craving, corruption by view, and corruption by misconduct.

762. Herein, corruption by craving is purified by quiet, and that quiet is the concentration category. Corruption by view is purified by insight, and that insight is the understanding category. Corruption by misconduct is purified by good conduct, and that good conduct is the virtue category.

763. When someone is established in virtue, if clutching at the kinds of being arises in him, then any quiet and insight of his becomes the ground for making merit consisting in keeping in being since it causes reappearance to occur in some kind [of existence] or other.

764. These four [basic types of] Threads [A-D], when [combined] in common, come to eight; and those same eight [combined] in common come to sixteen.¹ The [entire] Ninefold Thread is classifiable under these sixteen [types thus] classified.²

760/2 *NettiA* remarks that of the possible 6 dyads, 4 triads, and 1 tetrad (see n. 764/1), as combinations of the basic 4, only 4 dyads and 2 triads are chosen, though 'there is no reason for leaving the others out' and so 'the text should be regarded as set out in abbreviated form' (p. 185). Cf. *Pe* ch. ii.

760/3 The last 6 are merely subdivisions respectively of the first and of the other 3, together, and *NettiA* points out that they were wanting in some MSS. See *Pe* 29.

764/1 *NettiA* gives the following arithmetic: The '8' are the 4 simple ones, A, B, C, D, (Nos. 1-4) and the 4 included dyads, AB, AC, AD, BC (nos. 5, 6, 7, and 10), which total 8. The second '8' is made up of the following combinations: BD, CD, ABC (No. 9), ABD, ACD (no. 8), BCD, ABCD, and the negative tetrad not-A-not-B-not-C-not-D. The over-all total is thus 16. Cf. *Pe* 29.

764/2 This means that the whole of what is called the '*Sutta*'—the 'Thread' in the sense of the Buddha's Utterance—in its nine classes (see n. 1/9) is made to fall under these 16 divisions. Therefore this chapter claims to cover

765. Verse should be assessed by verse, prose-exposition should be assessed by prose-exposition (cf. *Pe* 10, 11, 19), Thread should be assessed by Thread.¹

[First Grouping—Illustrative Quotations]

[1]

766. Herein, what is the type of Thread Dealing with Corruption ?

<Caught in the net of sensual murk,
And blocked by craving's bondage,
[129] Fenced in by fences of neglect
Like fishes in a funnel-trap,
They follow after ageing and death
As does the sucking-calf its mother> (§198; *Pe* 24).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

767. <'Bhikkhus, there are these four goings on a bad way. What four? One goes a bad way through will, another goes a bad way through hate, another goes a bad way through fear, another goes a bad way through delusion.' So the Blessed One said. The Sublime One having said this, he, the Master, said further:

'When man strays from the True Idea
Through will, hate, fear, or through delusion,
His good fame wanes away, he finds,
As in its dark half does the moon>' (cf. *Pe* 48, 64; *A.* ii, 18).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

768. <Ideas are heralded¹ by mind,
Mind heads them, and they are mind-made.
If someone with corrupted mind
Is wont to speak or act, then pain

the whole range of the Buddha's Utterance by means of classified quotations, setting it out as a 'pattern' from which, by subsuming it all under the '18 Root-Terms' (see §§4, 759 and 964) it is intended that the Guide-Lines can be 'moulded' (see also n. 759/1).

765/1 See *Pe* 10, line 3.

768/1 *Pubbangama* as adj. means 'preceded by'. In Pali the illustration given is that of a king preceding his army. 'Herald' is compendious.

*Sure follows after him as does
The wheel the harnessed [ox's] hoof* > (Dh. 1; cf. §787).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

769. <*A dullard, drowsy with much gluttony,
Engrossed in sleep, who wallows as he lies
Like a great porker stuffed with fattening food,
Comes ever and again back to the womb*> (§190).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

770. <*As the rust-stain that grows out of the iron
Devours the iron wherefrom it takes its growth,
So too are led habitual transgressors
By their own acts to evil destinations*> (Pe 8, 49; Dh. 240).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

771. [130] <*Just as a robber taken in house-breaking
Is haunted by and responsible for his act,
So too a man hereafter, when departed,
Is haunted by and responsible for his act*> (§188).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

772. <*One with the rod maltreating cruelly
Beings that desire but pleasure,
When he too his own pleasure seeks
Departing hence, he finds it not*> (Ud. 12; Dh. 131; cf. §789).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

773. <*When cattle go across a ford
And the bull leader goes astray
Then all the others go astray
Because the guide has gone astray.
So too it is among mankind:
If the appointed ruler acts
Contrary to the True Idea,
How much more all the other folk;
The whole realm suffers when its king
Acts counter to the True Idea*> (A. ii, 75ff.; cf. §790).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

774. <Fine work indeed have men, who evil do
Through lusting for essentials of existence
Then crowd into the Unremitting Hell
To suffer there most fearful agonies !> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

775. <Fruiting kills the plantain tree
And kills the bamboo and the rush,
And honours kill unworthy men
As foaling does she-mules> (S. i, 154).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

776. <A bhikkhu given much to anger
And contempt through gain and honour
Grows in the True Idea no more
Than in good soil a rotten seed> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

777. <'Here, bhikkhus, with cognizance I penetrate some person's cognizance by means of the Enlightened One's eye, and I understand thus: According as this person is behaving, and according to the way he is practising and the path he is taking, [131] were he to die on this occasion, then as if carried [there], so [he would be] placed in hell.¹ Why is that? His heart is corrupt. It is because of his heart's corruption that here, on the dissolution of the body, after death, someone reappears in a state of unease, in a bad destination, in perdition, in hell.' This is the meaning the Blessed One stated. Herein, it is stated as follows:

On recognizing here some person
Whose heart was brimming with corruption,
The Master did expound the meaning
In the bhikkhus' presence thus:
'Now should it happen that this person
Came to die at such a moment
He then would reappear in hell
Through the corruption of his heart;

777/1 This difficult and idiomatic phrase, which is repeated in a number of Suttas, is probably best evidenced here by this verse-paraphrase. A commentarial explanation is given at, e.g., MA. ii, 32.

*For heart-corrupted creatures go
On to an evil destination.
As if he had been carried off
And placed [there], so a fool like this,
After the body's dissolution,
Reappears in Hell'.*

This was the meaning stated by the Blessed One, so I heard > (cf. *Iti.* 12f.; cf. §795).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

778. <*Now if you are afraid of pain
And if you find pain disagreeable
Then do no sort of evil act
In public or in secrecy.
If you do or if you will do
An evil act, [no matter what,]
You will no safety find from pain,
Even by flight to future states* > (*Pe* 43, 44; *S.* i, 209).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

779. <*Whatever increment they get
Unlawfully, and what by lies,
Fools do conceive both to be 'mine';
Now how will that turn out to be?
There will be troubles, and besides,
What has been gathered vanishes;
No heaven for them when they die:
Now are they not undone thereby?* > ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

780. <*'How does a man consume¹ himself?
How does he come to lose his friends?
How does he turn from² the True Idea?
How does he fail to go to heaven?'
'Through greed a man consumes himself,
Through greed he comes to lose his friends,*

780/1 '*Khanati*—to consume': not in *PED* in this sense; cf. *Vis.* 145 and 527; *NettiA* ignores.

780/2 '*Vivattate*—turns from': *NettiA* glosses with *nivattati*, not with *vattati* as stated in *PTS Netti Index* (p. 280, note 1).

*Through greed he turns from the True Idea,
Through greed he fails to go to heaven' > ().*

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

781. *<When fools show their stupidity
They are their own selves' enemies;
For they do evil actions, which
Will bear an evil fruit.
[132] The act is not well done, for which
When done regret comes in its wake,
Whose ripening one undergoes
Mourning with tearful face> (Dh. 66; S. i, 57).*

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

782. *<The unfit man the monk's state finds
Both hard to gain and hard to bear;
For many are the troubles there
Wherein a fool may come to grief> (S. i, 7).
<For should a fool corrupt his mind
The while a Perfect One expounds
A meaning or an idea else,
Futile his life thereby becomes> ().
<'This pain I do indeed deserve, and worse besides, O venerable
sir; for I, not lust-free, hate did nurse at heart for Perfect Ones
immeasurable'> ().¹*

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

783. *<Who is there, then, that knows would think
To measure the immeasurable?
I hold him dense, witless, who tries
To measure the immeasurable> (S. i, 149).*

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

784. *<When once a man has come to birth
An axe is born inside his mouth,
Whereby the fool will cut himself
By uttering ill-spoken words> (S. i, 149).*

782/1 Perhaps this quotation should be verse, as printed in *Bb*.

<For never did well whetted blade
Or poison of kalāhala
So certainly undo a man
As can the ill-spoken word> (Jā. iii, 103).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

785. <Who the condemnable commends
Or the commendable condemns
Casts¹ by his mouth an unlucky throw,
A throw through whose means no bliss he finds.
Trifling the unlucky throw at dice
That gambles away the wealth of all,
Including oneself; far worse indeed
Is that unluckiest of throws
That steels the heart against Sublime Ones.
A hundred thousand and thirty-six
Nirabbudas, and five abbudas,
[Of years] in evil hellish states
[133] Reap men who Noble Ones revile
For so disposing their heart and speech> (Sn. 658-60).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

786. <When a man is devoted to service of greed
He is one who gives vent to the slander of others.
He is faithless, ignoble,¹ and cannot judge speech,
Avaricious as well and devoted to malice.
O foul-mouth, O trickster, O ignoble fellow,
Destroyer and renegade, doer of evil,
O miscreant, sinner, and son of the gutter,
Say little here now, you belong to the hells.²
You have scattered pollution for [others'] misfortune,

785/1 'Vicināti—casts': lit. to store up (misfortune as the 'unlucky throw'): not in *PED* under letter v, though included there under *kali* (q.v.).

786/1 Here *anariyo*, but at Sn. 663 *kadariyo*; also *avajātakaputta* here, where Sn. 664 has *avajāta*. The passage *Yo lobhagūṇe . . . to . . . pesunīyam anugutto* should be in verse as at Sn. 663.

786/2 'Hell' is used here to render *niraya* (for a commentarial gloss, see *MA.* ii, 37). But in the Buddha's teaching, hell, like heaven and everything else that arises, is impermanent, and no existence there is eternal (see *M. Sutta* 130). Also a being creates his own existence in hell as in heaven, doing so by his acts, whose future results he creates for himself in acting, and he cannot be consigned there by another. 'Sinner' (for *kali*) here is also only

*You have censured the true and done hideous things;
Through all of the many misdeeds you have done,
You are going for long to remain in the pit* > (Sn. 663-5).

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

[2]

787. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with morality?

*<Ideas are heralded by mind,
Mind heads them, and they are mind-made.
If someone with a placid¹ mind
Is wont to speak or act, then bliss
Sure follows after him as does
His shadow keep him company* > (Pe 24, 163; Dh. 2; cf. §768).

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

788. <Mahānāma the Sakyan said this to the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, this [city of] Kapilavatthu is successful, prosperous, populous and crowded with people, its alleys are teeming. Now, venerable sir, it happens that when I have done honour to the Blessed One or to reverend bhikkhus, I then go in the evening into Kapilavatthu, and I encounter perhaps an uncontrolled elephant or an uncontrolled horse or an uncontrolled carriage or an uncontrolled cart or an uncontrolled man. On that occasion, venerable sir, mindfulness instigated by the Blessed One is forgotten, mindfulness instigated by the True Idea is forgotten, mindfulness instigated by the Community is forgotten. Venerable sir, I wonder: Were I to pass away on that evening, what would my destination be, what would my prospect be?'—[134] 'Do not fear, Mahānāma, do not fear. Your death will be free from evil, your passing away free from evil. When a noble hearer possesses four ideas he tends to extinction, he inclines to extinction, he leans to extinction. What are the four? Here a noble hearer, through experience undergone, has confidence in the Enlightened One thus: 'That Blessed One is such since he is accomplished, . . . [as in §296] . . . teacher of gods and men, enlightened Blessed . . . in the True Idea . . .

in the sense of one who is 'unlucky' enough to act against his own welfare to so great an extent. Consequently this verse is in no sense an imprecation or commination—a 'consigning to hell', which would be impossible to effect—but simply a description and an apostrophe as a warning to others not to make the same miserable mistake through greed, hate and delusion.

787/1 "Placid" through confidence in the law of action and its ripening' (NettiA. 192).

[as in §297] . . . in the Community . . . [as in §298] . . . And then he possesses the kinds of virtue desired by Noble Ones, untorn . . . [as in §299] . . . and conducive to concentration. Suppose that a tree tended to the east, inclined to the east, leaned to the east, what side would it fall to when cut at its root?—‘Venerable sir, it would fall where it tended, would fall where it inclined, would fall where it leaned.’—‘So too, Mahānāma, when a noble hearer possesses four ideas he tends to extinction, he inclines to extinction, he leans to extinction. Do not fear, Mahānāma, do not fear. Your death will be free from evil, your passing away free from evil’ > (cf. *Pe* 24, 170; *S.* v, 371).

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

789. <Not with the rod maltreating cruelly
Beings that desire but pleasure,
When he too his own pleasure seeks
Departing hence he meets with it> (*Ud.* 12; *Dh.* 132; cf. §772).

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

790. <When cattle go across a ford
And the bull leader goes aright
Then all the others go aright
Because the guide has gone aright.
So too it is among mankind;
If the appointed ruler acts
According to the True Idea,
How much more all the other folk;
The whole realm prospers when its king
Acts following the True Idea> (*A.* ii, 76; cf. §773).

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

791. <The Blessed One was living at Sāvatti in Jeta’s Wood, Anāthapiṇḍika’s Park. Now on that occasion a number of bhikkhus were engaged on robe-work for the Blessed One, [135] [thinking] ‘The Blessed One will go wandering when the robes are finished’. And on that occasion the officials, Isidatta and Purāṇa, were staying at Sāketa for some business or other. They heard: ‘It seems that a number of bhikkhus are engaged in robe-work for the Blessed One [thinking] “The Blessed One will go wandering when the robes are finished.”’ Then they posted a man on the path, [telling him] ‘Good man, when you see the Blessed One coming, accomplished and fully

enlightened, then tell us'. When the man had waited two days or three, he saw the Blessed One coming in the distance. When he saw him, he went to Isidatta and Purāṇa, and he told them 'Sirs, this Blessed One is coming, accomplished and fully enlightened. Now is the time to do as you will'. Then the officials, Isidatta and Purāṇa, went to the Blessed One, and after paying homage they followed close behind him. Then the Blessed One stepped aside from the road and sat down on a seat made ready at the root of a tree. The officials, Isidatta and Purāṇa, paid homage and sat down at one side. When they had done so they said: 'Venerable sir, when we hear that the Blessed One is going from Sāvattthi wandering among the Kosalans we are dissatisfied on that occasion and we grieve that the Blessed One will be far from us. And when we hear that the Blessed One has gone from Sāvattthi to wander among the Kosalans we are dissatisfied on that occasion and we grieve that the Blessed One is far from us. When we hear that the Blessed One is going wandering among the people of Kāsi and Magadha, we are dissatisfied on that occasion and we grieve that the Blessed One [136] will be far from us. And when we hear that the Blessed One has gone to wander among the people of Kāsi and Magadha we are not a little dissatisfied on that occasion and we grieve not a little that the Blessed One is far from us. When we hear that the Blessed One is going wandering among the people of Magadha and Kāsi we are dissatisfied on that occasion and we grieve that the Blessed One will be far from us. And when we hear that the Blessed One has gone to wander among the people of Magadha and Kāsi we are dissatisfied on that occasion and we grieve that the Blessed One is far from us. But when we hear that the Blessed One is going wandering among the Kosalans back to Sāvattthi we are satisfied on that occasion and we rejoice that the Blessed One will be near to us. And when we hear that the Blessed One is living in Sāvattthi in Jeta's Wood, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park, we have no little satisfaction and we rejoice no little that the Blessed One is near to us.'—'That, officers, is because the house-life is a constrained and dirty place; but the life gone forth is wide open: enough so indeed for you to be diligent.'—'Venerable sir, we have a constraint more constraining and counted more constraining than that.'—'What is this constraint of yours more constraining and counted more constraining than that?'—'Here, venerable sir, when king Pasenadi of Kosala would go to the parade-ground, we have to see that king Pasenadi of Kosala's elephants are got ready for his mounting, and we have then to seat the king's favourite consorts, one before him and one

behind. Now, venerable sir, those ladies have scent like that of a scent-casket just opened, as may be expected of those embellished with scents that are fit for a king. And, venerable sir, those ladies have a bodily touch like [137] that of tula-cotton or that of kappāsa-cotton, as may be expected of kings' daughters brought up to pleasure. Now on that occasion, venerable sir, the elephant must be guarded and the ladies must be guarded and we ourselves too must be guarded. Yet we have never known evil thoughts to arise in regard to those ladies. Venerable sir, we have this constraint more constraining and counted more constraining than that.'—'That, officers, is because the house-life is a constrained and dirty place; but the life gone forth is wide open: enough so indeed for you to be diligent. When a noble hearer possesses four ideas he has entered the stream, he is no more inseparable from the idea of perdition, he is certain [of rightness] and bound for enlightenment. What are the four? Here a well taught noble hearer, through experience undergone, has confidence in the Blessed One thus: 'That Blessed One is such since . . . [as in §296] . . . blessed' . . . in the True Idea . . . [as in §297] . . . in the Community . . . [as in §298] . . . 'field of merit for the world'. And then he abides in the house-life with his heart free from stain and avarice, freely generous, open-handed, delighting in relinquishing, expecting to be asked, and rejoicing in giving and sharing. A noble hearer possessing these four ideas has entered the stream, he is no longer inseparable from the idea of perdition, he is certain [of rightness] and bound for enlightenment. Now, officers, you, through experience undergone, have confidence in the Enlightened One thus: . . . in the True Idea thus: . . . in the Community thus: . . . And whatever there is in the clan to be given, none of it is withheld from the virtuous who are inseparable from the idea of good. How do you conceive this: how many people are there among the Kosalans your equals in giving and sharing?'—'For us, venerable sir, it is gain, for us it is great gain, that the Blessed One knows this about us' > (S. v, 348f.).

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

792. [138] <I gave only a single flower;
 Thereafter eighty myriad aeons
 Mid gods and human kind [I lived]
 To reach extinction with trace left> (cf. *Thag.* 96).¹

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

792/1 See similar untraced quotation at *KhpA.* 222.

793. <Under a Wisdom Tree
 Broad and tall-grown and greenly shining
 As I sat meditating
 A sign I saw as of an Enlightened One.
 Today these thirty aeons
 Have passed, and I since then no more have been
 To a bad destination,
 And the Triple Science has been verified,
 The moral of that sign> (cf. *Thag.* 217-18).
 This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.
794. <The Foremost of Men entered for alms
 The capital of Kosala
 Before the meal, compassionate,
 The Stilled One, healer of [all] craving.
 A man had in his hand a chaplet
 Bedecked with every kind of bloom;
 He saw the Fully Enlightened One
 With a Community of Bhikkhus
 Entering on the king's high way,
 Honoured by gods and human beings.
 Happy, with confidence at heart,
 He drew near to the Blessed One.
 The chaplet full of blossom-fragrance
 Gay with many a charming colour
 He gave with his own hand in faith
 [To grace] the Fully Enlightened One.
 Then from the Buddha's lips came forth
 With colour as of fiery flames
 A beam of full a thousand rays,
 Like lightning flashing from his mouth.
 After rounding him to the right
 It thrice revolved upon the head
 Of the Sun's Kinsman, and thereon
 Vanished away upon his brow.
 On seeing this most wonderful,
 This marvellous hair-raising thing,
 Ananda asked the Blessed One,
 Setting his robe upon one shoulder:
 'O mighty Stilled One, tell the cause
 Wherefor you manifest a smile.

*It will light up the True Ideal¹
 If you dispel our wonderings.
 Then he in whom is ready ever
 Knowledge about everything*
 [139] *Did answer the Elder Ānanda*
 [Who stood there] *wondering in doubt*
*'This man, Ānanda, since he has
 Had confidence in me at heart
 Will go to no bad destination
 For four and eighty thousand aeons.
 And after ruling heavenly realms
 Of godly beings among the gods,
 He will be ruler among men,
 He will be king of a [whole] realm,
 And in the end he will go forth
 To find the True Idea's own law
 And be the Hermit Enlightened One
 Vataṃsaka, free from all lust.
 No trivial offering is that
 Made with a heart [full resolute]
 Confiding in a Perfect One
 Fully enlightened, or his hearer.
 Measureless are the Enlightened Ones,
 Measureless is their True Idea,
 Measureless fruit for those who place
 Their confidence in the measureless> ().*

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

795. <'Here, bhikkhus, with cognizance I penetrate some person's cognizance by means of the Enlightened One's eye, and I understand thus: According as this person is behaving, and according to the way he is practising and the path he is taking, were he to die on this occasion, then as if carried [there], so [would he be] placed in heaven. Why is that? His heart is confident. It is because of his heart's confiding that here, on the dissolution of the body, after death, someone reappears in a good destination, in heaven.' This is the meaning the Blessed One stated. Herein, it is stated as follows:

*On recognizing here some person
 Whose heart was full of confidence,*

*The Master did express the meaning
 In the bhikkhus' presence thus:
 'Now should it happen that the person
 Came to die at such a moment
 He then would reappear in heaven
 Through the confiding of his heart;
 For confident-hearted creatures go
 On to a happy destination.
 As if he had been carried off
 And placed [there], so a wise man like this
 After the body's dissolution
 Reappears in heaven.'*

This was the meaning stated by the Blessed One, so I heard > (cf. *Iti.* 13f.; cf. §777).

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

796. [140] <On board a boat a woman was
 With a gold awning overspread.
 She plunged her hand into the pool
 And with it plucked a lotus flower> (Vv. p. 4).
 <'Whence comes the beauty that you have?
 Whence comes the radiance of your being?
 All riches seem to flow to you,
 No matter what your mind may wish;
 Tell me, O deity, when asked,
 What is the action gave this fruit?
 Most happily the deity,
 Thus questioned by the king of gods
 In answering did thus reply
 To Sakka's question, as I heard:
 'While I was on a journey going
 I saw a truly lovely shrine,
 Wherein my heart had confidence
 In Kassapa of great renown.
 I offered lotus flowers there
 In confidence with my own hands.
 Such is the fruit, the ripening of that action,
 Which those that have made merit do obtain> ()

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

797. <Talk on giving, talk on virtue, talk on heavens> (M. i, 379),
<talk on merit, talk on ripening of merit> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

798. <Besides, men that have helped to build
Earth-monuments made dedicate
To those who wield the Powers Ten
Abide in the joys of heaven> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

799. <All with a god's son's bodily appearance
And with the blessing of fair shapeliness,
Have earth prepared by wetting well with water
And raise¹ a monument to Kassapa.
Fair-limbed ones, 'tis a shrine built for a sage
Sublime with the Ten Powers, walking in Truth:
These gods and men who work with confidence
Thereon will be released from ageing and death> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

800. <It was indeed a mighty thing
That I upon the monument
Erected to the Greatest Sage
[141] Did place four lilies and a wreath.
Today these thirty aeons have passed,
And I since then have no more been
To a bad destination; for
I honoured the Master's monument> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

801. <I honoured once the monument of him that wore
The Marks of a Great Man that number thirty-two,
The Helper of the World, Victorious in Battle,
For which I have rejoiced a hundred thousand aeons.
Such was the merit that I stored away [thereby]
And such the godly blessing through that merit [gained]
That I had work of kings to do [for all that time]
Without once ever going to perdition. [Now]
My heart is so disposed that I obtained in full

*That Eye [of understanding] in the Dispensation
Of him that was the Tamer great of the untamed;
My heart is freed, and now the Creeper, has been shaken off>*
().

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

802. <It was but a samaka-measure of rice¹
That I gave to a Hermit Enlightened One,
Whose heart was freed from the five Wildernesses,²
Who, taintless, without conflict did abide,
And in his heart no clinging. I did fancy
In him to be the peerless True Ideal
And to that True Idea disposed my mind:
'O let me meet with those who thus abide,
Quite unconcerned for any kind of being.'
Then owing to the ripening of that action
I had a thousand births among the Kurus,³
Those long-lived creatures who call nothing 'mine',⁴
Who gain distinctions that they do not lose.
And owing to the ripening of that action
I had a thousand births among the Thirty,⁵
Among those with distinguished bodies going,
Famously decked with many a garland gay.
And owing to the ripening of that action
My heart is freed from the [five] Wildernesses,
Taintless, I met those bearing their last bodies,
[142] And who have passed beyond both woe and weal,⁶
I realized what that Perfect One had told:
'What men of virtue want may well befall,'
According as my mind did think it out
So it befell. This is my last existence> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

802/1 *NettiA* (p. 196) reads *sāmākapatthodanamattam* and expands to *sāmāka-tiñānam naḷik-odana-mattam*.

802/2 For the 'Wildernesses of the heart' (*ceto-khīla*) see *M. Sutta* 16.

802/3 '*Kurūsu*—among the Kurus' means here the Uttara-Kurū, said to inhabit the 'Northern Continent' of Uttara-Kuru.

802/4 '*Amama*—who call nothing "mine"': = *appariggaha* (*NettiA*).

802/5 *Tidasā*: variant name for *Tāvatisā*, 2nd of the 6 sensual-sphere heavens, governed by Sakka Ruler of Gods. See *Sn.* 679.

802/6 *NettiA* paraphrases *hitāhitāsihi* by *kusalākusale vitivattehi* (p. 196).

803. <Thirty-one aeons past the Blessed Victor
Sikhī lived, unperturbed, of infinite vision.
His brother was the king named Sikhāṇḍī,
Trusting the Buddha and the True Idea.
When that World-Guide attained complete extinction
The king built a tall stately monument,
One quarter-league around, to that great Sage,
That god of gods, that greatest of all men.
One day a man brought there an offering
And as he offered a wild-jasmine [spray],¹
One of its flowers fell² blown by the wind.
I picked it up and gave it back to him.
And thereupon he said with confident heart:
'This flower I do give you as a gift.'
I took it then and there and offered it,
Minding repeatedly the Enlightened One.
Today these thirty aeons have passed
And I since then have no more been
To a bad destination, through
That bloom placed on that monument> ().

'This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

804. <There is the town named Kapila
Belonging to king Brahmādatta
Frequented, populous and crowded,
Successful, prosperous as well.
Now there as I was selling bread¹
At the last house of the Pañcālas
[143] I saw the [Hermit] Enlightened One
Uparittha of holy fame.
Glad and with a confident heart
I did invite that best of men,
Arittha, for a regular meal
To be provided in my house.

803/1 C and Bb have (correctly) *jāṭisumanam* as one word (Ba does not divide its words mostly); not in PED, where see *sumanā*.

803/2 Read *pati tassa* as two words (*pati* here aor. of *patati*); *patitassa* as gen. pp. of *patati* makes no sense here.

804/1 *Kummāsa* is here rendered by 'bread' for want of a better word since in the Vin. Commentaries it is said to be made of wheat (*yava*), so it cannot well be 'junket' as in PED; perhaps 'chapatti' (or 'pasta').

And when the moon was waxen full
Later, in the Kattika month,²
I took out a new set of clothing
And to Arittha offered it
Knowing the confidence in my heart,
The best of men accepted it,
The Stilled One, cured of all craving,
By pity and compassion moved.
Now by my doing such good action
As the Enlightened Ones commend
I fared among both gods and men
Until I fell from that estate
To reappear in a rich clan
Inhabiting Benares city;
I was a banker's only son
More dear than any living being.
But when I had discretion reached
A god's son did exhort me then:
I left my mansion's [upper chamber]
And went to the Enlightened One.
He, Gotama, compassionate,
Did teach the True Idea to me:
Suffering, and its Origin,
And what Beyond all Suffering,
And the Noble Eight-Factored Path
That leads to suffering's surcease.
These four Truths of the Noble Ones,
This Stilled One's True Ideal, he taught.
When I had heard his utterance
I dwelt glad in the Dispensation;
I penetrated Quiet, besides,
By night and day unfailingly;
And all the taints that had in me

804/2 *Kattikā* is the 4th month of the Rains; it is also called the 'month for receiving robes' (*civara-māsa*). *PED* ascribes 5 months to the Rains (under *Kattikā*), but is that ever so? The three Indian seasons have each 4 lunar months, and when, every few years, an 'extra month' (*adhika-māsa*) is added in order to bring the seasons back into line with the solar year, it is added at the end of the Hot Season (*gimhāna*) as a 5th month, after *Āsaḥa*, the 4th month of that Season. The day on which the full moon falls (reckoning the day to begin at dawn) is the last day of the month.

*Objects without, within myself,
 Came once and for all to severance
 And nevermore did they arise
 Now suffering is ended [all];
 This is my final body, too;
 There is no further future being,
 Or roundabout of birth and death> ().*

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

[3]

805. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with penetration ?

*<Above, below, in every way released,
 And seeing not at all that 'I am this';
 Thus liberated, he has crossed the flood
 Not crossed before, for non-renewal of being>*
 (§352; Pe 24, 176).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

806. [144]<Ānanda, no virtuous man has to choose "How shall I have no remorse?"; for it is essential to the idea of the virtuous man that he has no remorse. No man without remorse has to choose "How shall I be glad?"; for it is essential to the idea of a man without remorse that he is glad. No man who is glad has to choose "How shall I be happy?"; for it is essential to the idea of a man who is glad that he is happy. No happy man has to choose "How will my body become tranquil?"; for it is essential to the idea of a happy man that his body is tranquil. No one tranquil in body has to choose "How shall I feel [bodily] pleasure?"; for it is essential to the idea of one tranquil in body that he feels [bodily] pleasure. No one [feeling bodily] pleasure has to choose "How shall I become concentrated?"; for it is essential to the idea of one [feeling bodily] pleasure that he is concentrated. No one who is concentrated has to choose "How shall I understand how [things] are?"; for it is essential to the idea of one who is concentrated that he understands how [things] are. No one who understands how [things] are has to choose thus "How shall I find dispassion?"; for it is essential to the idea of one who understands how [things] are that he finds dispassion. No one finding dispassion has to choose "How will lust fade in me?"; for it is essential to the idea of one finding dispassion that lust fades in him. No one in whom lust has faded

has to choose "How shall I be liberated?"; for it is essential to the idea of one in whom lust has faded that he is liberated. No one liberated has to choose "How shall I have knowledge and seeing of deliverance?"; for it is essential to the idea of one liberated that he has knowledge and seeing of deliverance> (cf. A. v, 2f.; cf. Pe 44, 182).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

807. [145] <When true ideas are manifest to him that lives
As one become divine by ardent meditation;
Then all his doubts do vanish since he understands
How each idea [arising] has its cause> (Ud. 2; Vin. i, 2).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

808. <When true ideas are manifest to him that lives
As one become divine by ardent meditation;
Then all his doubts do vanish since he understands
Exhaustion of conditions [for arising]> (Ud. 2; Vin. i, 2).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

809. <Why are you angry? Never be angry.
Non-anger, Tissa, should be your rule.
The Life Divine is lived for outguiding
Anger, conceit and contemptuousness> (S. ii, 282).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

810. <When shall I see Nanda a forest-dweller,
Wearer of robes made out of refuse-rags,
Gleaning his sustenance unrecognized
And unconcerned for sensual desires?> (S. ii, 281).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

811. <'One lies in bliss with what burnt out?'¹
One sorrows not with what burnt out?
Destruction of what one idea
Do you proclaim, O Gotama?
'One lies in bliss with anger burnt out
One sorrows not with anger burnt out.

*The Noble Ones commend destruction
Of anger, as the poison-root
With a sweet-tasting sprout; with that
Burnt out, Divine, one sorrows not*' > (S. i, 161; cf. S. i, 41).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

812. <*'What should, when once sprung up,¹ be killed ?
What should, when born, be guided out ?
What should the steadfast man reject ?
And what, when actualized, is bliss ?'*
[146] *'Anger should, when sprung up, be killed.
Lust should, when born, be guided out.
Ignorance steadfast men reject.
And actualizing truth is bliss'* > ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

813. <*'As pierced by a down-falling spear,
As though he had his head on fire,
A mindful bhikkhu sets about
Abandoning lust for sense desires.'*
*'As pierced by a down-falling spear,
As though he had his head on fire,
A mindful bhikkhu sets about
Abandoning embodiment-view'* > (S. i, 13, 53; Pe 48).¹

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

814. <*'The end of all stores is exhaustion,
The built-up ends by falling down,
None is there but must come to death,
And none has everlasting life.
So then, remembering this fear of death,
Make merit because merit bliss provides.'*

812/1 Reading *uppatitam* with C, Ba, Bb and *NettiA* instead of *uppatitam*.

813/1 *SA* (reproduced by *NettiA*) points out that the mistake made by the deity who utters the 1st statement is in fancying that mere abandoning of sensual desires by suppression (by meditation, or by rebirth in the higher heavens) without entirely severing them by purification of view is enough. And so the Buddha points out in his reply that it is wrong view that must be abandoned. The next question and answer (§814) are of the same sort.

*'The end of all stores is exhaustion,
The built-up ends by falling down,
None is there but must come to death,
And none has everlasting life.¹
So then, remembering this fear of death,
Leave worldly matters, look instead to peace' > ().*

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

815. *<It is the Stilled Ones lie in bliss,
They never sorrow, Māvidha,
Whose minds delight in meditations> ().
<He that is wise, well concentrated,
Energetic and self-controlled,
Crosses the flood so hard to cross,
Shunning percepts of sense-desires,
Gone beyond every kind of fetter,
With relish and being both exhausted,
He never founders in the deeps> (cf. S. i, 53).*

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

816. *<When he has faith in the True Idea
Whereby the Accomplished reach extinction,
Through wish to hear gains understanding,
Is diligent and has discretion,
[147] Does what is right, is loyal, alert,
He will experience its riches,
And truth will bring him a good name,
And giving ensures friends for him,
And when from this world to the next
He goes, he knows no sorrowing> (S. i, 214f.).*

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

817. *<'For you who have all this rejected
As a monk completely freed,*

814/1 Cf. *Udānavarga* I. 22 (Chakravarti edn., p. 4):

*sarve kṣayāntā nicayāḥ patanāntaḥ samucchrayāḥ
saṃyogā viprayogāntā maraṇāntaḥ ca jīvitāḥ*

(quoted Lamotte, *Hist. du Bouddhisme Indien*, p. 548, n. 21), and see *Mahāvastu* iii, p. 152, 183; *Divyāvadāna*, pp. 27, 100, 486. Cf. also *Dhp.* 148: *maranāntaḥ hi jīvitāḥ*.

*It is improper that you should
Impart instruction to another.
'Sakka, no matter how it is
Companionship may come about,
To let his mind be stirred by that
Befits no man of understanding.
But if, with mind clear-confident,
He should instruct another, then
He is by that in no way fettered¹
With any stirrings of emotion* > (S. i, 206).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

818. < *Lusting and hating have what for their source ?
Delight, boredom, horror: from what are they born ?
And where is the mould for the thoughts in the mind
Like to boys who would dangle a crow [on a string]?'
'Lusting and hating have this¹ for their source.
Delight, boredom, horror: from this they are born.
And this is the mould for the thoughts in the mind
Like to boys who would dangle a crow [on a string].
They are born and gain being from [sappy] affection
Like suckers that sprout from a banyan-tree stump;
And attached far and wide among sensual desires
Like a wood tented over with maluwa-creeper.
When men understand it and wherefrom it sources
They put it away. And now listen, O spirit:
'Tis they that cross over the flood hard to cross,
Not crossed before, for non-renewal of being* > (Sn. 270-3).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

819. [148] < *O Blessed One 'tis hard to do; O Blessed One 'tis very
hard to do !'
'Yet¹ what is hard to do Initiates do,
Kāmada' the Blessed One said,
'Through virtue concentrated, steady in themselves,*

817/1 Cf. the '3 *satipaṭṭhānā*' at M. iii, 221 for this equanimity towards pupils.

818/1 'This' means 'this personality' (NettiA 200).

819/1 Read in each case '*vāpi*' and resolve into *eva api*. The name '*kāmada*' means 'given to sensual-desire'.

Content brings bliss to one in homelessness.'
'O Blessed One, 'tis hard to gain content !'
'Yet what is hard to gain they yet do gain,
Kāmada' the Blessed One said,
'Whom peaceful cognizance delights, whose minds
Delight to keep it day and night in being.'
'O Blessed One, 'tis hard to concentrate !'
'They concentrate the hard-to-concentrate,
Kāmada' the Blessed One said,
'Whom having faculties at peace delights,
Who cut the net Mortality has made
And thereby go ennobled, Kāmada.'
'O Blessed One, hard going the uneven way !'
'Yet, Kāmada, the ennobled go where going
Is hard, uneven. While ignoble ones
On paths uneven fall head-over-heels,
For those ennobled that same path is even,
Since they are even in unevenness' > (S. i, 48).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

820. <O healing Jeta's Wood, frequented
 By the community of Seers,
 Where lives the True Idea's own king,
 The fount of all my happiness.
 By acts, by science, by the True Idea,
 By virtue, the sublimest life,
 By these are mortals purified
 And not by lineage or riches.
 A wise man, therefore, when he sees
 His own good should investigate
 The True Idea in reasoned way,
 That there he may be purified.
 Sāriputta is first of all
 In virtue, understanding, peace:
 At best a bhikkhu who has gone
 Across can only equal him > (M. iii, 262; S. i, 33).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

821. <Let not a man trace back the past
 Or wonder what the future holds:
 The past is . . . but the left-behind,

The future . . . but the yet-unreached.

[149] *Rather, with insight let him see*

Each idea presently-arisen:

To know and to be sure of that

Invincibly, unshakably.

Today the effort must be made:

Tomorrow death may come, who knows ?

No bargain¹ with Mortality

Can keep him and his hordes away.

But one who bides thus ardently,

Relentlessly, by day, by night,

'Tis he, the Hermit Stilled has said,²

That 'has One Fortunate Attachment' >³ (M. iii, 187).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

821/1 Read (as in *M.* text) *sangaram tena* instead of *sankar'antena*.

821/2 The grammar of this line is: *santo muni tam vā 'bhaddekaratto' ti ācikkhati*. *Santo muni* (= a Buddha) is subject of verb *ācikkhati* and *tam* (= *bhaddekaratto*: its object).

821/3 It is not clear precisely what *bhaddekaratta* (the name of 4 successive Suttas in the *Majjhima Nikāya*) means. *NettiA* (p. 203) says '*Evam pati-pannattā bhaddo ekaratto assā ti bhaddekaratto*' (= *MA.* v, 3). *MAA* adds '*Ekā ratti ekaratto, bhaddo ekaratto etassā ti bhaddekarattam vipassanam paribrahento puggalo; eten'āha "vipassanānuyogasamannāgatattā" (MA. v, 1). Tam uddissa pavattiyā pana bhaddekarattasahacaranato bhaddekaratto; ten'āha bhagavā "Bhaddekarattassa vo bhikkhave uddesañ ca vibhangañ ca desissāmi"* (*M.* iii, 187) *ti* (*MAA.* iii, 368, Burm. ed.). *Netti Tīkā* offers nothing. The only other mention, referring to these 4 Suttas, is at *NdI.* 484, namely '*bhaddekrattavihāram*' in an explanation of '*jāgariyānuyogapariyanto*'. The *NdA* has nothing enlightening. All these comments seem to take the *ratt* element as representing *ratti* ('night' = Skr. *rātri*), and so the literal translation would then be 'one who has an auspicious one (i.e., entire) night' (i.e., 'the night spent as one entirely in insight') and the Burmese transcript of the *Majjhima Nikāya* gives the same sense to '*bhaddekaratta*' as to '*ahorattam*' ('by day, by night') two lines higher. But these explanations are all grammatical and avoid the meaning. The term night—it has been suggested, but this is entirely speculative—have been a popular one for, say, the Hindu *Śivarātri* (the last night of the waning moon, and devoted by Brahmans to meditation), which was purposely given a new sense here by the Buddha, as he did with many other current terms. (*Ekarattivāso* at *Sn.* 19 has apparently no connection with this, being simply the opposite of *samānavāso* at *Sn.* 18.) An alternative derivation might be that *ratt* stands for *ratto* or *ratti* from *√rañj* 'to desire to lust': cf. *dhamma-rāga* (*A.* iv, 423) or *tathāgatārañjita* (§59); cf. the 'profitable craving' and 'profitable conceit' (§§506-7), though there is apparently no example of *ratti* from this root in Pali (cf. Skr. *rakti*). This interpretation has been adopted in the translation here as more trenchant

822. <Bhikkhus, there are these four verifiabiles. What four? (1) There are ideas verifiable by the eye and by understanding. (2) There are ideas verifiable by mindfulness and by understanding. (3) There are ideas verifiable by the body and by understanding. (4) There are ideas experienceable through understanding and verifiable by understanding. (1) What ideas are verifiable by the eye and by understanding? The heavenly eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, is verifiable by the eye and by understanding. (2) What ideas are verifiable by mindfulness and by understanding? The recollection of past life is verifiable by mindfulness and by understanding. (3) What ideas are verifiable by the body and by understanding? The power of supernormal success, and cessation, are verifiable by the body and by understanding. (4) What ideas are experienceable through understanding and verifiable by understanding? The knowledge of exhaustion of taints is experienceable through understanding and verifiable by understanding> (cf. A. ii, 182f.).

This is the type of Thread dealing with penetration.

[4]

823. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept?

<Whose cognizance is steady as a rock
And never can be made to shudder,
Is free from lust and lust-provoking things
Untroubled too by any trouble;
Whose cognizance is thus maintained in being,
How then shall suffering come to him?>

(Ud. 41; Pe 24-5, 190).

[150] This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

824. Also the tenth(?) prose-exposition of the venerable Sāriputta's [in reply to a certain bhikkhu's accusation that after insulting him he was going] wandering [without apologizing] can be quoted (A. iv, 373-8; Pe 25, 195).¹

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

(i.e., 'attachment' to insight, which leads to non-attachment), though neither seems quite safe, and the meaning remains unsettled.

824/1 *NettiA* and *Tikā* ignore. This reference is taken up from Pe 25 and 195, which establishes the *Anguttara* ref. In the A. text, since there are 9, not 10, paras to the *Sihanāda*, it is not clear what 'tenth' (*dasamaṃ*) means here. Cf. also story in *DhA. ad Dh. 95*.

825. <When a divine excludes ideas of evil,
*Eschews 'ha-hum',¹ is unsoiled, self-controlled,
 And, perfect in science, lives the life divine,
 Then he might use the word 'divine' by right
 As one who has no favourites in the world*>
 (Ud. 3; Vin. i, 3).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

826. <Enlightened Ones with fetters none,
*Excluding all ideas of evil
 Walking always in mindfulness:
 They are divine ones in the world*> (Ud. 4).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

827. <Where neither water nor yet earth
*Nor fire nor air a footing finds,
 There the white [stars] never shine,
 There no sun's orb is displayed,
 There no full moon ever beams,
 There no darkness can be found.
 When he knows this for himself,
 The Stilled One made divine by stillness,
 Then he is free from form and formless,
 And [free] from pain and pleasure too*> (Ud. 9).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

828. <'When a divine has reached the further shore
*Concerning all ideas that are his own,
 Then [it is certain that] he has outstripped
 This goblin with his shouts of 'Pakkula!'*> (Ud. 5).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

829. <He had no relish for her coming,
*And had no sorrow when she left,
 Sangāmajī is freed from clinging (sanga)
 As one, I say, become divine*> (Ud. 6).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

825/1 'Huhunkajātiko brāhmaṇo' is commented on as 'one who says "hum, hum" out of pride', and 'nihuhunko' means without that.

830. [151] <Purity comes not through water;
Many people wash in that.
In whom are Truth and True Idea,
He is pure, he is divine> (Ud. 6).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

831. <When true ideas are manifest to him that lives
As one become divine by ardent meditation,
Then where he stands he scatters Māra's [serried] hosts
As the sun's orb illuminates the firmament> (Ud. 2; Vin. i, 2).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

832. <See how he goes with faculties [all] quieted,
He has the Triple Science, naught [remains]
For his abandoning, all bonds outstripped,
He with no owning goes, wears refuse-rags.
And many a mighty deity draws near
To that [great] thoroughbred, designed divinely,¹
Who did reject the lineage power, and they
Pay homage to him here² with confident minds:
'Honour to thee,³ Man-thoroughbred, First among men,
Whose meditation's field we do not know> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

833. <Indeed, bhikkhus, these [two] companions [here]
For very long have been together meeting,¹
And the true object of their faith is met
In the Ideal the Enlightened One proclaimed.
By Kappina they were well guided out
In the Ideal proclaimed by Noble Ones,

832/1 'Vimāna' here in 'brahma-vimānaṃ' does not seem to be in any of the ordinary senses. *NettiA* ignores.

832/2 'N-idha' presumably stands for *naṃ idha*. *C* reads *nidham*.

832/3 Reading with *C* and *Bb yassa te nābhijānāma*, the expression *yassa te* being a doubled pronoun, cf. *so' haṃ, tassa me*, etc.

833/1 'Sametikā (adj.)—meeting together (going together)': *PED* gives only one ref., namely 'Sn. 285' in error for *S. ii, 285* (= this ref.), and, giving no reason, substitutes *samāhitā*; but all texts and *NettiA* confirm *sametikā*, which both fits the context and makes sense of the word-play with *sameti* ('is met') in the next line.

*And now for the last time they bear a body,
After conquering Māra with his mount* > (S. ii, 285).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

834. <*Extinction giving freedom from all ties,
In no case can that ever be arrived at
Either with weakness as the instigation
Or yet through insufficient fortitude.*
[152] *And this young bhikkhu [here has now attained]
The state that is foremost among mankind
Since now he bears for the last time a body,
After conquering Māra with his mount* > (S. ii, 278).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

835. <*Mogharāja the unsightly,
Coarse robes wearing, ever mindful,
Taints exhausted, rid of fetters,
Task completed, rid of taints,
With Triple Science, Magic Powers,
Skill in penetrating hearts;
And now for the last time he bears a body,
After conquering Māra with his mount* > ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

836. <'Bhikkhus, a Perfect One, accomplished and fully enlightened, who is liberated owing to dispassion, fading of lust, cessation, and non-arising, in the case of form, is called a "Fully Enlightened One", [and] a bhikkhu liberated through understanding,¹ who is liberated owing to dispassion, fading of lust, cessation, and non-arising, in the case of form, is called "liberated through understanding" . . . [similar paragraphs for] feeling . . . perception . . . determinations . . . consciousness . . . Herein, what is a distinction, what is a difference, what is a variance, between a Perfect One, accomplished and fully enlightened, and a bhikkhu liberated through understanding?'—'Venerable sir, our ideas are rooted in the Blessed One, [the Blessed One is their guide and their home. It is good that the meaning of these words should occur to the Blessed One. Having heard it from the Blessed One, the bhikkhus will remember it.]—'Then listen, bhikkhus, and attend

carefully to what I shall say.'—'Even so, venerable sir' they replied. The Blessed One said this:]—'Bhikkhus, a Perfect One, accomplished and fully enlightened, is the arouser of the unarisen path, the producer of the unproduced path, the declarer of the undeclared path, path-knower, path-seer, and skilled in the path. But now when his hearers become possessed of the path by abiding in conformity therewith, they do so following after him. This is a distinction, this is a difference, this is a variance, between a Perfect One, accomplished and fully enlightened, and a bhikkhu liberated through understanding' (S. iii, 65f.).

This is the type of Thread dealing with the Adept.

[5]

837. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with corruption and dealing with morality?

[153] <Rain soddens what is covered up,

But what is open it soddens not.

So open out the covered up,

That rain may never sadden you> (Ud. 56; Pe 25, 202).

'Rain soddens what is covered up' is corruption. 'But what is open it soddens not' is morality. 'So open out the covered up That rain may never sadden you' is corruption and morality. This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption and dealing with morality.

838. <Great king, there are these four kinds of persons to be found in the world. What four? Dark with a dark supreme value, dark with a bright supreme value, bright with a dark supreme value, bright with a bright supreme value> (A. ii, 85; S. i, 93; Pe 25, 207).

Herein the two kinds, the person called 'bright with a dark supreme value' and the person called 'dark with a dark supreme value', deal with corruption, while the two kinds, the person called 'dark with a bright supreme value' and the person called 'bright with a bright supreme value', deal with morality. This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption and dealing with morality.

[6]

839. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with corruption and dealing with penetration ?

*<The steadfast will never call that a strong bond
Made of iron or consisting of wood or of thongs.
But greed flushed with lusting for jewels [and gems]
And concern for a wife and for children as well,>*

(§§ 194-5; Pe 25, 214),

is corruption, while

*<'Tis these that the steadfast will call a strong bond,
Which pulls a man down, subtle, hard to get free from;
But this too they sever, and wander [in freedom],
Unconcerned, and [all] sensual desires foregone>*

(§§ 194-5; Pe 25, 214),

is penetration.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption
and dealing with penetration.

840. *<Whatever one chooses, and whatever one asserts,¹ and whatever one lets tendencies underlie, that becomes the object whereby consciousness has a steadying-point. It is when there is an object that consciousness has a standing-point. When consciousness with a standing-point [154] has developed thereon, then renewal of being is made to occur in the future, then birth, ageing and death, sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief, and despair, have actual being in the future. That is how there is an origin to this whole category of suffering. If one does not choose and if one does not assert, but still one lets tendencies underlie, that becomes the object whereby consciousness has a steadying-point. It is when there is an object that consciousness has a standing-*

840/1 *Pakappati* here means 'to assert' or sponsor one side (of a dialectic; cf. *anuruddha* and *paṭiviruddha* at *M.* i, 65; the word *vikappana* represents the either/or of a dialectic inviting taking one side. The three terms *ceteti*, *pakappeti* and *anuseti* here rendered by 'chooses', 'asserts' and 'allows tendencies to underlie' could be (psychologically) paraphrased as follows: He makes an initial choice (based on an assumption), he asserts that choice in his behaviour by either affirmation or denial (acceptance or rejection of the idea assumed), he allows the initial choice with its assumption to lapse below the threshold of awareness whence it continues to influence his behaviour without his understanding why (and colours his subsequent choice, assertion and underlying tendencies).

point. When consciousness with a standing-point has developed thereon, renewal of being is made to occur in the future. When renewal of being is made to occur in the future, then birth, ageing and death, sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair, have actual being in the future. That is how there is an origin to this whole category of suffering> (S. ii, 65; Pe 25, 218). This is corruption.

<[But] as soon as one no more chooses and one no more asserts and one no more lets tendencies underlie, then there is no object whereby consciousness might have a steadying-point. It is when there is no object that consciousness has no standing-point. When consciousness, having no standing-point, thereon develops no more, then no renewal of being is made to occur in the future. When no renewal of being is made to occur in the future, then birth, ageing and death, sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair, cease in the future. That is how there is a cessation to this whole category of suffering> (S. ii, 65f.; Pe 218).²

This is penetration.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption
and dealing with penetration.

[7]

841. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with corruption and dealing with the Adept?

<'Bhikkhus, the untaught ordinary man says "sea, sea", yet that vast mass of water, that vast expanse of water is no sea in the Noble Ones' Outguiding (Discipline). The eye is man's sea, whose tide is forms'> (S. iv, 157).

This is corruption.

<'Whoever overcomes that tide of forms, of him it is said: He has crossed the sea of the eye, with its waves, its whirlpools, its monsters [155] and its ogres; he has crossed over, gone to the further shore, and he stands upon firm ground, as one divine'> (S. iv, 157).

This is the Adept.

<'The ear is man's sea . . . The nose . . . The tongue . . . The body . . . The mind is man's sea, whose tide is ideas'> (S. iv, 157).

This is corruption.

<'Whoever overcomes that tide of ideas, of him it is said: He has crossed the sea of the mind, with its waves, its whirlpools, its monsters and its ogres; he has gone to the further shore, and he stands upon firm ground as one divine'> (S. iv, 157).

This is the Adept.

<That is what the Blessed One said. The Sublime One having said that, he, the Master, said further:

'Who crossed the sea with all its monsters, ogres, waves,
Fearfully hard to cross, of him it can be said:
He found the end of science; he lived the life divine;
The world's end he has found, gone to the further shore>

(S. iv, 157).

This is the Adept.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption
and dealing with the Adept.

842. <Bhikkhus, there are these six kinds of bait in the world for the guiding of creatures astray, for the affliction¹ of breathing things. What are the six? There are forms cognizable through the eye that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desire and productive of lust. If a bhikkhu relishes and affirms them and steadily cleaves to them, then it is said of him: He has swallowed Māra's bait, he has let himself be guided astray, he is heading for ruin, he is one whom the Evil One can do as he will with. There are sounds cognizable through the ear . . . odours cognizable through the nose . . . flavours cognizable through the tongue . . . tangibles cognizable through the body . . . There are ideas cognizable through the mind that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desire and productive of lust. If a bhikkhu [156] relishes and affirms them and steadily cleaves to them, then it is said of him: He has swallowed Māra's bait, he has let himself to be guided astray, he is heading for ruin, he is one whom the Evil One can do as he will with> (S. iv, 159).

This is corruption.

<Again, there are forms cognizable through the eye that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desire and productive of lust. If a bhikkhu does not relish or affirm them or steadily cleave to them, then it is said of him: He has not swallowed

Māra's bait, he has destroyed the bait, he has quite destroyed the bait, he has not let himself be guided astray, he is not one whom the Evil One can do as he will with. Again, there are sounds cognizable through the ear . . . odours cognizable through the nose . . . flavours cognizable through the tongue . . . tangibles cognizable through the body . . . There are ideas cognizable through the mind that are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable, connected with sensual desire and productive of lust. If a bhikkhu does not relish or affirm them or steadily cleave to them, then it is said of him: He has not swallowed Māra's bait, he has destroyed the bait, he has quite destroyed the bait, he has not let himself be led astray, he is not heading for ruin, he is not one whom the Evil One can do as he will with > (S. iv, 159).

This is the Adept.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption
and dealing with the adept.

[8]

843. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with corruption, dealing with penetration and dealing with the Adept ?

This world¹ is born to anguish, and subject to [painful] contact;

<It is a sickness² that it calls self;

For however it conceives [it],³

'Tis [ever] other than that.

Maintaining its being otherwise [than it conceives],⁴

The world clings to being, expectantly relishes only being.

[But] what it relishes brings fear,

And what it fears is pain > (Ud. 32-3; Pe 26, 223).

This is corruption.

843/1 The readings here seem preferable to those in the *PTS Udāna* text. The whole passage is of much ontological interest. It is very difficult to render adequately.

843/2 *Rodam* (with *attano*), if accepted as right, would be ppr. nom. masc. sing. agreeing with *loko* ('Weeping it speaks of itself'). The alternative is *rogam* ('sickness'), which would be acc. masc. sing. governed by *vadati* (with *attato*), and this has been taken in the rendering. The *Pe* text (p. 224) shows plainly that its author had only the reading *rogam*; *UdA* agrees.

843/3 For the meaning of *maññati* ('to conceive (conceits)') see *M. Sutta* 1 and *S. iii*, 128-32 (for its relation to *māna* ('conceit') as *asmi-māna* ('the conceit "I am"')).

843/4 *Pe* (p. 224) says, though, that *aññathābhāvī* (so read there for '*maññathā bhavam*') means 'while existing, it aspires to future existence'.

<Now this divine life is lived to abandon being> (Ibid.).

This is penetration.

[157] <Whatever monks and divines have declared liberation from being [to come about] through [some kind of] being, none of them, I say, are liberated from being. And whatever monks or divines have declared escape from being [to come about] through non-being,⁵ none of them, I say, escape from being. It is by depending on (by asserting) the essentials of existence that this suffering has actual being:> (Ibid.).

This is corruption.

<With exhaustion of all kinds of assumption, suffering has no actual being> (Ibid.).

This is penetration.

<See this wide world subjected to ignorance,
Which is, which delights to be, never freed from being:
[Yet] whatever the kinds of being, in any way, anywhere,
All are impermanent, pain[-haunted], inseparable from the idea
of change> (Ibid.).

This is corruption.

< So when a man sees thus
With right understanding how it is,
[His]craving for being is abandoned,
And he no more expectantly relishes non-being.
That is the utter exhaustion of all craving,
That is the remainderless fading, cessation, that is extinction>
(Ibid.).

This is penetration.

<That bhikkhu being quenched through not assuming,
No more his being comes to a renewal.
Transcended is Death's being,⁶ the battle won,
One such as this outstrips all [modes of] being> (Ibid.).

This is the Adept.

843/5 *Vibhava* (lit. perhaps 'out-being') has the opposite senses of 'out-standing being' and 'non-being', the prefix *vi-* (= 'out') having both augmentative and privative senses (compare the English 'put out the flags' and 'put out the lights'). The term *bhavābhava* has a similar double sense (see n. 877/1).

843/6 *Abhihūta* lit 'overbeen'; cf. *abhihū* ('Supreme Being', 'Transcendent Being') as used of the High Divinity (*D.* i, 221) and the Buddha (§§252, 917; *M.* i, 171), and *abhihāyatana* ('base for transcendence', i.e., of sensual desire: *M.* ii, 13), etc.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption, dealing with penetration and dealing with the Adept.

844. <Bhikkhus, there are these four kinds of persons. What four? One goes with the stream, one goes against the stream, one has steadied himself, and one has crossed over, gone to the further shore, and stands on firm ground as one divine> (A. ii, 5; Pe 28, 228).¹

Herein, the person who 'goes with the stream' is the [type of Thread] dealing with corruption. Herein the two persons, namely the one who 'goes against the stream' and the one who 'has steadied himself', are that dealing with penetration. [158] Herein, the person who 'has crossed over, gone to the further shore and stands on firm ground as one divine', is that dealing with the Adept.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption, dealing with penetration and dealing with the Adept.

[9]

845. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with corruption, dealing with morality and dealing with penetration?

<There are six kinds of giving birth. There is the black person given birth by blackness who gives birth to a black ideal. There is the black person given birth by blackness who gives birth to a white ideal. There is the black person given birth by blackness who is interested in extinction as the infinite goal, not black, not white, and with no ripening black or white. There is the white person given birth by whiteness who gives birth to a black ideal. There is the white person given birth by whiteness who gives birth to a white ideal. There is the white person given birth by whiteness who is interested in extinction as the infinite goal not black, not white, and with no ripening black or white> (cf. A. iii, 384).

Herein, the two persons, namely the 'black person given birth by blackness who gives birth to a black ideal' and the 'white person given birth by whiteness who gives birth to a black ideal', are that dealing with corruption. Herein, the two persons, namely the 'black person given birth by blackness who gives birth to a white ideal' and the 'white person given birth by whiteness who gives

844/1 According to *NettiA* (p. 209) 1 = the 'ordinary man', 2 = the 'good ordinary man' (*kalyāṇa-puthujjana*) i.e., one practising who has not reached the 1st Path), 3 = the Initiate, and 4 = the Adept.

birth to a white ideal', are that dealing with morality. Herein, the two persons, namely the 'black person given birth by blackness who is interested in extinction as the infinite goal, not black, not white' and with no ripening black or white' and the 'white person given birth by whiteness who is interested in extinction as the infinite goal, not black, not white, with no ripening black or white', are that dealing with penetration.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption, dealing with morality and dealing with penetration.

846. <Bhikkhus, there these four kinds of action. What four? [159] There is black action with black ripening. There is white action with white ripening. There is black-white action with black-white ripening. There is not-black-not-white action with not-black-not-white ripening, which is the supreme kind of action, the best kind of action, which conduces to the exhaustion of action> (A. ii, 230).

Herein, any 'black action with black ripening' and any 'black-white action with black-white ripening' are corruption. Any 'white action with white ripening' is morality. Any 'not-black-not-white action with not-black-not-white ripening, which is the supreme kind of action, the best kind of action, which conduces to the exhaustion of action', is penetration.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption, dealing with morality and dealing with penetration.

[10]

847. Herein, what is the type of Thread dealing with morality and dealing with penetration?

<After obtaining the human state, two [things]:

What is the task and what is not the task.

The proper task is 'any kind of merit,

And then abandoning of [all] the fetters> (; §866).

'The proper task is any kind of merit' is morality. 'The abandoning of [all] the fetters' is penetration.

<Those who by meritorious performance

Have merit made pass on from heaven to heaven.

But those who have abandoned [all] the fetters

Are liberated from old age and death> (; §866).

'Those who by meritorious performance Have merit made pass on from heaven to heaven' is morality. 'But those who have abandoned [all] the fetters Are liberated from old age and death' is penetration.

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality
and dealing with penetration.

848. <Bhikkhus, there are these two principal endeavours.¹ What two? (i) That which gives away robes, alms-food, lodging, and requisite of medicine as cure for the sick [by distribution] among those gone forth from the house-life into homelessness; and (ii) that which is the relinquishment of all essentials of existence, exhaustion of craving, fading out, cessation, extinction, [to be found] among those who have gone forth from the house-life into homelessness> (cf. A. i, 49).

[160] Herein, 'that which gives away robes . . . cure for the sick among those . . . into homelessness' is morality. 'That which is the relinquishment of all essentials of existence . . . extinction, [to be found] among those . . . into homelessness' is penetration.

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality and dealing with penetration.

[11]

849. Herein, the type of Thread dealing with corruption by craving can be demonstrated by whatever is on the side of craving: by the three kinds of craving, namely <craving for sensual desire, craving for being, and craving for non-being> (§425), or it can be demonstrated by whatever is the thing cleaved to. Its detail is the thirty-six ways of behaviour of the net of craving (see A. ii, 211 ff.).

[12]

850. Herein, the type of Thread dealing with corruption by views can be demonstrated by whatever is on the side of views: by annihilationism and eternalism (cf. S. iv, 400), or it can be demonstrated by whatever object anyone insists on by means of a view thus <Only this is truth, anything else is wrong> (M. ii, 233; D. ii, 282). Its detail is the sixty-two types of view (D. Sutta 1; M. Sutta 102).¹

848/1 *Padhāna* means both 'foremost' ('principal') and 'endeavour'.

850/1 The '62 types' are to be taken, not as individual views expounded by

[13]

851. Herein, the type of Thread dealing with corruption by misconduct can be demonstrated by [action as] choice and by action as concomitant of cognizance (§239): by the three kinds of misconduct, namely bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct (§913). Its detail is the ten unprofitable courses of action (*M.* i, 46-7; cf. §238).

[14-16]

852. Herein, the type of Thread dealing with cleansing from craving can be demonstrated by quiet.

853. The type of Thread dealing with cleansing from views can be demonstrated by insight.

854. The type of Thread dealing with cleansing from misconduct can be demonstrated by good conduct.

[Discussion]

855. <Three roots of the unprofitable . . . why is that? For the occurrence of the roundabout . . . When the roundabout is made to occur thus, [there is] misconduct of body . . . good conduct of body . . . misconduct of speech . . . good conduct of speech . . . misconduct of mind . . . good conduct of mind . . . It is by this ugly ripening of action that this characteristic of the fool is made to occur> ().

[161] This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption. <It is by this beautiful ripening of action that this characteristic of the Great Man is made to occur> ().

This is the type of Thread dealing with morality.

856. Herein, the type of Thread dealing with corruption can be demonstrated by the four planes of defilement: by the plane of underlying tendencies, by the plane of obsessions, by the plane of fetters, and by the plane of the kinds of assumption. In one who has an underlying tendency an obsession is born; one who is obsessed is fettered; when he is fettered, he assumes; with assuming as condition, being; with being as condition, birth; with birth as

teachers contemporary with the Buddha, but as a comprehensive scheme—the 'Divine Net' (*Brahma-jāla*) in which all possible speculative views must be caught.

condition, ageing and death have actual being and also sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair; that is how there is an origin to this whole category of suffering. All defilements are included and comprised by these four planes of defilement.

This is the type of Thread dealing with corruption.

857. The type of Thread dealing with morality can be demonstrated by the three kinds of good conduct.

858. The type of Thread dealing with penetration can be demonstrated by the four truths.

859. The type of Thread dealing with the Adept can be demonstrated by the three kinds of ideas: by ideas of Enlightened Ones, by ideas of Hermit Enlightened Ones, and by the plane of the hearer in the province of the meditator.

*

[Second Grouping]

860. Herein, what [of the] eighteen Root-Terms ?¹

[Schedule]

- i. (a) Belonging to worlds, (b) disjoined from worlds, (c) belonging to worlds and disjoined from worlds (*Pe* 23, no. 1);
- ii. (a) expressed in terms of creatures, (b) expressed in terms of ideas, (c) expressed in terms of creatures and in terms of ideas (*Pe* 23, no. 8);
- iii. (a) knowledge, (b) the knowable, (c) knowledge and the knowable (*Pe* 23, no. 4);
- iv. (a) seeing, (b) keeping-in-being, (c) seeing and keeping-in-being (*Pe* 23, no. 5);
- v. (a) our own statement, (b) someone else's statement, (c) our own statement and someone else's statement (*Pe* 23, no. 7);
- vi. (a) the answerable, (b) the unanswerable, (c) the answerable and unanswerable;²
- vii. (a) action, (b) ripening, (c) action and ripening (*Pe* 23, no. 2);

860/1 See *NettiA* quoted in n. 759/1. This Grouping, while drawn from *Pe* ch. ii, is nevertheless altered, simplified and improved.

860/2 This triad is not in *Pe* ch. ii and seems to be drawn from the 3rd section of *Pe* ch. iv (*Pe* 78, line 23 to p. 79, line 22).

- viii. (a) the profitable, (b) the unprofitable, (c) the profitable and unprofitable;³
 ix. (a) the agreed, (b) the refused, (c) the agreed and refused (*Pe* 23, no. 10);
 x. Eulogy (cf. *Pe* 23, no. 9).

[*Illustrative Quotations*]

[i (a)]

861. Herein, what is that belonging to worlds ?

<For evil action when performed,
 Like new milk, does not turn at once,¹
 It follows, like a lurking spark,
 The fool, burning him [later on]> (*Dh.* 71; *Pe* 48).

[162] This is that belonging to worlds.

862. <*Bhikkhus*, there are these four kinds of goings on a bad way.
 Which four ? . . . [all as in §767 down to] . . .

As in its dark half does the moon> (§767).

This is that belonging to worlds.

863. <*Bhikkhus*, there are these eight worldly ideas. What eight ?
 Gain, non-gain, fame, ill-fame, blame, praise, pleasure, pain. These
 eight worldly ideas> (*A.* iv, 157).

This is that belonging to worlds.

[i (b)]

864. Herein, what is that disjoined from worlds ?

<Whose faculties are well and truly quieted,
 Like horses by a charioteer well trained,
 With [all] conceit abandoned in him, taintless,
 Then even to the gods he will be dear> (*Dh.* 94; *Pe* 48).

This is that disjoined from worlds.

860/3 This triad is likewise not in *Pe* ch. ii, and seems to be drawn from the 1st section of *Pe* ch. iv (*Pe* p. 74, line 1 to p. 77, line 16, word *desitam*).

861/1 The commentary has been followed. *Muccati* is glossed there by *parinamati*, and it is explained how new milk does not curdle at once (cf. the milk-curd simile at §453). The negative *na* at the beginning of the verse must govern the simile as well, which then fits neatly. *Dahantam* (one word) is glossed by *vipaccamānam* as a nom. neut. sing. ppr. qualifying *kammam*.

865. <Bhikkhus, there are these five faculties disjoined from worlds. What five? The faith faculty, the energy faculty, the mindfulness faculty, the concentration faculty, the understanding faculty. These five faculties disjoined from worlds> (S. v, 193).

This is that disjoined from worlds.

[i (c)]

866. Herein, what is that belonging to worlds and disjoined from worlds? The two verses [beginning]

<After obtaining the human state, two things: . . . (S847).

Here [the words] 'the proper task is any kind of merit' and 'those who by meritorious performance Have merit made pass on from heaven to heaven' belong to worlds. But [the words] 'And then abandoning of [all] the fetters' and 'But those who have abandoned [all] the fetters Are liberated from old age and death' are disjoined from worlds.

This is that belonging to worlds and disjoined from worlds.

867. [163] <Bhikkhus, when there is consciousness as nutriment there is the finding of a footing for name-and-form. When there is the finding of a footing for name-and-form there is renewal of being. When there is renewal of being there is birth. When there is birth, then ageing and death have actual being, and also sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief and despair; that is how there is an origin to this whole category of suffering (cf. §304). Suppose there were a great tree whose roots, whether they went downward or around, all brought up nourishment, then in that way, with that nutriment, with that assuming, the great tree would long remain,¹ so too, when there is consciousness as nutriment there is the finding of a footing for name-and-form . . . That is how there is an origin to this whole category of suffering> ().

This belongs to worlds.

<Bhikkhus, when there is no consciousness as nutriment there is no finding of a footing for name-and-form. When there is no finding of a footing for name-and-form there is no renewal of being. When there is no renewal of being, then ageing and death cease, and also sorrow and lamentation, pain, grief, and despair; that is how there is

a cessation to this whole category of suffering. Suppose there were a great tree, and then a man came with a spade and a basket, and he cut down the tree and then he dug all round it, and then he pulled up the roots even to the very fibres,² and then he cut it up bole and branch, and then he split it, and then he chopped it, and then he dried it in the sun, and then he burnt it in a fire, and then he reduced it to ash,³ and then he winnowed it in a high wind, and then he let a swift-flowing river wash it away; in that way the great tree would be cut off at the root, made like a palm-stump, done away with, and no more inseparable from the idea of future arising;—so too, when there is no consciousness as nutriment [164] there is no finding a footing for name-and-form . . . that is how there is a cessation to this whole category of suffering> ().

This is disjoined from worlds.

This is that belonging to worlds and disjoined from worlds.

[ii (a)]

868. Herein, what is that expressed in terms of creatures ?

<I visited all quarters with my mind
Nor found I any dearer than myself;
Likewise is self to every other dear,
Who loves himself will never harm another> (Ud. 47).

This is expressed in terms of creatures.

869. <All beings there are, and that will come to be,
Will travel on, abandoning their bodies;
A man with skill in births, knowing all that,
Would lead the life divine most ardently> (Ud. 48; cf. Pe 55).

This is expressed in terms of creatures.

870. <'Bhikkhus, when a good friend possesses seven factors he should never be rejected by one as long as life lasts, even if one is sent away and dismissed, even if one is driven away.¹ What seven? He is endearing, venerable and emulatable,² he is willing to talk to one and

867/2 'Usīra—fibres': meaning in PED does not fit here. See Vin. iv, 130.

867/3 Read *masīm* for *maṃsīm*.

870/1 Read *panujjamānena* ? For someone who should not be abandoned, see M. i, 108: *na pakkamitabbam api panujjamānena pi*.

870/2 *Bhāvanīya*, a praise-word for persons, is very hard to render except loosely; lit. 'one who should be made to be'. Nettī4 says 'Uttarimanussa-dhamavasena sambhāvetabbatāya', which suggests 'to be respected'.

willing for one to talk with him, and he never exhorts groundlessly [in a manner not in conformity with the True Idea and Outguiding Discipline]. When a good friend possesses these seven factors . . . even if driven away.' That is what the Blessed One said. When the Sublime One had said this, he, the Master, said further:

'Dear, venerable, to be emulated,
Who talks to one, and can be talked with, too,
Is willing to explain what is profound,
And never gives a groundless exhortation:
A friend like that may well be served for life
By one who is desirous of a friend> (cf. A. iv, 32).

This is expressed in terms of creatures.

[ii (b)]

871. [165] Herein, what is that expressed in terms of ideas ?

<Whatever bliss in sense desires
Or bliss of heaven in the world,
All are not worth a sixteenth part
Of bliss that comes with craving's exhaustion> (Ud. 11; Pe 55).

This is expressed in terms of ideas.

872. <Extinction is true bliss indeed
As taught by the Enlightened One:
The sorrowless, secure, stainless,
Where suffering does come to cease> ().

This is expressed in terms of ideas.

[ii (c)]

873. Herein, what is that expressed in terms of creatures and in terms of ideas ?

<Having slaughtered a mother and a father,
And then two warrior-kings, and having slaughtered
A realm together with its governor,>¹

this is expressed in terms of ideas.

873/1 'Sānucara—with its governor': *anucara* not in *PED*, see *CPD*; the Commentary is followed in the rendering.

<One wanders in immunity, divine> (Dh. 294)²

this is expressed in terms of creatures.

This is expressed in terms of creatures and in terms of ideas.

873/2 Some translators have got ethically embroiled over this verse and that which follows it (Dh. 294 and 295). So, it is worth while examining it carefully. There are three problems: (1) the grammar, (2) the direct meaning, and (3) the interpretation. The Pali is *mātaram pītaram hantvā rājāno dve ca khattiye rattham sānucaram hantvā anīgho yāti brāhmaṇo*. Now (1) the grammar (syntax) is unusually simple, being gerund (*hantvā*) followed by finite verb (*yāti*), a very frequent Pali construction signifying either temporal or causal succession ('having slaughtered . . . goes' or 'by slaughtering . . . goes'). There is no justification at all for inserting, as some have done, an 'although' ('although having slaughtered . . . goes') since there is no corresponding word in the Pali and the syntax does not require it. For the gerund and verb there are two possible subjects: either (a) *brāhmaṇo* ('a Divine') as noun, with *anīgho* ('immune') as qualifying adj., or (b) 'one' (*ekacco* or *so*) understood, of whom then both *anīgho* and *brāhmaṇo* are qualifying adjs. (This construction is very common in Pali, cf. Sn. 35 'sabbesu bhūtesu nidhāya (ger.) *daṇḍam* . . . *eko* (adj.) *care* (verb) *khaggavisāṇakappo* (adj.)', both adjs. qualifying an understood 'one' as verb-subject). (2) As to the direct meaning: first (a), if *brāhmaṇo* is taken as the subject of the verb ('a *brāhmaṇa* (already such) having slaughtered (or by slaughtering) a mother . . . goes immune'), this must imply some such doctrine as the 'teleological suspension of the ethical' (e.g., 'a saint with pure heart can commit any crime without sin', etc.). But in the whole Tipiṭaka no such doctrine is taught anywhere, which would make hay of innumerable discourses, and particular nonsense of the 'instance and non-instance' (§546) the '10 courses of action', and the eight-factored path. If there is an alternative, it must be considered. There is one. In fact, (b) *brāhmaṇo* can be taken in its natural adj. sense to qualify 'one' understood as subject of the verb (as in Sn. 35 referred to above: cf. §829, etc.). Then the understood subject has two qualifying adjs. *anīgha* and *brāhmaṇo*, and the natural direct rendering then is 'Having slaughtered (by slaughtering) a mother, . . . two kings . . . [one] wanders immune, divine'. This is certainly preferable since it is grammatical and literal and involves no necessary contradiction of other texts as long as a figurative meaning is possible. (3) The interpretation could either be literal or allegorical. If literal (i.e., 'It is *by* (or *after*) slaughtering a mother . . . two kings . . . that one wanders immune, divine', then besides the clash mentioned above (2a), the statement as a whole is absurd since the 'two' kings ('two' in both verses) cannot be explained at all. This, in fact, rules out a literal interpretation. The verse is, then, on its internal evidence quite clearly a 'shock-allegory' (there is another, milder, one in §812, and see below), and it should be rendered exactly as it is in the Pali in all its 'shocking' simplicity with no words squeamishly interpolated through misapprehending it. The allegorical sense is underlined by *Netti* in its own way by its allotment of the term 'expressed in terms of ideas'. What it is an allegory for is given by *Netti* A

874. <Bhikkhus, there are these four bases for success. What four? The basis for success that possesses concentration of will, as well as endeavour and determinations . . . the basis for success that possesses concentration of energy . . . the basis for success that possesses concentration of cognizance . . . the basis for success that possesses concentration of inquiry, as well as endeavour and determinations> (cf. S. v, 254).

This is expressed in terms of ideas.

<He mounts cognizance upon the body, and he mounts the body upon cognizance, and after finding a footing in easy perception and quick perception, he enters upon that and abides therein> (cf. Ps. ii, 210).

This is expressed in terms of creatures.

This is expressed in terms of creatures and in terms of ideas.

[iii (a)]

875. Herein, what is knowledge?

<That knowledge which has spanned the worlds,¹
Whereby he is called omniscient,
Which knows no wane at all, and which
Has access to all times> ()²

This is knowledge.

(cf. *DhA*) as follows: 'The "mother" is craving, which gives birth to creatures in the 3 planes of existence; the "father" is the conceit "I am", which gives the egoist value to individuality; the "two kings" are the eternalist and the annihilationist views, which divide the world (of opinion) between them; the "realm" is the 6 pairs of bases beginning with eye-cum-forms; the "governor" is will and lust for those' (p. 212-13). (N.b. all *Dh.* verses are out of their context). Still another, milder, 'shock allegory' is given with explanation at S. iv, 136 ('This divine life is lived without pupils and without teacher').
875/1 '*Lokuttara*—spanned the worlds': this is not the normal use, which is renderable by 'disjoined from worlds' in the sense of being connected with their cessation (*nibbāna*). *NettiA* points out that omniscient knowledge (*sabbāññutā*) is technically 'belonging to worlds' (*lokiya*) and not 'disjoined from worlds' (*lokuttara*) in the usual sense (see n. 326/2). So the word must here be taken quite literally as 'what has come to know all worlds by crossing (*uttarati*) them' rather than the usual 'what has crossed over all worlds to know *nibbāna*'.

875/2 *NettiA*: ' "Which has access to all times" is said because its existence is dependent upon its adverting thereto. It does not occur constantly and continuously; for it cannot be said that simultaneous omniscient knowledge occurs in the Blessed One' (p. 213). Cf. *M.* ii, 127, also *Ppn.*, ch. vii, note 7.

876. [166] <Best in the world is understanding—
The kind that leads on to extinction—
Whereby one understands completely
Exhaustion of both birth and death> (Iti. 36; cf. Pe 51).

This is knowledge.

[iii (b)]

877. Herein, what is the knowable ?

<'Then I will tell you' what peace is,
Dhotaka' the Blessed One said
'Peace here and now, no hearsay tale,
Which knowing, one who mindful goes,
Surmounts attachment to the world.'
'Indeed, great Seer, I look with hope
To that, the state of peace supreme,
Which knowing, one who mindful goes,
Surmounts attachment to the world.'
'Whatever [is], that understand,
Dhotaka' the Blessed One said
'Or up or down, around, amid,
Know that as wants, and have no clinging
To better or worse being¹ in the world'> (Sn. 1066-8).

This is the knowable.

878. <'Bhikkhus, it is owing to the non-discovery, to the non-penetration, of four noble truths that both I and you have had to run on and on and go the roundabout of this long journey. When this noble truth of suffering has been discovered and penetrated, when this noble truth of the origin of suffering has been discovered and penetrated, when this noble truth of the cessation of suffering has been discovered and penetrated, when this noble truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering has been discovered and penetrated, then need for being is annihilated, that Guide to Being is exhausted, there is now no renewal of being.' That is what the Blessed One said, when the Sublime One had said this, he, the Master, said further:

'By lack of seeing four noble truths
[With understanding] how they are

877/1 *NettiA* explains *bhavābhava* here by minor and major kinds of existence and alternatively by eternalism and annihilationism (cf. n. 843/5).

*Long was the journey travelled through
The roundabout of varied births.
The Guide that leads men to exist
Is slain as soon as these are seen;
With roots of pain annihilated
There is no more renewal of being* > (S. v, 431f.).

[167] This is the knowable.

[iii (c)]

879. Herein, what is knowledge and the knowable ?

<Form is impermanent, feeling is impermanent perception is impermanent, determinations are impermanent, consciousness is impermanent> (S. iii, 21).

This is the knowable.

<Knowing and seeing thus, the noble hearer sees form as impermanent, sees feeling as impermanent, sees perception as impermanent, sees determinations as impermanent, sees consciousness as impermanent> ().

This is knowledge.

<He is liberated from form,¹ liberated from feeling, liberated from perception, liberated from determinations, liberated from consciousness; he is liberated from suffering, I say> ().

This is knowledge and the knowable.

880. <Impermanent are all determinations> (§38).

This is the knowable.

<And so when he sees thus with understanding> (Ibid.).

This is knowledge.

<He then dispassion finds in suffering;
This path it is that leads to purification> (Ibid.).

This is knowledge and the knowable.

881. <[And] painful too are all determinations> (Ibid.).

This is the knowable.

879/1 *Rūpena* must be a misreading for *rūpamhā*, cf. *viññāṇamhā* in last clause but one of quotation.

<And so when he sees thus with understanding> (Ibid.).

This is knowledge.

<He then dispassion finds in suffering;
This path it is that leads to purification> (Ibid.).

This is knowledge and the knowable.

882. <[And then besides] not-self are all ideas> (Ibid.).

This is the knowable.

<And so when he sees thus with understanding> (Ibid.).

This is knowledge.

<He then dispassion finds in suffering;
This path it is that leads to purification> (Ibid; Pe 52).

This is knowledge and the knowable.

883. [168] <Soṇa, when any monk or divine, with form as the reason, which [form] is impermanent, [liable to] pain, and inseparable from the idea of change, sees 'I am better', 'I am like' or 'I am worse', then what is that other than not seeing how it is? When, with feeling . . . perception . . . determinations . . . consciousness as the reason, which [consciousness] is impermanent, [liable to] pain, and inseparable from the idea of change, sees 'I am better', 'I am like' or 'I am worse', what is that other than not seeing how it is?> (S. iii, 48).

This is the knowable.

<Soṇa, when any monk or divine does not, with form as the reason, which [form] is impermanent, [liable to] pain, and inseparable from the idea of change, see 'I am better', 'I am like' or 'I am worse', what is that other than seeing how it is? When he does not, with feeling . . . perception . . . determinations . . . consciousness as the reason, which [consciousness] is impermanent, [liable to] pain, and inseparable from the idea of change, see 'I am better', 'I am like' or 'I am worse', what is that other than seeing how it is?> (S. iii, 48f.).

This is knowledge.

This is knowledge and the knowable.

[iv. (a)]

884. Herein, what is seeing ?¹

*<Such as clearly evince the Noble Truths
Well taught by Him profound in understanding,
Although they may be mightily neglectful,
Still they can never take an eighth existence> (Sn. 230).*

This is seeing.

885. *<As a locking-post deep-planted in the earth
Would stand unshaken by the four winds' blast,
[169] So too is the True Man, I say, that sees
The Noble Truths by undergoing them> (Sn. 229).*

This is seeing.

886. *<Bhikkhus, when a noble hearer possesses the four factors of Stream-Entry he could, if he wished, declare himself to himself thus: 'I have exhausted [risk of rebirth in] the hells, the animal womb, the ghost realm, the states of unease, the bad destinations, and the perditions; I am a Stream-Enterer, no longer inseparable from the idea of perdition, certain [of rightness], and bound for enlightenment;> (A. v, 182; Pe 52) <after running on and on and going the roundabout among gods and men seven times at most, I shall make an end of suffering> (cf. A. i, 233). <What four? Here, bhikkhus, (i) a noble hearer's faith in a Perfect One is completely established, with roots fully developed, invincible by monk or divine or god or Māra or High Divinity or anyone in the world in any way that accords with the idea [of truth]. (ii) He has reached his goal in the True Idea:> (cf. M. i, 320) <'The True Idea is well proclaimed by the Blessed One, to be seen for oneself, not delayed (timeless), inviting inspection, onward-leading, and directly experienceable by the wise> (§297; A. iii, 285), <That is to say, the disillusionment of vanity, . . . cessation'> (§297; A. ii, 34). <(iii) And for him both householders and those gone forth from the house-life who are with him in the True Idea are wished for, desired, agreeable and likable> (). <(iv) And he possesses the kinds of virtue desired by Noble Ones untorn, unrent, unblotched, unmottled, liberating, commended by the wise, not misapprehended, and conducive to concentration> (cf. §298). <When a noble hearer is possessed of these four factors of Stream-Entry he could,*

if he wished, declare himself to himself thus: 'I am . . . [as above] . . . I shall make an end of suffering' > [as above].

[170] This is seeing.

[iv (b)]

887. Herein, what is keeping in being ?

<Whose faculties¹ are well maintained in being
As to himself, without, and to all the world,
Who, this and the next world knowing, bides his time
Keeping [the path] in being in himself,
'Tis such as he that can be called 'well tamed'>

(Sn. 576; Pe 52).

This is keeping in being.

888. <Bhikkhus, there are these four traces of the True Idea.¹ What four? Non-covetousness is a trace of the True Idea, non-ill-will is a trace of the True Idea, right mindfulness is a trace of the True Idea, and right concentration is a trace of the True Idea. These are the four traces of the True Idea> (A. ii, 29; Pe 52).

This is keeping in being.

[iv (c)]

889. Herein, what is seeing and keeping-in-being ?

<Five one should sever, five abandon,
And five too one should keep in being;
The bhikkhu who outstrips five clings¹
Is called 'One who has crossed the flood'> (Dh. 370).

'Five one should sever, five abandon' is seeing. 'And five too one should keep in being, The bhikkhu who outstrips five clings' is called "One who has crossed the flood"' is keeping in being.

This is seeing and keeping-in-being.²

887/1 The 5 faculties of faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and understanding.

888/1 *NettiA* glosses *dharmapadā* ('traces of the True Idea') by *dharmakotthāsā*, which means 'parts of the True Idea'; but it seems admissible to take *pada* here as 'trace' or 'footprint' (as in *M. Suttas* 27 and 28).

889/1 "The first "five" are the 5 near-side fetters, the second "five" the 5 further-side fetters (*D. iii*, 234), the third "five" the faculties beginning with faith, the "five clings" are those of lust, hate, delusion, conceit, and views' (*NettiA*, 216).

889/2 This explanatory paragraph is missing in both *Ba* and *Bb*.

890. <Bhikkhus, there are these three faculties. What three? The I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty, the act-of-final-knowing faculty, and the final-knower faculty> (S. v, 204; Pe 51, 66). <What is the I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty? Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu arouses will to actualize the as yet unactualized noble truth of suffering, he makes efforts, instigates energy, exerts his cognizance, and endeavours. He arouses will to actualize the as yet unactualized [171] noble truth of the origin of suffering . . . of cessation of suffering . . . He arouses will to actualize the as yet unactualized noble truth of the way leading to cessation of suffering, he makes efforts, instigates energy, exerts his cognizance, and endeavours. This is the I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty> (; Pe 66).

This is seeing.

<What is the act-of-final-knowing faculty? Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu understands how it is, thus 'This is suffering'; he understands how it is, thus 'This is the origin of suffering'; he understands how it is, thus 'This is cessation of suffering'; he understands how it is, thus 'This is the way leading to cessation of suffering'. This is the act-of-final-knowing faculty. What is the final-knower faculty? Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu, verifying by his own direct acquaintanceship, here and now enters upon and abides in the heart-deliverance and understanding-deliverance that are taintless with [final] exhaustion of taints. He understands 'Birth is exhausted, the divine life has been lived out, what can be done is done, of this there is no more beyond'. This is the final-knower faculty> (; Pe 67).¹

This is keeping in being.

This is seeing and keeping-in-being.

[v (a)]

891. Herein, what is our own statement?¹

<No doing any kind of evil,
Perfecting profitable skill,

890/1 The quotations describing the 3 faculties are not in the Suttas as such. The material corresponds roughly as follows: the 1st *M.* ii, 11 (4 right endeavours), the 2nd = *M.* i, 183 (knowledge of actualization of the 4 Truths), and the 3rd = *M.* i, 35-6 and 184 (knowledge of exhaustion and of non-arising). **891/1** 'One's own statement' (*sakavacana*) means a statement made by the Buddha or by one of his disciples and approved by him as a statement of the

*And purifying one's own heart:
This is the Buddhas' Dispensation* (§238).

This is our own statement.

892. *<Bhikkhus, there are these three fool-characteristics of a fool by which others know that a fool is a fool. What are the three? A fool thinks what is ill-thought, speaks what is ill-spoken, and the actions he does are ill-done. These are the fool-characteristics of a fool, by which others know that a fool is a fool. [172] Bhikkhus, there are these three wise-man-characteristics of a wise man, by which others know that a wise man is wise. What are the three? A wise man thinks what is well thought, speaks what is well spoken, and the actions he does are well done. These are the three wise-man-characteristics of a wise man, by which others know that a wise man is wise> (cf. A. i, 102).*

This is our own statement.

[v (b)]

893. Herein, what is someone else's statement ?

*<Nothing so broad as to equal the Earth,
No chasm is found that can equal the Pit,¹
Nothing so high as to equal Mount Meru,
And no man can equal a Wheel-Turning Monarch> ().*

This is someone else's statement.

894. *<'Ruler of Gods, let there be victory won through what is well spoken.'—'Vepacitti, let there be victory won through what is well spoken.'— . . . —'Vepacitti, say a verse.' Then Vepacitti Ruler of Asura Demons uttered this verse:*

*'Fools would display their anger more
Were no one to withstand them, so
Let the steadfast keep fools in check,
With a right heavy punishment.'*

True Idea (see e.g., *M. Suttas* 18 and 44). 'Someone else's statement' (*para-vacana*: §893) is one made by someone other than that, which may or may not be acceptable.

893/1 *NettiA* ignores this verse. The *pātāla* ('Pit') appears at *S. iv*, 206 (and elsewhere) and is commented on at *SA. iii*, 75; '*pātassa alam pariyaṇto n'atthi ettha patitthā ti pātālo*' (*PTS SA* ed. wrongly inserts a full-stop after *n'atthi*).

Now, *bhikkhus*, when this verse was uttered by Vepacitti Ruler of Asura Demons, the Asura demons applauded but the gods were silent. Then Vepacitti Ruler of Asura Demons said to Sakka Ruler of Gods: 'Ruler of Gods, say a verse.' Then Sakka Ruler of Gods uttered this verse:

*'In my opinion, [sirs,] there is
But one way to withstand a fool:
When one another's anger knows,
He mindfully maintains his peace.'*

Now, *bhikkhus*, when this verse was uttered by Sakka Ruler of Gods, the gods applauded but the Asura demons were silent. Then Sakka Ruler of Gods said to Vepacitti Ruler of Asura Demons: 'Vepacitti, say a verse.' Then Vepacitti Ruler of Asura Demons uttered this verse:

[173] *'As to forbearance, Vāsava,
I find that it has this defect:
That once a fool should choose to fancy
That my forbearance springs from fear,
Then surely he will chase me more,
As does a bull a fugitive.'*

Now, *bhikkhus*, when this verse was uttered by Vepacitti Ruler of Asura Demons, the Asura demons applauded but the gods were silent. Then Vepacitti Ruler of Asura Demons said to Sakka Ruler of Gods: 'Ruler of Gods, say a verse.' Then Sakka Ruler of Gods uttered these verses:

*'Let him fancy, or let him not,
That my forbearance springs from fear:
One's own good is the best of all,
And there is none surpasses patience.
It is when one endowed with strength
Will show forbearance to the weak
That patience shows supreme, they say:
If weak, a man is always patient.¹
Whose strength is but the strength of fools,
His strength is weakness, as they say;
But there is none can countervail
Strength fortified by True Ideal.
To repay angry men in kind*

*Is worse than to be angry first;
 Repay not angry men in kind,
 And win a battle hard to win.
 The good of both he does promote,
 His own and then the other's too,
 Who shall another's anger know
 And mindfully maintain his peace.
 'Tis men unskilled in the True Ideal
 Who, when a man forbears for both
 His own [good] and the other's, too,
 Do fancy him to be a fool.'*

Now, *bhikkhus*, when this verse was uttered by Sakka Ruler of Gods, the gods applauded and the Asura demons were silent> (S. i, 222f.; cf. Pe 54).

This is someone else's statement.

[v (c)]

895. Herein, what is our own statement and someone else's statement ?

<What is [already] reached and what is [yet] to be reached are both soiled with dirt in him who trains as one [still] sick. [And] those for whom the core consists [only in undertaking] training [precepts], for whom the core consists [only] in sustaining virtue, duty, livelihood, and the divine life [consisting in chastity]; these are one extreme. And those with such theories and views as 'There is nothing wrong in sensual desires': these are [174] the second extreme. So both these extremes go on swelling the cemeteries, and the cemeteries go on swelling [wrong] view. It is through lack of acquaintanceship with both these extremes that some hold back and some over-reach> (Ud. 71-2; Pe 54).

This is someone else's statement.

<But of those who, through acquaintanceship with both these extremes, no more therein found being, who no more thereby conceived [the conceit 'I am'], there is no describing any round [of renewed being]> (Ibid.).¹

This is our own statement.

This Exclamation is our own statement and
 someone else's statement.

895/1 For the source of this quotation, cf. Sutta at Iti. 43-4 (quoted at Ppn. p. 689).

896. <King Pasenadi of Kosala said this to the Blessed One: 'Venerable sir, here while I was alone in retreat the following thought arose in my mind: "To whom is self dear? To whom is self not dear?" Venerable sir, it occurred to me as follows: "Self is not dear to those who practise misconduct by body, speech or mind; and for all that they may say self is dear to them, still it is not. Why is that? Because of themselves they do to themselves what one who is not dear would do to one not dear [to him]. That is why self is not dear to them. But self is dear to those who practise good conduct by body, speech and mind; and for all that they may say self is not dear to them, still it is dear to them. Why is that? Because of themselves they do to themselves what one who is dear would do to one dear [to him]. That is why self is dear to them." '—'So it is, great king, so it is. Self is not dear to those who practise misconduct by body, speech or mind; and for all that they may say self is dear to them, still it is not. Why is that? Because of themselves they do to themselves what one who is not dear would do to one not dear [to him]. That is why self is not dear to them. But self is dear to those who practise good conduct by body, speech and mind; and for all that they may say self is not dear to them still it is dear to them. [175] Why is that? Because of themselves they do to themselves what one who is dear would do to one dear [to him]. That is why self is dear to them.' > That is what the Blessed One said. The Sublime One having said this, he, the Master, said further:

<If a man would know himself as dear,
 Then let no evil fetter him;
 For pleasure comes not easily
 To him that does what is ill-done.
 Once seized by the Exterminator,
 Once letting go the human state,
 What is there, then, that is his own?
 What takes he with him when he goes?
 And what will follow him as would
 His shadow keep him company?
 The merit and the evil, both,
 That here a mortal has performed,
 That then is there and is his own,
 That takes he with him when he goes,
 And that will follow him as would
 His shadow keep him company.

*So let him make a store of good
 For him to reap in lives to come:
 For merit in the world beyond
 Provides a breathing thing's foundation* > (S. i, 71f.).

Here the Thread is someone else's statement and the paraphrasing-verse is our own statement.

This is our own statement and someone else's statement.

[vi (a)]

897. Herein, what is the answerable ?

When a question is asked [whether] one should be acquainted with this, [whether] this should be diagnosed, [whether] this should be abandoned, [whether] this should be kept in being, [whether] this should be verified, [whether] these ideas, being taken thus, make this fruit occur, [whether] this is the meaning of those [ideas] taken thus, this is answerable.

898. [When it is asked whether] one should demonstrate unreservedly the Enlightened One's grandeur thus 'Great is the Enlightened One, the Blessed One', and the True Idea's well-proclaimedness, and the Community's goodly practice [correspondingly, or when it is asked whether] one should demonstrate unreservedly that <Impermanent are all determinations> (§38), <[and] painful too are all determinations> (§38) [or] <[and then besides] not-self are all ideas> (§38), or anything else of the same sort, this is answerable.

[vi (b)]

899. [176] Herein, what is the unanswerable ? [When it is asked as follows:]

<O Leader of men to be tamed,
 When you design,
 No gods or men or even all
 The whole [array
 Of] breathing things can know what is
 Thought by your mind
 Using the quiet concentration
 Without conflict (; Pe 71):

'What is it that the Blessed One
Is there intending?' > ().

This is unanswerable.

900. [When it is asked whether] the Blessed One is this much in respect of the virtue category, the concentration category, the understanding category, the deliverance category, or the knowing-and-seeing-of-deliverance category, in respect of behaviour, in respect of dignity, in respect of seeking welfare, in respect of compassion, in respect of supernormal success, this is unanswerable.

901. [When it is said] <*Bhikkhus, with the arising of a Perfect One, accomplished and fully enlightened, in the world, there is the arising¹ of the three Jewels, of the Enlightened-One Jewel, of the True-Idea Jewel, and of the Community Jewel*> () [and it is asked] 'What is the measure of the three Jewels?', that is unanswerable.²

902. [When it is asked likewise about] the province of an Enlightened One (see A. ii, 80), That is unanswerable.

903. [When it is asked likewise about] the Knowledge of diversity in [the faculties of other] persons (see §585), that is unanswerable.

904. [When it is said] <*Bhikkhus, a past term is not evident of creatures who, with ignorance as hindrance and craving as fetter run on and on, going the roundabout now in hell, now in the animal womb, now in the ghost realm, now in the Asura-Demon womb, now among gods, now among men*> (cf. S. ii, 178 v, 326; cf. §644), [and it is asked] 'What is the past term?', that is unanswerable. It is 'not evident' owing to deficiency in the hearer's knowledge.¹

905. [Now] the teaching of the Enlightened Ones, the Blessed Ones, is of two kinds, namely with themselves as guiding example and with another as guiding example. [The teaching] <*is not evident*> (§905) is with another as guiding example, while [the

901/1 Reading *ratanānaṃ uppādo*.

901/2 Read probably . . . *sangharatanassa*' (end of quote). *Kim-pamānāni tīni ratanāni ? ti idam avissajjaniyaṃ* (new para.).

904/1 This, oddly expressed as it is, does not mean that there *is* a 'first term (beginning)' which they cannot see, but rather, it is the 'deficiency' in their knowledge that makes them seek the illusory 'first term', that is, deficiency in their knowledge of the following, namely, '*atha pana paññāyati "idappaccayā avijjā" ti*' (A. v, 113) and '*"idappaccayā bhavatanhā" ti*' (A. v, 116).

teaching] <The Enlightened Ones, the Blessed Ones, have no non-cognition> () is with themselves as guiding example. According as the Blessed One told a certain bhikkhu about the bhikkhu Kokālika: [177] <Bhikkhu, suppose there were a Kosalan sesamum-seed waggon of twenty khārika-measures' capacity, [and at the end of every hundred years or every thousand years a man took a single sesamum seed away, that Kosalan sesamum-seed waggon of twenty khārika-measures' capacity would in this manner sooner be exhausted and come to an end] than would the abbuda¹ hell; and like twenty abbuda hells is the one-nirabbuda hell; and like twenty nirabbuda-hells is the one-aṭaṭa hell; and like twenty aṭaṭa hells is the one-ahaha hell; and like twenty ahaha hells is the one-kumuda hell; and like twenty kumuda hells is the one-sogandhika hell; and like twenty sogandhika hells is the one-uppala hell; and like twenty uppala hells is the one-pundarika hell; and like twenty punḍarika hells is the one-paduma hell. Now it is the paduma hell that Kokālika has reappeared in through hardening his heart against Sāriputta and Moggallāna> (S. i, 152).

906. Or in fact, [any question about the measure of] anything of which the Blessed One has said 'This is measureless, incalculable' is always unanswerable.

This is the unanswerable.

[vi (c)]

907. Herein, what is the answerable and unanswerable ?

When the ascetic Upaka asked the Blessed One 'Where are you going, friend Gotama ?' and the Blessed One said 'I am going to Benares. I am going to set rolling the True Idea's Wheel, the Deathless Drum, not to be stopped in the world' and the ascetic Upaka asked, 'Do you claim to be a Victor, friend Gotama ?' and the Blessed One said :

<The Victors like me, Upaka,
Are those whose taints are quite exhausted;
I vanquished all ideas of evil,
And that is why I am a Victor> (M. i, 171).¹

905/1 This and the following names are all names of progressively huge numbers, the last of which are borrowed from different kinds of (many-petalled) lotus flowers.

907/1 The first part of this paragraph up till the verse is not a quotation but a précis.

[Now the questions] 'How a Victor ?' or 'By what reason a Victor ?' are answerable; [but the question] 'What [is] a Victor ?'² is unanswerable. [Again, the question] 'Which exhaustion of taints ? [Is it] exhaustion of lust, exhaustion of hate, exhaustion of delusion ?' is answerable; [but the question] 'How much exhaustion of taints ?' is unanswerable.

[178] This is the answerable and unanswerable.

908. [The question] 'Is there (*atthi*) a Perfect One (*tathāgata*) ?' is answerable.¹

[The question] 'Is there form ?' is answerable. [The question] < '[Is] a Perfect One form ?' > (S. iv, 383) is unanswerable; [the question] 'Does a Perfect One possess form ?' is unanswerable; [the question] < '[Is] a Perfect One in form ?' > (S. iv, 383) is unanswerable; [the question] '[Is] form in a Perfect One ?' is unanswerable.

Likewise 'Is there feeling ?' . . .

Likewise 'Is there perception ?' . . .

Likewise 'Are there determinations ?' . . .

[Likewise] 'Is there consciousness ?' is answerable. < '[Is] a Perfect One consciousness ?' > (S. iv, 383) is unanswerable; 'Does a Perfect One possess consciousness ?' is unanswerable; < '[Is] a Perfect One in consciousness ?' > (S. iv, 383) is unanswerable.

'[Is] a Perfect One apart from form ?' is unanswerable; '[Is] a Perfect One apart from feeling . . . from perception . . . from determinations . . . from consciousness ?' are unanswerable.

'[Is] this Perfect One without form ? . . . without feeling . . . without perception . . . without determinations . . . without consciousness ?' are unanswerable.

This is the answerable and unanswerable.

907/2 'Katamo jino—what [is] a victor ?': *NettiA*: 'Is the Victor form or feeling or perception or determinations or consciousness ? Or is he apart from them ?' (p. 220); see §379.

908/1 The question '*atthi tathāgato ?*' = '*atthi satto ?*' (*NettiA*, p. 220); also 'This person (*āyasmā*) is describable thus by an assumption based on the 5 categories as named so-and-so, of such-and-such family, and this, since it refers to that so-described person, is answerable' (p. 220). 'Person' is otherwise called an '*avijjamāna-paññatti*' (*PugA*, i.e., 'description in terms of the non-factual'), the categories, etc., being '*vijjamāna-paññatti*' (description in terms of the factual'). Cf. S. iv, 52.

909. 'Does the Blessed One with the heavenly eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, see creatures passing away and re-appearing . . . and so all the rest (see §591) . . . does he understand how creatures pass on according to their actions ?' is answerable.

'What [are] creatures ?' and 'What [is] a Perfect One ?' are unanswerable.

This is the answerable and unanswerable.

910. 'Is there (*atthi*)¹ a Perfect One ?' is answerable. 'Is there (*atthi*) a Perfect One after his death ?' is unanswerable.

This is the answerable and unanswerable.

[vii (a)]

911. Herein, what is action ?

*<When one is overcome by death¹
And letting go the human state,
What is there then that is his own ?
What takes he with him when he goes ?
And what will follow him as would
His shadow keep him company ?
The merit and the evil, both,
That here a mortal has performed,
That then is there and is his own,
That takes he with him when he goes,
And that will follow him as would
His shadow keep him company> (§896).*

This is action.

912. *<Again, bhikkhus, when a fool is on his chair [179] or his bed or resting on the ground, then the evil actions that he did in the past through misconduct by body, speech or mind cover him and overspread and envelop him. Just as the shadow of a great rock-peak in the evening sun covers and overspreads and envelops the ground, so too, when a fool is on his chair or his bed or resting on the ground, then the evil actions that he did in the past through misconduct by body, speech or mind cover him and overspread and envelop him. Then it*

910/1 All Tipiṭaka refs. have *hoti*, not *atthi*, in these contexts.

911/1 *Antakenādhīpannessa* at §896 and *marañenādhībhūta* here, though the rest of the verse is the same.

occurs to the fool 'I have left undone what is good, I have left undone what is profitable, I have made myself no shelter from anguish, I have done what is evil, I have done what is cruel, I have done what is wicked. Whatever is the destination of those who have so acted, there I shall go when I depart', and he sorrows and laments, beating his breast, he weeps and becomes distraught> (M. iii, 164-5). <Again, bhikkhus, when a wise man is on his chair or his bed or resting on the ground, then the good actions that he did in the past through good conduct by body, speech and mind cover him and overspread and envelop him. Just as the shadow of a great rock-peak in the evening sun covers and overspreads and envelops the ground, so too, when a wise man is on his chair or his bed or resting on the ground, then the good actions that he did in the past through good conduct by body, speech and mind cover him and overspread and envelop him. Then it occurs to the wise man 'I have left undone what is evil, I have left undone what is cruel, I have left undone what is wicked, I have done what is good, I have done what is profitable, I have made myself a shelter from anguish. Whatever is [180] the destination of those who have so acted, there I shall go when I depart', and he neither sorrows nor laments, nor, beating his breast, does he weep and become distraught> (M. iii, 171). <[He knows] 'Merit has been made by me and no evil done. Whatever is the destination of those who have left undone what is evil, left undone what is cruel, left undone what is wicked, who have done what is good, done what is profitable, and made themselves a shelter from anguish, with that destination I shall coexist in the existence that follows the departing', and so he has no remorse. Bhikkhus, I say that death is auspicious, completion of time is auspicious, for a woman or a man, whether householder or gone forth from the house-life, who has no remorse> ().

This is action.

913. <Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of misconduct. What three? Misconduct by body, misconduct by speech, and misconduct by mind. These three kinds of misconduct> (Iti. 54; Pe 49). <Bhikkhus, there are three kinds of good conduct. What three? Good conduct by body, good conduct by speech, and good conduct by mind. These three kinds of good conduct> (Iti. 55; Pe 53).

This is action.

[vii (b)]

914. Herein, what is ripening ?

<Bhikkhus, it is gain for you, it is great gain for you, to have found the moment for living the divine life out. Bhikkhus, I have seen hells that provide the six bases for contact. There whatever the form one sees with the eye, one sees only the un-wished-for, never the wished for, sees only the undesired, never the desired, sees only the disagreeable, never the agreeable. Whatever the sound one hears with the ear . . . odour one smells with the nose . . . flavour one tastes with the tongue . . . tangible one touches with the body . . . Whatever the idea one cognizes with the mind, one cognizes only the un-wished-for never the wished for, cognizes only the undesired, never the desired, cognizes only the disagreeable, never the agreeable. Bhikkhus, it is gain for you, it is great gain for you, to have found the moment [181] for living the divine life out. Bhikkhus, I have seen heavens that provide the six bases for contact. There whatever the form one sees with the eye, one sees only the wished for, never the un-wished-for, sees only the desired, never the undesired, sees only the agreeable, never the disagreeable. Whatever the sound one hears with the ear . . . odour one smells with the nose . . . flavour one tastes with the tongue . . . tangible one touches with the body . . . Whatever the idea one cognizes with the mind, one cognizes only the wished for, never the un-wished-for, cognizes only the desirable, never the undesirable, cognizes only the agreeable, never the disagreeable.¹ Bhikkhus, it is gain for you, it is great gain for you, to have found the moment for living the divine life out> (S. iv, 126).²

This is ripening.

915. <Full sixty thousand years gone by
 Ripened in hell. When will it end ?
 There is no end ! Where is the end ?
 No sign of any end at all
 Appears for you and me, good sir;
 For evil we did then perform> (Jā. iii, 47; Pe 49).

This is ripening.

914/1 For 'hell' see n. 786/2.

914/2 For this para cf. Pe 49, lines 13-14 and 58, line 17.

[vii (c)]

916. Herein, what is action and ripening ?

<Whenever a negligent man has done wrong,
 Then wherever he goes in the bad destinations
 The wrong that he did will [continue to] hurt him
 Like a black cobra snake that lays hold of itself> ()¹
 The right idea and wrong idea
 Have never the same ripening:
 The wrong idea guides men to hell,
 The right idea brings them to heaven> (Thag. 304).

This is action and ripening.

917. <Bhikkhus, fear no kinds of merit. It is a designation for the pleasure that is wished for, desired, dear, and agreeable, [182] namely 'The kinds of merit'. For long I had acquaintance with merit made, whose ripening was coessential with the wished for, and desirable, the dear and agreeable. For seven years I maintained lovingkindness in being in my heart. Thereafter for seven aeons of world-contraction and world-expansion I never came back to this world; for with the aeon contracting, I passed on up into the [world of] the Ābhassara (Streaming-Radiance) [High Divinity]; and with the aeon expanding, I reappeared [in the next lower world] in a High Divinity's empty mansion. There I was the Divinity, the High Divinity, the Transcendent Being Untranscended, Infallible in Vision, Wielder of Mastery.¹ And then thirty-six times I was Sakka Ruler of Gods [in the second paradise of sensual desire]. And many hundred times I was a Wheel-Turning Monarch² as a rightful emperor with the ideal of righteousness, conqueror of the Earth's four corners, with stabilized provinces, and in possession of the seven Jewels. What need to speak of local kingship? It occurred to me [to wonder] 'What action of mine is it the fruit of, with what action's ripening is it, that I have now such vast success and might?', [and the answer] occurred to me 'It is the fruit of three kinds of action of mine, it is with three kinds of action's ripening, that I now have such vast success and

916/1 The reading is *sayam*. The point of the simile thus seems to be that bad actions cause self-inflicted pain, like that of a cobra biting itself.

917/1 For this description of *Brahmā* ('the High Divinity') see *M. Sutta* 49 and *D. i*, 221.

917/2 For the 'Wheel-Turning Monarch' (*cakkavatti*) see *M. Sutta* 129.

might: *It is owing to giving, it is owing to [self-]taming, and it is owing to refraining'* > (Iti. 14f.).

Herein, the 'giving', the 'taming' and the 'refraining' are action, while the ripening, with that as its condition, that was coessential with the experience, is ripening.

918. Likewise the *Cūḷa-Kammapavibhaṅga-Sutta* (M. Sutta 135) should be quoted as taught to the student Subhā Todeyyaputta.

Herein, those ideas that conduce to short life and to long life, to much affliction and to little affliction, to little influence and to much influence, to uncomely looks and to comely looks, to low birth and to high birth, to little property and to great property, to want of understanding and to possession of understanding, [183] are action, while the short life and long life, . . . the want of understanding and the possession of understanding, therein, are ripening.¹

This is action and ripening.

[viii (a)]

919. Herein, what is the profitable ?

*<Who guards his speech, is well restrained in mind,
Does no unprofit by the body's means:
Who purifies this triple course of action,
Will win the path the Sages have divulged > (Dh. 281; Pe 70).*

This is the profitable.

920. *<Who has no more wrongdoing done
By body or by speech or mind,
Who is in triple mode restrained,
'Tis him I call divine > (Dh. 391).*

This is the profitable.

921. *<Bhikkhus, there are these three roots of profit. What three?
They are non-greed as a root of profit, non-hate as a root of profit,
and non-delusion as a root of profit. These are the three roots of profit > (A. i, 203).*

This is the profitable.

922. <Bhikkhus, science heralds the perfecting of profitable ideas, with conscience and shame following in its wake> (Iti. 34).

This is the profitable.

[viii (b)]

923. Herein, what is the unprofitable?

< A man who is excessive in unvirtue,
Like māluvā-vines choking sālā-trees,
Does act in such a way he makes himself
Exactly as his enemy would wish > (Dh. 162).

This is the unprofitable.

924. <The evil by oneself performed, self-born,
Owing to self its actual existence,
Grinds away them so stupid [as to do it],
As does the adamant the stony gem> (Dh. 161).

This is the unprofitable.

925. [184] <The profitless, who profit miss
In action's tenfold course fulfilling,
Are censurable, deity,
As fools who ripen out in hell> ().

This is the unprofitable.

926. <Bhikkhus, there are these three roots of unprofit. What three? They are greed as a root of unprofit, hate as a root of unprofit, and delusion as a root of unprofit. These are the three roots of unprofit> (A. i, 201).

This is the unprofitable.

[viii (c)]

927. Herein, what is the profitable and unprofitable?

<According as the seed is sown
So [later] is the harvest reaped:
And good is for the doer of good,
And evil for the evil-doer> (S. i, 227; cf. Pe 46).

Herein, the words 'good is for the doer of good' are the profitable, while the words 'And evil for the evil-doer' are the unprofitable.

This is the profitable and unprofitable.

928. <It is by actions beautiful
 That men fare on to heaven,
 And owing to their ugly acts,
 To states where is no ease.
 But with exhaustion of [all] acts
 The heart is liberated;
 Like lamps with fuel [all] used up
 They reach extinguishment> ().

Herein, the words 'It is by actions beautiful That men fare on to heaven' are the profitable, while the words 'And owing to their ugly acts, To states where is no ease' are the unprofitable.

This is the profitable and unprofitable.

[ix (a)]

929. Herein, what is the agreed ?
 <And as the bee comes to the flower
 And soon flies off with nourishment,
 Leaving the colour and scent intact,
 So goes the Stilled One to the town> (Dh. 49).

This is the agreed.

930. [185] <Bhikkhus, there are these three [tasks] to be done by bhikkhus. What three? Here (i) a bhikkhu abides restrained with the restraint of the Patimokkha Rule, perfect in conduct and resort, and seeing fear in the slightest fault, he undertakes the training precepts and trains in them; then since his bodily, verbal, and mental action is profitable, he has purified his livelihood. (ii) Then he has instigated energy, is firm and staunch in persistence, never shirking the task in abandoning unprofitable ideas and in keeping in being and verifying profitable ideas. (iii) And then he has understanding, he possesses understanding that extends to rise and disappearance; is noble and penetrative, and extends to the complete exhaustion of suffering. These, bhikkhus, are the three [tasks] to be done by bhikkhus> (; cf. Pe 57).

This is the agreed.

931. <Bhikkhus, there are these ten ideas to be constantly reviewed by one gone forth from the house-life. What ten? 'I have come to a casteless state' is [an idea] to be constantly reviewed by one gone forth. ['My livelihood is bound up with others' . . . 'I have a different (special)

way to behave' . . . 'Does my self reproach me on my virtue's account?' . . . 'Do wise companions in the divine life, on considering me, reproach me on my virtue's account?' . . . 'There will be division and separation from all that are dear to me and beloved' . . . 'I am an owner of action, heir of action, womb of action, responsible for (kin of) action, home of action, whatever action I do, whether good or bad, that I shall inherit' . . . 'How has my passing of the nights and days been?' . . . 'Do I delight in an empty house?' . . . 'Have I arrived at any superhuman idea worthy of the Noble Ones' knowing and seeing, so that if I am questioned in my last hours by companions in the divine life, I shall not have been in vain?' is [an idea] to be constantly reviewed by one gone forth from the house-life.] These ten ideas are to be constantly reviewed by one gone forth from the house-life> (A. v, 87-8).

This is the agreed.

932. <Bhikkhus, there are these three tasks to be done. What three? They are good conduct by body, good conduct by speech, and good conduct by mind. These are three tasks to be done> ().

This is the agreed.

[ix (b)]

933. Herein, what is the refused ?

[When it was said]

<There is no loved one equal to one's child,
There are no riches equal to one's cow,
No radiance is equal to the sun,
The sea is sure the greatest of the waters> ,

The Blessed One replied

<There is no loved one equal to oneself,
There are no riches equal to one's corn,
No radiance can equal understanding,
The rain is sure the greatest of the waters> (S. i, 6; Pe 54, 57).

Here the first verse is refused [by the second].

934. [186] <Bhikkhus, there are these three [tasks] not to be done. What three? They are misconduct by body, misconduct by speech, and misconduct by mind. These are three tasks not to be done> (; Pe 57).

This is the refused.

[ix (c)]

935. Herein, what is the agreed and refused ?

<What are the multitude afraid of here?
A path with many a base divulged—I ask,
O Gotama with breadth of understanding,
Where stands he that fears not the other world ?
‘When speech and mind have rightly been disposed,
When no more evil bodily is done,
Then [even] in a house of plenty dwelling,
A man who takes his stand on four ideas—
Who is faithful, gentle, generous, wise-spoken—
Here stands he that fears not the other world> (S. i, 42f.).

Herein, when it is said ‘When speech and mind have rightly been disposed’ this is the agreed. When it is said ‘When no more evil bodily is done’ this is the refused. When it is said ‘Then [even] in a house of plenty dwelling A man who takes his stand on four ideas—Who is faithful, gentle, generous, wise-spoken—Here stands he that fears not the other world’ this is the agreed.

This is the agreed and refused.

936. <No doing any kind of evil,
Perfecting profitable skill,
And purifying one’s own heart:
This is the Buddhas’ Dispensation> (§238).

Herein, when it is said ‘No doing any kind of evil’ this is the refused. When it is said ‘Perfecting profitable skill’ this is the agreed.

This is the agreed and refused.

937. <Ruler of Gods, bodily behaviour is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated. And verbal behaviour [187] is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated. And mental behaviour is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated. And search is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated. ‘Bodily behaviour is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated’: so it was said; and with reference to what was this said? There is bodily behaviour such that when a man cultivates it unprofitable ideas increase in him and profitable ideas diminish. Such bodily behaviour is not to be cultivated. Herein, when he knows of any

bodily behaviour that 'This bodily behaviour is such that when I cultivate it unprofitable ideas diminish and profitable ideas increase', such bodily behaviour is to be cultivated. So it was with reference to this that it was said 'Bodily behaviour is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated'. 'Verbal behaviour' . . . 'Mental behaviour' . . . 'Search is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated': so it was said; and with reference to what was this said? There is search such that when a man cultivates it unprofitable ideas increase and profitable ideas diminish. Such search is not to be cultivated. Herein, when he knows of any search that 'This search is such that when I cultivate it unprofitable ideas diminish and profitable ideas increase' such search is to be cultivated. So it was with reference to this that it was said 'Search is of two kinds, I say, to be cultivated and not to be cultivated' > () (cf. M. iii, 45ff.).

Herein, when it is said 'to be cultivated' this is the agreed. And when it is said 'not to be cultivated' this is the refused.

This is the agreed and refused.

[x]

938. [188] Herein, what is eulogy ?

<The Eightfold is the best of paths,
The four states are the best of truths,
Fading of lust the best idea,
And one with vision best of bipeds> (Dh. 273; Pe 56).

This is eulogy.

939. <Bhikkhus, there are these three foremost things. What three? In so far as there are creatures, footless or two-footed or four-footed or many-footed, or with form or without form or percipient or non-percipient or neither-percipient-nor-non-percipient, of these a Perfect One is reckoned foremost, reckoned best, reckoned supreme, that is to say, one accomplished and fully enlightened. In so far as there is any description of True Ideas, whether determined or undetermined, of these the fading of lust is reckoned foremost, reckoned best, reckoned supreme, that is to say, disillusionment of vanity, elimination of thirst, outguiding of reliance, termination of the round, exhaustion of craving, fading, ceasing, extinction. In so far as there is any description of communities, any description of societies, any description of multitudes gathered together, of these the Community of a Perfect One's hearers is

reckoned foremost, reckoned best, reckoned supreme, that is to say, the four Pairs of Mature Men, the eight Types of Mature Persons . . . (see §298) . . . field of merit for the world > (cf. *Iti.* 87-8; cf. *Pe* 56).

940. <A Master who all worlds crossed over,

A True Idea on profit's side,

A Lion-Man's society:

These are the most distinguished three > ().

<A lily-sheaf of saints is the Community,

The glorious Ideal its knower venerated,

Man's Tamer glorious, possessed of [perfect] vision:

This is the Trinity beyond the world > ().

<A Master without equal [anywhere],

An Ideal with no essentials of existence,¹

A glorious Community ennobled

This is the Trinity the most distinguished > ().

<Truly named is the Conqueror Secure

All-Transcendent with Truth for his Ideal,

None other beyond Him. His Comity

Of Noble Ones the wise ever revere.

[189] This is the Trinity beyond the world > ().

<The Seer of [all] birth's exhaustion understood

The Path of single [aim],² compassionate for weal,

And it is by that path that men who cross the flood

Crossed over in the past and will do so in future > (*S.* v, 108).

<And even such was He, the best of gods and men,

Whom creatures do adore, hoping for purity > ().

This is eulogy.

* * *

[Discussion]

941. Herein, (i (a)) the type of Thread *belonging to worlds* [in the second grouping] can be demonstrated by two types of Thread [in the first grouping], namely by (1) that *dealing with corruption* and (2) that *dealing with morality*.

940/1 'Nirūpadāha—with no essentials of existence': not in *PED* in any form. *NettiA*: 'Rāgapariḷāhādīhi nirūpadāho' (p. 226). If fm. √dhā, the word is simply a variant of *nirupadhi*, but perhaps connected with *pariḷāha*.

940/2 'Ekāyana—of single aim' (lit. 'with a single going') = *ekam maggaṃ* (*NettiA*, 226). Often rendered by 'the only way', but besides the context at *M.* i, 55, that at *M.* i, 74 should also be considered, since it brings out the meaning more clearly.

(i (b)) the type of Thread *dissociated from worlds* can be demonstrated by three types of Thread, namely by [(3) that *dealing with penetration* subdivided into] (3a) that *dealing with seeing* (Pe 39) and (3b) that *dealing with keeping in being* (Pe 39), and (4) that *dealing with the Adept*.

(i (c)) the type of Thread *belonging to worlds and dissociated from worlds* can be demonstrated in so far as regards that belonging to worlds by either type of Thread to which the word is appropriate, namely by (1) that *dealing with corruption* or (2) that *dealing with morality*, and in so far as regards that *dissociated from worlds* it can be demonstrated by whichever type of Thread the word is appropriate to, namely by (3a) that *dealing with seeing*, (3b) that *dealing with keeping in being*, or (4) that *dealing with the Adept*.¹

942. (2) The type of Thread *dealing with morality* is for counteracting (1) the type of Thread *dealing with corruption*. (3a) The type of Thread *dealing with seeing* is for counteracting (2) the type of Thread *dealing with morality*. (3b) The type of Thread *dealing with keeping in being* is for relinquishing (3a) the type of Thread *dealing with seeing*. (4) The type of Thread *dealing with the Adept* is for relinquishing (3b) the type of Thread *dealing with keeping in being*. (4) The type of Thread *dealing with the Adept* has [also] the purpose of a pleasant abiding here and now.

943. (i (b)) the type of Thread *dissociated from worlds* that is (ii (a)) *expressed in terms of creatures* can be demonstrated by the [following] thirty-six types of persons, and they are to be sought for in the three types of Threads, namely (3a) that *dealing with seeing*, (3b) that *dealing with keeping in being*, and (4) that *dealing with the Adept*.

944. Herein, (3a) the type of Thread *dealing with seeing* can be demonstrated by five types of persons, namely the Single-Seed, the Clan-to-Clan, the Seven-at-Most, the Follower by Faith, and the Follower by Ideas.¹ The type of Thread dealing with seeing can be demonstrated by these five types of persons (see Pe 42).

945. (3b) The type of Thread *dealing with keeping in being* can be

941/1 'And similarly the remaining triads can be combined with the four basic types in the first Grouping' (NettiA, 227).

944/1 The 3 types of Stream Enterer are given at A. i, 233, the other two at S. iii, 225 and M. i, 479; but see also Pug. 15-16, where the Follower by Faith and Follower by Ideas are made applicable only to the Stream-Entry Path but not to its Fruit. Cf. Pe 42. There seems to be a difference here by the Netti's applying *dassana* ('seeing') to both the Path and Fruit of Stream Entry.

demonstrated by twelve types of persons, namely by him who is on the way to verification of the fruit of Once-Return, by the Once-Returner, by him who is on the way to verification of the fruit of Non-Return, by the Non-Returner,¹ [190] by One Who Attains Extinction Early On [In His Next Existence], by One Who Attains Extinction Late [In His Next Existence], by One Who Attains Extinction Without Prompting-determinations, by One Who Attains Extinction With Prompting-determinations, by The Up-Streamer Bound For The Not-Junior Gods,² by One Liberated By Faith, by One Attained To Right View, and by a Bodily Witness.³ The type of Thread dealing with keeping in being can be demonstrated by these twelve types of persons (see *Pe* 42).

946. (4) The type of Thread *dealing with the Adept* can be demonstrated by nine types of persons, namely by One Liberated By Faith,¹ by One Liberated By Understanding,² by One Liberated Through Voidness, by One Liberated Through Signlessness, by One Liberated Through Dispositionlessness,³ by One Both-Ways Liberated,⁴ by a Level-Headed One,⁵ by a Hermit Enlightened One,⁶ and by a Fully Enlightened One. The type of Thread dealing with the Adept can be demonstrated by these nine types of persons (cf. *Pe* 30-32, 42).

That is how the supramundane type of Thread expressed in terms of creatures can be demonstrated by these thirty-six types of persons.

947. (i (a)) The type of Thread *belonging to worlds* (ii (a)) *expressed*

945/1 For the first 4 of these, see *Pug.* 17; They have respectively the Path and Fruit in each pair of cases.

945/2 For the 5 types of Non-Returner see *A.* i, 233; *Pug.* 16-17.

945/3 For these 3 see *M.* i, 478. Their inclusion here remedies their complete omission in the *Pe*.

946/1 Cf. *Pug.* 14-15, also *M.* i, 478; 'One Liberated by Faith' is not extended to the Fruit of Arahantship in the *Piṭakas*, but at *Vis.* 659 both he and the 'Body-Witness' are.

946/2 'Paññāvimutta—Liberated by Understanding': see e.g., *A.* iv, 452-3, *S.* i, 191; ii, 121-7; *M.* i, 477-8; *D.* ii, 70; *Pug.* 14.

946/3 See §528ff. for the 3 Gateways to Liberation.

946/4 See *M.* i, 477.

946/5 See *Ps.* i, 101. This is one who attains Arahantship and his death-moment simultaneously.

946/6 The Hermit Enlightened One (*pacceka-buddha*) is one who, in the period of absence of a Fully Enlightened One and his proclaimed teaching, penetrates the four Truths for himself and so makes an end of suffering; but he is unable to communicate his discovery verbally to another.

in terms of creatures can [also] be demonstrated by the [following] nineteen types of persons, and they are to be sought for among the types of temperament. Some are of lusting temperament, some are of hating temperament, some are of deluded temperament; some are of lusting temperament and hating temperament, some are of lusting temperament and deluded temperament, some are of hating temperament and deluded temperament, some are of lusting temperament and hating temperament and deluded temperament (cf. *Pe* 141 and 144-5).

[Then there are:] One of lusting temperament steadied under the heading of lust, one of hating temperament steadied under the heading of lust, one of deluded temperament steadied under the heading of lust, and one of lusting temperament and hating temperament and deluded temperament steadied under the heading of lust. [And there are:] one of hating temperament steadied under the heading of hate, one of deluded temperament steadied under the heading of hate, one of lusting temperament steadied under the heading of hate, and one of lusting temperament and hating temperament and deluded temperament steadied under the heading of hate. [And there are:] one of deluded temperament steadied under the heading of delusion, one of lusting temperament steadied under the heading of delusion, one of hating temperament steadied under the heading of delusion, and one of lusting temperament and hating temperament and deluded temperament steadied under the heading of delusion. The type of Thread belonging to worlds expressed in terms of creatures can be demonstrated by these nineteen types of persons.

948. (2) The type of Thread *dealing with morality* can be demonstrated by the types of the virtuous. These [191] types of the virtuous are the five types of persons, namely [those possessing the following ideas:]¹ natural virtue, virtue as undertaking, confidence of cognizance (heart), quiet, insight. The type of Thread dealing with morality can be demonstrated by these five types of persons.

949. By means of these five ideas, (1 (b)) the type of Thread *dissociated from worlds* can be demonstrated by the three types of Thread, namely (3a) that *dealing with seeing*, (3b) that *dealing with keeping in being*, and (4) that *dealing with the Adept*.

950. (i (c)) That *belonging to worlds and dissociated from worlds*

948/1 The grammar of this sentence is rather odd: the (neut.) *pakatisīlam*, etc., are not (masc.) *puggalā*.

(ii (c)) *expressed in terms of creatures and in terms of ideas* can be demonstrated in both ways.

951. (iii (a)) *Knowledge* can be demonstrated by understanding, and by the understanding faculty, understanding power, training in the higher understanding, investigation-of-ideas enlightenment factor, right view, judgment, adjudgment, knowledge about an idea, knowledge about an inference, knowledge about exhaustion, knowledge about non-arising, the I-shall-come-to-know-finally-the-as-yet-not-finally-known faculty, the act-of-final-knowing faculty, the final-knower faculty, vision, (eye), science, discovery, breadth, wit (cf. §294); or it can be demonstrated by any designation for understanding that is appropriate.

952. (iii (b)) *The knowable* can be demonstrated by the past, future, and presently-arisen, by the in-oneself and external, by the inferior and superior, by the far and near, by the determined and undetermined, by the profitable, unprofitable, and undeclared; or in brief by the six objects [of the six bases in oneself].

953. (iii (c)) *Knowledge and the knowable* can be demonstrated by both. And also understanding that is made the object [of subsequent knowledge] is *the knowable*; and also anything whatever, whether in-oneself or external, that is made the object [of knowledge is *the knowable*, and] all that can be demonstrated as determined and undetermined.

954. (iv (a)) *seeing* and (iv (b)) *keeping in being*, (v (a)) *our own statement* and (v (b)) *someone else's statement*, (vi (a)) *the answerable* and (vi (b)) *the unanswerable*, (vii (a)) *action* and (vii (b)) *ripening*, and (c) the double form in each instance, can be demonstrated appropriately by observing how it is demonstrated in the Thread; or whatever other statement the Blessed One utters can all [be demonstrated] by observing how it is demonstrated in the Thread (cf. *Pe* 42).

955. Cause is twofold as action and as defilements. Defilements are origin.

956. [192] Herein, *defilements* can [only] be demonstrated by (1) the type of Thread *dealing with corruption*. *Origin* can be demonstrated [both] by (1) the type of Thread *dealing with corruption* and by (2) the type of Thread *dealing with morality*.

957. Herein (viii (a)) *the profitable* can be demonstrated by four types of Threads, namely (2) by that *dealing with morality*, (3a) that *dealing with seeing*, (3b) that *dealing with keeping in being*, and (4) that *dealing with the Adept*.

958. (viii (b)) *The unprofitable* can be demonstrated by (1) the type of Thread *dealing with corruption*.

959. (viii (c)) *The profitable and unprofitable* can be demonstrated by both [as appropriate].

960. (ix (a)) *The agreed* can be demonstrated by what the Blessed One has agreed, which is of five kinds, namely restraint, abandoning, keeping in being, verification, and what is allowable [explicitly in the texts] and what is in conformity with that. Whatever is found in the several planes [beginning with that of the ordinary man] can be demonstrated by the allowable and what is in conformity [with it].¹

961. (ix (b)) What is *refused* by the Blessed One can be demonstrated by the reason for the refusal.

962. (ix (c)) *The agreed and refused* can be demonstrated by both [as appropriate].

963. (x) *Eulogy* can be demonstrated by praise. That should be understood as of five kinds, namely [praise] of the Blessed One, of the True Idea, of the Noble Community, of the Training in Noble Ideas, and success in mundane qualities. That is how eulogy can be demonstrated.

*

964. The plane of the faculties can be demonstrated by nine terms and the plane of defilements can be demonstrated by nine terms. So these terms are eighteen: nine profitable terms and nine unprofitable terms, according as it was said [earlier] 'The eighteen Root-Terms: where are they to be seen? In the Pattern of the Dispensation' (§759).

965. That is why the venerable Mahā-Kaccāna said:

'With nine terms on the side of profit
And nine terms on unprofit's side
Construed, these Root-Terms [thus] do come
[In all] to number eighteen terms' (§4 end).

The Pattern of the Dispensation is ended.

*

960/1 The 'allowable' (*kappiya*) is, according to *NettiA*, what is explicitly stated in the texts, while 'what is in conformity therewith' (*anuloma*) is what is compatible with that in the way described under the Principal Appeals to Authority (§120ff.).

[193] At this point the Guide is completed, which¹ was spoken by Mahā-Kaccāna, approved by the Blessed One, and chanted at the original Council.

End of The Guide

965/1 Read *Netti, yā*.